



OFFICIAL REPORT
AITHISG OIFIGEIL

DRAFT

Meeting of the Parliament

Tuesday 30 September 2025

Session 6



The Scottish Parliament
Pàrlamaid na h-Alba

© Parliamentary copyright. Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body

Information on the Scottish Parliament's copyright policy can be found on the website - www.parliament.scot or by contacting Public Information on 0131 348 5000

Tuesday 30 September 2025

CONTENTS

	Col.
TIME FOR REFLECTION	1
BUSINESS MOTION	3
<i>Motion moved—[Graeme Dey]—and agreed to.</i>	
TOPICAL QUESTION TIME	4
Universities and Colleges (Financial Situations)	4
Extreme Wildfire Warning	8
MyCare (Accessibility)	10
POINT OF ORDER	14
TECHSCALER PROGRAMME	15
<i>Statement—[Kate Forbes].</i>	
The Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Economy and Gaelic (Kate Forbes)	15
URGENT QUESTION	27
“Supporting Transgender Pupils In Schools” (Consultation)	27
HOUSING (SCOTLAND) BILL: STAGE 3	33
HOUSING (SCOTLAND) BILL	224
<i>Motion moved—[Màiri McAllan.]</i>	
The Cabinet Secretary for Housing (Màiri McAllan)	224
Meghan Gallacher (Central Scotland) (Con)	226
Mark Griffin (Central Scotland) (Lab)	229
Maggie Chapman (North East Scotland) (Green)	230
Willie Rennie (North East Fife) (LD)	232
Alasdair Allan (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)	233
Edward Mountain (Highlands and Islands) (Con)	234
Davy Russell (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)	236
Jeremy Balfour (Lothian) (Ind)	237
Graham Simpson (Central Scotland) (Reform)	237
Ariane Burgess (Highlands and Islands) (Green)	238
Pam Duncan-Glancy (Glasgow) (Lab)	240
Alexander Stewart (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)	242
Màiri McAllan	243
COMMITTEE ANNOUNCEMENT (DELEGATED POWERS AND LAW REFORM COMMITTEE)	247
Stuart McMillan (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)	247
PARLIAMENTARY BUREAU MOTION	249
<i>Motion moved—[Graeme Dey].</i>	
DECISION TIME	250

Scottish Parliament

Tuesday 30 September 2025

[The Presiding Officer opened the meeting at 14:00]

Time for Reflection

The Presiding Officer (Alison Johnstone):

Good afternoon. The first item of business is time for reflection. Our time for reflection leader today is Cameron McGerr of Clydeview academy.

Cameron McGerr: Presiding Officer and members of the Scottish Parliament, I have been invited here today by Stuart McMillan to share the goal of my pulse of life campaign. Pulse of life aims to make cardiopulmonary resuscitation training mandatory in all high schools across Scotland, first in secondary 1 during a physical education lesson, and then in S4 as a refresher course.

Out-of-hospital cardiac arrests are common in the west of Scotland. In Scotland, roughly 9,000 out-of-hospital cardiac arrests occur annually, but the bystander CPR rate is only about 66 per cent. That is a major deal, because for every minute that CPR is not performed, the survival rate goes down by about 10 per cent.

This passion comes from my own personal experience. In 2022, I lost my mother to a heart attack, and in February this year, I lost my father to cardiac arrest while at home. That came as a shock. I moved from being someone with caring parents to being someone who had both parents stolen from me early.

I believe that if I had known CPR, I would have been able to save my dad. I would have been more confident while performing CPR, worrying less as his ribs broke under the force of my hands. I would not have had to wait for the 999 operator to instruct me in what to do. In my panic, I lost probably two and a half minutes, which instantly decreased his chance of survival by 25 per cent.

When my mother passed, I woke up to my dad screaming, unsure what to do. Being in S1 at the time, I wonder whether, if I had been given CPR training, I would have been able to step in and make a difference. However, I cannot live life wondering, "What if?"—I need to live to make a difference for other people who might encounter the same problem, and that is why I took action. I have been working closely with my school, Clydeview academy, which is the first school in Scotland to show recognition for world heart day. Inverclyde Council is supporting it by lighting up buildings and monuments red in awareness.

However, in order to make meaningful change, I believe that we in Scotland must go further. All PE teachers should be trained to be able to teach CPR, and training would take place in a single PE lesson to help cut down on missed class time. That will be a long process, but it could make an astronomical difference. *[Applause.]*

Business Motion

14:03

The Presiding Officer (Alison Johnstone):

The next item of business is consideration of business motion S6M-19134, in the name of Graeme Dey, on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, on changes to business.

Motion moved,

That the Parliament agrees to the following revisions to the programme of business for—

(a) Tuesday 30 September 2025—

delete

7.15 pm Decision Time

followed by Members' Business

and insert

8.20 pm Decision Time

(b) Wednesday 1 October 2025—

after

followed by Scottish Labour Party Debate:
Protecting Scotland's Fire Service

insert

followed by Ministerial Statement: Urban Gulls Summit

delete

5.10 pm Decision Time

and insert

5.40 pm Decision Time

(c) Thursday 2 October 2025—

after

2.30 pm Portfolio Questions:
Social Justice and Housing

insert

followed by Ministerial Statement: Scotland's Prison Population

and after

5.00 pm Decision Time

insert

followed by Members' Business—[Graeme Dey]

Motion agreed to.

Topical Question Time

14:03

Universities and Colleges (Financial Situations)

1. **Katy Clark (West Scotland) (Lab):** To ask the Scottish Government what its response is to the report from the Scottish Funding Council stating that universities and colleges are in unsustainable financial situations, with some at risk of insolvency in the current financial year. (S6T-02699)

The Minister for Higher and Further Education (Ben Macpherson): The Scottish Funding Council publishes an analysis of financial stability of Scotland's colleges and universities every year. The recent report that the member mentions is significant and is being considered as such by me and other ministers, as Parliament and the public would expect.

In that context, I emphasise that Scottish ministers recognise the vital role that universities and colleges play in the economy and wider society. However, despite the significant financial contribution from the Scottish Government in the previous budget, Scotland's universities and colleges are facing a broad range of pressures, several of which have been caused by United Kingdom Government decisions. Those include its approach to immigration and changes to national insurance contributions, which have created an estimated cost of around £50 million per year. UK ministers have not provided support for those impacts.

Katy Clark: Much of the report focuses on further education colleges, which have historically been underfunded and more vulnerable because of their reliance on Scottish Funding Council grants. Unless the deficits are addressed, it is projected that there will be 667 full-time equivalent job losses. Will the Scottish Government respond to those pressures with greater investment in the further education sector?

Ben Macpherson: I thank the member for raising the contribution of further education colleges not just to the people who are involved in them and enrolled as students but to the national economy and the local economies where they operate.

The member will appreciate that the budget was set by the Parliament for this financial year and that the Funding Council and the Government—which is engaging with the Funding Council—are giving on-going consideration to the serious matters that are raised in the report. I would be

happy to have further dialogue with the member on these matters.

Katy Clark: The report highlighted that 11 universities have underlying operating deficits. The University of the West of Scotland, which is in my region, is expected to post an £8.4 million deficit, which could result in more than 75 academic job losses, while senior staff who earn more than £100,000 get pay increases of more than 30 per cent. Does the cabinet secretary agree with calls from trade unions for greater transparency in financial planning for universities?

Ben Macpherson: The member raises a point about the excellent university in her region. I have already had some engagement with that institution since coming into post last week. Members will appreciate that, through the budget process, the Government has shown a long-term commitment to universities by investing more than £1 billion in the sector every year since the 2012-13 financial year. That includes £1.1 billion for teaching and research in the previous budget.

However, we appreciate the pressures on the sector and the nature, context and substance of the reports that have been published. I look forward to engaging more with the Parliament on those important reports and questions, including at committee tomorrow. If the member wants to follow up with any specifics with regard to her region, I would be happy to receive that correspondence.

I would also be happy to engage with the member on the constructive correspondence that we can have with the UK Government to get it to play more of a part by using its massive financial power to support these very important contributors to the economy and to change its position on national insurance contributions and immigration policy, which have, in fact, damaged our higher education institutions.

The Presiding Officer: We have much interest in this topic, so concise questions and responses are appreciated.

Keith Brown (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP): As the minister has indicated, the effect of the jobs tax has been to put £600,000 on to the wage bill of Forth Valley College. As the Alloa campus of Forth Valley College is vital in ensuring that young people and adult learners in Clackmannanshire can access further and higher education close to home, what action is the Government taking to protect the future of that campus in the face of the funding challenges?

Ben Macpherson: I am aware of Keith Brown's proactive approach to this serious matter in his constituency. As he set out, the campus in Alloa plays a vital role in providing access to services for people in the community, and I and the

Government are keen that everything possible is done to keep the campus open.

The Scottish Government and the Scottish Funding Council have identified a route by which some funding could be used this financial year to support urgent feasibility studies to inform the SFC's forthcoming college infrastructure investment plan. The SFC is also working closely with the college sector to address infrastructure issues, including in the member's constituency, and it continues to have close engagement with Forth Valley College on those matters.

I am grateful to the member for the engagement that he has shown so far, and I look forward to having further engagement with him on this matter of understandable concern in his constituency.

Stephen Kerr (Central Scotland) (Con): Far be it from me to come to the rescue of a United Kingdom Labour Government, but the issues that are identified in Keith Brown's question and that the minister is talking about predate a Labour Government. The amount of money that has gone towards student funding in universities has been dramatically cut in real terms over the past decade. That is an economic fact. That has meant that universities are now very dependent on international students as a source of income, and that is precarious—I would admit that.

The minister has only two choices. He can either increase the amount of public money that supports Scottish undergraduates and universities or he can review the funding model for Scottish undergraduates at Scottish universities. Which course of action will he take?

Ben Macpherson: The member talks about the pressure on the system. The austerity that the whole of the UK has had to live with since 2010 has not helped anyone in that regard, including our higher education system.

I appreciate the member's points. However, he also seems to be making a point about—if I have heard this incorrectly, I am happy to be corrected—his belief that tuition fees should be reintroduced in Scotland. I do not share that approach, and neither does the Scottish Government.

Our approach of free tuition encourages individuals—young and older—to go into further and higher education to fulfil their potential without the consideration of the burden of debt.
[*Interruption.*]

The Presiding Officer: Let us hear one another.

Ben Macpherson: The question that I put to the member is this: if charging fees was a panacea for the situation, why are several higher education institutions in England, which have high tuition

fees of more than £9,000 a year, struggling financially?

Stephen Kerr: You are in control. You have a choice. What are you going to do?

The Presiding Officer: Mr Kerr.

Ben Macpherson: The question is how we work together with the sector to take a constructive way forward and look at alternative funding models. The Scottish Government continues to engage with Universities Scotland in that collaborative approach, along with other parties, so that we can ensure the sector's long-term financial sustainability.

Pam Duncan-Glancy (Glasgow) (Lab): I am afraid that the minister, quite predictably, points the finger at someone else. Given the £5.2 billion extra that the Scottish Government got from the UK Labour Government, colleges will rightly ask, how come there has been a 17 per cent real-terms cut to funding since 2021, how come staff numbers are down by 27 per cent since 2007 and how come student participation and completion rates are falling? Where has that money gone?

Ben Macpherson: The Scottish Government has supported over 163,000 students through the sector. Record numbers of individuals come from care-experienced backgrounds or are receiving support through the disabled students allowance. We have also provided support for individuals who come from more deprived backgrounds. Widening access has been a great success.

It is important to reflect on the fact that, under this Government, thousands of people go through our further and higher education institutions very successfully every year. The member makes a point about funding for the college sector. As I stated in previous answers, this Government has dedicated billions of pounds annually to supporting the sector and does so in an environment in which it operates within a restricted financial envelope.

As I have stated since taking up the post, I am keen to work constructively with members. If, as we go into the Scottish budget, the Labour Party wants to come to me and colleagues with suggestions for that budget, we would be happy to receive them. The big question—

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, minister.

Ben Macpherson: However, the big question for all parties that we have to think about is where the money would come from in order to go somewhere else, and that is a factual consideration.

Willie Rennie (North East Fife) (LD): I am disappointed with the minister's approach this afternoon. It seems to be a step backwards, because his predecessor had accepted that the

funding model for higher education was broken and had opened the door to cross-party discussions with the universities. Is Ben Macpherson saying that that has now been abandoned? *[Interruption.]*

Ben Macpherson: I seem to have a drummer to my left. *[Laughter.]*

I am not saying that that approach has been abandoned. I embrace it fully, and I want to bring the same approach to the process. I did not mean in any way to disrespect another member or to say, implicitly or directly, that I am closed to anything—apart from bringing in tuition fees, which the Scottish Government has had and continues to have a strong position on. That is our policy. I know that Willie Rennie is engaged in constructive discussions on alternative funding models, along with Universities Scotland. I look forward to further conversations with him, and I hope that this answer reassures him in that regard.

Extreme Wildfire Warning

2. Tim Eagle (Highlands and Islands) (Con): To ask the Scottish Government what its response is to reports that the Scottish Fire and Rescue Service has issued an extreme wildfire warning for the first time in September since 2020. (S6T-02690)

The Minister for Victims and Community Safety (Siobhian Brown): Climate change is contributing to warmer and drier conditions, which increase the likelihood and the intensity of wildfires. Shifts in weather patterns, such as those that led to last week's wildfire danger warning and this week's yellow warning for rain, reinforce the climate challenges that we currently face.

Although there have been no significant wildfires during the latest wildfire warning period, we have seen significant fires this year. I commend the SFRS and its partners in the rural and land management sectors, which ably assisted in dealing with those fires.

In October, the Minister for Agriculture and Connectivity and I will host a wildfire summit to discuss with our partners how we can improve our wildfire preparedness, prevention and response in the future. We continue to work with the SFRS to support full implementation of its wildfire strategy, which will continued to be rolled out this year, with new equipment, vehicles and personal protection equipment, to be backed by £1.6 million of funding over three years.

Tim Eagle: Scotland has witnessed more than 1,500 wildfires in the past decade, but the recent fires at Carrbridge and Dava were the worst and the biggest ever recorded. It is clear that a new approach is needed before someone, or even an entire community, is seriously affected.

What consideration is the Scottish Government giving to establishing a dedicated wildfire response unit, to ensure that communities in my area of the Highlands and Islands, and across Scotland, are protected?

Siobhian Brown: I note the concerns that the member has raised, which all ministers in the Government share. We would like to extend our sympathies to all those who were affected by the wildfires that occurred in late June and early July. I am grateful to the SFRS, gamekeepers, land managers, volunteers, partners, landowners, extended local communities, the wider land management sector and, indeed, everyone who played a major role in getting this spring and summer's wildfires under control.

As I said in my opening answer, in October we will hold a summit at which we will work with everybody to find the best way of moving forward.

Tim Eagle: Given the rise in wildfires this session, rural organisations have expressed concerns that the new muirburn licensing arrangements will make fuel management even harder. That, of course, follows the bungle in May 2023 over expensive all-terrain vehicles that were not, in fact, fit for purpose.

Will the Scottish Government review the muirburn changes, as some gamekeepers are asking it to do? Will it also engage with landowners and gamekeepers, to ensure that the people of Scotland are protected by equipment that actually works?

Siobhian Brown: Muirburn is just one way of addressing the increasing wildfire risks in Scotland and should not be seen as a silver bullet. I appreciate that not everybody agrees with the science on muirburn on peatlands, but that was thoroughly consulted on and debated during the lead-up to and passage of the Wildlife Management and Muirburn (Scotland) Act 2024.

The muirburn licensing scheme that the Minister for Agriculture and Connectivity is introducing has not been brought into effect yet. We are working with practitioners to ensure that it will be a workable scheme, especially in relation to wildfire prevention.

With regard to the equipment for the Scottish Fire and Rescue Service, I have regular meetings with the SFRS and it has not brought that up as an issue. If the member has any specific concerns, I am happy for him to write to me and I will look into them for him.

Rhoda Grant (Highlands and Islands) (Lab): The minister will know that fewer than 10 per cent of fire stations in the Highlands and Islands have full teams of firefighters. They also lack equipment for wildfire management, such as all-terrain

vehicles and leaf blowers, and they do not have decontamination facilities. When will the fire service in rural Scotland be staffed and equipped to deal with wildfire and to protect our rural communities?

Siobhian Brown: Because of the increase in wildfires this year and the concerns that have been raised, the Minister for Agriculture and Connectivity and I are holding the summit in October so that we can explore how rural areas can be better prepared for wildfires. That is also why it is important that the Scottish Fire and Rescue Service is undertaking a service delivery review, the full public consultation for which just closed a couple of weeks ago. That is considering how we can prepare for a safer Scotland as we move into the future.

Emma Roddick (Highlands and Islands) (SNP): It is clear that the climate emergency is changing our weather and that the dry summer this year brought about unprecedented wildfires. What support is the Scottish Government giving to the Scottish Fire and Rescue Service to cope with the changing needs of our communities?

Siobhian Brown: We will continue to support the Scottish Fire and Rescue Service to deliver the high standard of services that are required to keep Scotland safe. That includes the implementation of its wildfire strategy and an overall budget increase of £18.8 million for this year.

The emergencies that the SFRS has responded to have changed significantly over the years. For example, dwelling fires have reduced by more than 20 per cent since 2013. Although the number of house fires has reduced, other incidents, such as flooding and wildfires, which is what we are talking about, have increased. That is why it is right that the fire service is carefully considering how to adapt to the changing risks to remain effective and efficient, with firefighters in the right place at the right time.

MyCare (Accessibility)

3. Alex Cole-Hamilton (Edinburgh Western) (LD): To ask the Scottish Government for what reason patients across Scotland will reportedly not be able to fully access the new MyCare NHS app until 2030. (S6T-02701)

The Cabinet Secretary for Health and Social Care (Neil Gray): I refer Alex Cole-Hamilton to the summary of the roll-out plan, which was published on Friday and of which Parliament was notified. That confirms the intention to make the MyCare app available across the population of Scotland throughout 2026, starting in April.

It is right and normal practice for digital technology roll-out to include iterative improvements beyond the initial launch, with new

and improved services being added regularly, and that is what we aim to do. That approach also allows us to continue to be informed by testing and user feedback. That will ensure that the service is developed to be robust, secure and aligned to what people need, and it will allow for this transformational innovation to progress effectively.

Alex Cole-Hamilton: Amanda Clark and her family moved to Scotland from England three years ago. The app that was available to her south of the border made her life as a parent and carer much easier. It gave instant access to her medical history and allowed her to easily renew prescriptions for herself and her disabled son. When she moved to Scotland, she expected that her details would automatically migrate to the Scottish version of the app—except that there was not one. The transfer of paper records led to vital information being missed on allergies, Covid vaccines and complex medical conditions. Why, in 2025, are patients in Scotland still unable to benefit from a national health service app that provides the same joined-up care that families in England have been able to rely on since before the pandemic?

Neil Gray: I sympathise with the situation that Alex Cole-Hamilton has narrated about Ms Clark and her family. That is exactly the aspiration that I have for MyCare, which will go further than what has been available to residents in England—

Stephen Kerr (Central Scotland) (Con): Oh, that is nonsense.

Neil Gray: —by providing an integrated health and social care application. [*Interruption.*]

The Presiding Officer: There are some voices that I am hearing rather more clearly than I would expect, particularly when such voices have not been called to speak.

Neil Gray: It is a statement of fact that this is an integrated health and social care app, the likes of which is not available elsewhere in the United Kingdom. Yes, we have learning to build on from the health service app that is available in England. We will do that, and that has formed the basis of the roll-out plan that was published and that Parliament was notified of on Friday.

Alex Cole-Hamilton: That felt like something of a “jam tomorrow” response from the cabinet secretary. Incidentally, tomorrow does not fall until very soon after the next Scottish election, which feels convenient.

The app will be incredibly limited compared with what has been available for years in England, so that will be cold comfort to Scottish patients. Some 34 million people use the app in England. They have come to rely on the functionality that Amanda

expected when she came here, but her move to Scotland felt like a step back in time.

Patients in Scotland are stuck in a phone queue for the 8 am scramble for general practitioner appointments. British Medical Association Scotland has called it a disgrace that GPs still have to sign paper prescriptions by hand, given the pressures on their time. Software platforms still do not speak to each other across our health service. Everything is harder for patients and staff when GPs have to navigate outdated tech.

Does the cabinet secretary recognise that, as long as our Scottish NHS relies on technology from the last century, we are holding clinicians and patients back and deepening the crisis in our health service?

Neil Gray: To answer Mr Cole-Hamilton’s point about the app happening only after the election, that is not the case. The roll-out will happen from April, which, patently, falls before the election.

In response to his latter point, the iterative improvements that will come thereafter will ensure that we give people—service users of the health and social care system and those who work within it—better access to digital capability and innovation. I want that iterative process to move as quickly as possible. That is what we will invest in and what we will deliver.

David Torrance (Kirkcaldy) (SNP): The introduction of the NHS MyCare app will undoubtedly revolutionise Scotland’s healthcare system. I welcome last week’s news that the app will be rolled out across Scotland from 1 April. My Kirkcaldy constituents will also welcome that. Opposition members can never bring themselves to welcome a good news story in Scotland. Will the cabinet secretary make it clear how Scotland’s MyCare app will be more wide ranging than any other NHS app in the UK?

Neil Gray: David Torrance is right. The app will be transformational for how people across Scotland manage their health and social care services. When the roll-out is complete, it will be the most wide-ranging app that is offered in the UK, because we have been clear from the outset that its development must include social work and social care, so it will go beyond being just an NHS app. That will put us in a strong position to develop services that meet the population’s needs, regardless of whether they are being supported by the health system or the social care system.

Brian Whittle (South Scotland) (Con): I am surprised at how long it is taking to develop and deploy such tech. Will the cabinet secretary confirm that the Scottish Government will deliver a single shared electronic patient record and software interoperability, alongside the roll-out of a

fully functional MyCare app, across the NHS by 2030?

Neil Gray: I recognise Brian Whittle's interest in that. I look forward to continuing to collaborate with him on the app's roll-out and will continue to do so after April. The full business case, which is in development, will quantify the benefits as well as the expected return on investment. That will inform the roll-out plan, as per our commitment in the NHS Scotland operational improvement plan. It will include areas such as digital patient records, digital prescribing and other elements that Mr Whittle is very interested in—as am I, because I can see that there will be human resource and financial resource savings, as well as outcome improvements, for people who use the app.

The Presiding Officer: That concludes topical question time. My apologies to those members whom I was unable to call. Before we move to the next item, I will allow a moment or two for members on the front benches to organise themselves.

Point of Order

14:28

Fergus Ewing (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I regret that I have not had the opportunity to give you notice of this question, as I normally would.

I seek your guidance on how, under rules 13.6B and 13.8 of standing orders, I might raise in the chamber the plight of tourist accommodation businesses in the city of Edinburgh, which, as of tomorrow, will be required to maintain records in order to apply the visitor levy on advance bookings for dates from July next year.

The Presiding Officer (Alison Johnstone): Mr Ewing—

Fergus Ewing: How can I raise the issue, given that my requests for a topical question and an urgent question have been rejected?

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Ewing. That was not a point of order, but I am happy to discuss with the member the many mechanisms that he can use to raise issues in the chamber.

Techscaler Programme

The Presiding Officer (Alison Johnstone):

The next item of business is a statement by Kate Forbes on the Techscaler programme. The Deputy First Minister will take questions at the end of her statement, so there should be no interventions or interruptions.

14:29

The Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Economy and Gaelic (Kate Forbes): It is with pride, optimism and some frustration that I address the chamber on the progress of Techscaler: pride, because the programme is exceeding expectations; optimism, because its performance is contributing to Scotland's rise as one of Europe's fastest-growing entrepreneurial economies; and frustration, because even that undeniable success cannot escape political and, even worse, anonymous sniping.

We should begin with what Techscaler does and why it matters. In 2020, I asked one of Scotland's most successful modern entrepreneurs, Mark Logan, to review Scotland's entrepreneurial economy. He concluded that Scotland has no shortage of ideas or ambition, but we lacked the necessary density of experienced talent to turn sparks of inspiration into globally successful companies. As Mr Logan put it, as we are

"short on experience, we must go long on education."

That is where Techscaler comes in. It is an ambitious idea that is designed to provide the world-class support that is taken for granted in silicon valley, Helsinki and Paris. It operates across 13 co-working spaces and provides structured commercial education from ideation through to scale. That includes free national access to Reforge, which is one of silicon valley's leading and prestigious providers of scale-up training.

Techscaler pairs new founders with mentors who have been there and done it, and those mentors provide support over months, not just in one-off clinics. It is also about culture and community—creating the events, networks and peer learning that make an entrepreneurial economy thrive.

Nearly three years on from its creation, let us examine Techscaler's performance. Membership stands at 1,300 start-ups, and the number of applications continues to accelerate. Thirty-five per cent of members are women, which is well above industry averages. It is perhaps no coincidence that a new study from JP Morgan shows that investment in female-led businesses in Scotland has risen by 10.5 per cent in the past

year. That compares with a 29 per cent fall in England.

Collectively, Techscaler members have raised £195 million of investment. Sifted, the *Financial Times* start-up platform, ranks Techscaler as among the best founder communities in Europe. This year, 18 members have won Scottish EDGE awards, and three Techscaler companies—Malted AI, Simple Online Healthcare and Wordsmith AI—are named in Tech Nation's future fifty programme, which focuses on companies with a \$1 billion potential.

Techscaler is far from the totality of our offer. Today, I can announce that, as part of our commitment to Ana Stewart's "Pathways: A New Approach for Women in Entrepreneurship" report, £1.16 million will be provided to 14 organisations to support new entrepreneurs across Scotland, with a focus on women and underrepresented groups.

None of that is to say that Techscaler is perfect. The contract was awarded, on the basis of cost and quality, to CodeBase, a local ecosystem builder—a start-up itself—that has scaled operations rapidly. The programme is new and ambitious, and it offers a complex mix of services at national scale, so it is only natural that there continues to be scope to refine and optimise. There are challenges to overcome and opportunities that can be realised only if Techscaler is able to adapt and change.

In the post-pandemic economy, the focus on physical co-working has been challenging, as has creating a focal point for the entrepreneurial community in regions where none has previously existed. The start-up world evolves quickly and, since the Logan review, investors are turning towards deeptech. That requires Techscaler to pivot to emerging sectors such as artificial intelligence, medtech and robotics. It requires Techscaler, like any start-up in a fast-moving environment, to improve its leadership, agility and execution. It also requires accountability for results and a positive approach to partnership.

We want Techscaler to be one of the best programmes of its kind anywhere in the world. That is why, earlier this year—long before any of the recent anonymous criticism—I commissioned an early independent review. I will shortly meet CodeBase's chair, the exceptional Gillian Docherty, who is the chief commercial officer at the University of Strathclyde, to discuss the emerging findings.

However, the unfortunate reality is that we are not here to discuss the rationale for Techscaler or its performance, or to debate how the programme could be optimised. Instead, we are here because some see political capital in a series of

unattributed, unsubstantiated claims that have been made in the press. Let us address those claims head on.

Techscaler's international programme helps start-ups to go global by connecting to investors, entering new markets and enabling founders to benchmark their companies against world-class competitors. Techscaler covers the cost of workspace, economy flights and accommodation. Participants cannot claim for any additional travel or subsistence costs. That part of the programme represents 2 per cent of Techscaler's spend to date. As we shall see, that is far from excessive by international standards.

The programme deliberately does not have a militarised schedule. It is about supporting serious entrepreneurs from Scotland to live and work in the world's best ecosystems for an extended period. In that regard, Techscaler mirrors international best practice. Germany pays for founders to base themselves in silicon valley with free space and expert support. The Nordics go even further, clubbing together to operate a series of scaled start-up incubators across the US and Asia with subsidised travel and accommodation, allowing founders to focus on growth, not logistics. The Finns go further still, investing in local housing to support founders to live and work in silicon valley for a full three months. That is the level of ambition that we are competing against. The real question is not whether Techscaler goes too far in relation to international exposure for founders and entrepreneurs but whether it is doing enough.

