OFFICIAL REPORT
AITHISG OIFIGEIL

DRAFT

Meeting of the Parliament

Wednesday 24 September 2025

Session 6

The Scottish Parliament
Pàrlamaid na h-Alba

© Parliamentary copyright. Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body

Information on the Scottish Parliament's copyright policy can be found on the website - www.parliament.scot or by contacting Public Information on 0131 348 5000

Wednesday 24 September 2025

CONTENTS

	Col.
PORTFOLIO QUESTION TIME	1
DEPUTY FIRST MINISTER RESPONSIBILITIES, ECONOMY AND GAELIC	1
Gross Value Added (Growth)	1
Visitor Levy (Impact on Hotel and Tourism Sectors)	2
Town Centres (Development)	4
Small Business Support (Coatbridge and Chryston)	7
International Trading Links	8
Glasgow City Region Deal (Transport and Connectivity)	10
City Region Deals (Major Projects)	11
POINT OF ORDER	12
PORTFOLIO QUESTION TIME	13
FINANCE AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT	13
Budget 2025-26 (Aberdeenshire Council)	13
Empowering Communities Programme	14
Local Authority Senior Officer Pay and Conditions	15
Road Safety (A84)	16
Budget 2025-26 (Waste Management Services)	17
Social Housing (Funding)	18
Public Sector Pay Deals	19
United Kingdom Budget	20
RESIDENTIAL OUTDOOR EDUCATION	22
Statement—[Natalie Don-Innes].	
The Minister for Children, Young People and The Promise (Natalie Don-Innes)	22
MOTION WITHOUT NOTICE	33
Motion moved—[Graeme Dey]—and agreed to.	
HOUSING (SCOTLAND) BILL: STAGE 3	34
BUSINESS MOTION	245
Motion moved—[Graeme Dey]—and agreed to.	
DECISION TIME	247

Scottish Parliament

Wednesday 24 September 2025

[The Deputy Presiding Officer opened the meeting at 14:00]

Portfolio Question Time

Deputy First Minister Responsibilities, Economy and Gaelic

The Deputy Presiding Officer (Liam McArthur): Good afternoon. The first item of business is portfolio questions, and the first portfolio is Deputy First Minister responsibilities, economy and Gaelic. I advise the chamber that there is a lot of interest in supplementaries. As members will know, we are under considerable time pressure across the afternoon and into the evening. Therefore, I require brevity in questions and responses if we are to get through them all.

Gross Value Added (Growth)

1. **Liam Kerr (North East Scotland) (Con):** To ask the Scottish Government for what reason Scotland will see the slowest GVA growth of the devolved nations over the next three years, according to the EY "UK Regional Economic Forecast 2025". (S6O-04962)

The Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Economy and Gaelic (Kate Forbes): Economic forecasts continue to underline the economic headwinds that we face, which are particularly difficult for an open, trade-focused economy such as Scotland. We have prioritised driving growth through investment and innovation and addressing economic inactivity with the limited powers that are at our disposal. However, if I could choose one issue that directly answers the member's question, it would be that we face distinct demographic challenges. There is a strong need to boost our working-age population and seize the significant economic opportunities that are available to us which, in turn, would drive GVA growth.

Liam Kerr: I thank the cabinet secretary for that answer, but interrogating the data shows that, following 18 years of Scottish National Party rule, Aberdeen is projected to be the slowest-growing city in the United Kingdom, with falling household incomes between 2025 and 2028. Having hammered Aberdeen through a naive and ignorant presumption against oil and gas, an unevidenced low-emission zone, Scotland's highest tourist tax and a business rates regime that is killing Union Street, what exactly is the Government going to do to reverse Aberdeen's suffering under the SNP?

Kate Forbes: Let us be very clear on a point of agreement, which is that there are significant economic challenges across our regions. The member will know, particularly in the oil and gas industry, that companies that have unfortunately made part of their workforce redundant have nearly always cited the adverse impact of the energy profits levy. If memory serves me right, it was Mr Kerr's party that introduced that.