In a few cases, participants have chosen to extend their stay beyond the programme and to be joined by partners, but that was entirely at their own personal expense and no public funds were used for those purposes. My officials have, however, made clear to CodeBase's leadership that, where public funds are concerned, appearances matter and the highest standards of propriety must be upheld.

Most importantly, the international programme has been a huge success. Multiple export contracts have been secured, six participants secured £5.4 million of investment and several other firms are in dialogue with investors. Showcasing Scottish companies has also put us on the entrepreneurial map. Techscaler has now hosted inward visits from 12 countries, including America, Singapore and China, which are all keen to partner with Techscaler and invest in Scotland.

Since the anonymous criticisms were published, business leaders have expressed their views publicly. Wes Beard of konversable said:

"The fact this has been reported as a 'free holiday' is not only factually inaccurate, but an insult to the entrepreneurs".

Daniel Grant of fern said that he has

"never heard anyone call these trips a holiday."

Natalie Garry of danceSing said:

"We arrived with no US clients. We now have contracts signed, a clear strategy to scale in the US, and an invaluable network of connections."

Sandeep Casi, a Tokyo-based partner at Antler, which is a global venture capital fund, said:

"the quality of the Scottish founders that recently travelled to Japan ... is proof that Scotland is set for ... success ... Japan can be a key territory to drive this".

I could continue with testimonials, but I prefer to conclude positively. Five years ago, this Government set out a vision to establish Scotland as one of Europe's fastest-growing entrepreneurial economies. That vision is now a reality. The latest analysis shows that Scotland is growing at a rate of 19 per cent, which is well above the UK rate of 12.5 per cent, and almost double the rate of Sweden and the Netherlands. Last year, investment in Scottish companies also grew by 19 per cent, even as global markets stalled. Reports from multiple sources record business start-up rates growing at record levels. As the chief entrepreneur, Ana Stewart, told me last week,

"Scotland is back in the game—a recognised player for the first time in decades."

In the chamber, members frequently and rightly challenge me to support policies and projects that will drive economic growth. That is what Techscaler is doing, and I would hate to see that progress compromised by these anonymous briefings. I say sincerely to members: help us with your support, your ideas and your challenges, because together we have a genuine opportunity to transform Scotland's economy and back the initiatives that are delivering results.

The Presiding Officer: The Deputy First Minister will now take questions on the issues raised in her statement. I intend to allow around 20 minutes for questions, after which we will move to the next item of business.

Murdo Fraser (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con): I thank the Deputy First Minister for her statement and for advance sight of it. We asked for the statement not to criticise the ambition of Techscaler, or indeed to criticise CodeBase, which I had the pleasure of visiting with some colleagues earlier this year, but simply to get some clarity concerning information about the use, or potential misuse, of public funds, which had been put in the public domain thanks to the investigative journalism of the *Sunday Post*. It relates to claims from whistleblowers that overseas trips funded by Techscaler were not properly supported and that those who organised them attended with their partners, effectively treated them as a jolly and

were barely seen at meetings or events. Surely, even for this Government, that should be a matter of concern—instead of the Government seeking to castigate journalists and to diminish evidence as “fake news” in Donald Trump style.

Let me ask the Deputy First Minister three questions. At the weekend, the Scottish Government accused me—me—of spreading misinformation, but, when challenged, it could not substantiate that claim. I ask the Deputy First Minister directly: what is the “misinformation” that I am accused of spreading?

Secondly, why was all the negative feedback from participants on those trips redacted from paperwork released to journalists under freedom of information legislation? Why does the Scottish Government not want to give a balanced view on the value of those trips—or was the negative feedback simply too embarrassing?

Thirdly, the Deputy First Minister said that, collectively, members of Techscaler had raised £195 million—which is a very healthy total. Can she tell us how much of that total comes from exclusively private sources as opposed to Government-backed funds such as those from the Scottish National Investment Bank, Scottish Enterprise or Par Equity?

Kate Forbes: First, I thank the member for leading his question by saying that he is not here to criticise Techscaler or CodeBase. That is so important: the more cross-party support there can be for initiatives that are delivering results, the better. I am very grateful to him for outlining that point.

Let me confront the points that the member made. First, on misinformation, I quoted to him in the statement the direct rebuttals—which were made on the record—from businesses and founders who had been involved with the schemes, all of whom strongly rejected any suggestion that the trips were jollies or holidays. In fact, the one person who had gone on the record and was quoted in the newspaper headlines promptly went on to say that he totally rejected the characterisation of Techscaler that had been made—and he said that in his own words. That is quite conclusive regarding the challenge that those trips were somehow holidays. I prefer to listen to people who are happy to speak in their own name.

Secondly, let us talk about the redactions. The point is that Techscaler is taking feedback, and rightly so. It is in its third year of operation, and I would expect it to take on board feedback, which is vital. It allows us to take on board areas for improvement as well as to recognise those areas that have been a success. The redactions were made on the basis of two reasons. First, some

elements were commercially sensitive, and I think that nobody disagrees with that. Secondly, the information was provided on the express basis of anonymity. If the same people who are so keen on reducing or removing that anonymity cannot even get anybody to go on the record in the press without their names being removed, that says it all.

The final point is about the split of the £195 million. I am more than happy to come back to the member to split that down. I have previously given comments in the chamber on the breakdown, but I would rather give that to him in writing.

Pam Duncan-Glancy (Glasgow) (Lab): I thank the Deputy First Minister for advance sight of her statement. I agree that Techscaler is proving to be a significant driver of Scotland’s tech ecosystem, and we hope that the concerns that have been raised will be considered by the DFM’s early independent review, so that Techscaler can maximise its positive impact on Scottish businesses.

Techscaler was central to Mark Logan’s recommendations, but so, too, was the skills pipeline. Indeed, he was right to say that we need to “go long on education”. However, in that area, progress has been more limited. Inspiring young people into technology careers, including in AI and robotics, is crucial to addressing skills gaps, yet, last year, computing science teacher numbers were at an all-time low, with computing science deserts across Scotland. Will the Deputy First Minister outline a comprehensive plan to ensure that young people can access technical skills in schools nationwide? How many additional computing science teachers will be deployed as a result?

Kate Forbes: I thank Pam Duncan-Glancy for her question, too. I enormously value the cross-party support that has always existed for the implementation of the Scottish technology ecosystem review—STER—which is Mark Logan’s review, and I am grateful to hear that confirmed again.

On the centrality of education, Pam Duncan-Glancy is absolutely right to say that a number of education programmes are offered through Techscaler, tailored to different stages of the founder journey. I mentioned membership of Reforge, which is a premium education programme that is globally respected. The fact that our scale-ups have access to that is probably underappreciated in Scotland. We also have other programmes, including Techscaler discovery, which is a free online programme to support individuals at the earliest stages of their journey, and there is a catalyst accelerator, which is a 10-week hybrid programme. In many cases, those programmes are delivered by experienced founders and industry experts.

On embedding this in our schools, I was delighted to confirm last year that, for the first time ever, we now have entrepreneurial education provided through the whole school experience, from primary 1 to secondary 6, because of the way in which we have provided funding to key organisations. It means that young people, at different stages of their school experience, have access to entrepreneurial learning. The Gen+ programme was one such programme that benefited, and there are others, as well.

The challenge to recruit computing science teachers continues. I know that the Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills is very much committed to that, and it is an area of collaboration across Government.

Kenneth Gibson (Cunninghame North) (SNP): I welcome the Deputy First Minister's statement. It is truly heartening to see Scotland doing so well in such a globally competitive sphere, and I congratulate all concerned. Given the scale of success and return relative to a modest Scottish Government investment, which represents but a fragment of the Scottish budget, does she agree that, over and above the £1.16 million investment that was announced today, a significant increase in the resources allocated to the Techscaler programme in the next budget is necessary to take it to the next level, with all the private investment that that will attract and the employment and economic growth that will undoubtedly follow?

Kate Forbes: Kenneth Gibson will appreciate that, in my engagement with the Cabinet Secretary for Finance and Local Government, I will be making a strong case for investment in programmes such as Techscaler, because the more prosperous our economy is, the more revenues are raised and reinvested in our public services. I come back to the point that, where there is a project, policy or initiative that works, we should back it.

Stephen Kerr (Central Scotland) (Con): Can I just say how much I deplore the language that the Deputy First Minister has used this afternoon in the chamber while discussing whistleblowers? It goes to the heart of how the Scottish National Party Government works, because it loves to silence dissident voices.

Let us be frank about what has happened. The Government claims that the redactions in the Techscaler feedback obtained by FOI were for commercial sensitivity, but I think that that is an exaggeration. Investigative journalism at the *Sunday Post* revealed that the redacted information was actually negative feedback. The Government does not want to hear negative feedback. It would appear that the Government does not believe in the value of whistleblowing.

Will the Deputy First Minister consider her attitude towards those who fear speaking out but wish to do so on the basis of anonymity, so that what they have to say can be heard in a country that increasingly lives in fear of how the SNP Government operates?

Kate Forbes: I base everything that I say on fact, and Daniel Grant was the only individual named in the *Sunday Post* article. He has since taken to LinkedIn to say that he has "never heard" anyone call those trips holidays; yet, in this chamber, I have already heard the Opposition refer to them as that. I would rather take Daniel Grant's word than Stephen Kerr's.

Audrey Nicoll (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP): Yesterday, I had the great pleasure of attending the opening of the new energy transition skills hub in my constituency. It is a collaboration between North East Scotland College, ETZ Ltd and Shell that will power an evolving energy workforce and that will, I am confident, play its part in producing some of our future Techscaler talent.

I very much welcome the cabinet secretary's update on the Techscaler international programme, which helps start-ups to go global and to access new markets overseas. What action is the Scottish Government taking to incentivise our ambitious founders and scale-ups to remain right here, in Scotland?

Kate Forbes: I am pleased to hear that Techscaler is having an impact in the north-east, because the whole premise of the programme was to ensure that the initiative was not concentrated only in Glasgow and Edinburgh and would also be able to support entrepreneurs right across Scotland. That is what makes it such a critically important programme.

The question of how we retain scaled firms is, in some ways, a nice problem to have, because it is symptomatic of the growing pains of a thriving but still emerging entrepreneurial economy. All scale-ups need access to three things: the talent, the capital and the infrastructure that is relevant to their businesses. That is what we are trying to deliver.

Martin Whitfield (South Scotland) (Lab): *The Sunday Post* asked CodeBase what kind of selection process was carried out. The response was:

"Ultimately, the value they"

—that is, the contributing individuals—

"derive from these programmes depends on their own commitment and approach."

Techscalers have a crucial part to play in the tech ecosystem and are worthy of public money to

support that, so will the Scottish Government's scrutiny and accountability reflect that individual commitment and approach?

Kate Forbes: Techscaler is in only its third year. As I said, it is improving year-on-year, and the feedback processes allow it to keep improving.

One important area is the balance between application processes and selection, which means tailoring programmes to those who would benefit most. As members know from some of the testimonials, the fact that some companies have gone out and got international contracts that they would not otherwise have had is indicative of their commitment to pursuing those opportunities. The member is absolutely right to highlight that.

Emma Harper (South Scotland) (SNP): Investing in Scotland's talent also means mentoring, training and creating partnerships that will help our entrepreneurs to innovate and build. Can the Deputy First Minister say any more about the advice and support that Techscaler provides to founders and entrepreneurs?

Kate Forbes: The whole remit of Techscaler is to build relationships. Rather than having an education programme in which people just turn up for a one-off clinic, hear some great advice and then leave, Techscaler tries to embed a bit more flexibility, offering networks and a mentoring programme alongside world-class educational facilities.

Lorna Slater (Lothian) (Green): I note the support in the Techscaler scheme for international flights and for what the Deputy First Minister calls "deep tech", such as AI, which can have high energy needs. How is the Scottish Government ensuring that the programme supports its stated ambition to transition to net zero? What is the carbon cost of all the money that has been spent on Techscaler? What will it cost the public purse to sequester the emitted carbon later?

Kate Forbes: I really like the way that the member has framed that question because she is absolutely right that a lot of those companies are involved in support for the transition and for the innovation that is required to meet our climate change goals.

She may have heard me say in my statement that the spend on the international element of the programme is only 2 per cent of the overall spend. Given that the amount of capital raised is about £195 million, if even some of that is reinvested in helping us innovate to get to net zero, I think that that is money well spent.

Willie Rennie (North East Fife) (LD): Just 8 per cent of firms have full access to the necessary skills to effectively use AI tools and tech. That is according to Hays, the specialist recruitment

agency. However, in the past 20 years, we have lost almost 30 per cent of our computing science teachers. How will Techscaler succeed if we do not have the necessary skilled workers to work in the sector?

Kate Forbes: That question is worthy of a much longer answer than I am about to give, but Techscaler is one part of the answer. Techscaler equips, enables and supports founders. A point that is frequently put to me is that building up a density of companies and entrepreneurs who are all doing this activity makes it a lot easier to attract the skills to Scotland in the first place.

Techscaler has a great focus on the educational element, but the challenge to the answer that I am giving is that it is self-selecting. In other words, those who are already interested in developing a business or whatever, particularly with a focus on AI, will probably self-select to become part of the Techscaler programme. The question that Willie Rennie asks is about the wider cohort of people who do not feel that they have AI skills.

Richard Lochhead has just launched the AI Scotland programme, which is specifically designed to embed AI much more widely in the public and private sectors, and a big part of that involves equipping people with the skills to make them confident in applying or working with AI.

Jackie Dunbar (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP): Thanks to the work of the Scottish Government, Techscaler successfully raised more than £100 million of capital investment last year, from both public and private sources, and it is supporting businesses across medical technology, artificial intelligence and space. Can the Deputy First Minister say any more about the importance of collaboration with the private sector and of developing confidence in and attracting investment into Scotland's early talent?

Kate Forbes: Collaboration is critically important here. The success of Techscaler members in securing £195 million of investment is a powerful reflection of the confidence that investors have in Scotland, and credit goes to the exceptional founders, whose innovation is driving Scotland's growth. However, that progress is rooted in collaboration. A prime example is Techscaler's partnership with Scottish EDGE, which runs Scotland's leading business funding competition. Through the Techscaler-sponsored young EDGE award, Techscaler provides funding to innovative founders who are under 30, alongside access to its education and mentorship programmes. This year, 18 Techscaler members won Scottish EDGE awards. From my perspective, it is brilliant to see the ecosystem working together, and long may that continue.

Craig Hoy (South Scotland) (Con): Does the Deputy First Minister share my view that, in order to succeed, projects such as Techscaler must enjoy public confidence and the support of members of this Parliament? Although the Deputy First Minister says that Government-funded overseas trips should not be run to a “militarised schedule”, this is one business leader’s account of the trip:

“They went out drinking all night and even when stuff was organised for the next day, not by Techscaler but by other organisations, they didn’t turn up because they were sleeping it off. Some of them did it every day.”

The FOI response was heavily redacted, and apparently other criticisms of the programme were redacted as well. Will the Deputy First Minister join me in encouraging a re-release of the FOI response with only commercially sensitive information redacted?

Kate Forbes: If a survey is responded to on the basis of anonymity and confidentiality, I think that it is pretty challenging to then breach that confidentiality, not least as people on the Conservative benches have been encouraging me to respect the anonymity of whistleblowers.

Rona Mackay (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP): Recent figures confirm that Scotland is by far the fastest-growing start-up economy in the UK and is fast becoming Europe’s leading start-up nation. That success comes despite a challenging fiscal environment in which Labour’s tax on jobs is harming growth and Brexit is limiting access to talent across the country. Can the Deputy First Minister say any more about Scottish Government’s policy choices and how we can build on that momentum?

Kate Forbes: The member is right to talk about some of the global headwinds and the challenges that we are encountering right now, which give us all the more reason to support and back the initiatives that are having an impact. The outlook for Techscaler, even after three years, demonstrates that the strategy is working. Every major indicator—start-up rates, investment of risk capital, the size of later-stage investment deals, and external investment—is growing rapidly, often bucking UK-wide and global trends. In other words, it is working. I sincerely hope that members across the chamber can find it within themselves to back something that works.

The Presiding Officer: That concludes the ministerial statement.

Stephen Kerr: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. Since I mentioned whistleblowing in the chamber, I should be transparent by making it clear that my entry in the register of members’ interests states that I am a director of WhistleblowersUK, a not-for-profit organisation

that was set up to advocate for a more positive environment for whistleblowers and whistleblowing.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Kerr. That is not a point of order, but your comments are on the record.

There will be a brief pause before we move to the next item of business.

Urgent Question

15:00

“Supporting Transgender Pupils In Schools” (Consultation)

Pam Gosal (West Scotland) (Con): To ask the Scottish Government who it consulted before producing the “Supporting Transgender Pupils in Schools: Guidance for education authorities and schools”, which it published yesterday.

The Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills (Jenny Gilruth): The revised guidance has been developed to respond to and take account of recent legal decisions. There has been engagement with education authorities and trade unions to understand the concerns that are experienced in our schools. The guidance on which the revised guidance is based was developed in the light of engagement with a range of stakeholders, including parents and carers, education representatives, LGBT organisations and women’s organisations.

The Scottish Government has been taking forward the detailed work that is necessary as a consequence of the Supreme Court’s ruling. We remain committed to engaging with and involving partners and stakeholders throughout that process, as and when appropriate.

I make it absolutely clear that the rights of all children and young people must be respected in our schools. We have brought forward updates to the guidance to provide clarity and confidence to teachers and staff as they work to support the mental, physical and emotional health of transgender young people in our schools.

Pam Gosal: Yesterday, the Scottish National Party Government published new guidance that was meant to give schools clarity about how boys’ and girls’ toilets and changing room facilities should be provided. Yet, instead of finally protecting single-sex spaces, the muddled new SNP guidance has confused matters further.

This morning, the SNP education secretary repeatedly refused to state whether biological males could still use girls’ toilets and changing rooms in our schools. I therefore give the cabinet secretary the opportunity to answer yes or no to a simple question: under the guidance, can biological males who identify as women still use girls’ toilets?

Jenny Gilruth: It is important to say that we have been clear since the Supreme Court’s ruling that we accept the judgment on biological sex. I also put it on the record that, under the School Premises (General Requirements and Standards)

(Scotland) Regulations 1967, our schools already provide toilets for boys and girls. That is stipulated in legislation at the current time. There is also a requirement in relation to accessible toilets.

More broadly, as I alluded to in my previous response, the rights of all children and young people must be respected in our schools. It is also important to remember that transgender people represent 0.44 per cent of the population of Scotland. Evidence tells us that transgender young people have significantly worse educational and wellbeing outcomes than other pupils. They are much more at risk of bullying, they are more likely to leave education early and they are at risk of increased mental health and wellbeing concerns.

We have updated the guidance in accordance with the Supreme Court ruling, and I have responded to the member’s point in relation to the law and the stipulation that relates to the point that she has raised on single-sex spaces.

Pam Gosal: All that I needed was yes or no, but, obviously, I did not get that.

What is even more disturbing about the guidance is who has helped to develop it. The guidance boasts that it was developed by LGBT Youth Scotland. That taxpayer-funded lobbying group previously produced guidance that suggested that there was no such thing as biological sex, which was widely criticised by child health experts, including one who said that that guidance simply should not be accessible to our school children. Why on earth is the SNP Government still taking its cue from an extreme gender ideology lobbying group instead of the Supreme Court?

Jenny Gilruth: I think that the member is somewhat misguided in relation to the point that she made about stakeholder engagement.

I have been very clear that, throughout the course of the months that have passed since the Supreme Court’s ruling, we have engaged with trade unions, in particular, in order to hear from them about their members’ experiences, and with the Convention of Scottish Local Authorities directly.

Our stakeholder engagement has also included the Association of Directors of Education in Scotland—I hope that the member does not have an issue with us engaging with ADES—COSLA, which I have already alluded to, Education Scotland, Engender, LGBT Youth Scotland, the National Parent Forum of Scotland, Rape Crisis Scotland, sportscotland, Stonewall Scotland and the Scottish Trans Alliance. That is a list of the organisations that were engaged with back in 2021.

The update that I provided yesterday is a technical change, and it, of course, relates directly to recent legal changes that have come forward. We have updated the guidance in accordance with those legal changes.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: A large number of colleagues want to ask supplementary questions. It is unlikely that I will get through all of them, but I will require brevity in both the questions and the responses.

Paul McLennan (East Lothian) (SNP): Ensuring support for transgender children in Scotland's schools is absolutely vital to their wellbeing and learning experience. Can the cabinet secretary speak further on how the guidance will contribute to that objective?

Jenny Gilruth: I thank the member for raising an important point. As I have already alluded to, the rights of all children and young people must be respected in our schools.

I have now spent a number of meetings engaging with our trade unions and listening to COSLA about members' and teachers' feedback on what is happening in our schools. I want to again put on the record that we are talking about a very small percentage of Scotland's pupil population at the current time.

However, it is important that the Government updates our guidance in relation to the Supreme Court ruling. It is absolutely right that schools play their part, along with others, in ensuring that those young people who are feeling particularly vulnerable at the current time are supported, and the guidance goes a long way in helping to provide for that.

Pam Duncan-Glancy (Glasgow) (Lab): The Scottish Government's guidance for school estates says:

"Discrimination requirements under the Equality Act and inclusion measures should be dealt with under suitability."

Will the cabinet secretary reassure members that the new guidance will give schools a clear understanding of their duty to support the rights of all pupils to safely access toilet facilities when conducting future suitability surveys?

Jenny Gilruth: The national guidance goes some way towards providing for that. We have had clear engagement with COSLA on the issue, and with the trade unions, which have been very helpful.

I listened to some of the really helpful contributions from Andrea Bradley on BBC Radio Scotland this morning. The Educational Institute of Scotland has been very outspoken in its views on the issue, and I welcome its contributions in that regard. The EIS is keen to provide support to its

members, but it is also keen to tell me about the impact that recent decisions have had in relation to schools in particular.

I have been clear that we had to update the guidance in line with the Supreme Court ruling. We have undertaken that work over a number of months to ensure that we are compliant with the ruling, and the updated guidance was published yesterday to that end.

Patrick Harvie (Glasgow) (Green): Although some members might not want to accept it, the people who are most directly affected by the changes are trans and non-binary young people themselves.

The cabinet secretary referred to the document that was published by LGBT Youth Scotland some years ago. Can she tell us what input young trans and non-binary people, and the organisations that work with and represent them, have had to the recent changes—whether LGBT Youth Scotland, the Time for Inclusive Education campaign, Scottish Trans or others? If the answer is none, why is that?

Jenny Gilruth: As I alluded to in my response to Ms Gosal, the update to the guidance is technical in nature and responds directly to the Supreme Court's ruling in that regard.

However, as I set out in my previous answer, we will continue to engage with a range of organisations, including the ones that Mr Harvie alluded to. It is really important that the Government listens to the views of young people on those issues directly.

We continue to fund LGBT Youth Scotland. We also provide funding to the TIE campaign to deliver work around inclusive education in our schools—which, of course, every party was able to vote for back in 2018. It is important that we remember the solidarity that existed previously on these issues.

I will continue to work with the organisations that Mr Harvie alluded to, and particularly to listen to the voice of young people in all that I do as education secretary.

Alex Cole-Hamilton (Edinburgh Western) (LD): Whatever one's point of view on these matters, everyone can recognise that it is harder to be trans in Scotland than it used to be.

When trans pupils go to school, they want to be clear about what is expected of them, and they want to know that their anonymity will be protected—if they want it to be—and that teachers, staff and other pupils are there to support them.

When it comes to teachers, I have no doubt that they will want to know that the conversations and

plans that the guidance suggests that they carry out will be done in the most sensitive manner possible. In that spirit, what further assistance and assurance can the cabinet secretary provide to trans pupils and teachers in navigating these issues?

Jenny Gilruth: In my response to Mr Harvie, I talked about some of the support that we provide, such as funding to the TIE campaign and to LGBT Youth Scotland. I engage directly with our teaching trade unions, and, over the past few months since the Supreme Court's ruling I have engaged on that issue in particular and how it is impacting on staff in our schools and their engagement with pupils. I will continue to engage in that way with our professional associations and to listen to views from their members about how we might be able to strengthen that support and look at further considerations in that regard. The member has raised a very important point.

Sharon Dowey (South Scotland) (Con): The Scottish Government's revised guidance for schools refers young people and families to charities such as Mermaids and Time for Inclusive Education for help. That is despite Mermaids being criticised for giving young people chest binders without their parents' involvement, and despite TIE providing schools with guidance that promotes gender ideology.

I have been contacted by numerous parents—

The Deputy Presiding Officer (Liam McArthur): Question.

Sharon Dowey: —who are concerned about gender ideology literature in schools. Does the cabinet secretary think that it is appropriate to give such literature to primary children, and will she review the extent of that practice?

Jenny Gilruth: The revised guidance remains clear that schools should support young people who are considering their gender identity. That is an individual's choice, and it is for schools not to influence or to determine a young person's choice, but to support them once it is established that they are considering changing their gender identity.

The guidance also talks about parental communication, which for me, as a former teacher, is hugely important, as engagement and support can be offered to young people not only through the whole school community but through the home. It is important that that approach is considered and that support is provided in the round, and the guidance provides some detailed examples of how that might be undertaken.

I see that the member is shaking her head at me, but I hope that she engages on the substantive points that are made in the guidance on that point.

Douglas Ross (Highlands and Islands) (Con): The cabinet secretary is refusing to answer a very straightforward question. Under the guidance, could a biological male use a female single-sex-only toilet in a Scottish school?

Jenny Gilruth: As I think that I alluded to in a response to the member's colleague, all schools in Scotland are required to provide separate toilets for girls and for boys—that is stipulated in law. In addition, the guidance makes it clear that councils should give careful consideration to

“the individual needs of transgender pupils in light of ... school context”

and in the light of their school community.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Apologies to those whom I was not able to call. I am conscious of the business that we still have to get through this afternoon and this evening, so we need to move on to the next item of business.

Housing (Scotland) Bill: Stage 3

15:12

The Deputy Presiding Officer (Liam McArthur): The next item of business is stage 3 proceedings on the Housing (Scotland) Bill. In dealing with the amendments, members should have the bill as amended at stage 2—SP bill 45A—along with the second marshalled list and the second grouping of amendments.

The division bell will sound and proceedings will be suspended for around five minutes for the first division. The period of voting for the first division will be 30 seconds. Thereafter, I will allow a voting period of one minute for the first division after a debate.

Members who wish to speak in the debate on any group of amendments should press their request-to-speak buttons or enter RTS in the chat function as soon as possible after I call the group.

Members should now refer to the marshalled list of amendments.

Section 41—Duties of relevant bodies in relation to homelessness

The Deputy Presiding Officer: We have reached group 19, which is on housing and homelessness: supporting persons experiencing etc abuse. Amendment 309, in the name of Katy Clark, is grouped with amendments 310 to 312, 240, 241, 327 to 329, 111 and 17.

Katy Clark (West Scotland) (Lab): I will speak to amendment 309 and my other amendments in the group. Amendment 309 would require relevant bodies to ask individuals who they have reason to believe might be homeless or threatened with homelessness whether their situation arose as a result of either past or on-going experience of abuse.

Amendment 310 would define “abuse” under the definition that is outlined in section 43 of the bill, as conduct

“giving rise, or likely to give rise, to physical or mental injury, fear, alarm or distress”.

Amendments 311 and 312 would require the relevant body, where it is informed that a person is either homeless or threatened with homelessness

“as a consequence of ... having experienced or experiencing abuse”

to provide details of support to that person.

15:15

Amendments 328 and 329 were lodged after discussions with the Children and Young People’s

Commissioner Scotland, which highlighted the need for greater security for victims of domestic abuse who may be left vulnerable to homelessness after ending a joint tenancy with their abusers.

Amendment 328 would allow a joint tenant who

“has experienced, is experiencing or is at risk of domestic abuse”

to end their interest in the tenancy

“without giving notice to each of the other joint tenants”.

The amendment, which would apply to registered social landlords, would require that, when a landlord receives notice under the provision, they

“must provide the tenant with details of such other support that may be available to the tenant in relation to domestic abuse”.

The amendment would address a gap in the law and similar issues, which I spoke to last week in relation to my amendment 293.

Social landlords are clear that they need such statutory footing in order to be able to implement their domestic abuse policies—I stress that amendment 328 relates to social landlords, not the private sector. I raised the issue at stage 2 and discussed it with the cabinet secretary and her predecessor. Given that the amendment relates to domestic abuse in circumstances in which the landlord accepts that there is or has been domestic abuse, a longer period than one week’s notice should not be required; one week’s notice is sufficient.

As I said, the provision in amendment 328 has been requested by social landlords. For example, the Scottish Federation of Housing Associations said in its briefing:

“We strongly support amendment 328”.

It believes that the new section that the amendment proposes is needed for registered social landlords to be able to implement domestic abuse policies, which has been asked for by various campaigns.

Amendment 329, which also relates to social landlords, would require a domestic abuse policy to include the steps that can be taken to write off rent arrears where there has been domestic abuse.

I move amendment 309.

The Cabinet Secretary for Housing (Màiri McAllan): I will begin by addressing Katy Clark’s amendments 309 and 310, which would oblige the relevant body to ask

“whether the person is homeless or threatened with homelessness”

as a result of abuse. Amendments 311 and 312 refer to the provision of details of support services, as Ms Clark set out.

I am pleased to confirm that the provisions in all four of those amendments are already catered for in the bill. The bill contains provisions on addressing homelessness that arises from abuse, including duties on relevant bodies to provide appropriate support. Indeed, section 45 of the bill will require all local authorities and registered social landlords to publish a policy that sets out how they support tenants who

“have experienced, are experiencing or are at risk of domestic abuse”.

Landlords will have to take into account guidance from the Scottish ministers on how those policies should be developed and how they should be used. The guidance could require information on support services to form part of the support that is offered. I intend to work on the development of that guidance with Katy Clark and others for whom I know that that is a priority.

Amendments 240 and 241, in my name, will ensure that the term “abuse” is used consistently in the Housing (Scotland) Act 1987. One part of that act currently refers to “domestic abuse”, but the bill includes a broader definition of abuse to cover a wider range of harmful behaviours. My amendment will update the wording so that the broader definition is used and that it is in line with the Domestic Abuse (Protection) (Scotland) Act 2021. Maggie Chapman’s amendment 327 is not required, as my amendments, which I have just elaborated on, will ensure that the broader definition is used throughout.

I turn to amendment 328, which is another of Katy Clark’s amendments. The first part of it would require ministers to lay regulations to commence part 2 of the Domestic Abuse (Protection) (Scotland) Act 2021. I have discussed with Katy Clark the fact that I am entirely committed to doing that, and I confirmed to Ruth Maguire during part of last week’s stage 3 consideration that it is my intention to lay regulations to ensure that part 2 of the 2021 act comes into force. My aim is to do that by Christmas. I want those powers in force.

Had that provision been an amendment on its own, I would have accepted it. However, there is a fundamental problem with the second part of amendment 328, which means that I cannot accept it. As has been set out, it seeks to reduce the statutory notice period for a victim or survivor of domestic abuse to end their interest in a joint tenancy from four weeks to one week, and, crucially, to remove the requirement to notify a joint tenant and to do so without the consent of the landlord.

Creating a circumstance in which a joint tenant could unilaterally end a joint tenancy at short notice would be extremely challenging. It could be open to misinterpretation; it could even be open to misuse. The amendment would represent a significant change to the property rights of social landlords and, therefore, to the operation of social housing. It could unintentionally provide a route for any tenant to leave their tenancy on one week’s notice—we can imagine the impact that that would have on social housing.

I will expand on that a bit more, because I know that there are interests in this—

Kevin Stewart (Aberdeen Central) (SNP): Will the cabinet secretary take an intervention?

Màiri McAllan: Speaking of interests, I will absolutely take Mr Stewart’s intervention.

Kevin Stewart: I thank the cabinet secretary for taking my intervention. I am very pleased to hear her say that the Domestic Abuse (Protection) (Scotland) Act 2021 will be implemented in full, and I welcome the swiftness with which that will be done.

I recognise that the second part of amendment 328 is complex—it involves contract law and many other things. Will the cabinet secretary assure me that she will continue to look at all that as we move forward, so that we do our very best to protect the victims of domestic abuse?

Màiri McAllan: I am very happy to give that assurance to Kevin Stewart, because I know the import that he places on those matters. I hope that he, and other members, see that I have a similar objective.

The second part of Katy Clark’s amendment 328 is unworkable, so I cannot support it. However, further to Mr Stewart’s intervention, I assure members that I will continue to consider the contract law and other matters that are at play here. I also offer assurance to members that the bill takes us a significant step forward in respect of the protection of the housing rights of people who are suffering abuse, not least through the existing provision in the bill that allows for the ending of a joint tenancy—crucially, with the landlord’s consent—but also through my commitment to implementing part 2 of the Domestic Abuse (Protection) (Scotland) Act 2021, which will provide that a social tenant who is a victim of abuse can stay in her home and have the perpetrator removed.

Amendment 329, in the name of Katy Clark, would require social landlords, as part of their domestic abuse policies, to consider writing off a tenant’s rent arrears due to domestic abuse. I am pleased to say that the bill already has provisions in sections 44 and 45 for social landlords to

support tenants in that way. Section 45 requires social landlords to have a domestic abuse policy that includes a description of the action that must be taken in relation to the needs of a tenant in those circumstances.

I will support amendment 111, in the name of Meghan Gallacher, on the Scottish social housing charter, as it will bolster the support that we offer to tenants who are suffering from domestic abuse.

Amendment 17, in the name of Maggie Chapman, would oblige ministers to prepare and publish a timetable for implementing the December 2020 report entitled, "Improving housing outcomes for women and children experiencing domestic abuse". I would have liked to accept the amendment, because we are already implementing parts of that report. However, I am afraid that there are parts of the report that I cannot commit to implementing today. For example, one of the provisions is that legal advice should be freely available in the case of someone who is suffering domestic abuse. The Scottish Legal Aid Board already provides legal advice, but the question of whether it is free is determined according to whether the individual can afford to pay. Therefore, although I place great priority on protecting the housing rights of women and children, I cannot accept amendment 17.

Maggie Chapman (North East Scotland) (Green): Will the cabinet secretary take an intervention?

Màiri McAllan: Yes, I will.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Please be brief.

Maggie Chapman: I understand what the cabinet secretary is saying, but given that, as we have discussed in relation to other legislation, including legislation that we passed not even two weeks ago, there is clearly a desire to ensure that people who are victim survivors of domestic abuse and other such crimes get that legal advice for free. It is so important from the point of view of access to justice that they do so outwith their ability to pay.

Màiri McAllan: I understand entirely the point that Maggie Chapman puts to me, but I am afraid that I cannot commit today to putting that into primary legislation, because the functions of the Scottish Legal Aid Board do not currently accord with what is asked of in the report to which I referred.

With time in mind, I will round off my remarks there. I ask members to support my amendments and Meghan Gallacher's amendment 111.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I call Maggie Chapman to speak to amendment 327 and other amendments in the group.

Maggie Chapman: I am grateful for the work that I know the cabinet secretary has done with Scottish Women's Aid. Because of that work, I will not move amendment 327.

I have worked with Scottish Women's Aid on the issue that amendment 17 deals with. The "working group report" that the amendment refers to made a wide range of recommendations that were accepted by the Scottish Government. Some of them have already made their way into the bill; others, as the cabinet secretary has said, are in train. However, the report was wide ranging and made 27 recommendations, and we still have a way to go to see many of those being implemented in full.

There is more work to be done on housing first strategies for victims and survivors, on ensuring that homelessness policies are designed and implemented with a gendered lens, and on improving how homelessness that results from domestic abuse appears in statistics. That is the premise behind my amendment 17. That is why I recommend inserting a simple monitoring process into the bill, whereby we check annually on progress on those recommendations. I believe that that will help to ensure that we stay on track to implement in full those crucial recommendations that the Scottish Government has already accepted.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I call Meghan Gallacher to speak to amendment 111 and the other amendments in the group.

Meghan Gallacher (Central Scotland) (Con): It is good to begin today's housing bill proceedings on a positive note. I thank the previous cabinet secretary, Shirley-Anne Somerville, and Màiri McAllan for their work with me on amendment 111. I hope that it will give additional reassurance to survivors of domestic abuse that we are looking at all legislation to ensure that we are implementing measures that make it easier for people who have experienced, might experience or are currently experiencing domestic abuse.

Amendment 111 will amend section 32 of the Housing (Scotland) Act 2010 to enable Scottish ministers, when setting standards and outcomes in the Scottish social housing charter, to include standards and outcomes relating to the support that social landlords should provide to tenants who are affected by domestic abuse. It also inserts a cross-reference to the definition of "domestic abuse" in the Domestic Abuse Protection (Scotland) Act 2021.

I understand some stakeholders' concerns that work is already set to be undertaken in relation to the social housing charter next year. However, when it comes to issues such as domestic abuse, I believe that, if the opportunity to do so arises

through the bills that we are discussing in Parliament, we should look at ways in which we can strengthen the charter and other pieces of legislation to ensure that we are protecting people who need protection and that survivors of domestic abuse hear the message, loud and clear from across the parties, that we are looking at all pieces of legislation in order to support them.

I will not speak to the rest of the amendments in the group, because they have already been spoken to. I will leave my remarks there.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I call Katy Clark to wind up and to press or withdraw amendment 309.

Katy Clark: The cabinet secretary seems to be saying that amendments 309 to 312 and 329 are not required, because the bill will require that landlords adopt a domestic abuse policy and that the rights set out in the amendments are likely to be included in such policies. Of course, those specific rights might be included, but they also might not be.

The purpose of those amendments is—as, indeed, the purpose of the bill should be—to ensure that those rights are definitely in law and that we are not reliant on individual social landlords up and down Scotland to develop their own policies that might or might not include them.

I very much hope that the amendments will be agreed to today, or that social landlords are listening and that they will ensure that such rights are put into any policies that are developed, because we have to ensure that individual tenants who are subjected to domestic abuse have those protections.

I welcome the fact that the cabinet secretary will come forward with regulations by Christmas to deal with what is in the first part of my amendment 328. She has indicated that she might have concerns about the second part of it and that she plans to come forward with regulations relating to the points that it raises. I would be grateful if I received an assurance from the cabinet secretary that she has the statutory basis for doing that and that the regulations will fully encompass the points that are being raised.

15:30

We need the law and the policy to give the necessary protections to those who stay at home when they are subjected to domestic abuse as well as to those who decide that they have to leave. The cabinet secretary has stated on a number of occasions, including in writing to me, that the Scottish Government's position is that victims should have protections to be able to stay. Equally, we need to ensure that we have the

housing rights in place for situations where victims who have been subjected to domestic abuse feel, for whatever reason, that they have to leave.

That is the scenario that amendment 328 attempts to deal with. It has been drafted to address a gap in the law that has been highlighted by many social landlords, many campaigners on the rights of women who have been subjected to domestic abuse, and those who work in the housing sector. I urge the cabinet secretary to look at the matter again. She has said that she will not be able to support the amendment, but I hope that, in any process, she will ensure that there are no gaps, because that is the issue that is being brought to me and many other members. My concern is that, because of the way in which the bill is drafted, it will not enable us to close all the gaps that clearly exist for women who are in this situation.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: To clarify, are you pressing amendment 309?

Katy Clark: I press my amendment.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 309 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division. As this will be the first division of the stage 3 proceedings today, I suspend the meeting for around five minutes, to allow members to access the digital voting system.

15:31

Meeting suspended.

15:37

On resuming—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: We will proceed with the division on amendment 309, in the name of Katy Clark.

The vote is closed.

The Cabinet Secretary for Health and Social Care (Neil Gray): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I could not connect to the app. I would have voted no.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Gray. I will ensure that that is recorded.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)

Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)

Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 48, Against 58, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 309 disagreed to.

Amendment 310 moved—[Katy Clark].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 310 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

I call Angus Robertson for a point of order.

The Cabinet Secretary for Constitution, External Affairs and Culture (Angus Robertson): I am sorry, Presiding Officer, but I wanted to make a point of order for the previous vote. I would have voted no in the previous vote, but I have taken part in this division.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Robertson. As you have acknowledged, it is too late to record your vote in the previous division, but what you have said is now on the record.

The Minister for Children, Young People and The Promise (Natalie Don-Innes): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I would have voted no.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Ms Don-Innes. I will ensure that that is recorded.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)

FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 48, Against 61, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 310 disagreed to.

Amendment 311 moved—[Katy Clark].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 311 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)

Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)

Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 49, Against 61, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 311 disagreed to.

Amendment 107 moved—[Jeremy Balfour].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 107 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)

Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)

Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 47, Against 61, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 107 disagreed to.

Amendment 312 moved—[Katy Clark].

15:45

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 312 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)

Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)

Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 49, Against 59, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 312 disagreed to.

Amendment 108 not moved.

Amendment 313 moved—[Mark Griffin].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 313 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

Alexander Burnett has a point of order.

Alexander Burnett (Aberdeenshire West) (Con): Apologies, Presiding Officer. I did not mean to make a point of order.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Oliver Mundell has a point of order.

We are unable to hear it, so we will proceed.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Ind)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)

Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)

McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 47, Against 63, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 313 disagreed to.

Amendments 314 and 315 not moved.

Amendment 316 moved—[Meghan Gallacher].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 316 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

Craig Hoy (South Scotland) (Con): On a point of order, Deputy Presiding Officer. Apologies, but my app froze. I would have voted yes.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Hoy. I will ensure that that vote is recorded.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)

Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)

McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 49, Against 60, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 316 disagreed to.

Amendments 317 to 325 not moved.

Amendment 109 moved—[Jeremy Balfour].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 109 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)

Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)

Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 49, Against 60, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 109 disagreed to.

After section 41

Amendment 326 moved—[Màiri McAllan]—and agreed to.

Amendment 110 moved—[Maggie Chapman].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 110 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)

Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 21, Against 89, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 110 disagreed to.

Amendment 236 moved—[Maggie Chapman].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 236 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)

Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)

White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 21, Against 89, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 236 disagreed to.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Group 20 is on rough sleeping. Amendment 237, in the name of Jamie Halcro Johnston, is grouped with amendments 238 and 46.

Jamie Halcro Johnston (Highlands and Islands) (Con): My amendments 237 and 238 emphasise the importance of tackling rough sleeping, as distinct from other forms of homelessness.

Amendment 237 would create a duty on the Scottish Government to work towards ending rough sleeping by the end of the decade and to report on progress by the end of 2027 and again by the end of 2028. Amendment 238 would introduce an additional requirement on the Scottish Government to prepare a specific rough sleeping action plan by the end of next year. The amendments recognise the huge cost to individuals in terms of their mental and physical health, the ability to access services and a whole range of other rough sleeping issues, including the immediacy of the needs of those individuals.

I lodged almost identical amendments at stage 2 but did not press or move them, with the then minister Paul McLennan recognising that, although rough sleeping

“is the least prevalent form of homelessness, it is the most damaging and the most visible.”—[*Official Report, Social Justice and Social Security Committee*, 24 April 2025; c 34.]

I recognise that rough sleepers often have among the most complex range of needs. If anything, however, that emphasises the importance of ensuring that support is accessible. There are many reasons why some rough sleepers refuse help. In many cases, it is because of problems with accommodation, the potential for violence or abuse, inappropriate care, or alcohol or substance misuse. My amendments aim to have those issues addressed, and it is why amendment 238 raises the need for an effective action plan.

Graham Simpson (Central Scotland) (Reform): The amendments deal with the really important issue of rough sleeping. In the previous parliamentary session, I was lucky enough to go with the Local Government and Communities Committee on a visit to Sweden, where we looked

at the housing first model. That had virtually eliminated rough sleeping in Sweden, but I well remember being told that it could not totally eliminate it, because some people choose to rough sleep. It is incredible to think that some people choose to do so, but, in relation to amendment 237, how would Jamie Halcro Johnston address that issue? Of course, amendment 238 calls for an action plan, which is different.

Jamie Halcro Johnston: I welcome Graham Simpson's intervention. That issue has come up in the discussions that I have held with a number of bodies. As I have highlighted, some people refuse help, but many times when help is refused it is because complex needs do not fit in with the support that is available. Housing first was obviously an model that came up again and again as an effective—albeit very costly—way of dealing with that.

Every rough sleeper represents a failure to meet an individual's needs. Most have been failed many times and at many stages in their life by a range of public and other agencies and bodies. What is common to them is how immediate their needs are and the positive benefit of decisive interventions. Often, the stability of housing is only the first step, but it is an essential step in ensuring that other interventions can be effective.

16:00

During stage 2 consideration of the bill, the minister pointed to the ending homelessness together initiative, which has made welcome steps towards co-ordinating policy between the Scottish Government and local authorities. The programme that my amendments propose aims to complement those objectives, particularly the expressed wish to end rough sleeping. Ending homelessness together recognises that the response to Covid-19 resulted in a "dramatic" reduction in the numbers of people sleeping rough, which demonstrates what can be achieved when the will exists within Government to do so.

We all recognise that addressing homelessness will require tackling multiple distinct problems, but that should not be an either/or situation. Nothing done to tackle rough sleeping would prevent the Scottish Government from also addressing wider issues, such as insecure accommodation. It goes without saying that rough sleepers experience the highest level of harm as a result of their homelessness. Sadly, many rough sleepers may not have time to wait for other issues to be resolved.

One area of frustration is the lack of clear statistics on rough sleeping being maintained by the Scottish Government. We are often left to rely

on charity counts, which can fail to fully identify the hidden side of rough sleeping. I therefore welcome Maggie Chapman's amendment 46, which would require a review of data on rough sleeping within two years and the Scottish Government to set out any actions that it plans to take as a result of that review.

Although there is a degree of overlap between our proposals, I believe that we are both trying to achieve the same objectives, which are to improve understanding of rough sleeping and to prompt clear action from the Scottish Government to bring it to an end. I believe that, in creating a clear duty for the Scottish Government to aim towards, my amendment 237 would provide not only accountability but the necessary impetus towards change in the coming years.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I call Maggie Chapman to speak to amendment 46 and other amendments in the group.

Maggie Chapman: My amendment 46 aims to improve the quality of the data on rough sleeping that we gather and have access to. Rough sleeping numbers in Scotland are assessed by asking questions when people make a homelessness application. However, because not everyone sleeping rough will register as homeless, that data needs to be supplemented with real-time information.

In London, organisations supporting people who are sleeping rough collect and submit real-time data, building an accurate picture across the city through a process called the combined homelessness and information network, or CHAIN. The Scottish Government has had some useful recommendations from the measuring impact task and finish group, and my amendment would ensure that those recommendations are considered and that the need to improve the vital data is kept on the agenda.

As Jamie Halcro Johnston has already indicated, my amendment would support and complement the aims of his amendments in this group, and the Greens will support both his amendments. Taken together, the amendments in the group are a clear signal that we must do better by collecting better data on rough sleeping, so that we can better address the issues that arise as a consequence.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: A couple of other members wish to make brief contributions, so I call Jeremy Balfour, to be followed by Graham Simpson.

Jeremy Balfour (Lothian) (Ind): I thank Jamie Halcro Johnston and Maggie Chapman for lodging their amendments. I will be supporting them all, and I hope that the cabinet secretary will take them seriously.

At the moment, the bill lacks any thought about rough sleeping, although we have heard from both members about its importance. I walked from my home to Parliament this morning and went out again at lunch time. The number of people I saw who were still sleeping rough, even during the day, is a shocking indictment of Scotland. We have seen those numbers going up and up, particularly in Edinburgh, and there seems to be no coherent Scottish Government policy.

Very few good things came out of Covid, but one positive was the way that the Scottish Government stepped up to deal with rough sleeping, both in this city and in other parts of Scotland. Reports written then said that people got a gold-standard service, and we saw almost everyone being taken off the streets and given a home or a bed for the night. We can do that if there is the political will to do it, but my fear at the moment is that the political will has gone from this Government.

In a couple of weeks' time in Edinburgh, the winter shelter run by Bethany Christian Trust will open again. That is a welcome service, but it does not run throughout the year, which leaves people still very vulnerable. I hope that the cabinet secretary will accept the amendments in this group and that, collectively, we can deal with an issue that affects so many people's lives.

Graham Simpson: Jeremy Balfour mentioned the situation that we had during Covid. Members who were here in the previous session will well remember that, just around the corner from this Parliament, there was a guy who used to sleep on a bench every single night in all weathers. When Covid came along, he did not sleep on the bench, because we managed to deal with rough sleeping. That shows that, if there is a will, it can be done.

I have had a similar experience to Mr Balfour. On my walking route to work in Edinburgh, I, too, see examples of rough sleeping—people who have clearly bedded down in alleyways or makeshift shelters—and I am seeing that increasingly.

The intent behind all the amendments in the group is something that we should aspire to. As I said earlier, it is probably not possible to completely eliminate rough sleeping, but all that Jamie Halcro Johnston's amendment 237 says is that ministers

"must take reasonable steps to ensure that ... there is no rough sleeping".

It is reasonable, as are the other amendments in the group.

Màiri McAllan: Jamie Halcro Johnston's amendments 237 and 238 seek to address the very important matter of rough sleeping, but

unfortunately they seek to do that via an inflexible and unworkable statutory duty that overlooks key aspects of the problem.

I say from the outset that the Government is already committed to ending all forms of homelessness, including rough sleeping. Our homelessness strategy, which is entitled "Ending Homelessness Together", is informed by experts and, crucially, those with lived experience, including experience of rough sleeping.

I understand why Jamie Halcro Johnston lodged his amendments. I have listened to some other members who have indicated that they intend to support them, but I must ask them to reconsider that, because the amendments are defective. They illustrate how difficult it is to define the concept of rough sleeping. For example, the definition of rough sleeping that is used in the amendments would capture those who were sitting down near a sleeping bag or people who were lying down on a park bench but not sleeping. The definition is therefore defective. It also tries to frame rough sleeping as a one-off event rather than a continuing course of action. Rough sleeping is fraught with indignity and trauma, but it is nonetheless multifaceted, and it is not framed properly by the inflexible statutory obligations in the amendments, so I cannot support them.

Jamie Halcro Johnston: The amendments do none of those things. They would require the Scottish Government, which launched the strategy to end rough sleeping in 2018, to put a timescale on when it will deliver on that. By the end of the decade, it will be more than 12 years since that strategy came in. My amendments would require the Government to come with a timescale to deliver on that. It would not have to exclude some of the other issues around homelessness but could work in a way that was complementary to them.

I am not sure what it is that the Scottish Government finds difficult to deliver here. It is surely not impossible to have an objective to end rough sleeping by the end of the decade.

Màiri McAllan: Absolutely not. As I said, the Government already has a commitment to end homelessness, and to end rough sleeping as part of that, and we report to Parliament annually on our actions in furtherance of that. However, I am afraid that there are fundamental problems with the definitions that are used in the amendments, which make them completely unworkable.

Kevin Stewart: The Government has done a huge amount of work on the ending homelessness together action plan, and I thank all the folk who have been involved in that, including Jon Sparkes, the former chief executive of Crisis.

We all want to end rough sleeping. There are complexities, but members have to recognise that amendments are sometimes not legally possible.

I wish the cabinet secretary all the best. Covid was a bit different. We managed to get everyone off the streets. I hope that we can again have such a concerted effort, but that will take co-operation from local authorities, too.

However, I wonder whether the cabinet secretary could agree to continue to look at data. Elena Whitham and I have been discussing the CHAIN process, which failed in certain places. It may be time to revisit that, not necessarily via an amendment to legislation but through common sense.

Màiri McAllan: I thank Kevin Stewart for his comments and for the considerable experience that he brings to bear. It is also worth pointing out what another part of the bill does in implementing the ask and act duties. That has been hailed by those with experience of homelessness as having the capacity to change lives and as being significant in that regard. As Mr Stewart put it, the amendments are unworkable and I cannot support them.

Mr Stewart also mentioned data, which speaks to Maggie Chapman's amendment 46 on carrying out a review of data on rough sleeping. Local authorities already collect data on the experiences of rough sleeping of households that make a homelessness application. That information is published twice a year by the Scottish Government, and we are already conducting a review of the collection of homelessness data, including data on rough sleeping. For the time being, the amendment would not add anything to that process, and I would be grateful if members supported the continuation of that review.

Maggie Chapman: Will the cabinet secretary take an intervention?

Màiri McAllan: I have finished.

The Presiding Officer (Alison Johnstone): Members will note that we have passed the agreed time limit for the debate on this group of amendments. I exercise my power under rule 9.8.4A(c) to allow the debate to continue beyond that limit, in order to avoid its being unreasonably curtailed.

I call Jamie Halcro Johnston to wind up and to press or withdraw amendment 237.

Jamie Halcro Johnston: Breaches of the legal obligation to provide accommodation are increasing. The number of rough sleepers—those whom we know of—is increasing. Last winter was bad, especially in Glasgow, but there are warnings that this year will be worse. I hope that we all recognise that, until no one is forced to sleep on

our streets or in our parks, not enough is being done.

My amendments do not call for the impossible. They simply seek to place a duty on the next Scottish Government to take reasonable steps to ensure that, by 31 December 2029, there is no rough sleeping in Scotland, and that ministers produce an action plan by the end of next year on how they will achieve that.

I ask all members, in all parties, before they vote on my amendments 237 and 238, what they object to in those amendments. If we are not to vote today to hold the next Government to a deliverable target and a realistic timetable that requires from ministers only a real and steadfast commitment to act, when does the Parliament think that we should end rough sleeping by? If not now, when? For how many more years will so-called compassionate Scotland leave vulnerable people to sleep on our streets?

I press amendment 237.

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 237 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division. Members should cast their votes now.

The vote is closed.

Alasdair Allan (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I could not connect. I would have voted no.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Dr Allan. We will ensure that that is recorded.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)

Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)

Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 47, Against 63, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 237 disagreed to.

Amendment 238 moved—[Jamie Halcro Johnston].

16:15

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 238 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)

Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)

Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 47, Against 63, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 238 disagreed to.

Section 42—Assessment of housing support services

Amendment 239 moved—[Graham Simpson].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 239 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)

Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast

by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 23, Against 86, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 239 disagreed to.

Section 43—Local authorities etc.: consideration of domestic abuse

Amendments 240 and 241 moved—[Màiri McAllan]—and agreed to.

Amendment 327 not moved.

After section 44

Amendment 328 moved—[Katy Clark].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 328 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)

Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)

Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 48, Against 63, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 328 disagreed to.

Section 45—Social landlords: policies about supporting tenants affected by domestic abuse

Amendment 329 moved—[Katy Clark].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 329 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dowe, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)

Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 23, Against 87, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 329 disagreed to.

After section 45

Amendment 111 moved—[Meghan Gallacher]—and agreed to.

Amendment 17 moved—[Maggie Chapman].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 17 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)

Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 44, Against 66, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 17 disagreed to.

Amendment 18 moved—[Maggie Chapman].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 18 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

Neil Bibby (West Scotland) (Lab): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I would have voted yes.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Bibby. We will ensure that that is recorded.

For

Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)

Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 20, Against 91, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 18 disagreed to.

Amendment 332 moved—[Maggie Chapman].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 332 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)

MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 20, Against 91, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 332 disagreed to.

Amendment 330 moved—[Meghan Gallacher].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 330 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

Edward Mountain (Highlands and Islands) (Con): On a point of order, Presiding Officer—

The Presiding Officer: Can I have Edward Mountain's microphone? Thank you.

Edward Mountain: I was worried that I had not put my card in. I am sorry that I was unable to connect. I would have voted yes.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Mountain. We will ensure that that is recorded.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)

Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 48, Against 63, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 330 disagreed to.

Amendment 331 moved—[Mark Griffin].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 331 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)

Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)

Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 46, Against 64, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 331 disagreed to.

16:30

Amendment 335 moved—[Maggie Chapman].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 335 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)

Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Abstentions

Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 7, Against 88, Abstentions 13.

Amendment 335 disagreed to.

Amendment 333 moved—[Maggie Chapman].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 333 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

Craig Hoy: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. Apologies, but my app keeps freezing. I would have voted no.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Hoy. We will ensure that that is recorded.