Audrey Nicoll (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP): The Scottish economy is currently part of a UK economic model that is less productive, with lower national income per head and greater inequality than independent countries that are comparable to Scotland. The UK's relatively poor economic performance was evident before Brexit, which has made our economic prospects even worse. Can the Deputy First Minister outline how making decisions in Scotland, combined with our economic strengths, will lead to better outcomes?

Kate Forbes: The member is absolutely right to highlight those points. As I mentioned in my opening answer, there are particular challenges around the working-age population. Time and again, when I speak to businesses about their growth aspirations, they talk about the importance of securing the right skills. That comes from investing in training and skilling our population. However, without expanding the working-age population, it becomes a case of one employer taking skills from another employer in a circular way. The point is that, without devolution, which would allow a more progressive approach to visas and immigration, those issues will remain.

Visitor Levy (Impact on Hotel and Tourism Sectors)

2. **Craig Hoy (South Scotland) (Con):** To ask the Scottish Government what recent discussions the business minister has had with ministerial colleagues regarding the impact of the visitor levy on the hotel and tourism sectors. (S6O-04963)

The Minister for Business and Employment (Richard Lochhead): The Scottish Government recognises the importance of the visitor economy and ministers regularly discuss how to grow the sector further. The Visitor Levy (Scotland) Act 2024 gives councils broad powers to shape a levy that suits local needs and benefits communities, councils and businesses, while supporting tourism. Some areas want greater flexibility, so, as the chamber heard yesterday, we are exploring options to extend powers and allow single or tiered flat-rate models in addition to the current percentage-based approach. Tourism stakeholders are involved, and the Minister for Public Finance will keep colleagues updated as that work progresses.

Craig Hoy: The minister should be ashamed about the chaos into which the Scottish National Party's tourist tax has descended. Across Scotland, councils are consulting on the visitor levy, and some are on the point of introducing it, but huge uncertainty now hangs over them. Dumfries and Galloway Council is consulting on its plans, and local hotelier Matthew Wallace, who runs the Cairndale hotel and spa in Dumfries, says that there is no overtourism problem in the region. He adds that the levy is just a further increase in taxation and makes the region needlessly more expensive.

Will the minister join me in urging the Scottish Government to pause the implementation of the levy until it listens to the very real concerns of businesses in Dumfriesshire and fixes the problem that the Government has created?

Richard Lochhead: I am surprised that, given his experience, Mr Hoy appears not to appreciate the fundamental point of the legislation, which is to enable local authorities to introduce the levy, should they so wish, after consultation with their local tourism sectors and wider communities. The Scottish Government does not impose the levy on any part of Scotland; we enable local authorities to take advantage of the legislation, should they so wish, and to do so in a way that is tailored to local circumstances. I know how valuable the visitor economy is to the south of Scotland.

I have visited Dumfriesshire many times. It is undergoing a revolution in tourism at the moment, and has a very positive story to tell. The member should make those representations to his local authority, and it should take those concerns on board.

Evelyn Tweed (Stirling) (SNP): The Visitor Levy (Scotland) Act 2024 gives businesses the opportunity to work with local councils to generate funding for enhanced facilities, heritage events and the promotion of local culture. Does the minister share my view that, in many cases, the visitor levy can enhance the visitor experience by making destinations more attractive and competitive?

Richard Lochhead: I absolutely agree with the member's points. We should remember that 21 out of 27 European countries have some type of occupancy tax that is broadly equivalent to the visitor levy, and they do so for the very reasons that the member outlines.

Many people whom I have spoken to in the tourism and hospitality sectors of Scotland are relaxed about the levy. We want to ensure that it is implemented where appropriate and in an appropriate manner locally. That is, of course, a discussion for local authorities.