Jamie Hepburn (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I am afraid that I was unable to vote. I would have voted no.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Hepburn. We will ensure that that is recorded.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Burgess, Arianne (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)

Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)

Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Abstentions

Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 10, Against 85, Abstentions 13.

Amendment 333 disagreed to.

Amendment 334 moved—[Maggie Chapman]—and agreed to.

Amendment 46 moved—[Maggie Chapman].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 46 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)

Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)

Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 46, Against 64, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 46 disagreed to.

Section 46—New pitch fees: considerations

The Presiding Officer: Group 21 is on mobile homes. Amendment 52, in the name of Murdo Fraser, is grouped with amendments 53 to 59.

Murdo Fraser (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con): This is my first contribution to stage 3 consideration of the bill. I remind members of my entry in the register of members' interests, as I own a property in Edinburgh that is subject to a private residential let, although that is not directly relevant to the amendments in the group.

At stage 2, I lodged a number of amendments in relation to the situation of individuals who are resident in park homes. As members might be aware, park homes are a growing sector of the housing market. They are lodges or chalets on residential parks, and they are often popular with retirees or others who are looking to downsize to a smaller, more affordable property.

Despite the growing popularity of park home residences, there have been a number of high-profile cases recently of individuals purchasing park homes and then running into disputes with the site owners. Unlike a traditional bricks-and-

mortar property, park homes, when they are purchased, are treated as mobile structures and therefore no formal conveyance is involved. The park home owner owns the structure of the property but simply leases the land on which it sits.

When I led a members' business debate on the issue earlier in the year, I was struck by the number of colleagues, from across the chamber and representing different parts of Scotland, who had been approached by constituents who were living in park homes and had highlighted the difficulties that they had experienced. It is clear that legislation in the area needs to be thoroughly reviewed and updated. That is a much bigger piece of work.

I have been working with SCOPHRA—the Scottish Confederation of Park Home Residents Associations—to identify areas in which the current bill could be made to improve life for park home residents. One such area was the resolution of disputes. Currently, any disputes between a park home resident and the site owner can be resolved only by going to the sheriff court. That is a lengthy and expensive process, and it is difficult to find solicitors with the relevant expertise in the law, as it is a very specialised area. In addition, as we know, civil legal aid is extremely difficult to obtain, which leaves many residents effectively without a remedy when they run into difficulties.

I lodged an amendment at stage 2 to move consideration of disputes involving park homes from the sheriff court to the First-tier Tribunal for Scotland, to bring those disputes into line with other housing and rental situations. I was pleased to get the Local Government, Housing and Planning Committee's support for that change at stage 2, although at that point the Scottish Government opposed it.

On conclusion of stage 2, the cabinet secretary ran a consultation on the issue. I am pleased that she has now accepted the principle that there should be a shift of park home disputes to the First-tier Tribunal. The amendments in this group essentially tidy up the wording of the Mobile Homes Act 1983 to make it clear that questions or disputes that arise under that act will have to be decided first by the First-tier Tribunal for Scotland.

A consequence of the wording at section 47A of the bill as it stands is to remove the current option of arbitration for dispute resolution. Amendment 58 has the effect of reinstating that option for the parties to resolve a dispute under the Mobile Homes Act 1983 via arbitration. References to the First-tier Tribunal for Scotland will be read as references to the arbitrator where the parties have entered into a written arbitration agreement relating to a question under the 1983 act.

Amendments 52 to 57 make consequential changes to give effect to the change in jurisdiction at section 47A by replacing references to the court with references to the First-tier Tribunal. Amendment 59 moves section 47A before section 46, simply because it fits better at that point.

I put on record my thanks to the cabinet secretary for the positive engagement that I have had with her and her officials on these matters. I also record my thanks in particular to Gordon and Vicki Morrison of SCOPHRA for all the work that they have done in supporting the amendments.

I am pleased to move amendment 52.

Màiri McAllan: The Government is committed to supporting the rights of mobile home residents and to ensuring that they have appropriate access to justice. I welcome Mr Fraser's amendments 52 to 59. Scottish Government officials have sought views from stakeholders and have reviewed existing powers to ensure that we can provide for a range of situations in implementation.

Like Mr Fraser, I thank SCOPHRA for highlighting the issue and for its support in the development of the amendments. Because of all that, I am confident in supporting Mr Fraser's amendments. In particular, I welcome the reinstatement of the option of arbitration for resolving disputes, where that is agreed by both parties.

Murdo Fraser: The only matter that I will raise in winding up is that, clearly, the amendments will put an additional burden on the First-tier Tribunal. I hope that the Scottish Government will consider adequately resourcing it to ensure that we do not have excessive delays in resolving disputes. With that, I will press amendment 52.

Amendment 52 agreed to.

Amendments 53 and 54 moved—[Murdo Fraser]—and agreed to.

Section 47A—Mobile homes: first-tier tribunal

Amendments 55 to 59 moved—[Murdo Fraser]—and agreed to.

After section 47A

The Presiding Officer: Group 22 is on tenement buildings: insurance. Amendment 336, in the name of Paul Sweeney, is the only amendment in the group.

Paul Sweeney (Glasgow) (Lab): [*Inaudible.*]—that structural failure in their tenement building might result in the council's building control officers evacuating them from their homes at a moment's notice. Indeed, for several, that has

already happened, with devastating personal consequences.

It is clear to me that certainly Glasgow and probably other places in Scotland have a ticking time bomb when it comes to tenement maintenance. If we do not get a grip of the issue soon, we will have an even bigger crisis on our hands. In July, a category B listed tenement at the junction of Albert Drive and Kenmure Street in Pollokshields collapsed after five years of sitting derelict since a fire in the roof, leaving residents permanently homeless but, perversely, still paying for a mortgage on a home that no longer exists. Others in neighbouring closes were evacuated by Glasgow City Council building control officers and are still in limbo.

There were several frustrating flaws in existing legislation that led to the evacuation and eventual demolition of that tenement building, but the recurring theme has been a lack of appropriate block insurance among the flat and shop owners and the way in which that block was managed—it was self-factored, as is the case with many other tenements.

That is not an isolated case. Recently, in the Calton, Wendy Murray, one of my constituents, was ordered out by building control officers when her block was deemed dangerous due to a derelict pub on the ground floor suffering a floor collapse. She did what the system asks and declared herself as homeless only to be offered unsuitable temporary accommodation while an absentee owner and unresolved responsibilities stalled the rapid repair of the tenement building. She ended up paying rent and a mortgage while also paying with her health.

16:45

Graham Simpson: What does Paul Sweeney recommend should happen when owners cannot agree on a common insurance policy? I can imagine a case in which one owner comes up with one policy and another owner fancies another. How would he resolve that?

Paul Sweeney: Ultimately, it is similar to having car insurance. Fundamentally, you are obligated to insure the building because it is a critical asset and, as we know, the consequences of not having it are detrimental. There has to be agreement on best value, and the way to resolve disagreements would perhaps be arbitration.

However, first and foremost, getting the fabric repaired is the most important thing, and having common block insurance is critical in that regard. Although the council has powers to clear a building if it is in a dangerous condition, it cannot readily compel or fund repairs that are needed to allow for rehabilitation. Wendy Murray, like too

many others, fell into the gap between our existing tenement law and the reality of managing common repairs to residential buildings that are under shared ownership.

The issue is increasingly predictable, certainly in Glasgow, where around 70,000 tenement flats predate the first world war. When it comes to structural condition, roof stonework enclosures are now reaching life expiry. That issue will not be sorted flat by flat, yet the law too often assumes that each owner can solve a shared risk on their own. When that assumption meets fire, water ingress or structural failure, claims stall, responsibility is disputed and buildings deteriorate while families live in limbo, which significantly detracts their health and wellbeing.

Although we urgently need a new comprehensive tenements act to address those myriad issues, the Housing (Scotland) Bill offers an opportunity to make some immediate reforms that will provide greater security for tenemental living across Scotland.

Amendment 336 does that in a simple and practical way. It simply creates a legal requirement for all owners in a tenement building to establish and have a common single insurance policy that covers the entire building. In the 1970s, when storms exposed widespread disrepair in Glasgow, the city organised large-scale rehabilitation programmes and kept communities intact. What we need is not complicated: clear duties, a functioning owners' framework and rapid access to funds for repairs. A building-wide insurance policy can provide that fundamental underpinning, which would safeguard households and reduce public costs. It is standard elsewhere, so let us make it the standard here.

I move amendment 336.

Màiri McAllan: I understand the reasons behind Mr Sweeney's amendment, and the cases that he has referred to have been on my mind as well, but I am afraid that the amendment is not the simple solution that Mr Sweeney thinks it is.

It is already mandatory for the owners of a tenement building to insure their property. The law currently provides flexibility for that to be done individually, in common or through a mix of both. The law also gives individual owners the right to request evidence from another owner in the tenement of their insurance policy and of recent premium payments. The duty to insure may be enforced by any other owner in the building. I cannot agree to imposing an obligation on owners to arrange for a common insurance policy, given that individual owners are already under a duty to take out cover for their flat, as well as an interest in the common parts of the tenement. I am also concerned about unnecessary costs, which could

be an additional burden on home owners and amount essentially to double insurance.

John Mason (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind): The cabinet secretary has acknowledged that insurance is an issue, but there is a wider issue with tenement maintenance. Graham Simpson and others have led a Scottish parliamentary working group on the subject. Does the cabinet secretary accept that we need to look at tenement maintenance as a whole, including the point about insurance?

Màiri McAllan: I am quite sure that a number of issues have to be looked at, and I know that members have been engaged in that work. Some of the cases that Mr Sweeney referred to indicate why such issues ought to be considered closely.

Amendment 336 will not do the job, but it is worth mentioning to John Mason and others that the Scottish Law Commission is currently consulting on reform of the 2004 act, with a view to making recommendations next year. Ultimately, I ask Mr Sweeney not to move the amendment, but I am sure that members will be interested to see the results of that work.

The Presiding Officer: I call Paul Sweeney to wind up the debate and to press or withdraw amendment 336.

Paul Sweeney: I accept the points that the cabinet secretary has made, but the Government's lack of urgency, hitherto and currently, is unacceptable, given that the inadequacy of existing legislation is causing significant public harm.

I disagree with the cabinet secretary on whether there is a need for the obligation on owners. It is clear to me that atomising things into separate insurance policies for flats is not sufficient and that we need to rationalise the system, with all owners in a tenement building having a clear legal duty to maintain a single common insurance policy that covers the entire building fabric. Having one insurer and one claim for one building is essential. I say that as a consequence of my deep study of the issue as a trustee of Glasgow City Heritage Trust and as someone who has dealt with several complex cases in the city in that regard over the past few years.

I strongly encourage the cabinet secretary to consider the particular issue of insurance, because my proposal would mean that repairs to the common fabric could start quickly, residents could return sooner and the hold-out problem with absentee landlords, invalid policies and missing signatures would no longer block everyone else and lead to a spiral of unintended consequences.

I am sure that members will have heard similar accounts in their constituencies. The situation is

simply unacceptable. The public sector is paying through having to provide homelessness support and having to deal with the health impacts, and communities are paying through empty buildings dragging down streets, often for years. In the case of Pollokshields, that resulted in a building collapsing into the street and people being made homeless.

We can make a change now. I accept that amendment 336 is simply a way of indicating the need for more urgent movement on the issue by the Government. I am afraid that subcontracting the issue to the Law Commission will not be enough alone, because we need to move at a greater pace than the pace at which the Law Commission can deliver. For several years, I have been working with Mr Simpson and others on the working group on tenement maintenance, and we are disappointed and frustrated that the Government is not moving more quickly. Residents in Pollokshields, Calton and Dennistoun, as well as those elsewhere in Glasgow, need greater security and greater reassurance from the Government that it will deal with the issue sooner rather than later.

I ask members to back amendment 336, which I press.

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 336 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

Kenneth Gibson (Cunninghame North) (SNP): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I would have voted no.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Gibson. We will ensure that that is recorded.

For

Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)

Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)

Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 22, Against 87, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 336 disagreed to.

After section 47B

Amendment 337 moved—[Ariane Burgess].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 337 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Lennan, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)

Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)

Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 23, Against 85, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 337 disagreed to.

Amendment 338 moved—[Paul Sweeney].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 338 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)

White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)

Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 46, Against 63, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 338 disagreed to.

Before section 47C

The Presiding Officer: Group 23 is on property factors. Amendment 339, in the name of Mark Griffin, is grouped with amendments 19, 340 to 347, 20, 243, 48 and 49.

Mark Griffin: It is no secret that property factoring in Scotland has been a source of real frustration for home owners for a number of years, particularly for home owners who live in new-build housing estates with ground maintenance contracts. Members need look no further than—
[*Interruption.*]

The Presiding Officer: Will members who are leaving the chamber please do so quietly?

Mark Griffin: The members who are still in the chamber probably do not need to look much further than their own inboxes for complaints from their constituents about factoring arrangements. Constituents contact me regularly about unfair charges, poor communication and a lack of accountability from their factors.

The issue is not new. The Property Factors (Scotland) Act 2011 was a step forward, but it is clear that it has not addressed the concerns of our constituents about the accountability of their factors. Despite earlier promises from the Government to introduce a code of conduct for land maintenance companies, progress has stalled. The reality is that, for more than a decade, home owners have been left to deal with expensive and often opaque factoring arrangements, while meaningful reform has been delayed repeatedly.

That is why I, along with colleagues from across the chamber, have laid a package of amendments to the bill with the simple aim of giving home owners a fairer deal and a stronger voice in how their homes and shared spaces are managed. I acknowledge the efforts of members from all parties who have championed the rights of home owners to remove unsatisfactory factors more easily, and I also welcome the Government's willingness to improve the system.

Labour's amendments in this group would allow groups of home owners to work together more easily to take action against factors who are not living up to their roles and responsibilities by putting the onus on the factors to set up and arrange meetings and by ensuring that home

owners can more easily take action against them by facilitating the annual meeting of home owners.

17:00

I have also stipulated that factors must produce information that allows home owners to defend their rights more easily before the First-tier Tribunal for Scotland. I note that several of my colleagues, and the Government, have amendments that touch on that. I acknowledge the work of colleagues across the parties—Ariane Burgess, Maggie Chapman, Graham Simpson, Sarah Boyack and Pam Duncan-Glancy, as well as the Government—and I urge members to support the amendments in this group in their entirety.

The proposals in my amendments focus on transparency, accountability and home owner empowerment. Factors would be required to share their written statement of services and to publish clear and accessible information about service costs, both current and historic. If a factor plans to transfer their contract to another company, home owners must be notified in advance. Those seem to me to be basic standards that any fair contract should meet. We should never have a situation where the first time that a home owner realises that their factor has changed is when they receive a bill from the new factor without any notice whatsoever.

I also seek to add a purpose section to the 2011 act, making it clear that its role is to set out the rights and responsibilities of both factors and residents. That will help to guide interpretation and enforcement of the law.

I am calling for the maximum compensation that the tribunal can award to be raised to £10,000, providing a meaningful response to factors who flout the law that applies to them and reflecting the time and effort that home owners invest in pursuing such complaints. That provision would allow for further future increases by regulation. Additionally, any major expenditure over £10,000 that is not already covered by the deed of condition should require approval from the residents forum. That ensures that home owners have oversight of significant spending decisions.

Finally, I support further amendments in the group that strengthen transparency and enforcement throughout the legislation.

I will now briefly cover three amendments in the name of Sarah Boyack—as she is not available to be in the chamber today—starting with amendments 344 and 345. Amendment 344 creates a clear duty on factors to provide relevant information to home owners on request, or where a case is live before the First-tier Tribunal. It defines “relevant information”, it requires the

tribunal to issue a disclosure direction unless a request is unreasonable or off point, and it ties non-compliance to ministerial enforcement. That relates to transparency that shortens disputes by getting documents, invoices, contracts and decisions up front, with reduced hearings, costs and frustration for everyone. I encourage members to support amendments 344 and 345.

Amendment 346, in Sarah Boyack's name, is on owners associations. It recognises owners associations under the development management scheme, so that home owners can act collectively in dealing with factors and, where needed, at the First-tier Tribunal.

Graham Simpson: In relation to amendment 346, which deals with owners associations, we have already heard that the Scottish Law Commission is doing a piece of work specifically on compulsory owners associations for tenements. I know that the member is speaking for Sarah Boyack in this case, but would he accept my point, which is that we really ought to let the Law Commission complete its work? I know that it is slow and that it has been very frustrating, but I think that the commission needs to complete that detailed piece of work and report back to Parliament. It will be for the Parliament in the next session, whatever its make-up, to deal with the important issues that the commission reflects on.

Mark Griffin: The issue is wider than that: it goes beyond tenement maintenance.

Grounds maintenance issues are affecting new-build estates right across the country. Mandatory owners associations would enable people to come together to challenge the occasional poor practice and lack of transparency and, more crucially, would provide a forum to allow home owners to change factor if they so desired.

Although the work that the Scottish Law Commission is doing is clearly valuable, given that it applies purely to tenements and does not give coverage of grounds maintenance contracts that affect new-build estates across the country, it is still worth our considering this valuable amendment and compulsory home owners forums, organisations or whatever we want to call them, to give people the ability to come together annually to consider the performance of their factor. I ask members to support all amendments in the group.

I move amendment 339.

Maggie Chapman: Many members in the chamber will have been asked to help constituents who are experiencing difficulties with property factors. Some property factors provide really good services to owners, but many—too many—do not. Since the Property Factors (Scotland) Act 2011 came into force, the number of complaints has

grown, starting at 26 a year and reaching a record high of 338 in 2023. Some owners of factored properties complain that much-needed repairs are not done or are delayed, that they are carried out to a poor standard or that they are overcharged for.

Approximately 710,000 Scottish properties—about a quarter of all homes—are managed by almost 400 property factors and letting companies. Those figures will only grow as we build much-needed new blocks and estates.

When owners want to change factors, it can be very difficult, as Mark Griffin has already outlined, given the high thresholds that need to be reached. In larger developments, perhaps with many absentee owners, it can be especially difficult, which means that factors lack the incentive to improve, and owners are stuck with poor service. We do not tolerate that in other markets. It used to be much harder to switch energy providers, for instance, but energy customers can now switch much more easily if they are paying too much or not getting a good service. We should do the same with property factors.

At the moment, it is complicated to dismiss or appoint a factor, with different thresholds applying to different developments. My amendment 20 would address that by requiring only a simple majority vote. Previous legislation has already lowered the threshold for some properties, so my amendment is not at all unprecedented.

Amendment 19 would provide a simple process for requesting that a factor is removed from the register. Owners would send a request to the Scottish Government, saying that their factor is failing and falling short of its obligations. Ministers would be under a duty to consider such requests and to either remove the factor from or retain them on the factor register, giving reasons why. Information on the number of factors removed or retained, and the reasons why, would be published, which would improve transparency and strengthen the hand of owners against poor factors.

Citizens Advice Scotland supports changes in the factoring system. It has said:

"The kind of reforms and legislation within the Act of 2011 don't really hold factors to account as much as they probably should. There's an urgent need for greater transparency and awareness to ensure home owners understand their rights and can effectively challenge unfair factoring practices."

Some owners and tenants have waited far too long for improvements in the factoring industry. I welcome the other amendments in the group, and I thank Mark Griffin and members of his group for their engagement on the issue. The amendments, taken together with mine, would improve the

service that residents need. I urge members to support my amendments in the group.

Pam Duncan-Glancy (Glasgow) (Lab): Amendment 341 provides that,

“Unless otherwise stated in the title deeds, a change of property factor may be approved by a majority ... of home owners present at a residents’ forum meeting.”

It would mean that any decision to change a property factor would be considered binding on all home owners.

Under section 28 of the Title Conditions (Scotland) Act 2003, a factor can be dismissed if more than half the owners agree. The difficulty with that is that some owners may be less engaged than others or unresponsive when residents reach out to discuss concerns regarding their existing property factor. Amendment 341 would address that and take a more collective approach, empowering residents to resolve concerns about factors.

Graham Simpson: Pam Duncan-Glancy has launched a really interesting amendment, but, unless the title deeds state otherwise, it could allow a situation in which very few people—for example, six out of 200—actually turn up to a residents meeting but, according to her amendment, a majority, which in this case would be four, could vote to change the factor. I am sure that Pam Duncan-Glancy does not want that sort of situation, so does she accept that that would be a bit ludicrous?

Pam Duncan-Glancy: I think some of the figures that Mr Simpson uses are probably quite extreme, but I understand the point he is trying to make.

The alternative is that home owners find themselves at a complete impasse because they cannot mobilise enough members to do anything at all about a factor that they consider not to be meeting the standards that they would expect. Amendment 341 would enable decisions to be taken far more conveniently and, in some cases, more quickly, empowering residents to move things on and to act in the interests of a building and of those who live there.

Residents and home owners associations are well-known mechanisms allowing residents to come together. Those associations often have the backing of many, if not most, residents in a building, but attendance and membership are not always as they should be. My amendment would address part of that problem and would allow things to progress where they might come unstuck.

We all know from our casework that there are serious issues with the dismissal of property factors and that that complexity has been

recognised through previous action. The amendments in this group in the names of Mark Griffin and others are essential to addressing some of those concerns.

The amendments in Mark Griffin's name, on grounds maintenance, would address the concerns of constituents at Newton Farm in Cambuslang, who have said that they are having direct experience of a complex situation that was raised with the Parliament's Justice Committee as far back as 2013. The Government concluded that legislation was not needed to improve their circumstances and said that it would simply update the voluntary code of conduct. However, in the years since, that update has still not been carried out and it is now clear that there is a case for legislation to address the issue. The residents have no mechanism by which to hold their factor to account and question whether the factor is acting in accordance with the law or with the voluntary code of conduct.

The amendments in this group would all serve to resolve such situations. On that basis, I support all the amendments in the group and I intend to move amendment 341.

The Presiding Officer: I call the cabinet secretary to speak to amendment 243 and other amendments in the group.

Màiri McAllan: We recognise that home owners face difficulties in the property factoring system. At stage 2, the Cabinet Secretary for Social Justice committed to a review of that regime and I intend to honour that with greater urgency than has been brought to the situation that Pam Duncan-Glancy spoke of. That review will seek input from stakeholders across the system, including homeowners and factors, and will consider compliance with the code of conduct, how well its requirements are understood and the work that we must do to assess whether a person is fit and proper.

It should be possible to address most of the issues raised by the amendments in this group by preparing an updated code of conduct for property factors, which will set out minimum standards of practice for registered property factors. Any updated code would, of course, be laid before Parliament, so members can be assured that they would be able to explore what is proposed for the system.

Pam Duncan-Glancy: Can the cabinet secretary set out when that work on the code will be done?

Màiri McAllan: A number of pieces of work will flow from the bill. I will have to take forward regulations in respect of Awaab's law and in respect of the Domestic Abuse (Protection) (Scotland) Act 2021. I will not put a timescale on

that action in particular, but I undertake to update Ms Duncan-Glancy and other members as soon as I have a timetable for that, because I understand how important the issue is for members and for their constituents who have raised concerns.

I turn to Mr Griffin's amendments 343 and 347. I appreciate the intent behind the amendments, but I invite him not to press them, as the proposed changes would be better considered as part of the review. They could be implemented if, after consultation, they are considered helpful.

17:15

Amendment 339, which is also in Mr Griffin's name, seeks to insert a purpose clause into the Property Factors (Scotland) Act 2011. The amendment is absolutely well intentioned, but the clause is not essential—nor, arguably, would it be helpful. The purpose of the 2011 act is already clear from the provisions and the explanatory notes, and its legal framework is based on the relationship between property factors and home owners. Tenants do not have a contractual relationship with a property factor, so I fear that including them in a purpose clause could cause confusion.

I was pleased to lodge amendment 243. Similar provisions were previously proposed by Ariane Burgess and Maggie Chapman. The amendment will make it easier for owners of related properties to dismiss a property manager and appoint someone else, which a number of members have said is important. The changes that I propose will mean that a simple majority of the owners, as opposed to two thirds, will be able to remove the manager, regardless of whether the title deeds provide for a higher voting threshold. I am grateful to Ariane Burgess and Maggie Chapman for their suggestions. Maggie Chapman's amendment 20 and her consequential amendment 49 ultimately seek to address the same matter but without the correct framing, which I have sought to provide in my amendment.

Mark Griffin's amendment 340 would require a property factor to arrange and attend two resident forum meetings per year, with notice being given by recorded delivery, hybrid access and so on. I do not think that such detail is suited to the rigidity of primary legislation. It would be more appropriately addressed in the code of conduct for property factors, which I have committed to Parliament will be updated in a timely manner.

As I noted, my amendment 243 will allow a simple majority of home owners to remove a manager of related properties. Ms Duncan-Glancy's amendment 341 seeks to achieve a similar outcome. The changes would apply if a

decision was taken at a residents forum meeting, but only in relation to home owners who had a deed of conditions or contract with the property factor. It would therefore have a more limited application than what I propose, and it is probably less clear how it would apply in practice. I ask Ms Duncan-Glancy to support what the Government is proposing in relation to positions on voting.

Mark Griffin's amendment 342 would require property factors to seek formal home owner approval for works costing £10,000 that were not specified in the title deeds, and it includes some other details. Again, those things would be more appropriately addressed through the code of conduct for property factors, which can be updated when need be. That is the benefit of having things in the code rather than in primary legislation.

Maggie Chapman's amendment 19 and her consequential amendment 48 seek to introduce a new process by which home owners may refer the property factor's fitness for registration to the Scottish ministers. However, it is not the ministers' role to determine who may operate as a property factor. Whether a manager is authorised to act is ultimately a matter for home owners. I note again that my amendment 243 seeks to further empower home owners.

Ms Boyack's amendments 344 and 345 would require property factors to provide home owners and the First-tier Tribunal with certain documents, including documents relating to the interests, rights and obligations of home owners, and would make failure to do so a criminal offence. However, the code of conduct for property factors already requires disclosure, and the tribunal already has powers to enforce compliance, so I cannot support those amendments.

Amendment 346 seeks to allow owners associations to bring complaints to the tribunal. Ms Boyack has put that proposal to the Government on a number of occasions and we have looked into it. Although I appreciate the intent, the tribunal already routinely groups related applications under existing regulations. That is standard practice. I have some notes on how often that has been done. In 2022, nearly two thirds of the 254 applications were grouped. Ultimately, I think that, if Ms Boyack was here, she would note that that is already routinely done.

For those reasons, I ask members to support my amendment 243 and to either not press or not support the other amendments in the group.

Graham Simpson: This group of amendments is important. It deals with issues that most members will have come across, I imagine: difficulties with changing property factors and removing substandard property factors, albeit that those are a very small minority of the sector.

I am pleased to have heard from the cabinet secretary that she wants to update the code of conduct. My question is, how enforceable is that? She can intervene to tell me. What powers would there be under that code of conduct to get important matters changed?

I see that she does not seek to intervene, so I will just have to guess on that front. However, it is encouraging that there will be an updated code of conduct—that she is going to conduct a review—so I can happily support amendment 243. That said, the issues that have been raised by other members are equally serious and should be considered seriously. Making it easier to change a property factor is very important, so the action that has been called for should be taken.

Unfortunately—and it is a rare event for me—I am not persuaded by Pam Duncan-Glancy's amendment 341. I apologise for that, but I can probably support most of the other amendments in the group.

The Presiding Officer: I call Mark Griffin to wind up and to press or withdraw amendment 339.

Mark Griffin: A well-known phrase is that nothing is certain in life apart from death and taxes. Somebody from a new-build housing estate told me that it should be updated to say that nothing is certain in life apart from death, taxes and factor fees, given the frustration that a lot of people have with that quarterly bill over which they genuinely feel they have no control. It is the one area of their life in which they do not have a choice. They have no choice as to who supplies their factoring service, nor when it comes to a complaint about the quality of that service or the ability to remove that service provider. There is a real frustration among home owners about the system of factoring as it operates at the moment. I am encouraged to hear from the cabinet secretary that the Government will consult on and introduce a code of conduct. For home owners who are currently frustrated, it is critical that that work is done at pace. I look forward to seeing the detail of the code come before the Parliament.