Our communities face many issues, and they want them to be addressed through the improvement of infrastructure to enable them to cope with the number of tourists and visitors in their areas. Money being put back into the community to grow local facilities and infrastructure is a positive story that people want to tell. It is only a good thing for visitors and local communities.

Fergus Ewing (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind): Does the minister agree that the Scottish Government has sought, by way of an amendment to the Housing (Scotland) Bill, to bring in the power for local authorities to change the levy to a flat tax or to provide that as an option? Will he confirm that that request was made but was rejected by the Presiding Officer? If it was made, does that not prove that the Government has accepted that the law is flawed? If it is flawed, will the Government now pause it and correct the flaw by bringing forward primary legislation, or is tourism not important enough?

Richard Lochhead: As I explained to the chamber yesterday, having listened to the sector, the Minister for Public Finance has been exploring how to find a legislative vehicle to introduce further flexibility. Of course, if we had not listened to the sector, members would right now be protesting that we were not listening to it, but we are listening to it and are looking for opportunities to introduce further flexibility. Clearly, there was consultation on the original legislation, and there have been further comments from industries since then. We are responding to the feedback that we have been hearing, and we are listening closely to the concerns of the sector.

Town Centres (Development)

3. **Davy Russell (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab):** To ask the Scottish Government what steps it is taking to redevelop town centres across Scotland. (S6O-04964)

The Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Economy and Gaelic (Kate Forbes): We want our town centres to be revitalised. That is backed up by policies such as our leading town centre first principle, the delivery of the town centre action plan and provision of support through the national planning framework 4.

We also provide direct financial support for town centres through the regeneration capital investment programme, the place-based investment programme and the regeneration capital grant fund. That includes investment of more than £62 million this year alone to help transform vacant properties, bring them back into productive use and unlock opportunities for

housing, business and enterprise activity in town centres.

Davy Russell: I am sure that many colleagues across the chamber, including the Deputy First Minister, will now be familiar with my constituency, which mirrors many towns throughout Scotland that have been starved of funds and neglected over the past 18 years when the Scottish National Party has been running Scotland.

Members will also know that, although there remains a distinct Hamiltonian identity, the town centre is in much need of regeneration—the issue was in the top 3 during my election campaign. However, thanks to budding potential from renewables, digital, cybersecurity and infrastructure projects, Hamilton is primed for growth—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Question.

Davy Russell: —from new industries. As a result, the town centre must be fit for purpose and able to embrace the growth. At the same time—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I need a question, Mr Russell.

Davy Russell: South Lanarkshire Council has undertaken a comprehensive consultation and allocated £8 million to kick start the redevelopment. However, it needs Scottish Government—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I need a question, Mr Russell.

Davy Russell: Can the Scottish Government match the £8 million that South Lanarkshire Council has put in?

Kate Forbes: It is for South Lanarkshire Council to develop plans for Hamilton town centre, and it sounds as though it is doing so. I am aware that the council published details of that 15-year master plan for Hamilton town centre and that there was strong support when the plans were consulted on.

South Lanarkshire Council has received more than £27 million of regeneration capital investment since 2014, which includes £3.4 million through the town centre fund.

We will continue to work with local authorities such as South Lanarkshire Council on their priorities.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have a number of supplementaries. I will try to get in as many as I can.

Murdo Fraser (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con): There are many town and city centres, such as in Perth in my region, where there are a large number of former commercial premises that will never come back into use for retail. They could potentially be converted to residential properties, but the current process for doing that is cumbersome, bureaucratic, expensive and time consuming. Can the Scottish Government look at some way of streamlining the planning process to make it easier for the owners of those properties to transfer them from commercial use to residential use?

Kate Forbes: There are a number of points that I agree with, not least because of the potential to revitalise Perth town centre, of which I have great memories.

There are a number of non-domestic rates incentives for bringing vacant properties back into use. We have also gone through a consultation process on compulsory purchase of property that has remained empty and derelict for some time.