I also welcome amendment 243, in the name of the cabinet secretary, which clarifies that a simple majority can be used to remove a factor that is not performing. I imagine that all of us have had concerns and complaints in our inboxes about the performance of factors. Many residents say that, often, when they complain to the factor itself, the factor knows that it is so difficult to remove it from its position that it can essentially dismiss any complaint out of hand. We need to move away from a system in which the minority of factors that do not do the job that they are supposed to do, and dismiss such complaints, can carry on doing so.

I take on board the points that the cabinet secretary has made about the technical aspects of my amendment 339. I look forward to the work that the Government plans to do on bringing forward the code of conduct. I seek permission to withdraw amendment 339.

Amendment 339, by agreement, withdrawn.

The Presiding Officer: Members will note that we will shortly reach the next time limit and that we still have a further group to debate. As a consequence, under rule 9.8.5A of standing orders, I am minded to accept a motion without notice to propose that the time limit be extended by 30 minutes. I invite the Minister for Parliamentary Business and Veterans to move such a motion.

Motion moved,

That, under Rule 9.8.5A the eighth time-limit be moved by up to 30 minutes.—[Graeme Dey]

Motion agreed to.

After section 47E

Amendment 19 moved—[Maggie Chapman].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 19 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)

Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)

Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 20, Against 88, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 19 disagreed to.

After section 47G

Amendment 340 not moved.

Amendment 341 moved—[Pam Duncan-Glancy].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 341 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)

Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast

by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 22, Against 85, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 341 disagreed to.

Amendment 342 moved—[Mark Griffin].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 342 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)

Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 46, Against 61, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 342 disagreed to.

17:30

Amendment 343 moved—[Mark Griffin].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 343 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)

Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 47, Against 60, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 343 disagreed to.

Section 47H—Monitoring of compliance

Amendments 344 and 345 not moved.

After section 47H

Amendment 346 not moved.

Amendment 347 moved—[Mark Griffin].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 347 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)

Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 47, Against 61, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 347 disagreed to.

Amendment 20 moved—[Maggie Chapman].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 20 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)

Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)

Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 20, Against 87, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 20 disagreed to.

Amendment 243 moved—[Màiri McAllan].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 243 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

The Cabinet Secretary for Finance and Local Government (Shona Robison): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I could not connect. I would have voted yes.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Ms Robison. We will ensure that that is recorded.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)

Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)

Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 82, Against 27, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 243 agreed to.

Amendment 348 moved—[Richard Leonard].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 348 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

Tess White (North East Scotland) (Con): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I would have voted no.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Ms White. We will ensure that your vote is recorded.

Russell Findlay (West Scotland) (Con): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I had a problem with the app. I would have voted no.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Findlay. We will ensure that that is recorded.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)

Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)

McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 24, Against 85, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 348 disagreed to.

Amendment 349 moved—[Richard Leonard].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 349 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

Natalie Don-Innes: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I would have voted no.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Ms Don-Innes. We will ensure that that is recorded.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)

Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)

Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 24, Against 84, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 349 disagreed to.

Amendment 350 moved—[Richard Leonard].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 350 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)

Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 24, Against 85, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 350 disagreed to.

The Presiding Officer: At this point, we will have a comfort break. I ask members to be back in the chamber at 17:57 sharp.

17:41

Meeting suspended.

17:57

On resuming—

After section 51

The Deputy Presiding Officer (Liam McArthur): We turn to group 24, on housing availability. Amendment 112, in the name of Ariane Burgess, is grouped with amendments 366, 255, 256, 21, 367, 260, 261, 387 and 51.

Ariane Burgess (Highlands and Islands) (Green): For two decades, politicians have told the co-housing sector that they support the model, yet no significant progress has been made.

Amendment 112 would require the Scottish Government to produce guidance on co-housing. Specifically, it would give ministers the option of developing definitions that outline how the model could develop and how the public sector should support co-housing. I wish to underline that the amendment includes no obligation on what must be included in the guidance. The only obligations are that the guidance must be published within two years and drafted in collaboration with relevant stakeholders, which would provide ministers with plenty of flexibility.

The Scottish Government must be active in facilitating the co-housing model. The current pace of change has been too slow and has threatened to kill off the model before it can get started. That is despite the Government's policy aim to increase

co-housing in Scotland and the significant amount of support for the model from engaged and passionate communities that wish to build homes that suit their needs.

We need better understanding and support for co-housing in the public sector. We need to understand that, under the model, everyone has their own home and that, together, they share some common facilities, such as a laundry facility, common room or workshop. Such facilities build a sense of community and a culture of looking out for one another rather than after one another.

18:00

Co-housing projects struggle to access public funding at all levels, which leaves them stranded at the planning stage. They also get bounced between councils and public bodies that do not know what to do with them. That means that the wide variety of public good that the model offers is being lost.

One specific public good relates to the prevention agenda. Co-housing is known for resulting in people becoming immersed in an experience of wellbeing, and it can lead to a sense of community that removes the isolation that many people experience. Some co-housing is intergenerational, with younger people engaging with older people, which we desperately need in our society today.

A fully functioning co-housing sector would deliver significant cost benefits. We cannot continue to make promises that are not kept, particularly when taking action would be of significant benefit to communities and those with specific housing needs. That is why it is crucial that the provisions that amendment 112 would insert are added to the bill.

I move amendment 112.

Mark Griffin: The amendments in my name in this group relate to the declaration of a housing emergency. I acknowledge that the Government has now accepted the principle of my amendments that were agreed to at stage 2 and has provided me with technical changes to address some of the finer details. It is important that we get this right, so I welcome the Government's willingness to work constructively to ensure that the bill is robust. I look forward to seeing how ministers will now put the provisions into practice and demonstrate leadership in tackling Scotland's housing emergency.

I have been raising concerns about the growing housing crisis for years—long before the Parliament and the Government formally recognised the housing emergency. The declaration, when it was finally made, was a

necessary first step, but the obvious next step is action. What matters is what happens next.

Despite the volume of amendments to the bill and the scrutiny that it has received, there remains a glaring absence of measures that will increase the supply of homes for the hundreds of thousands of people in need. The intention of my amendments has always been to ensure that future Governments cannot simply sidestep responsibility for addressing the scale of homelessness and housing need in Scotland.

The declaration of a housing emergency must be more than a headline; it must come with a duty to act and to be held accountable for delivering real change. The housing emergency cannot be brushed aside when the news cycle moves on. It is a daily reality for thousands of families and children, who deserve better. That is why it is so important that the bill now places responsibility for action squarely on the Government of the day.

I am pleased that the Local Government, Housing and Planning Committee supported that approach, and I ask the Parliament to agree to the technical changes to the amendments that were agreed to at stage 2. Let us ensure that any Government that is faced with a housing emergency is required to set out clearly what it will do to end it and is judged on its actions, not just its words.

Maggie Chapman: We have heard criticisms that the bill does not do enough to increase the supply of homes. In many ways, I agree. My amendments 21, 255 and 256, along with the associated consequential amendments, seek to address that.

The Scottish vacant and derelict land survey in 2023 showed that there were more than 9,000 hectares of derelict and vacant land in Scotland. That is the size of about 18,000 football pitches. Roughly two thirds of vacant and derelict land, if it is eventually brought into use, is used for residential housing.

We also have many houses that are not in use, such as the 31,596 homes that have been empty for more than a year. We have a housing crisis. People are living in unsuitable accommodation. Local authorities are suspending social housing allocations as that housing is needed for temporary accommodation. However, we also have 32,000 homes that could be rented or sold for people to live in now. That has to change, and my amendments seek to do that.

Amendment 256 would empower local authorities to order a property or land that has been left vacant for a specified period to be sold for housing or to be rented. It would also empower communities to tackle the blight of empty homes

and derelict land as community groups could apply to the local authority for such an order.

Compulsory sale and lease orders are not a new idea. England's empty dwelling management orders, which allow privately owned properties to be managed by local authorities, have been in place for about 20 years. The Scottish Land Commission published proposals in 2018 and the Scottish Government has been slow to act on them.

The manifesto on which the SNP was elected in 2021 says:

"We will strengthen compulsory purchase powers for local authorities and introduce new compulsory sale orders."

There are only eight months to go before the next election and, other than the bill, there is still no legislation on the books. If it is not going to happen in this bill, it will not happen within the current parliamentary session. The least that the Scottish Government could do in acknowledging that delay would be to agree the general principle of compulsory sale and lease orders now, and support amendments 255 and 256. It could then use amendment 255 to review the compulsory purchase system, consult and then, if needed, introduce secondary legislation early in the next parliamentary session under the powers that would be provided by amendment 256.

Introducing a whole new bill would add more delay; it would also not be needed. The English empty dwelling management orders did not need a stand-alone bill, because the powers were introduced in a general housing bill, just like the one that we have in front of us tonight.

As we contemplate further delay, England is forging ahead. The UK Government backs reducing the threshold for EDMOs to six months, which Westminster City Council says would help to bring 11,000 homes into use. As with the 12-month ban on evictions being introduced south of the border, Scotland risks falling behind.

I am grateful that Shelter Scotland has supported my amendments. I am not shying away from the fact that this is a technically and legally complicated area, which is why I have left parts of it to secondary legislation. However, given the need to boost housing supply, which all members agree is crucial, we should be using the bill to send a clear signal that we will no longer tolerate houses being left empty when people are homeless.

Màiri McAllan: I will begin with amendment 112, in the name of Ariane Burgess that requires ministers to publish guidance on co-housing. The amendment is identical to an amendment that she lodged at stage 2 that was not pressed at the time on the basis that we do not need a statutory

obligation to publish such guidance. Ministers can publish guidance on the issue without a statutory duty to do so. There was agreement at stage 2 that the Government would do just that, and I reconfirm that commitment today.

There are also a number of amendments in the name of Maggie Chapman in this group, relating to compulsory sale and lease powers. On amendment 255, I am pleased to confirm to Ms Chapman that we published a consultation on 19 September on exactly that point, and that ultimately makes amendment 255 obsolete. Its provisions have been fulfilled, so I ask her not to move amendment 255.

Amendment 256 seeks to commit ministers to introduce legislation within specific timeframes to give local authorities the power to require the owners of derelict land and buildings to offer for sale or rent such land or buildings for use as residential housing. That is essentially compulsory sale or lease. I support exploring those tools and how they can help us to respond to the housing emergency, but it would be premature to commit to legislating for such powers while we await the results of the consultation that is under way.

With those issues in mind, and taking into account the work that has been started, I ask Maggie Chapman not to move her amendments.

Maggie Chapman: I understand that the cabinet secretary is saying that the consultation is happening and that the amendments would, therefore, be premature. Surely, however, giving ministers powers to act in the event that the consultation leads down a particular path to require action would speed up the process in the future, which would mean that we do not have to wait for yet more primary legislation.

Amendment 256 would introduce an enabling power—it does not require you to do something. You could use the powers in amendment 256, depending on what the consultation that you have launched says.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Always speak through the chair.

Màiri McAllan: I absolutely take the point, but I am confident and comfortable that, whatever the results of the consultation, which has just opened and is currently on-going, the Government will be able to find the appropriate legislative vehicle to implement whatever, from among its results, we decide is necessary. It would be inappropriate to pre-empt that.

Amendment 21, and consequential amendment 51, would go a step further than amendment 256 and introduce a power for local authorities to order the compulsory sale or lease of property that has been vacant or derelict for a specific period. That

is identical to an amendment that was lodged at stage 2.

I reassure Maggie Chapman and the Parliament that we are committing to doing all that we can to support the best use of land and property in Scotland, and I absolutely believe that it should be used to provide high-quality housing. I am mindful of the potential usefulness of the measures in the amendment—indeed, that is why, as I said, we have delivered on the commitment that we made to consult by including various questions on both compulsory sale and lease orders in the consultation that was published on 19 September. Until we have the results of that consultation, however, the amendments would be premature.

I turn to Mr Griffin's amendments 366, 367 and 387. I have met Mr Griffin on a number of occasions, and we have agreed that tackling the housing emergency is of the utmost importance and that we must use the opportunity that the bill affords us to drive the agenda forward. I note that the members should be cognisant that, on 2 September, the Government published "Tackling Scotland's Housing Emergency: Housing Emergency Action Plan", which will help us to deliver around 8,000 affordable homes this year and 36,000 over the coming four years.

That aside, I am grateful that Mr Griffin agreed to make amendments to section 51F to ensure that the provision is as impactful as possible in tackling the housing emergency. I therefore ask members to support his amendments 366, 367 and 387 and oppose the other amendments in the group.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I call Graham Simpson for a brief contribution.

Graham Simpson: It will be brief, Presiding Officer—I just want to speak briefly about the amendments from Maggie Chapman about compulsory sale orders. The subject has been a frustration for many of us in the Parliament over many years—I think that the commitment from the SNP dates back to 2018; it might have been from even earlier than that. The SNP committed to legislate on the issue, and that was backed by parties on all sides of the chamber, but nothing has happened.

I hear that there is going to be a consultation—that is often Governmentspeak for kicking the can down the road. However, I hope that that is not the case here, and that the consultation will actually lead to action. We have too many properties sitting empty in Scotland, so it has to lead to something.

Màiri McAllan: The consultation is on-going. It is not to be started—it has started.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I invite Ariane Burgess to wind up and say whether she wishes to press or withdraw amendment 112.

Ariane Burgess: Other European nations already support co-housing—Denmark, for example, has embedded the model in its housing culture. Amendment 112 would bring forward a relatively small amount of work that could deliver a real difference, and I urge members to back it.

I brought the amendment back at stage 3, in part because of the change of cabinet secretary between stage 2 and stage 3, and in part following my discussions with stakeholders, who expressed frustration about the lack of action, which has led to mistrust. Support for a Scottish model of co-housing could unlock a powerful form of housing in Scotland.

Scottish Greens will also be supporting the amendments from Mark Griffin.

I press amendment 112.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 112 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)

Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)

White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 28, Against 76, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 112 disagreed to.

Amendment 244 moved—[Jamie Halcro Johnston].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 244 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division. Members should cast their votes now.

The vote is closed.

Tim Eagle (Highlands and Islands) (Con): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app would not connect. I would have voted no.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Eagle. I will ensure that that is recorded.

Kenneth Gibson: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I could not vote. I would have voted no.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Gibson. I will ensure that that is recorded.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)

Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)

Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 38, Against 70, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 244 disagreed to.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Group 25 is on accessibility of housing. Amendment 351, in the name of Pam Duncan-Glancy, is grouped with amendments 352, 368 and 369.

Pam Duncan-Glancy: Amendment 351 would require the Scottish ministers, no later than two years after the proposed new section comes into force, to publish an accessible homes standard. The Government said in “Housing to 2040” that it would develop and publish a new accessible homes standard for all new homes. The standard has not yet been updated, and it has not been updated in more than 20 years. The Government said that the standard would be implemented through changes to building standards, but it has delayed the introduction of that.

At stage 2, the Government said that it could not support a similarly drafted amendment, because it would be premature to do that in advance of consideration of responses to its consultation, which was carried out in 2023. However, for the 30,000 people across the country who are on waiting lists because they are disabled and need accessible housing, and who are stuck in their own homes, that action is not premature—it is far too late. In Glasgow alone, there are currently nearly 5,000 people on the waiting list for a ground-floor property or accessible accommodation. As there are more than 60 housing associations in Glasgow, I suspect that that number will be higher.

Disabled people and their representative organisations were actively consulted during the development of the housing to 2040 strategy, and they now—rightly—want to see change. More importantly, they need to see change. We cannot continue indefinitely without clarity on standards for new builds—standards that will ensure that we do not build more inaccessible homes but, instead, get it right for our population. The people who need accessible homes deserve such action.

That is why I lodged amendment 351. Since I lodged it, the cabinet secretary has reached out to confirm that she supports its intention and the urgency that it pushes for, but that she is unable to support it because of two technical issues. First,

the amendment's use of the Building Safety Act 2022 definition of “new build home” would mean that the standards would apply only at the point of ownership and not during construction, which is clearly not my intention. Secondly, the amendment lacks a link to an enforcement mechanism, such as the Scottish building standards system.

Since the cabinet secretary drew those points to my attention, we have worked together closely to develop a manuscript amendment that would have addressed those issues and provided an amendment that the cabinet secretary and Parliament could have supported and that would have delivered the intention that I set out in amendment 351. However, the manuscript amendment was not accepted, so I am not able to move it.

In a spirit of collaboration—I thank the cabinet secretary for her collaboration after those anomalies were pointed out—I am pleased that it is the Government's intention to set out this evening in Parliament the action that will be taken to deliver what the revised amendment would have delivered, and to review the building standards within two years of the bill receiving royal assent. That is welcome news, and I look forward to the cabinet secretary confirming that when she speaks on this group.

Accessible and adaptable homes enable people to thrive at every stage of their life. They reduce pressure on health and social care systems, empower older and disabled people to live with autonomy, and support working families by removing daily barriers to wellbeing. It is time that action on the issue is taken, and I am pleased that we should receive commitments to that effect this evening.

I lodged amendment 352 because we know that not everyone lives in a new home. Indeed, the majority of older and disabled people live in general needs housing that was never designed to meet changing needs. That situation puts increasing pressure on Scotland's housing, health and social care systems. Housing adaptations are a vital part of the solution. They are often the difference between staying at home and being forced into crisis.

However, despite decades of research and recommendations, Scotland's adaptation system remains fragmented, reactive and underresourced. Innovative work is happening but, too often, help arrives only after a fall, injury or hospital stay, and access to adapted housing varies depending on where a person lives, the tenure and what funding is available.

That is why I lodged amendment 352. It would require the Scottish ministers to create, by regulations, a “scheme to provide adaptations”.

The scheme would apply irrespective of tenure and would

“integrate adaptations into planned repair, maintenance, and upgrade programmes”.

It would

“include a mechanism for evaluating the adaptations made”

to inform

“future strategy and resource allocation”,

and it would

“ensure that the evaluation ... involves engagement with relevant ... organisations.”

Such a scheme is recommended in the recent “What’s next for adaptations?” report, which was led by the University of Stirling’s intersectional stigma of place-based ageing project. The report notes that

“delays and inequalities in access”

to adaptations are widespread across Scotland, and that

“the consequences are serious: more falls, avoidable hospital admissions and missed opportunities for prevention.”

More than that, living in a home that is not adapted has a profound impact on a person’s life.

The Government knows about the case for change in this area. The need is growing, and the cost of inaction will mount. One of my constituents has recently contacted me to say that he has had to find resources for a stair climber, because outdated advice that has been given in the existing regime suggests that some changes cannot be made to common areas because of the risk to other tenants. In this case, the risk of other tenants not being able to move their furniture up and down the stairs if a stairlift is in place is considered greater than the risk to my constituent’s wife, who has dementia, and to him when he has to pull her up four storeys in a stair climber.

Such examples demonstrate the need for clarity and direction from the Government. That is what my amendment 352 seeks to achieve, and I hope that it can garner cross-party support from members this evening.

The need is growing and the cost of inaction will mount. As the report says,

“The challenge is no longer knowing what to do, but when we will act.”

With that, I say that the time is now, and I hope that the Government will agree.

I move amendment 351.

Murdo Fraser: I am speaking to amendment 368 on behalf of Rachael Hamilton, who cannot be here in the chamber this afternoon. Amendment

368 seeks to close a gap in the current law that restricts adaptations such as stairlifts and accessible bathing facilities to a disabled person’s main residence. The amendment would apply only to cases of unpaid care provided by family members, to avoid ambiguity around issues of paid care or voluntary arrangements. It would extend rights to cover cases in which a disabled person spends significant time in another household for the purpose of receiving care and support from a family member.

The proposed change is important, because the current system does not reflect the reality of modern family life. Many disabled adults split their time across more than one home, perhaps between parents who are now separated, or between their own home and that of a carer with whom they sometimes stay. Without provision for adaptations in both residences, their independence, safety and dignity are compromised.

In summary, amendment 368 seeks to ensure that our housing system will be fairer, more inclusive and better aligned with the needs of disabled people and their families. I will be pleased to move amendment 368.

Meghan Gallacher: I am pleased to say that the Scottish Conservatives will support all the amendments in this group, if they are moved, given the importance of the issues that they raise.

My amendment 369 is a probing amendment. Through discussions with stakeholders, particularly MND Scotland, I have learned that local authorities do not have a clear definition of “accessible housing”. My concerns relate to people with accessible needs being allocated a house through social waiting lists only to find that the property is completely unsuitable for their needs. For example, one local authority defines an accessible home as a property that has up to four steps for access. If someone is wheelchair bound, that property will not be accessible to them without adaptations being made to it. That is why I welcome the amendments that Pam Duncan-Glancy has lodged. The report that she rightly referenced should offer more clarity in relation to definitions and accessibility, but that needs to be directed by the Government. The reason that we are debating the issue this evening is that that has not happened.

Too many people are waiting for adaptations. I have learned from discussions with MND Scotland that, in some circumstances, people who live with motor neurone disease are having to wait for up to a year for adaptations to their home. Those who know well the outcomes of MND with regard to people’s ability to live within their means throughout the rest of their lives will understand that they need adaptations to be made as quickly

as possible. They cannot afford to wait years for adaptations to be made. That is why I believe that it is imperative for the Scottish Government to strengthen the definition of “accessible housing” to ensure that councils fulfil their duty to provide suitable homes for people with additional housing needs.

Jeremy Balfour: I welcome all the amendments in this group, and I will support them all. I am pleased that Pam Duncan-Glancy has had positive negotiations with the cabinet secretary.

I will make two brief points. First, I wonder whether the cabinet secretary, in summing up, could confirm that, when we talk about accessible housing, we are not talking only about accessibility for people who have wheelchairs; accessibility applies to people who have hidden disability and other forms of disability as well. Too often, constituents come to me having been told that they can put a ramp in, or that they can do this or that for a wheelchair. That is really important, but others who perhaps have less visible disabilities also need adaptations to be made to their housing. I am therefore interested in ensuring that the cabinet secretary picks up on all forms of disability, both hidden and visible.

18:30

Secondly, I welcome the amendments that relate to the question of adapting houses. We must be honest: it is simply the case that not enough money goes into the budget for local authorities to do that work. As we just heard from Meghan Gallacher, there is often a very long waiting list for people who are waiting to have adaptations done. That can affect someone's mental health as well as their physical disability. If people are unable to do things for themselves that they could do with a little help, that can often lead to mental health issues and to their not being able to use their houses to their full extent. I again ask the cabinet secretary to ensure that, when it comes to adaptation, we do not look only at putting in ramps but make sure that all disabilities are covered.

I hope that the amendments in this group will be accepted by the Parliament if they are moved, because they deal with a massive issue for many disabled people across the whole of our country.

Màiri McAllan: On amendment 351 from Pam Duncan-Glancy, I absolutely support the intention of ensuring the accessibility and adaptability of Scotland's homes. I also recognise the urgency of such work. I am pleased to have heard cross-party support today for a commitment to introduce a Scottish accessible homes standard. Unfortunately, as Ms Duncan-Glancy narrated, significant drafting errors in her amendment meant

that I could not support it. We discussed that and she understood it, and she spoke to some of the detail of that in her speech. However, we worked together on an alternative manuscript amendment, which I would have backed whole-heartedly had it been accepted.

Despite that, I assure Ms Duncan-Glancy that I remain committed to introducing a Scottish accessible homes standard through building standards and guidance that will address the accessibility, adaptability and usability of Scotland's new homes. I would want that to be developed in consultation with the building sector as well as other stakeholders. Crucially, and most of all, that includes those with lived experience. That will help to ensure that any new building standards and guidance are meaningful and proportionate, with the aim of ensuring that all new homes are accessible and adaptable to current and future needs or lifelong, changing needs.

Following consultation with the sector, including disabled persons, I would want provision to be in place within two years, which reflects the discussion that we had. I am happy to put that on the record today, and I will be keen to engage with Ms Duncan-Glancy on that point.

Equally, regarding Mr Balfour's question, I confirm to him that I will make sure that, when we talk about the needs of disabled individuals, that will include the full spectrum of requirements. He need not be concerned that any hidden disabilities would be missed.

I am fully supportive of the principle of amendment 352, and I am clear that disabled people must be supported to live safely and independently in their own homes, regardless of their housing circumstances. However, this is another case in which a law already exists for the purpose. I am therefore not agreeable to layering further law atop what already exists, but I want to work with members to make the existing law work better. If it is the case—

Pam Duncan-Glancy: Will the cabinet secretary take an intervention on that point?

Màiri McAllan: I will in a moment—I will just finish the point. If it is the case that the law as it stands does not work, I will be interested to work out how we can change that.

Pam Duncan-Glancy: It is the case that the current legislation is not working. That was the conclusion of the report from the University of Stirling, which is why I lodged amendment 352. The report highlighted various different ways in which the law should be improved in this space, which includes the improvements that I am trying to make with amendment 352. On that basis, will the cabinet secretary reconsider and support the amendment?

Màiri McAllan: I take on board everything that Pam Duncan-Glancy puts to me. The principle behind my inability to accept the amendment does not change, which is that I do not want to confuse the legal landscape. However, I will absolutely take on board what Pam Duncan-Glancy tells me about the workability of the existing law. I will commit to undertaking a review of the current housing adaptation system, which will be able to make recommendations and build on some of the work that she has spoken about on how we best improve and streamline the system and better target resources. A lot of resources are being spent on adaptation, but we need to work on that if those resources are not being spent well.

Kevin Stewart: I welcome what the cabinet secretary said about a review, because the system is sometimes cluttered, with local authorities, health and social care partnerships and the national health service all overseeing a fragmented system. Would the cabinet secretary agree to that review bringing together all partners in order to get it right for people across Scotland?

Màiri McAllan: Absolutely. I whole-heartedly back what Mr Stewart says about the complexity of the existing landscape and about the need to bring partners together to understand what must be done. I am happy to commit to Parliament that the review will begin later this year and that I will engage with members on it.

While we are discussing adaptations, it is worth noting that we are continuing to support registered social landlords to appropriately adapt their properties. The budget for that programme for 2025-26 has more than doubled, to £20.9 million, which reflects our commitment to support social landlords to deliver the necessary adaptations.

I will address a couple of other amendments. Rachael Hamilton is not here, but her amendment 368 was spoken to and it dealt with provision to support disabled people who require adaptations. Section 73 of the Housing (Scotland) Act 2006 requires assistance to be provided in cases where the property is the only or main residence of a disabled person. We accept that, but further assistance may also be provided in certain circumstances, at the discretion of the local authority. As I have mentioned, we have committed to undertaking a review of current housing adaptations, and I will ensure those issues are raised as part of that work.

I cannot support Meghan Gallacher's amendment 369. I understand her intent and am sure that the issue is inadvertent and not what she intended, but I fear that amendment 369 might be a step back. Under the current law, adaptations can be simply for the purpose of improving access, but her amendment 369 would mean that works had to be done to allow "safe, convenient,

and unassisted access" throughout, which would be a slight step back. I know that that is not what she intended.

Meghan Gallacher: Amendment 369 was a probing amendment so that we could talk about definitions and the need for clarity surrounding definitions of accessible housing. It is really important for the Scottish Government to take that away following our debate this evening. I am glad that there will be a review, but the cabinet secretary must look at the definitions used by the 32 local authorities, because they are inconsistent at the moment, creating a lot of uncertainty for disabled families up and down the country.

Màiri McAllan: I note that Ms Gallacher has confirmed that she will not be pressing her probing amendment.

I conclude my remarks by reiterating my commitment to beginning work on the review later this year and to having an accessible homes standard within two years.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I call Pam Duncan-Glancy to wind up and to press or withdraw amendment 351.

Pam Duncan-Glancy: On the basis of the commitments that the cabinet secretary has given and in light of the drafting concerns she explained—because I would not want the amendment to apply only at the point when a house is purchased rather than when it is built—I will not press amendment 351. I welcome the cabinet secretary's commitment to take action in that area and particularly to work with disabled people, their organisations and others within two years.