If there are particular suggestions on how to streamline the process to enable residential development to take place, I am certainly open to them, and I imagine that the planning minister is as well.

Emma Roddick (Highlands and Islands) (SNP): The retail sector is vital to Scotland's economy and supports our local communities with services, amenities and employment opportunities.

Can the Deputy First Minister say any more about what the Scottish Government is doing to support Scottish businesses and regenerate our local areas, in particular through the investing in communities fund, which has provided £336,000 for New Start Highland in my constituency?

Kate Forbes: I am a big fan of New Start Highland—I saw some of its representatives at an event on Monday.

The member is absolutely right to talk about how critical the retail sector is. It is right at the heart of our agenda for economic growth. We have provided funding for the Scotland Loves Local campaign, the regeneration funding that I mentioned and, of course, the competitive non-domestic rates regime.

The investing in communities fund targets the most disadvantaged communities to deliver projects, services and activities that address poverty and disadvantage. We are providing more than £9 million in funding this year, which makes an enormously valuable contribution to organisations such as New Start Highland.

Jamie Greene (West Scotland) (LD): I hope that the Deputy First Minister will be as appalled as I was to learn that Port Glasgow was awarded the dreaded carbuncle award for the most dismal town in Scotland. Thankfully, sense has been seen. There has been a huge U-turn, and the award has been ditched in favour of the heart on

your sleeve award. However, there is a serious point behind all this. Many small towns and high streets feel unloved and forgotten, and their Government in Edinburgh feels distant to them.

What more can the Scottish Government do to ensure that the so-called carbuncles of Scotland's retail deserts can be turned into busy, buoyant and bustling town centres instead?

Kate Forbes: I put on record how much I love Port Glasgow—I am a huge fan of Port Glasgow. I have probably spent more time than many travelling to Port Glasgow in the years that I have been a minister, for very obvious reasons.

The member mentioned a number of different points that have driven the challenges for town centres, including the move to online shopping, which is a challenge for the retail sector in particular. I am very committed to working with local authorities and local leaders on the ground to deliver master plans or transformation for those areas.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Question 4 was withdrawn.

Small Business Support (Coatbridge and Chryston)

5. **Fulton MacGregor (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP):** To ask the Scottish Government what targeted support it is providing to small businesses in Coatbridge and Chryston to help them deal with inflation and rising costs. (S6O-04966)

The Minister for Business and Employment (Richard Lochhead): The Find Business Support website offers a centralised platform for accessing public sector support across the country. Businesses in Coatbridge and Chryston can explore available grants, funding and advice, as well as events that are tailored to their needs. To help businesses to manage rising operational costs, the cost of doing business section provides guidance and funding opportunities that support greener, more efficient and financially resilient practices.

The Scottish Government also offers a competitive non-domestic rates regime, with a package of reliefs that is worth an estimated £733 million this year. That includes the most generous small business rates relief in the United Kingdom. As of 1 June 2024, 4,110 properties in North Lanarkshire benefited from 100 per cent relief through the small business bonus scheme.

Fulton MacGregor: Given the significant pressures that local firms in Coatbridge and Chryston—especially those in our town centres—continue to face with rising energy bills and supply chain costs in particular, will the minister set out how the Scottish Government will ensure that support is targeted at and reaches the small businesses that need it the most? What further steps is the Government considering to help to sustain jobs and protect local economies in communities such as mine?

Richard Lochhead: In her answer to another member's question, the Deputy First Minister outlined some of the steps that we are taking as a Government. We will continue to support businesses and communities with our competitive non-domestic rates package. We have also allocated more than £236 million in the current financial year to Scottish Enterprise to support its work to deliver transformational projects across the country. The most recent figures show that, last year, it supported, helped to create or safeguarded more than 15,000 real living wage jobs, which was the second-highest figure on record.