On amendment 352, I am afraid that I do not accept the Government's response that a review is required. The report from the University of Stirling noted that there is consistent evidence of the case for change. The need for consistency and equity has been recommended 14 times since 2000, while the need for a strategic approach has been recommended 21 times and the need for partnership approaches 19 times. The time for review really is over, and it is now time to take action on adaptation. On that basis, I will be pressing amendment 352.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Please confirm that you seek to withdraw amendment 351.

Pam Duncan-Glancy: I seek to withdraw it.

Amendment 351, by agreement, withdrawn.

Amendment 352 moved—[Pam Duncan-Glancy].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 352 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)

Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 47, Against 61, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 352 disagreed to.

Before section 51A

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Group 26 is on taxes and local government finance. Amendment 353, in the name of Ross Greer, is grouped with amendments 354, 355, 245 to 247, 356 to 358, 248 to 251, 359, 252 to 254, 114, 113, 360 to 365, 376, 377 and 386. I point out that, if amendment 231 is agreed to, I cannot call amendment 359 due to pre-emption.

Ross Greer (West Scotland) (Green): We have saved the best for almost last. Who does not want to be discussing council tax reform with me on a Tuesday evening? I am glad that colleagues

in the Finance and Public Administration Committee have made it back in time from Lithuania for this.

Amendment 353 seeks to mandate ministers to undertake a property revaluation for council tax. We debated the issue at stage 2, when I moved a different but related amendment, and I have raised the matter in a number of other settings, so I will not rehearse all of that now. Suffice to say that it is absurd that we all pay council tax that is based on property values that we know are wrong and 34 years out of date.

Every party has recognised that our council tax system needs to change, regardless of what long-term reform looks like. We need accurate property values as a starting point for that reform process. Amendment 353 makes clear that ministers can make further regulations to not implement the revaluation if they do not wish to do so. Undertaking the revaluation would give us a data set on which to base future decisions about reform without committing us to any particular course of action, because I recognise the range of views across Parliament on where we should go with that reform. I think that we can all recognise the need to have the data on which to base those decisions.

Amendments 354 and 355 would allow councils to increase council tax on second and empty homes. I am grateful to the Government for working with me on those amendments. In 2023, we regulated to let councils impose a 100 per cent surcharge, if they wished to, on those properties. That worked—in one year, there were 2,500 fewer second homes in Scotland. That recognises the particular harm that is caused by the huge growth in holiday homes, particularly in rural and island communities.

On Arran, which is in my region, communities such as Lamlash are now approaching the point at which a majority of homes are either second homes or short-term lets. In other areas, such as parts of Skye and Wester Ross, they are already well past that point. That is destroying communities. I and other members spoke in detail about the impact that that is having on communities in my members' business debate before summer recess, so I will not repeat all that now. The amendments would build on what the Local Government, Housing and Planning Committee agreed to at stage 2, which is lifting the 100 per cent cap for the surcharge—effectively, the 200 per cent overall cap on council tax—and allowing for council tax to be more than doubled on second and empty properties.

The amendments would complete the process by giving councils the power to increase the surcharge, rather than leaving it entirely up to the Government and Parliament. They would also

allow ministers to produce binding guidance as to how that is applied, so that they can set sensible exemptions for situations such as locum general practitioner housing. I would have hoped that that would not have been necessary, but, unfortunately, the behaviour of a couple of councils has merited it.

Amendment 356 would make clear beyond doubt that ministers can write off the council tax debts of those who are experiencing or have survived domestic abuse, where, through joint and several liability, they are liable for the debts of their abuser.

I was glad to get the Government's support at stage 2 for an amendment of mine—it features in section 51B—that will lead to a review of the scale of the debt and how we can address it. I hope that, following the review, ministers will be writing off that, frankly, repugnant debt. Survivors should never have to pay off their abusers' debts.

Amendments 245 and 246, in the name of the cabinet secretary, change the time limit for the review that the committee agreed to at stage 2, from six months to a year after royal assent. I am happy to agree to that.

Amendment 357 would change the prescription or write-off period for council tax arrears. At present, under the Prescription and Limitation (Scotland) Act 1973, Scottish council tax debts are chased for 20 years, despite the fact that most other types of debt here are written off after five years, and council tax debt in England is written off after six years.

18:45

I have raised that matter with the First Minister twice in the past month so, again, I will not rehearse the arguments in full. Briefly, however, people who have been unable to pay off their debts after five years of enforcement action will almost certainly be struggling, and sending sheriff officers to their door over and over again is not helping anyone. It costs councils a fortune in enforcement costs for the little that they are able to recover, and it has knock-on costs. For example, when those who are trying to pay off their council tax debts are then unable to pay their rent, they end up homeless, and the council needs to find them housing.

As Aberlour has detailed in its research and campaigning, the current system is not working for anyone. It is not working for those who are in debt and it is certainly not working for councils. That is why I am proposing that council tax debts be moved to the five-year limit that already applies to many other forms of debt to the state.

Amendments 358 and 386 would mandate ministers to use their existing powers to rewrite the current regulations that govern how councils collect council tax debt. That would give everyone the right to pay council tax on a monthly basis, which is not a right that we currently have. At present, if someone falls behind on council tax by just a month or two, maybe due to a sudden change in their personal finances, the council can make them liable to pay the full annual balance for that financial year. Councils regularly make things worse for those who are struggling by demanding those massive up-front payments, which are often thousands of pounds, at the exact point at which people can least afford it.

Amendment 359 would require ministers, when doing their reviews of short-term let accommodation—which were secured by Rachael Hamilton at stage 2—to consider the cut-off point at which a property goes from being liable for council tax to being liable for non-domestic rates. At present, Scotland is well behind Wales on that. In Wales, a property has to be available for 252 days and let out for 182 days in a year for it to move from council tax to NDR. In Scotland, it is just 140 days and 70 days respectively. If we matched the Welsh dates, we would have more short-term lets paying the second home council tax surcharge and fewer paying no tax through qualifying for 100 per cent NDR relief. Given the impact of short-term lets on housing supply everywhere from here in the centre of Edinburgh to Arran, I do not think that we should be making it easier for those people to reduce their tax contributions.

Amendment 361 would end the relief from land and buildings transaction tax for foreign militaries. In short, if President Trump's military wishes to buy property in Scotland, it should pay its taxes like everyone else.

On a similar note, amendment 362 would end the Crown's exemption from LBTT in Scotland for residential property. It is absurd that one particular billionaire gets a personal tax break. If my constituents need to pay LBTT when they are buying a property, I think that the King should, too.

Amendment 363 would allow ministers to impose a surcharge when companies are buying up residential property. At present, as the Land and Buildings Transaction Tax (Scotland) Act 2013 is drafted, we can set only one rate, which serves as both the additional dwelling supplement for individuals and the company surcharge. I want to separate those two surcharges to allow for greater targeting. In England, the stamp duty surcharge on companies is 17 per cent, while in Scotland, because it is tied to the additional dwelling supplement, it is just 8 per cent. Like the council tax debt collection rules, that is an area

where the law in England is far more progressive than the law in Scotland, and we should fix that.

Amendment 364—I am almost done, Presiding Officer—would allow ministers to impose a surcharge on overseas buyers of additional property. To be clear, I note that it would not apply to people who are looking to move and live here. It would apply largely to the super-rich who are buying up homes here for holidaying or property speculation. The growing overseas ownership of Scottish land and property is a scandal that this Parliament should get to grips with.

Amendment 365 would allow ministers to impose a LBTT surcharge on the purchase of second and holiday homes in areas of linguistic significance. During the passage of the Scottish Languages Bill, we all acknowledged that the biggest threat to Gaelic-speaking communities is the rural housing crisis, and the key driver of that is second and holiday home ownership. Making it that bit more expensive to buy a second home in some of our most fragile communities would be an important tool for protecting Gaelic.

I hope that the cabinet secretary will respond positively to those proposals to fix elements of our property tax system that are, frankly, currently rigged against ordinary people and in favour of the wealthy few.

I move amendment 353.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I point out that, if amendment 251, rather than amendment 231, is agreed to, I will be unable to call amendment 359 due to pre-emption.

I call the cabinet secretary to speak to amendment 245 and other amendments in the group.

Màiri McAllan: Presiding Officer, as Mr Greer's contribution demonstrated, there are rather a lot of amendments in group 26. I will try to be as quick as I can. It is our penultimate group, however, so I hope that you will afford me a little time so that I can give members the courtesy of a response.

I will start with my amendments 245 and 246, which are about extending the timeframe for completing the review of the impact of a joint and several liability for council tax arrears in domestic abuse to 12 months after royal assent. That is to ensure that we can gather the necessary evidence and consult properly with stakeholders.

In general, as we have heard, some of the amendments in the group propose to make changes to LBTT. That would normally be taken forward in a tax-specific piece of legislation, with any proposed changes expected to follow focused taxpayer and stakeholder consultation. It would also normally involve collaborative working with Revenue Scotland to ensure effective

administration and compliance, and then be considered by the relevant committee. Lodging the amendments at this stage, and at this stage of a housing bill, is far from the right approach.

That said, Ms Burgess's amendments 113 and 144 were previously considered at stage 2. Existing LBTT arrangements provide relief to those co-operatives that are registered as a social landlord with the Scottish Housing Regulator or that operate as registered charities, but the exemption that is proposed would mean that transactions do not have to be notified at all to Revenue Scotland. That presents a clear compliance risk, so I cannot support the amendments.

Amendment 360 would require ministers to publish a report on LBTT in the context of housing co-operatives and other community-led housing models. That is best considered in the context of the Government's broader position on such housing models, rather than considering tax on that matter in isolation. I must again talk to my leading position, which is about the need for consultation and preparation for any changes in tax.

The Government cannot support amendment 353, which is on a full council tax revaluation. Although there is broad agreement on the need for council tax reform, there are different views on how that should be taken forward. That is precisely why the Government, working with the Convention of Scottish Local Authorities, has launched a programme of engagement to build consensus.

Elements of the amendment appear to be without legal effect, as they purport to rely on a provision that can be used only to change tax bandings. However, the much more important point is that an independent report from the Institute for Fiscal Studies will be shortly published, which will provide robust analysis of market trends and options for reform. That will be followed by formal consultation with town hall events across Scotland, which will lead to a debate in Parliament in early 2026. That will allow us to test illustrative proposals openly and to be evidence led, and we must allow that work to continue.

On amendments 354 and 355, we worked closely with the Convention of Scottish Local Authorities to deliver the first council tax premium on second homes from 24 April. Of course, in our 2025 programme for government, we committed to go further by removing the remaining constraints. The amendment delivers on that, so I am pleased to have worked with Mr Greer on it, and to support it.

On amendment 356, we recognise that joint and several liability for council tax can create very difficult circumstances for people who are experiencing or have experienced abuse. That is why, at stage 2, we supported the amendment to require a review of how council tax arrears in that situation affect individuals, and Mr Greer spoke to that. The outcome of that review will be reported to Parliament and will give us a much clearer understanding. I do not want to pre-empt the outcome of that review, because I want to make sure that the provision works, because the experience of victims and survivors is very important to me.

Ross Greer: Will the cabinet secretary give way?

Màiri McAllan: I have a huge amount to get to, but yes—absolutely.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Ross Greer, briefly.

Ross Greer: I hope that this will save us time in a moment, Presiding Officer. I am happy not to press amendment 356 if the cabinet secretary will confirm that the Government's intended outcome is that survivors are never put in the position of having to pay off their abusers' debts.

Màiri McAllan: I absolutely support the contention that victims and survivors should not be liable for abusers' debts, but all that I am saying is that I will await the work that we have committed to being done before committing to an approach in primary legislation. That is a sensible approach.

On Ross Greer's amendment 357 on the prescriptive period for council tax debt, the most important thing to highlight to the chamber is that the five-year period that is mooted could be reset when recovery action is taken or whenever there is an acknowledgement of the debt. I suspect that that was probably not Mr Greer's intention, because I understand his principled position that 20 years is too long and that five years is more appropriate. I expect that he probably did not intend that it could reset and go on beyond five years.

However, on the generality, I am very sympathetic to the points that were raised about the need to be considerate over what long-term debt feels like for those who experience it, and the impact that it can have on families. However, this stage in this bill is not the right place to do it, and we ought to have close consultation, including with local authorities, on what we might do, not least so that we can get the prescriptive period right and make sure that it is as fair as possible.

Ross Greer: I am happy not to move amendment 357 if the cabinet secretary will confirm that the kind of further consultation that

the Government believes is required will now be undertaken, and echo what the First Minister said last week, when he appeared to agree on the point of principle that the current rules on council tax debt are not working for struggling families and that some kind of reform is necessary. If the Government agrees on that point of principle and undertakes that that consultation will happen, I am happy not to move amendment 357, because that would be sufficient progress for me.

Màiri McAllan: Yes. As the First Minister said at First Minister's question time last week, the Government is very sympathetic to the inherent unfairness in the current system and to considering how it could be improved. My point is that we need to do that work to consider it and, importantly, to consult those who are affected.

Amendment 361 seeks to restrict the exemption from LBTT of the purchases of military headquarters and barracks by overseas visiting forces. The introduction of that relief was considered necessary as a consequence of UK international treaty obligations and NATO agreements. Most important, however, on the basis of defence and international relations reservations under the Scotland Act 1998, the removal of the exemption is likely to be outside parliamentary competence, and I cannot support it.

Amendment 362, on the application to the Crown of the Land and Buildings Transaction Tax (Scotland) Act 2013, introduces some ambiguity into the LBTT framework by referring to "residential property transactions", but it is not clear whether it is intended to apply to mixed-use or linked transactions. It is most important for matters of tax to be clear and not to be introduced at stage 3 of a bill, when difficulties in drafting cannot be overcome. I therefore cannot support amendment 362.

Members will be aware that the additional dwelling supplement is set at a flat rate of 8 per cent in addition to the core rates of LBTT. Amendments 363 and 365 would allow for a significant divergence from existing arrangements and long-standing policy and would require a thorough consultation to explore the case for change.

Likewise, on amendment 364, the arrangements for a broadly similar provision in the UK stamp duty land tax regime indicate that that is a highly complex proposition. Detailed consultation, including with Revenue Scotland, would be essential before any legislation on a surcharge could be considered.

I will move as quickly as I can, Presiding Officer.

Amendment 247, in the name of Graham Simpson, is defective. It appears to be based on

an out-of-date version of the relevant order, so I cannot accept it.

I am not sure whether someone other than Rachael Hamilton will speak to her amendment 376 on the visitor levy, but, under section 75 of the Visitor Levy (Scotland) Act 2024, there is already a requirement on ministers to review the operation of that act and to prepare a report to lay before the Parliament. I am not prepared to duplicate that work unnecessarily.

Equally, the effect of amendment 377 is that revenues that are generated could be put into general housing funds, as opposed to what the visitor levy was intended for—namely, tourism. I therefore cannot support amendment 377.

I turn to amendments 250 to 254. During stage 2, it was explained that the intention of section 51E was to require a review of the processes around the classification of self-catering holiday accommodation in particular. The evaluation of all non-domestic property, including the classification of properties on the roll, is a matter for the independent Scottish assessors. In any given year, assessors determine whether a property meets the requirements for classification as self-catering holiday accommodation, which is liable for non-domestic rates. We are considering whether further changes are needed, but the current wording of section 51E is very broad, and a wide range of property types would, potentially, be captured within its scope. For instance, hotels, guest houses, caravans and timeshares are all potentially suitable for providing housing.

Amendments 250 to 254, in my name, will deliver the same intention but provide greater clarity in doing so, namely that the scope of the review is the process surrounding the classification of self-catering holiday accommodation for the purposes of non-domestic rates. They will also make clear that the review must include the manner in which any such determination will be communicated.

19:00

Amendment 359, in the name of Ross Greer, would require the review of the classification of properties under section 51E to include within its scope the number of days a year for which a residential property has to be available for let and the manner in which it is to be let. The valuation of all non-domestic property, including the classification of properties on the roll, is a matter for Scottish assessors, as I have said. On a technical point, amendment 359 refers to days, but the unit of measurement for such requirements is nights, and that has been in effect since 1 April 2024.

More generally, I point back to amendments 250 to 254, in my name, which provide greater clarity and a better scope. I therefore encourage members to support amendments 250 to 254.

Amendments 248 and 249, in my name, seek to merge the two provisions of the bill that relate to the housing revenue account of local authorities into a single section.

Graham Simpson: Amendment 247 covers an issue that I raised at stage 2. I did so because it has been raised with me by students themselves. The amendment seeks to exempt students from the requirement to start paying council tax in the period between finishing a course and graduation.

The cabinet secretary alluded to drafting errors—it is the first that I have heard of them—but I will accept what she has said. However, the wider issue, which I have discussed with her, is that there could be quite a gap between someone finishing a course and graduating, and some people might not get round to graduating.

For those reasons, I will not move amendment 247.

Douglas Lumsden (North East Scotland) (Con): What would happen in a circumstance in which a person defers graduating for a year so that they can graduate with a friend? Would they be exempt from paying council tax for all that time?

Graham Simpson: Unfortunately, Mr Lumsden did not appear to hear what I said. I will not move amendment 247, because it has problems—probably the exact problems that he has alluded to.

This group of amendments has allowed Ross Greer to re-rehearse the arguments that he made at stage 2 about reforming council tax. He knew then, as he knows now, that although there is great merit in looking at council tax reform, it really needs separate legislation. That is also the case with his LBTT amendments—the issue needs proper consultation—although I accept that it has gone into the too-difficult box for too long.

I am pleased to hear the cabinet secretary say that there could be a debate about council tax revaluation in the Parliament in early 2026. That would be a good thing, but this legislation is not the place to make such a change. Ross Greer knows that, but at least he got a press release out of it.

Ariane Burgess: Housing co-ops play an important role in Scotland's housing landscape, and it is vital that we support them. Amendment 113 would remove the ADS burden from all housing co-ops, not only those that are registered as charities or social landlords; and amendment

114 would exempt housing co-operatives from land and buildings transaction tax.

The bulk of housing co-ops in Scotland are not registered social landlords or charities, which is often because of the way that they are set up or run, or the purposes that they serve, which prevents them from having either status. For example, the Edinburgh student housing co-op cannot be a social landlord or charity, but it enables students from low-income backgrounds to secure affordable housing in a challenging housing market, so it is a significant public good.

Amendments 113 and 114 both contain strict rules—set out under subsection (3) of each amendment—that co-ops would have to meet if they were to get exemptions. Key points to note are that only tenants, or those who are soon to move into a co-op, would be allowed to make decisions about how the co-op is run. Likewise, my definition is careful to state that shares and share capital are not subject to the market forces that make other types of housing so unaffordable.

The idea is that anyone can live in a co-op, regardless of their economic background or stage of life, and that those who do so cannot abuse their share of the co-op for their own gain. The wealth that is created through members' contributions should be held collectively, reinvested in the homes and the community, and passed on to future members. The whole concept is a purely democratic model, whereby co-ops redistribute wealth away from speculative and individual gain and into secure, affordable housing for the many.

Those robust provisions have been drafted with the support of the Confederation of Co-operative Housing and Co-operatives UK, as well as individual housing co-ops across Scotland. When I meet those organisations, they always say that LBTT and ADS are the biggest barriers to the co-op sector in Scotland and that those taxes make it harder for co-ops to get started and meet demand.

That matters, because the co-op model should have a big role to play in tackling our housing emergency. It offers an affordable option between renting and owning that takes pressure off local authorities and individual budgets. It also locks in collective wealth; instead of rent payments leaving the community, they circulate back into improving homes, strengthening the co-op and supporting long-term affordability. Likewise, the model offers social benefits that can lead to positive health and wellbeing outcomes, taking pressure off public services. In short, co-ops are vital if Scotland is serious about the community wealth building agenda and tackling the housing emergency.

Frustratingly, England is ahead of Scotland on co-ops. South of the border, co-ops get a form of

relief from stamp duty, despite working under a weaker legal definition than the one that I am proposing through my amendments 113 and 114, and it allows them to operate effectively in extremely challenging housing markets, such as in London. By agreeing to my amendments, we can change that and significantly improve housing outcomes for people all over Scotland.

My amendment 360 is a back-up to amendments 113 and 114. It would require the Scottish Government to produce a report on the impact of LBTT and ADS on the co-op and community-led housing sector. It would enable the Government to see for itself that there is a real need for those reliefs to be applied to the housing co-op model.

As I have already set out, co-ops are crucial if we are to tackle the housing emergency. Providing them with appropriate reliefs would allow them to play more of a role in providing housing for people of all backgrounds. Through collective power, co-ops can provide affordable, quality housing for all, without the need for much taxpayer support. However, they need Government facilitation if they are to become more strongly established and expand. The SNP recognised that during the period of the Bute house agreement coalition Government. It was a stated aim of that Administration that it would seek to support co-operative housing and consider LBTT relief. It is beyond time for that scoping exercise to happen. If the Government is serious about community wealth building and tackling the housing emergency, it must act.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I remind colleagues to either take their conversations outside or keep them much quieter. I call Murdo Fraser to speak to amendment 376 on behalf of Rachael Hamilton and to other amendments in the group.

Murdo Fraser: Amendments 376 and 377 in the name of my colleague Rachael Hamilton are probing amendments to try to determine the impact of the visitor levy on housing and other aspects of the economy. It is curious that we have not seen a full economic impact assessment of the likely impact of the visitor levy and, unsurprisingly, there is widespread concern across the tourist sector and the economy more widely about what the impact of the visitor levy is likely to be. We on the Conservative side of the chamber have consistently warned of the likely impact of the visitor levy, and we have been joined in that by many industry representatives.

Just last week, we saw a chaotic and shambolic situation, whereby, one day, the Minister for Public Finance announced that the Government was going to bring forward changes to the visitor levy and, three days later, corrected himself, saying

that the Government was just going to consider doing so. Unsurprisingly, that has caused a great deal of uncertainty and dismay in the tourist sector.

Earlier this year, more than 80 organisations from across the hospitality and tourist sector issued a stark warning that, without urgent changes, the visitor levy scheme would, in their words, cause

“harm to both Scotland’s economy and individual businesses.”

Right now, we see different councils—including the one here in Edinburgh—bringing forward plans for a visitor levy. At the same time, we do not know what the future of the levy will be, including whether the Government will bring forward changes, when it might do so, or what their impact might amount to.

Our call is therefore that, in the interests of Scottish business, before more damage is done, there should be a moratorium on the visitor levy until we see how it resolves itself.

Willie Rennie: I praise the indefatigability of Ross Greer for forever pursuing the reform of council tax. He is a starry-eyed optimist when he comes and talks about that issue, and quite rightly so. He has pursued it, in many cases, in the same way as Liberal Democrats have done, but to no avail.

We have seen repeated working groups, joint working groups, cross-party task forces, commissions, citizens assemblies, roadshows and debates—endless barriers to actually doing anything at all to reform the council tax. Liberal Democrat members will be voting for some of Ross Greer’s amendments to try and make that point.

However, the most important point is that, if the Government’s words are not to be hollow, it needs to come forward with proposals itself, rather than hiding behind processes for evermore. My appeal to the Government is to get off the fence.

Mark Griffin: I will speak briefly and broadly to the package of amendments that Ross Greer has lodged. There is a lot in there in relation to the additional dwelling supplement, land and buildings transaction tax, and wide-ranging reform of council tax and debt.

I absolutely agree with the policy behind some individual amendments, specifically in relation to areas around debt, and victims/survivors of domestic abuse paying for their abusers’ arrears. I am absolutely on board with the direction of travel of Mr Greer’s amendments there.

My issue is that, when we consider the cumulative impact of that entire package of

amendments, as a collective, on council tax and LBTT reform, it seems as though they have been lodged in a vacuum, and without consideration of the Verity house agreement. I did not hear any reference to working with Revenue Scotland, or to any dialogue with COSLA or local authorities.

For those reasons, this bill is not the place to tackle those issues—but they absolutely deserve consideration in a bill of their own. In saying that, I fundamentally agree with individual points that Mr Greer made in relation to some of his amendments. However, the cumulative impact of all those amendments is so wide-ranging, and would mean such a huge package of reform, that they need detailed consideration of their own.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I call Ross Greer to wind up, and to press or withdraw amendment 353.

Ross Greer: I will not revise the arguments around every amendment.

I will make a couple of observations, particularly on the cabinet secretary's points, and on some of what Mark Griffin and Graham Simpson said, about this not being the right bill or the right stage.

With respect, I have to say that the cabinet secretary's point that this is not the right stage, and that I have lodged the amendments too late, borders on disingenuous, given that almost all of this was brought at stage 2, and that I discussed the proposals with her predecessors. I have discussed these issues with the Government, specifically in relation to the bill, for months. Moreover, as Willie Rennie pointed out, many of us have also been discussing and trying to get progress on these issues for years and, in some cases, decades.

I, in fact, agree that this is not the ideal bill through which to deliver many of the proposals, and that they should be dealt with as part of dedicated tax legislation. However, my response to the cabinet secretary on that specific point is that the Government should introduce that tax legislation or a wider finance bill—which is something that members from across the political spectrum in this place have argued for a long time.

An annual finance bill, alongside the budget, would allow us to resolve many of these issues. It is not, therefore, a particularly compelling point from the Government to say that we have not lodged amendments to the right bill, when it has not introduced the right bill for members to use as a vehicle. The Government should not blame members of other parties for taking advantage of this bill to fix issues that the Government itself has not fixed.

19:15

An example is an area in which we have come to agreement: lifting the cap on council tax surcharges for second and empty homes. The Scottish Government committed to do that about three years ago, but it then said that there was no legislative vehicle for doing so during the remainder of the current session. We have proven that that is not the case, and I am glad that we have been able to agree on that.

I want to pick up in particular on Willie Rennie's point about all the barriers that have, for 34 years, been put in the way of fixing the council tax. That system was supposed to be a quick and dirty temporary replacement for the poll tax, but it has now been out of date for longer than I have been alive.

The Scottish Government has led substantive processes on council tax previously, which is why I struggle to trust the Government on this point in particular. It says that we need to take issues forward through the new reform process that it has recently announced and is now embarking on. However, 10 years ago, the Government launched the commission on local tax reform, which produced a substantive piece of work that the Government then barely acted on, to the extent that, when I asked the Government for a copy of the commission's report, it discovered that the domain had expired; it needed to use the internet archive known as the Wayback Machine to recover those critical documents.

It is particularly unfair of the Government to talk about drafting issues in respect of these amendments. In particular, I do not think that drafting issues are the reason why it does not support my amendment to end the King's personal tax break. It would have been helpful if the cabinet secretary had simply laid out the Scottish Government's position on the principle of those issues.

That being said, while I am going to press the first amendment in the group and I will move some of the other amendments, I will not move them all. I am frustrated, however, that so many of these issues could have been resolved if the Government had spent the summer engaging with me on the issues on which it apparently agrees in principle, instead of only now coming up with reasons of drafting to vote against my amendments.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 353 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

Keith Brown (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I was unable to connect. I would have voted no.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Brown. I will make sure that that is recorded.

For

Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dowe, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)

Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 12, Against 95, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 353 disagreed to.

Section 51A—Variation of council tax for unoccupied dwellings

Amendment 354 moved—[Ross Greer].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 354 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)

Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 75, Against 31, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 354 agreed to.

Amendment 355 moved—[Ross Greer].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 355 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)

Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)

Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 78, Against 30, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 355 agreed to.

Section 51B—Review of council tax arrears: joint and several liability

Amendment 245 moved—[Màiri McAllan].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 245 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division. Members should cast their votes now.

The vote is closed. Craig Hoy has a point of order.

Craig Hoy: I apologise, Presiding Officer. My point of order related to the previous vote.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)

Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)

Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 84, Against 26, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 245 agreed to.

Amendment 246 moved—[Màiri McAllan].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 246 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division. Members should cast their votes now.

The vote is closed.

Joe FitzPatrick (Dundee City West) (SNP): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I could not vote. I would have voted yes.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr FitzPatrick. I will make sure that that is recorded.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)

Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)

Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 83, Against 26, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 246 agreed to.

After section 51B

Amendment 247 not moved.

Amendments 356 to 358 not moved.

Section 51C—Transfer of funds into the Housing Revenue Account

Amendment 248 moved—[Màiri McAllan]—and agreed to.

Section 51D—Transfer of funds into the Housing Revenue Account

Amendment 249 moved—[Màiri McAllan]—and agreed to.

Section 51E—Review of classification of properties

Amendment 250 moved—[Màiri McAllan]—and agreed to.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I call amendment 251, in the name of the cabinet secretary, which has already been debated with amendment 353. I remind members that, if amendment 251 is agreed to, I cannot call amendment 359 due to pre-emption.

Amendment 251 moved—[Màiri McAllan]—and agreed to.

Amendments 252 to 254 moved—[Màiri McAllan]—and agreed to.

After section 51E

Amendment 114 moved—[Ariane Burgess].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 114 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dowe, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)

Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 21, Against 87, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 114 disagreed to.

Amendment 113 moved—[Ariane Burgess].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 113 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)

Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 30, Against 79, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 113 disagreed to.

19:30

Amendment 360 moved—[Ariane Burgess].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 360 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dowe, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)

Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 21, Against 87, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 360 disagreed to.

Amendment 361 not moved.

Amendment 362 moved—[Ross Greer].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 362 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)

Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dowe, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)

McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Abstentions

Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 10, Against 97, Abstentions 2.

Amendment 362 disagreed to.

Amendments 363 and 364 not moved.

Amendment 365 moved—[Ross Greer].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 365 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)

Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 8, Against 101, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 365 disagreed to.

Section 51F—Housing emergency

Amendment 366 moved—[Mark Griffin].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 366 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)

Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 83, Against 25, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 366 agreed to.

After section 51F

Amendment 255 not moved.

Amendment 256 moved—[Maggie Chapman].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 256 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)

Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)

Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 45, Against 65, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 256 disagreed to.

Amendment 21 not moved.

Amendment 367 moved—[Mark Griffin]—and agreed to.

Amendment 115 moved—[Martin Whitfield].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 115 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)

Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast

by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 21, Against 88, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 115 disagreed to.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Group 27 is on antisocial behaviour: register of tenants. Amendment 257, in the name of Edward Mountain, is the only amendment in the group.

Edward Mountain: I remind members of my entry in the register of members' interests, which states that I am a landlord in Moray. I let houses under private residential tenancies and I let tied properties. I have been letting houses for 30 years, and I am a qualified surveyor. I was also letting houses for people—[*Interruption.*]

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Could we have a little less noise around the chamber, please?

Edward Mountain: I am sure that it is bubbling excitement for my amendment. [*Interruption.*] Well, one of the reasons why I lodged this amendment was not, as I suspect some members believe, to protect landlords in the private rented sector, who have been described as “wolves” and the users of “weasel” words.

This is about trying to protect people who let houses, especially in the social sector. My mailbox is often full of complaints from people who live in social housing next door to people whose antisocial behaviour prevents them from being able to live in their houses and enjoy them. The point of amendment 257 is to allow the Government to draw up a register of people with a history of antisocial behaviour so that people are aware of the tenants that they are taking on.

To my mind, that is particularly important so that, when people are putting up in social housing people who have convictions for drug use or drug provision, they do not put them next to people who are susceptible or trying to go clean or make a break from drugs. That is one of the reasons why I lodged the amendment. It would allow the Government to make a register and to dictate how

the register would be kept and the information that would be specified. *[Interruption.]*

The Presiding Officer (Alison Johnstone): I would be grateful if any conversations that are happening in the chamber could be drawn to a close.

Edward Mountain: Thank you, Presiding Officer. I want to take interventions if I am allowed to, but it is somewhat difficult for me as my hearing aids have run out of battery power and I am struggling to hear whether members want to intervene. I will get through this as quickly as possible, because I know that time is against me.

The amendment would allow the Government to make provision on amending an entry and enforcement of the register.

Members may wonder whether such a register would be fair. I think that it would be, because landlords have to be registered. Under Government legislation, they have to renew their registration every three years, and they can be removed from the register if they are not regarded as a suitable landlord. If they cannot prove that they are a suitable landlord and they are removed, they cannot advertise the property and then they cannot let it. There are severe restrictions on landlords. I welcome those, because they weed out those who are not good landlords. However, it is only fair that, if we are controlling landlords, a register is kept so that everyone knows the tenants that they are taking on and whether they are going to come with problems.

That is the premise of my amendment. I would be delighted to hear the cabinet secretary's reasons why she is supporting it.

I move amendment 257.

Màiri McAllan: I listened carefully to Edward Mountain, but my reflection remains that his is a significant proposal with very wide-reaching implications. Although I hear what he says about his ultimate aim being to support housing providers to manage risk, his proposal is a significant, new and untested policy on which, as I understand it, there has been no previous discussion or consultation. Moreover, some of the information that would be sought is already available to landlords.

Beyond that, I have concerns regarding the proportionality of an approach that would require such a register. The proposal raises understandable concerns about fairness, privacy and, in particular, rehabilitation, given that I do not think that a time limit would be set for how long a person would remain on the register.

Edward Mountain: I wonder where the cabinet secretary can point me to that allows landlords to ascertain whether their proposed tenants have

behaved antisocially in the past. My amendment suggests that landlords need to know that. I cannot find that information.

Màiri McAllan: I mentioned that some of the information—not all of it—is already available to landlords.

I reiterate the point about proportionality, fairness, privacy and rehabilitation. Ultimately, I want to have an inclusive, rights-based approach to housing policy and I do not want to create indefinite barriers to people accessing social homes.

The Presiding Officer: I call Edward Mountain to wind up and press or withdraw amendment 257.

Edward Mountain: I listened to the cabinet secretary's intervention, in which she said that "some of the information" should be available. However, she gave me no indication of where that could be found. I do not think that my amendment seeks in any way to prevent people from getting houses. It would just allow people to understand which tenants are moving in, in the same way that the tenant has an absolute right to know what sort of landlord they are getting—that is, that he or she is a fit and proper person because they are on the landlord register.

I am disappointed that the Government is not going to support amendment 257. I worded it carefully and am glad that the cabinet secretary did not say that it was poorly worded. I worded it to give Scottish ministers the ability to amend how the register would be kept and it asks them only to keep a register.

I will press the amendment and I thank the cabinet secretary for giving me half an answer to my questions.

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 257 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)

Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)

Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 28, Against 82, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 257 disagreed to.

Amendment 368 moved—[Murdo Fraser].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 368 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]

McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)

Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 46, Against 61, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 368 disagreed to.

Amendment 369 not moved.

Amendment 370 moved—[Pam Duncan-Glancy].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 370 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

The Cabinet Secretary for Social Justice (Shirley-Anne Somerville): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I am just checking whether my vote was recorded as a no.

The Presiding Officer: I can confirm that that was recorded, Ms Somerville.

Edward Mountain: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. Sorry—I could not get my device to connect. I would have voted no.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Mountain. We will ensure that that is recorded.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)

Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Giltruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Nicol, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)

Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 23, Against 86, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 370 disagreed to.

Amendment 371 moved—[Pam Duncan-Glancy].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 371 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)

Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast

by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 47, Against 63, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 371 disagreed to.

Amendment 372 not moved.

Amendment 373 moved—[Ross Greer].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 373 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)

Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)

Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 45, Against 65, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 373 disagreed to.

Amendment 374 moved—[Ross Greer].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 374 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)

Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 45, Against 64, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 374 disagreed to.

Amendments 375 to 377 not moved.

Section 52—Regulations

Amendment 258 moved—[Edward Mountain].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 258 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)

Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 47, Against 62, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 258 disagreed to.

Amendment 259 moved—[Jamie Halcro Johnston].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 259 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)

Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 38, Against 70, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 259 disagreed to.

Amendments 260, 39 and 40 not moved.

20:00

Amendment 262 moved—[Emma Roddick]—and agreed to.

Amendments 263, 22, 264, 266, 265, 50 and 378 not moved.

The Presiding Officer: Amendment 379, in the name of Ross Greer, has already been debated with amendment 45. I invite Ross Greer to move or not move the amendment.

Ross Greer: I cannot break that streak.

Amendment 379 not moved.

Amendments 116, 380 and 381 not moved.

Amendment 382 moved—[Edward Mountain].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 382 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)

Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 45, Against 64, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 382 disagreed to.

Amendments 383, 385, 384, 48, 49 and 261 not moved.

Amendment 387 moved—[Mark Griffin]—and agreed to.

Amendments 386 and 51 not moved.

Amendment 117 moved—[Paul Sweeney].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 117 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

Shirley-Anne Somerville: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. Apologies—it has just shown up that my vote registered.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Ms Somerville.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)

Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 45, Against 64, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 117 disagreed to.

Amendments 388 to 390 not moved.

Section 56—Commencement

Amendments 118 and 23 not moved.

Amendment 119 moved—[Jeremy Balfour].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 119 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

Richard Leonard (Central Scotland) (Lab): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app would not connect. I would have voted yes.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Leonard. We will ensure that that is recorded.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dowe, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)

Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (SNP)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 17, Against 91, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 119 disagreed to.

Before schedule

Amendments 24, 25 and 120 not moved.

Schedule

Amendments 391, 392, 26 and 27 not moved.

Amendment 267 moved—[Maggie Chapman].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 267 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)

Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 22, Against 88, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 267 disagreed to.

Amendments 28, 29 and 41 to 43 not moved.

Amendment 121 moved—[Màiri McAllan]—and agreed to.

The Presiding Officer: I call amendment 268, in the name of Maggie Chapman, already debated with amendment 138. I remind members that if

amendment 268 is agreed to, I cannot call amendment 122 due to pre-emption.

Amendment 268 moved—[Maggie Chapman].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 268 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)

Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 22, Against 87, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 268 disagreed to.

20:15

Amendment 122 moved—[Màiri McAllan].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 122 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)

Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 101, Against 8, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 122 agreed to.

Amendment 269 moved—[Maggie Chapman].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 269 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)

Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Abstentions

Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 8, Against 100, Abstentions 1.

Amendment 269 disagreed to.

Amendment 393 moved—[Meghan Gallacher].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 393 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)

Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)

Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 39, Against 70, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 393 disagreed to.

The Presiding Officer: That ends stage 3 consideration of amendments.

As members will be aware, I am required under standing orders to decide whether or not, in my view, any provision of a bill relates to a protected subject matter—that is, whether it modifies the electoral system and franchise for Scottish parliamentary elections. In the case of this bill, in my view, no provision of the Housing (Scotland) Bill relates to a protected subject matter. Therefore, the bill does not require a supermajority to be passed at stage 3.

Before we move to the debate, I call the cabinet secretary to signify Crown consent to the bill.

Màiri McAllan: For the purposes of rule 9.11 of standing orders, I advise the Parliament that His Majesty, having been informed of the purport of the Housing (Scotland) Bill, has consented to place his prerogative and interests, in so far as they are affected by the bill, at the disposal of the Parliament for the purposes of the bill.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, cabinet secretary.

Housing (Scotland) Bill

The Presiding Officer (Alison Johnstone):

The next item of business is a debate on motion S6M-18992, in the name of Màiri McAllan, on the Housing (Scotland) Bill at stage 3. I would be grateful if members who wish to speak in the debate were to press their request-to-speak buttons.

20:20

The Cabinet Secretary for Housing (Màiri McAllan): I am absolutely delighted to finally begin this last step of the Housing (Scotland) Bill with a debate at stage 3. It has been a long and thorough process. Before turning to the substance of what this groundbreaking bill will provide, I should like to offer some acknowledgements.

First, I want to mention members from across the chamber for their rigour in scrutinising the bill, and in particular the members of the Local Government, Housing and Planning Committee, the Social Justice and Social Security Committee, and the Delegated Powers and Law Reform Committee, all of whom have taken a keen interest in the bill.

I extend significant thanks to all the experts who gave evidence to committee and who worked with the Scottish Government to help shape the contents of this ambitious piece of work. I also want to acknowledge the former ministers Patrick Harvie and Paul McLennan as well as the Cabinet Secretary for Social Justice, Shirley-Anne Somerville, all of whom have contributed, at one time or another, to this momentous piece of work.

My thanks also go to the Scottish Government bill team, who have worked incredibly hard on the bill's policies, as well as closely considering the policy purpose and legal effect of more than 1,000 amendments, and advising ministers on their implications. The team's commitment to the service of Scotland has been abundantly clear throughout, and I want to thank them, as well as those in my private office, who have helped me to pull everything together—including the bill folder, which I have been carrying around for quite some time now.

Finally, and most importantly, I thank everybody with lived experience of homelessness or housing precarity whose advocacy will now help to change the law in Scotland in a significant way.

On that note, I should like to focus on just some of what the bill provides that the Government is particularly proud of. I will begin with the ask and act powers. We believe that everyone in Scotland should have the opportunity of a warm, safe and affordable place to call home. That is, ultimately,

the cornerstone of a life of dignity and opportunity. Homelessness is not a one-off event. It is trauma, stigma and indignity, and it deprives people of the opportunity to live well, to succeed and to contribute fully in society. It must be ended, and we know that the best way to end homelessness is to prevent it from happening to people in the first place.

That is what our groundbreaking ask and act powers seek to ensure. They will sit atop Scotland's already highly protective legal landscape and will ensure that ending homelessness is, ultimately, everyone's business. Police officers, community link workers, social care staff, health visitors and social landlords are among those who will be expected to identify problems early and intervene if they believe that someone is threatened with homelessness. The approach is person-centred, flexible and responsive, and it will help to prevent the trauma and stigma of homelessness.

I mentioned the importance that the Government places on lived experience. I will share with the chamber a quote from a former service user, who was quoted by Advice Direct Scotland in September this year. They said:

"having experienced homelessness myself, I know how vital it is that people, regardless of their place in life, feel seen, heard and supported, with no judgement or feeling shame. 'Ask & Act' is a call to every front-line worker in Scotland to recognise the signs, to ask with compassion and act with purpose. The right question, asked at the right time, can change the course of a life."

That is what the Government seeks, with the First Minister's core objective for our Government being to eradicate child poverty in this country. The provisions of the big bill that we have been considering, together with the housing emergency action plan that was published at the beginning of the month, will help to serve that purpose. I hope that the Parliament will vote for the bill, offering as it does—and as was put to us by someone with lived experience and quoted by Advice Direct Scotland—the chance to

"change the course of a life."

The bill does so much across a broad range of topics and, in the time that I have, I want to touch on a couple more. Since coming into post, I have been determined to do what I can to ensure that no one in Scotland—especially no child—has to live in a tenanted property with damp and mould. That is why we have been clear that Awaab's law will be implemented across the social and private rented sectors in Scotland. My officials have already begun the series of round-table discussions with stakeholders that will help to bring in Awaab's law from March next year.

By way of background, Awaab's law is named after Awaab Ishak, who died in 2020 in Rochdale

in England, having been exposed to mould in his home. Although standards in Scotland have been rising gradually, to the extent that 90 per cent of all homes in Scotland are substantially free from damp and mould, we will not take any chances, especially not when it comes to the health and life chances of children.

I am conscious of the time, and this bold and ambitious bill does so much that I would like to mention, but another area of great importance to me is domestic abuse. It is utterly abhorrent, it is one of the leading causes of homelessness among women, and we must do all that we can to end it. That includes supporting the housing needs of women and children who are experiencing domestic abuse.

Among other things, the bill will create new rights to end a joint tenancy without an abusive joint tenant's approval. I have also confirmed that I will work to lay regulations under part 2 of the Domestic Abuse (Scotland) Act 2018 by Christmas to ensure that a victim survivor in a social home can stay in their home and remove a perpetrator of abuse. The bill will also require social landlords to implement policies to ensure that abuse or violence from a partner or former partner does not lead to somebody losing their home. That sits alongside a national fund to leave, which is backed by £1 million that the Government confirmed at the beginning of the month.

In opening, I have been able to touch on only three aspects of this groundbreaking bill. I have not yet been able to explore the system of long-term, evidence-based and balanced rent controls that the bill will create, nor the important rights to personalise a home. However, I will listen to members' contributions and reflect on those other areas in closing. In the meantime, I commend the Housing (Scotland) Bill to the chamber.

I move,

That the Parliament agrees that the Housing (Scotland) Bill be passed.

20:27

Meghan Gallacher (Central Scotland) (Con): Housing remains central to many of the challenges that our communities face. Our homes are the bricks and mortar that bind local cohesion. Access to good-quality housing should be the driving factor for us all. Sadly, the reality is that homelessness figures are at a record high, thousands of children are in temporary accommodation, there are unsustainable waiting lists, and local authorities are buckling under the pressure. There is a skills shortage and a declining housing sector.

The Housing (Scotland) Bill was born out of a pact that the Scottish National Party Government

made with the Scottish Greens. At that time, the Government did not understand that the consequence of far-left policies would be a bill that could devastate the housing market. I will admit that there has been some movement in that space in a last-minute attempt to offer an olive branch to investors and the private rented sector. At its core, however, this is a housing bill that proposes permanent rent controls and does not include a single line about building homes. It is a housing bill that is too broad in scope, and it should have been named the tenants' rights and homelessness prevention bill.

Rent control is a misguided policy. It is reckless and ideologically driven, and it could worsen the housing crisis. It could punish tenants, discourage investment and make Scotland a less attractive place to build the homes that we so desperately need.

We need to look at the facts. There were 19,288 homes built in 2024-25, which was down 4 per cent on the previous year. In the social sector, completions were at their lowest since 2016-17, with 4,490 completions, which was down 15 per cent. To reach the 110,000 affordable homes target by 2032, the Scottish Government needs to build around 10,000 homes a year, but it has achieved that only once since 2021, and it only built 7,444 affordable homes in 2024-25. Those figures are far below the figures that experts say Scotland needs each year to meet demand.

We know that developers and housing providers operate in a market that requires certainty. If rents are capped permanently and revenue streams are constrained, the incentive to build disappears. It is a simple economic fact that rent controls do not create homes—they prevent them. To compound the issue, damaging rent controls have already cost Scotland £3.2 billion in lost investment. That is the scale of the damage that is being wrought on the industry.

When fewer homes are built, tenants suffer the consequences. Competition for available properties intensifies, prices rise in uncontrollable sectors and homelessness continues to grow. That is not an abstract argument. In 2024-25, 17,240 households in Scotland were in temporary accommodation and, shockingly, that included 10,360 children. In 2024-25, there was a record number of 31,695 open homelessness applications. Behind every person who makes up that number is a heartbreaking story. All those numbers represent families who cannot find a safe roof over their heads, children who are moved from place to place, and vulnerable adults who live in uncertainty.

We ought to remind ourselves that the policies that we make and create in the Scottish Parliament have consequences. As I have said,

people desperately need homes. People on long waiting lists need hope and need politicians to understand the gravity of the crisis. They do not need policies that will potentially worsen the housing emergency, agreed to for ideological reasons.

The housing crisis is further compounded by a significant skills shortage in the construction sector. Scotland faces a gap of thousands of skilled tradespeople, bricklayers, joiners, plumbers and electricians. Industry reports show that more than 20 per cent of construction firms struggle to recruit the skilled workers that they need. That is not merely an inconvenience; it is a barrier to delivering new homes. These are the issues that should have been in the housing bill and that we should have been debating tonight. However, I will touch on the economic consequences of rent controls, because those consequences are equally stark to what is being experienced in our skills sector.

Research from multiple jurisdictions, including studies in London and parts of the United States, consistently shows that strict rent caps reduce investment in new housing. Developers delay projects, projects are cancelled, and fewer homes come on to the market. We cannot afford that: Scotland needs investment, not deterrence. We need ambition, not artificial constraints.

Furthermore, we must recognise the immense pressure that is on our local authorities. In an environment of year-on-year decline in budgets, councils are struggling to maintain existing housing stock, fund homelessness services and invest in new builds. Rising inflation, which, once again, is on the move, increases the cost of materials, wages and borrowing. That combination of pressures will inevitably reduce the number of homes that can be delivered. We need to look at affordable housing. We have spoken in the chamber many times about the affordable housing budget and the consequences that it has on local government.

We cannot in good conscience vote for a bill that will harm the possibility of building more homes that people desperately need and at the rate at which they need to be built. I thank cabinet secretaries Shirley-Anne Somerville and Màiri McAllan for the productive conversations that we have had during stages 2 and 3, although we clearly differ on what we believe will tackle the housing emergency. I hope that they will reflect on the bill. It has been too broad, and it does not address the housing emergency that is a priority for Scotland.

20:34

Mark Griffin (Central Scotland) (Lab): There are—absolutely—positive things in the bill, but let us be clear that it is a housing bill that will not build a single house. It will not bring a single new home into circulation, it will not bring immediate reductions in rent and it will not give local authorities the resources that they need to prevent homelessness. I support the bill because it will result in important improvements, but we all know that it could and should have gone so much further in the context of a housing emergency and a severe shortage of housing supply.

I am pleased that the Government accepted several of our amendments, including one that finally recognises, in law, that Scotland is in a housing emergency. We also secured improvements to factoring legislation and strengthened the bill's provisions on damp and mould through what is now being called Awaab's law. We also welcome the commitment to review the current grounds for eviction, which is long overdue. However, let us be clear that, despite the rhetoric, no-one will wake up tomorrow and find themselves in a rent control area. No-one's rent will go down because the bill has passed.

When the bill was introduced, there was no detail on what rent controls would actually look like, which caused more harm than good to efforts to build the homes that we so desperately need. After pressure, we now have a step forward. However, although the bill no longer threatens to harm supply, make no mistake: this is just a beefed-up version of rent pressure zones, and we all remember how effective those were.

We support mid-market rent and build-to-rent housing as part of a diverse housing mix, but the way in which those exemptions were introduced—late in the process, after a chaotic stage 2 and a change of minister two times over—raises serious questions across Government about how that policy was made and drafted in the first place. Initially including those sectors seriously risked housing supply, and I am not sure why it took so long for the Government to clarify its position on exemptions when it knew about the concerns about mid-market rent. It knew that it was an issue as much as three years ago, when we debated the emergency cost of living legislation.

As we finish our third day of consideration of this bill, 10,180 children are living in temporary accommodation, more than 40,000 families are homeless and rough sleeping is on the rise. We might grumble about the policy process of the bill, and we have valid complaints, but we cannot forget why, fundamentally, we are considering and voting for this law.

There are families, children and individuals out there who are being failed in horrendous ways by a system that is stretched to breaking point. That is why we welcome, in particular, the bill's focus on homelessness prevention, and particularly the new ask and act duty on public bodies. However, I have to say that those duties will work only if local authorities are properly resourced, and I feel that the Government's financial assessment of what it will take to implement specifically the ask and act and prevention duties is wildly optimistic. I hope that I am wrong and that the money that goes to local authorities will be enough to cover the costs of a proper and adequately resourced prevention system that stems the flow of people into the homelessness services, which are at breaking point.

We will support the bill because it contains improvements to the current system. However, it is not the transformative legislation that Scotland's housing crisis demands. We want to build houses and end homelessness, and we want rent controls that work not just in theory but in practice, and without harming supply. The bill is a step forward, but it is a very small step forward. We wish that we could vote for a more radical bill, but, in any case, we will vote for this one at decision time.

20:38

Maggie Chapman (North East Scotland) (Green): New year's day 1989 was a day of celebration for some—but, for many, it was the first of almost 40 years of runaway rip-off rents. Margaret Thatcher's Housing Act 1988 swept away rent controls, and working people have paid the price ever since.

Since 2010, rents for a two-bedroom flat have increased by 104 per cent in Lothian and by 82 per cent in Glasgow, but renters' wages have not gone up by anything like those amounts. So, what has happened? Exactly what that Maggie intended: a massive transfer of wealth from the poorest to those lucky enough to own property.

However, owning an asset is not an occupation. A basic human right to live in a warm, safe home has become a platform for profiteering. Today, Scotland rejoins the ranks of the many countries around the world that use rent controls to support affordable living. I am so proud that it was the Greens who introduced this bill and that I am another Maggie in the team, making it stronger and bringing back rent controls.

This bill, along with the rent controls that it will introduce, is the first stage of the new deal for tenants that the Scottish Greens promised. Renters will know that their rents should never increase by more than 6 per cent. The bill will give them certainty and will help them to better plan

their finances and lives. When rent notices are higher than they should be, renters can challenge them, and they will have more time to do so thanks to the Greens.

However, the system will not be as strong as it might have been. The bill will lock in above-inflation rent increases without considering the ability of renters to pay. The Parliament rejected my proposals for rent freezes and rent cuts, and it has opened the door to a range of exemptions. We should not build a two-tier system of protections in which some tenants are shielded and others are left to the mercy of the market. All renters deserve the same stability, no matter what roof they live under.

I am pleased that we are improving the evictions process by including more scope for delays during the winter months, although the outright winter ban that the Greens proposed would have been better. No one should live with the threat of eviction at a moment's notice, and I remain disappointed that Scottish renters will not have the same protections as English renters for the first 12 months of a tenancy.

If properly funded and implemented, the duty for public bodies to prevent homelessness—to step in when risk is first identified rather than when it is too late—will be a potential game changer. Housing first is another game changer. Giving homeless people with complex needs a long-term stable home and offering—but not forcing—health and other support services is tried and tested.

It will benefit so many people if the bill takes us closer to removing the cruel concept of intentional homelessness. Allowing someone to be assessed as intentionally homeless is a moral disgrace. Actions that might seem intentional often stem from trauma, violence and disadvantage.

It is right that we have made it easier for animal lovers who rent to keep pets and for people to make appropriate adjustments so that they can really feel at home. Although the introduction of Awaab's law is significant, there is still much more to do to drive up the quality of rented homes.

We are in the grip of a housing emergency not because we lack resources or capacity, but because, for four decades, our policies have prioritised profit over people—those who are homeless because of exploding rents and who are fighting for dignity in a system that is stacked against them. Housing instability crushes a person's spirit—it steals hope, erodes dignity and worsens inequality. We must not create another generation that is resigned to paying too much for too little. Instead, we must create a future in which everyone can say, "I have a home, I am safe and I am respected."

20:42

Willie Rennie (North East Fife) (LD): I praise the clerks and officials for their talent, their tolerance of this Parliament and their stamina. Their stamina has been outstanding throughout what felt like months at stage 2 and years at stage 3. I want members to show their appreciation. *[Applause.]*

The Liberal Democrats will vote for the bill. It is not the bill that we would have introduced, nor would we have gone through this process, which has knocked confidence within the sector at various stages. However, it is now a better bill and it is a bill worth voting for.

We are in a housing emergency. It is disappointing that it has taken a housing emergency for housing to get the priority that it has deserved for a long time. However, it has that priority now, and there should start to be some changes so that we can deal with the housing emergency.

This very day, Homes for Scotland told us that the number of new starts across all sectors is the lowest since 1996. We have a long way to go to build confidence within the sector. We need every part of the housing sector—it should be seen as one sector—to play its part in dealing with the housing emergency. Those who seek to demonise parts of it are undermining the very objectives that we are trying to achieve. We need the private sector—all those house builders who battle away through the various barriers at different times to build houses in communities that they care about. They want to deal with the housing emergency and to be partners, and we should welcome them as partners just like the public sector and charities. They will help us through this difficulty, and we should welcome their help.

There is a delicate balance to be struck in making sure that tenants have the rights that they deserve and the homes that they need, including family homes. However, we also need to do everything that we can to incentivise investment, and we have been pretty poor at that in recent years. There is still quite a bit of work to be done. I hope that the exemptions will be as generous as we can make them, in order to incentivise investment in mid-market rent and build to rent, but also significant investment by landlords. There should be measures to exempt them so that they can get a return on the investment; otherwise, we will find that we are not getting the appropriate investment in all properties, which is the thing that we desperately need.

We need to do an awful lot of work on planning, which is still seen as a barrier in many areas. I know that Ivan McKee is working hard to overcome that. We also need to work very

carefully on heat in buildings and on accessibility measures. I am in favour of them, but we need to get them right so that we incentivise that investment and get the best possible homes. Most of all, we have to build confidence, and for that we need stability and certainty—sometimes boring certainty—to make sure that house builders can invest for the longer term.

We will vote for the bill because it contains some really good measures on domestic abuse, homelessness and Awaab's law, and we will continue to work constructively with the Government, as we have done throughout the bill's passage, to make improvements. I commend the bill to the Parliament.

The Deputy Presiding Officer (Liam McArthur): We move to the open debate.

20:46

Alasdair Allan (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP): As someone who frequently raises the issue of affordable housing in relation to my constituency, I am pleased to speak in support of the Housing (Scotland) Bill, as well as the measures that the cabinet secretary set out recently in the Government's housing action plan.

Housing pressures remain acute across much of Scotland, and the lack of a private rented sector in many rural communities adds to the pressures there. I think that everyone acknowledges that, despite significant investment in housing over the SNP's time in government, challenges remain across our cities, towns and rural areas, but the bill will tackle those problems head on. This primary legislation will be useful in achieving those ends.

Under the SNP, Scotland is already the fairest place in the United Kingdom to rent, and the bill will build on that to create a sustainable, well-regulated sector. The bill is an essential piece of legislation that will help to advance tenants' rights and tackle homelessness in Scotland. As we have heard, measures in the bill will empower tenants, proactively prevent homelessness and provide certainty to encourage continued investment across the housing sector.

The recently published housing action plan outlines nearly £5 billion of investment over the next four years and focuses on three key areas—ending children living in unsuitable accommodation, supporting the housing needs of vulnerable groups, and supporting growth and investment in the housing sector.

Since coming to office in 2007, the SNP in government has built 40 per cent more affordable homes per head of population than England over the same period, and 70 per cent more than

Labour-run Wales. That is all against a backdrop of increased costs and challenges as a result of the financial crash, Brexit and the pandemic, as well as the severe limits that are placed on Scotland's borrowing powers.

In my constituency, work has begun this year on 12 new social housing units in Leverburgh in Harris. That might not sound a big number but, to a small community where no social housing has been built for 50 years, it could represent the difference that means the local care home staying open, a business continuing to be able to operate or local health services being able to function. The local community council and housing association are to be commended for their efforts in bringing that project to fruition.

At the other end of the scale, I can think of the 74-home development at An Allt Dubh outside Stornoway, which was visited recently by the First Minister and is one of a number of larger projects under way to improve access to affordable housing in the islands.

It is important that we continue investing in affordable housing to ensure that it is available to all of Scotland's communities. That flexibility ensures that the higher cost per unit of building in rural communities is not a barrier to progress. We must also continue helping community organisations and landowners to build affordable homes by using tailored support such as the rural and islands housing fund.

There remains much work to do to ensure that everyone in Scotland has a high-quality, long-term and affordable home, but the measures set out in the bill demonstrate the Scottish Government's commitment to tackling the housing emergency. I commend the cabinet secretary for her on-going efforts in bringing the bill, and the accompanying housing action plan, to fruition.

20:50

Edward Mountain (Highlands and Islands) (Con): I have struggled with this housing bill because I have wanted to engage with it, but every time I have tried to engage, it has proved difficult.

At the stage 2 amendment stage, the relevant committee met on the same day as the committee that I am on, so I was unable to attend most meetings, although I managed to attend on a few occasions to try to speak to some amendments. However, the amendments that I did manage to lodge and that were debated and agreed on at the committee stage were promptly reversed when it came to stage 3. That is really hard to take when a member has worked hard on a bill.

I have also found it hard to be in the chamber and hear, in line with a point that Willie Rennie made, all landlords of rented accommodation being tarred with the same brush. I am not embarrassed to say that I am a landlord and that I provide good-quality houses for long-term homes—I do not do short-term lets. During the course of this meeting, we have heard landlords being described as “wolves” of the private sector, being accused of a lack of concern and being said to weasel their way out of things. We have heard about grotesque and ludicrous rents, but that is not something that I recognise in the sector that I have worked in for 30 years. In 99 per cent of cases, landlords want to provide a home and to have a long-term relationship with their tenants, because those relationships make it easier for everyone. They allow the house to be well looked after and the landlord and tenant to come to an agreement on areas where there may be issues. I am bitterly disappointed when I hear that sort of language about landlords being used in the Parliament.

I remind Ms Chapman, the member who used that language and who is here, that there are something like 300,000 private rented properties across Scotland. However she might view landlords, they help by providing homes for individuals who cannot afford to buy their own homes. This Parliament has made legislation in the past about rent increases, and I think that that has worked in most cases.

I must also allude to the fact that I lodged 69 amendments during the course of stage 3. I did that because I thought that they were necessary, so to hear comments about them being unnecessary, not appropriate or not the right approach to take, and to hear others say that they “cannot commit today” or “might talk later” or that they “support the principle” but cannot agree to the amendment actually makes a mockery of the process. I am in the chamber to try to make the bill better, but I do not think that I have managed to do that in any shape or form.

I say to the cabinet secretary that she should remember the results of a survey carried out recently by Safe Deposits Scotland and published while we were here this afternoon. That survey found that 33 per cent of landlords want to get out of letting properties—that is 100,000 houses that would be taken out of the rented sector. Some in the chamber would argue that those would become homes that people would be able to buy, but only 62 per cent of those homes would go into private ownership and not all would be affordable for the people who need to rent properties.

Màiri McAllan: Will the member accept an intervention?

Edward Mountain: Do I have time, Presiding Officer?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There is no time in hand.

Edward Mountain: I am sorry, cabinet secretary, but I cannot.

I do not think that the bill strikes the right balance between getting it right for tenants and incentivising landlords to make their properties better and to invest in them in the future. They will have a huge amount to do to reach net zero, but this bill will put them off.

20:54

Davy Russell (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab): The big problem with the bill is that, from its outset, it looked to address the symptoms that we see in our housing sector rather than the underlying problems. However, we must acknowledge that the bill will mean some relief for those who are at the sharp end of the rented sector. Clearly there has been too much uncertainty and confusion, as well as loopholes. The bill takes a few steps forward when it comes to evictions, succession to tenancies, the rights of pet owners and homelessness, to name but a few issues, so it has positive aspects.

However, although the powers that it provides to introduce rent control areas may sometimes be necessary, they will not be sufficient to stem the tide of rising rents that are affecting the bottom end of the market. For a young family who are looking to guarantee their future and for parents who are looking to help their child to take that big step on to the housing ladder, the bill does nothing.

The bottom line is that there is a lack of affordable housing, which is putting strain on councils and registered social landlords alike and driving up rents. That is a key factor in the process.

By and large, the most common complaint that I receive from constituents is from families who are stuck in housing that is too small for them. They might be in their parents' house or their grandparents' house. In some cases, they leave one of their older children to live with other members of the family. The bill does not solve that issue, but it should have had a plan for that.

As I said a couple of weeks ago in the chamber, Scotland has 250,000 homes with damp, mould and condensation issues. We have had amendments that relate to how quickly landlords can fix those issues, but the bill should have challenged the reasons why there are 250,000 damp and mouldy homes in the first place.

I will close on this point. Post-first world war council house building was incredibly ambitious for the time, with revolutionary ideas—it seems strange to say this nowadays—such as indoor toilets for the working class. I believe that, in 2025, the Parliament of this country ought to be equally ambitious. That ambition should start with the idea that everybody should be able to afford to live somewhere that is warm, safe, dry and energy efficient. The bill combats some issues in the housing sector, but not the issues of housing.

I will vote in favour of the bill as a stepping stone towards something better, and I encourage all members to do the same.

20:57

Jeremy Balfour (Lothian) (Ind): I start by agreeing with Willie Rennie that we should give a big thank you to all the clerks who have worked so hard on the bill and helped us with it. I also thank third sector organisations, particularly Crisis, for their positive engagement over the past years.

For me, this is a disappointing night—a night of missed opportunities. The bill was an opportunity for us to do something really quite radical and different around housing and homelessness. I fear that after we have passed the bill—as we will do in a few minutes' time—people will look back and see it as a missed opportunity.

I cannot vote for the bill for two reasons. First, as a representative of Edinburgh and Lothian, I say that rent controls will have a devastating effect on the Edinburgh property market. If we look at the evidence around the world, we know that that will be the case. There will be more homelessness and more people struggling to find accommodation because of that measure.

Secondly, I believe that the work on preventing homelessness represents another missed opportunity. Like Mark Griffin, I hope that history will prove me wrong. I think that the ask and act provisions could have been so much better; we are being asked to jump into darkness. We will not have the benefit of a pilot programme to know whether that will or will not work. Having no data sharing, a lack of money and pressure on local authorities, on the third sector and on the national health service will all work against us.

The bill is a missed opportunity. The Government should go back and rethink it. I hope that I am wrong, but I fear that I am not.

21:00

Graham Simpson (Central Scotland) (Reform): This has been a real marathon; however, it has felt as though we have run this course before—as we have. Many of the stage 3

amendments, which have been debated over three long nights, were also debated at stage 2, when they were mostly not moved following promises of talks with the Government. Some of those talks took place, but some did not. We have ended up with a bill from which good ideas have been jettisoned, and the Government has got its own way on everything.

The bill is well intentioned but fundamentally flawed. It risks undermining the very goals that it claims to pursue—affordable, quality housing and a thriving rental sector. Instead, it introduces sweeping rent controls that will deter investment, reduce housing supply and, ultimately, hurt the very people it aims to protect.

I lodged amendments to help students, but none of those made it—not even the one that said that councils should include student housing in their local housing strategies. I proposed exempting build-to-rent and mid-market rent properties from ruinous rent controls. Even though the cabinet secretary agreed with that, those amendments did not make it either. We have ended up with a system in which those sectors will be exempted through regulations so as not to stifle investment, but the private rented sector will not be exempt. Quite why that will not stifle investment is beyond me—because it will.

Rent controls are a blunt instrument. They do not address the root causes of housing unaffordability, which are a chronic lack of supply and planning bottlenecks. The bill centralises too much power in ministers' hands by leaving key decisions to secondary legislation with limited scrutiny.

There are some good measures on homelessness; I want Awaab's law; and the measures on domestic abuse are good. However, I cannot vote for the bill because of the rent control measures, which will be extremely damaging.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: We move to closing speeches.

21:02

Ariane Burgess (Highlands and Islands) (Green): As we close our debate on the bill, let us return to the fundamentals: who the bill should serve and what we must demand if we are serious about delivering justice in housing. Too often, in the Parliament and in the media, discussions about housing are dominated by landlords, developers and big finance. We must recentre our debates so that they reflect the needs of the people and communities who rely on us to speak up for them.

The Scottish Greens have always insisted that housing is a human right, not a profit engine. That

is why we have pushed hard for rent controls that have real teeth, tougher standards to improve housing quality for everyone and the rectification of the unjust imbalance between tenants' rights and landlords' rights. The very fact that a housing bill is in front of us is due to the Scottish Greens. I thank my colleague Patrick Harvie, who introduced the bill and its key measures while serving as a minister. His work is a tangible demonstration of the fact that, when Scottish Greens are elected, they get things done.

The bill offers real progress. It introduces powers for local rent controls to cap annual rent increases in designated areas. It strengthens rights around repairs and security of tenure. Scottish Green amendments also pushed the Government to make changes in key areas.

The bill is a huge step forward for renters, although I am disappointed that it has been watered down in some areas. Improvements that were suggested by us in concert with experts such as Shelter Scotland and Generation Rent have not been agreed to.

The Scottish Greens highlighted how second homes and long-term empty properties must be part of the solution. Unlocking those homes is essential for communities from which local people are priced out. We have been clear that we must support community-led housing and co-operative models and provide stronger powers for local authorities to tackle landlord inaction on safety issues such as damp and mould.

I am concerned about some of the bill's shortcomings. Exemptions risk creating a two-tier rent control system, and above-inflation rent rises are still possible. Tenants must wait until 2027 for full protection, even though they need that now. Students risk being abandoned to the wild west of unregulated accommodation, and we need stronger compulsory purchase powers for empty homes. Ross Greer's focus on fairer taxation would have provided tools to deal with that. *[Interruption.]*

The bill is a test of our values. Will we side with working people and the vulnerable or with powerful interests? Too many Scots are in despair. Families are struggling with rents, students are in poor-quality overpriced housing and communities are being hollowed out by second homes. The Scottish Greens have put forward a vision of tenant empowerment, local accountability and community-led housing solutions. I championed tax relief for co-ops to make them viable, Maggie Chapman warned us not to reinforce inequality and Ross Greer challenged us to create a more just system.

I, too, recognise the work of MSPs from other parties and thank them for it. Mark Griffin worked

diligently on a wide range of issues, including emphasising issues to do with the housing emergency; Meghan Gallacher has introduced some welcome changes; and I share Richard Leonard's concerns about the shameful condition of accommodation for agricultural workers, which must be acted on urgently.

Renters, families, students and all who are at risk of homelessness are watching us tonight, and they need us to act with courage and integrity. Let the bill be the beginning, not the end. Let us deliver housing that works for people all over Scotland.

21:06

Pam Duncan-Glancy (Glasgow) (Lab): Deputy Presiding Officer, I apologise for the interruption earlier. I was looking for a figure on my phone, but when clicking on the message with the answer in it, I accidentally clicked on a message with sound, so forgive me for that.

I am pleased to close today's debate on behalf of Scottish Labour. We have heard numerous times throughout this debate, and many others, that Scotland is in the midst of a housing emergency. Although that terminology is now commonplace, the gravity of the situation cannot be overstated. As my colleagues Mark Griffin and Davy Russell have set out, Scottish Labour will support the bill today because it recognises the emergency in law and it moves us forward on other crucial areas, including Awaab's law, reviews of eviction grounds and rules on factoring.

However, we are clear that the bill is a missed opportunity. It fails to solve the fundamental problem of the lack of housing supply in Scotland, which is desperately needed to end the housing emergency, and it does not introduce proper and workable rent controls.

The reality is that the Government has done far too little far too late, so homelessness has risen on its watch. Figures that were released last week lay bare the stark reality of the situation in my region of Glasgow alone. More than 1,000 cases of rough sleeping were reported last year, and the overall number of people sleeping rough is rising to a record high across the country.

In Glasgow, there has been an 11 per cent increase in the number of people living in temporary accommodation—that is more than 4,000 people and is the highest number since 2022. Those people are living in Glasgow without somewhere permanent to call home. Furthermore, there has been a 9 per cent increase in homelessness applications.

Despite the current situation in Glasgow and across Scotland, the SNP Government has cut

funding for the affordable housing supply programme in real terms.

As I said, we will support the bill on the basis that I have set out, but it was an opportunity to change the direction of all that. Nonetheless, it brings some improvements, including those that were added by my colleagues and me.

I am pleased that the Government was supportive of amendments that sought to make it easier for students to end their tenancy in specific circumstances. However, it is disappointing that my proposals on a purpose-built student accommodation charter and strategy were rejected.

I am also disappointed that other crucial amendments, such as my colleague Katy Clark's amendment to support women fleeing violence, Paul Sweeney's amendments on common buildings insurance, which would have protected many residents in Glasgow and elsewhere, or Mark Griffin's amendment that would have allowed people with rent arrears to move to more suitable accommodation, have not made it into the bill. I hope that the Government will take urgent action in those areas, and Scottish Labour will continue to press it to do so.

I want to mention briefly the experience of disabled people. First, I thank members, including Jeremy Balfour and Meghan Gallacher, for their support on those issues today. Many disabled people require accessible homes. That means adapting old ones and building accessible new ones. That is why I moved the amendments that I did today.

I am pleased that the Government has committed to updating building regulations to make provision for accessibility and suitability for disabled people within two years of the act coming into force. That will be welcome news to the tens of thousands of disabled people waiting on housing lists for a home that suits their needs. With 25 years having passed since accessibility standards were reviewed, that is a significant step forward, but there is much more to be done in this space. Adaptations are a key part of that—they are a truly tangible, preventative approach to future proofing our homes.

It is, therefore, incredibly disappointing that the Government failed to support amendments on that aspect today and instead opted for a review. The time for reviews is over, and the time to act is now; I hope that the Government will reflect on that.

As I have set out, the bill moves us forward on some areas, so Scottish Labour will support it. However, as a whole—with no more homes built as a result; in the absence of proper and workable rent controls; and in the face of more reviews, with no action—the bill is a missed opportunity to

address the housing emergency in Scotland. On such an emergency, the SNP has not met the challenge and, for that reason, we encourage it to go further and faster to end the housing emergency in Scotland.

21:10

Alexander Stewart (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con): I am happy to close on behalf of the Scottish Conservatives.

The bill has had a long and difficult journey to where we now find ourselves. It was 10 months ago that we started stage 1; stage 2 covered numerous weeks of meetings of the Local Government, Housing and Planning Committee; and stage 3 has taken up almost three full days of parliamentary business.

However, the legislation, despite all the time that we have spent on it, still does not represent the response to Scotland's housing crisis that we so badly need. Despite all that time, we will not see one single home built as a result of the bill, and it also risks fracturing the lives of hundreds of thousands of privately rented households in Scotland.

Many stakeholders, including organisations such as Scottish Land & Estates and the Scottish Association of Landlords, have continued to warn that the rent control proposals in the bill will hurt supply in the private rented sector. Members on the Conservative benches have raised concerns about those proposals since the start of the process, and we have spoken about examples in countries such as Sweden and Germany, where rent controls did not lead to proper investment in housing. The SNP's failed experiment with rent caps in 2022 has not stopped the Government trying to make those damaging measures permanent. As I said, stage 3 has been a long time coming, and yet the bill will not contribute anything.

In the debate, Meghan Gallacher said that improving the supply of houses should be a driving factor. That is not happening, but the bill will put in place permanent rent controls, which is misguided, as it will ensure that investment does not take place. Rent controls do not make homes. The bill will see fewer houses built and homelessness continue to grow. It is a missed opportunity. Councils will struggle to cope, and the bill will not do anything to help the housing emergency.

Willie Rennie spoke about stamina. We have had a huge amount of stamina in going through stage 2 and stage 3, but the outcome is disappointing. What we have achieved is a long way from building confidence in the sector. It is not what the sector needs—the balance is not there, and planning is still a barrier. What we needed

was confidence, stability and security, and we have none of that.

Edward Mountain spoke about the way in which landlords have been demonised in the bill process, and the language that has been used. The needs of both residents and tenants and landlords need to be looked at in the long term to ensure that things will get better. In reality, the bill will not make things better—it will mean that there are still inequalities. Edward Mountain highlighted the finding that 33 per cent of landlords no longer want to continue in the business, and that is not the balance that we want to see.

In the debate, we have heard a narrative that pitches tenants against landlords. As I have said, that is not the narrative that we need to hear, but it is the inference from the proposals in the bill. Despite the Bute house agreement ending more than a year ago, the SNP appears to have fallen hook, line and sinker for the narrative that rent controls need to be in place.

It is time to talk about that narrative. We need to talk much more about the solutions that are needed. We need an attempt to increase the housing supply, and we have tried to move that forward. The bill was an opportunity to realise that and to deal with the housing emergency, but it has catastrophically failed to achieve what was set out. The bill is a missed opportunity, and it will risk making the housing crisis even worse—*[Interruption.]* For those reasons, Scottish Conservatives will certainly not support the bill at decision time—*[Interruption.]*

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I would discourage members on the front bench from repeatedly heckling in that way.

21:14

Màiri McAllan: After that lively contribution from the other side of the chamber, I wish to begin on a point of consensus, by acknowledging the considerable cross-party support for the bill that we have managed to foster. We ought to be proud of that, as that has not always been the case. We have been on a journey with certain aspects of the bill. Recently, though, when I have been speaking to housing stakeholders, among the many things that they have regularly remarked to me is how pleased they are to see politicians from across the chamber working together—not least on the very important exemptions from rent control that we have agreed today.

On that point of consensus, I particularly acknowledge Willie Rennie's contribution. I agree with him about much of what he has observed, and I thank him for his considered approach and his support.

I also acknowledge something that Alasdair Allan said. In a landscape of statistics and much strain on the system, we can get caught up in requiring a significant shift in the numbers, but Mr Allan pointed out that even comparatively small developments of affordable homes can be transformational in communities. That, among many other things, is what the Government's affordable housing supply programme is supporting.

I am very pleased that Labour, the Liberal Democrats and the Greens have confirmed that they will vote for the bill tonight. However, I am frankly astonished that the Conservatives have taken the position that they have—that they will not support the bill. That is utterly appalling. I want to be clear to them that what they are voting against is what somebody with lived experience of the indignity and trauma of homelessness described as the chance to change the course of a life.

Meghan Gallacher: I am astonished that the cabinet secretary has made that statement, to be frank. If members consider what I have said and what the Scottish Conservatives have said this evening, they will find that we are principally opposed to rent controls. That is what we are against. As I have said, the bill is not a housing bill; it is a renters' rights and homelessness prevention bill. If the Government had embarked on that track, it might have had much more success. We cannot and will not vote for a bill that does not tackle the housing emergency. We cannot and will not vote for a bill that will stifle investment—but it looks as though that is what the Government's priorities are.

Màiri McAllan: However much Meghan Gallacher tries to explain it away, the Conservatives have completely undermined any credibility that they remotely had on impacting homelessness—

Edward Mountain: Absolute nonsense.

The Presiding Officer (Alison Johnstone): Let us hear one another.

Màiri McAllan: —or on dealing with the housing emergency. We will not let the Conservatives forget it, and neither will the people of Scotland.

In her contribution, Meghan Gallacher said that the bill will not build houses, and Mark Griffin echoed that to an extent. Let me tell them both what will build houses: the housing emergency action plan that the Government published just four weeks ago, which provides for nearly £5 billion-worth of investment in the coming years. That is enough to build 8,000 affordable homes this financial year alone and up to 36,000 such homes over the next four years. We published that plan just four weeks ago. Today, I hope that we

will vote for a bill that will prevent homelessness in the first place, that will protect tenants from damp and mould, that will support the housing needs of women who are suffering domestic abuse—*[Interruption.]*

The Presiding Officer: Let us hear one another.

Màiri McAllan: —that will create rights for tenants to end their tenancies and to personalise their homes, and that will create a system of evidence-based rent controls.

I am afraid that the characterisation of rent controls by members at both ends of the chamber is a little skewed and inaccurate. On the one hand, the Conservatives have to acknowledge the severe strain that tenants face when their rents become uncontrollable and begin to rise or escalate in an uncontrollable way. That feeds homelessness from the private rented sector. On the other hand, I have to appeal to Green colleagues to see that the care and balance that I and Willie Rennie have been talking about are absolutely critical to our housing system. The exemptions that I began by talking about are therefore very important. What the Government has presented in the bill responds to the needs of tenants who are struggling with escalating rents; equally, it provides confidence and ensures investment in our housing system that will ultimately increase availability and, therefore, affordability.

I was asked recently what a home meant to me—*[Interruption.]*

The Presiding Officer: It is fair to say that this debate has been carried on over several days in a courteous environment. I would be grateful if we could carry that through to the end.

Màiri McAllan: I am just coming to an end—I realise that it has been a long session for everybody.

I was asked recently what a home meant to me, and I answered, fairly off the cuff, that it was about safety, relaxation and a place to spend time with family. However, I have been thinking about it since, and it reminds me of something that I used to do when I was training as a lawyer. I would be travelling early in the morning, trying to get to work before the partners—although that never worked out. It was always dark, and I would just sit and rest my head against the bus or train window and look at all the houses that I was passing. Some of them would be in darkness, where the family was still asleep. Some of them would have a little sign of life—a smoking chimney—and others would have a little glowing light. To me, that is what a home is: it is that little burning light against a dark, cold morning.

That is exactly what the Government wants—it wants that opportunity to be available to everybody in Scotland. Through a combination of the bill and our housing emergency action plan, we are absolutely providing that to the people of Scotland.

Committee Announcement (Delegated Powers and Law Reform Committee)

The Presiding Officer (Alison Johnstone):

The next item of business is an announcement by the Delegated Powers and Law Reform Committee on instruments considered during the first quarter of parliamentary year 2025-26. I call Stuart McMillan, the convener of the committee, to make the announcement.

21:21

Stuart McMillan (Greenock and Inverclyde)

(SNP): I am grateful for the opportunity to make this announcement on behalf of the Delegated Powers and Law Reform Committee regarding our recent report on the Scottish statutory instruments laid between mid-May and the start of this month.

It is an unprecedented step for our committee to seek to highlight one of our reports, which looks at the quality of the instruments. However, we felt that the issues that we have recently identified merited being raised in the chamber, which we hope will spur an improvement by the Scottish Government.

Our role is unique. We consider all subordinate legislation that is laid before the Parliament. As the report lays out, there was a marked decline in the quality of instruments that were laid before the Parliament in the first quarter of this parliamentary year. That change is identifiable in three main ways. First, and perhaps most prominently, the number of instruments that have been reported on under the reporting grounds that are laid out in rule 10.3.1 of the standing orders has increased to 28 per cent. To contextualise the figure, I note that the next highest percentage of instruments drawn to the attention of the Parliament in a quarter of this parliamentary session was 14 per cent, which is half the figure from the most recent report. More typically, the percentage figure is between 5 and 10 per cent.

Secondly, the number of reporting grounds engaged by individual instruments has also increased. Although an instrument may typically be reported on one or, occasionally, two grounds, we have had multiple instances of several reports being made for one instrument. There were 30 reports for just six instruments that were laid in this quarter, including one SSI that had eight reportable issues. Those errors have been identified across several policy areas, so this is of note to everyone in the chamber.

Finally, a number of the instruments that we have drawn to the attention of the Parliament this quarter have engaged serious reporting grounds,

with four issues reported on the ground of the drafting appearing to be defective.

The Scottish Government has committed to correcting many of the errors, which is to be welcomed. However, the fact that errors are happening so often now is a cause of concern for the committee.

The Delegated Powers and Law Reform Committee encourages the Scottish Government to work to improve the overall quality of instruments that are laid before the Parliament. I hope that for the rest of the parliamentary session and into the next one, the number of issues that are reported will fall back.

Parliamentary Bureau Motion

21:23

The Presiding Officer (Alison Johnstone): The next item of business is consideration of Parliamentary Bureau motion S6M-19135, on committee membership.

Motion moved,

That the Parliament agrees that Sarah Boyack be appointed as a member of the Economy and Fair Work Committee.—[*Graeme Dey*]

The Presiding Officer: The question on the motion will be put at decision time.

Decision Time

21:24

The Presiding Officer (Alison Johnstone): There are two questions to be put as a result of today's business. The first question is on motion S6M-18992, on the Housing (Scotland) Bill at stage 3. As it is a motion to pass a bill, the question must be decided by division. I would be grateful if members, who have been voting throughout the afternoon, were to refresh their screens.

The question is, that motion S6M-18992, in the name of Màiri McAllan, on the Housing (Scotland) Bill at stage 3, be agreed to. Members should cast their votes now.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Choudhury, Foyso (Lothian) (Ind)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Leonard, Richard (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]

Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab) [Proxy vote cast by Michael Marra]
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Dowe, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)

Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division on motion S6M-18992, in the name of Màiri McAllan, on the Housing (Scotland) Bill at stage 3, is: For 89, Against 28, Abstentions 0.

Motion agreed to,

That the Parliament agrees that the Housing (Scotland) Bill be passed.

[Applause.]

The Presiding Officer: The final question is, that motion S6M-19135, in the name of Graeme Dey, on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, on committee membership be agreed to.

Motion agreed to,

That the Parliament agrees that Sarah Boyack be appointed as a member of the Economy and Fair Work Committee.

Meeting closed at 21:26.

This is a draft *Official Report* and is subject to correction between publication and archiving, which will take place no later than 35 working days after the date of the meeting. The most up-to-date version is available here:
www.parliament.scot/chamber-and-committees/what-was-said-and-official-reports/official-reports

Members and other meeting participants who wish to suggest corrections to their contributions should contact the Official Report.

Official Report
Room T2.20
Scottish Parliament
Edinburgh
EH99 1SP

Email: official.report@parliament.scot
Telephone: 0131 348 5447

The deadline for corrections to this edition is:

Tuesday 28 October 2025

Published in Edinburgh by the Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body, the Scottish Parliament, Edinburgh, EH99 1SP

All documents are available on
the Scottish Parliament website at:

www.parliament.scot

Information on non-endorsed print suppliers
is available here:

www.parliament.scot/documents

For information on the Scottish Parliament contact
Public Information on:

Telephone: 0131 348 5000
Textphone: 0800 092 7100
Email: sp.info@parliament.scot