Because the member mentioned the rising cost of energy bills, I urge him to signpost his local businesses to Business Energy Scotland. Although UK energy policy is being mishandled by the UK Government—that has been the case for many years, despite Scotland being an energy-rich country—we are doing what we can to help businesses to bring down their energy bills. A local butcher in my constituency saved a lot of money by contacting Business Energy Scotland after I referred him to it.

International Trading Links

6. **Annabelle Ewing (Mid Scotland and Fife) (SNP):** To ask the Scottish Government what its current priorities are for international trading links. (S6O-04967)

The Minister for Business and Employment (Richard Lochhead): Our export strategy, "A Trading Nation", sets out the focus of our trading links. That was updated and published on 11 September. Europe and North America remain key markets for Scottish exporters and there are increasing opportunities in the Gulf and east Asia. The creation of a category for special interest markets also enables our enterprise agencies to engage flexibly with fast-growing emerging markets such as Brazil, Mexico, Indonesia, Singapore and South Korea. The addition of Ukraine also empowers us to bolster trade with that country in its hour of need.

Annabelle Ewing: The minister will be aware of the vital role that connectivity plays in international trade. I ask him to clarify where matters stand with regard to getting the proposed Rosyth to Dunkirk ferry over the line, specifically on what I understand is the key outstanding issue. What actions need to be taken by the Scottish Government and what actions are required to be

taken by the United Kingdom Government to allow Grangemouth to be designated as a border control post on a temporary basis for the purposes of freight being transported on the new ferry route?

Richard Lochhead: I thank Annabelle Ewing for raising an important issue in her constituency. I am aware that she has met the Deputy First Minister to discuss this topic and has been in correspondence with her. We continue to communicate with potential operators and Scotland's main ports to explore opportunities for new commercial ferry services so that our exporters and passengers have more direct routes to and from Europe.

On the obstacles that the member referred to, I know from first-hand experience that a main obstacle is the border control post requirements, which were brought in due to the UK exiting the European Union. There have been some recent announcements by the UK and the EU on potentially relaxing some of those obstacles through the sanitary and phytosanitary agreement, as it is known. However, until the effects and conditions of the agreement is known, it is difficult for the Scottish Government to provide certainty about future border control post requirements. As the member will appreciate, our officials are continuing to discuss those matters with the sponsors and with UK colleagues.

Alexander Stewart (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con): The minister claims to be focused on international trade, yet Scottish exports to the rest of the United Kingdom are worth three times more than exports to the EU and the rest of the world. Why is the Scottish National Party so obsessed with grandstanding abroad, instead of strengthening the most important trading relations, which are right here with the rest of the UK?

Richard Lochhead: I do not know what to say—I feel speechless after hearing that point. Is the member honestly suggesting that Scotland should abandon our international trade links and the tens of thousands of jobs in Scotland that rely on exports to overseas markets, in particular to the US but also to Europe? Of course, if we had stayed within the European Union, we would have obtained many more of the benefits of that relationship.

The member must be the only member in any Parliament in the world—maybe not in the whole world, but certainly in the countries that I can think of—who would argue that we should cut off our international links. Of course trade with the rest of the UK is extremely important to Scotland's economy, but so is international trade. As a country of 5.5 million people, if we want to grow our economy, we have to look towards the rest of the world as a big market, as well as to the rest of the UK.

Glasgow City Region Deal (Transport and Connectivity)

7. **Monica Lennon (Central Scotland) (Lab):** To ask the Scottish Government what discussions the economy secretary has had with ministerial colleagues regarding how the Glasgow city region deal can support improvements to transport and connectivity across the region. (S6O-04968)

The Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Economy and Gaelic (Kate Forbes): We regularly discuss matters of importance with colleagues to ensure that we are securing strong economic growth, including with regard to transport investment. The Glasgow city region deal is supporting a range of projects to strengthen regional transport and connectivity.

Monica Lennon: I welcome that update. Residents in Lanarkshire are in favour of more action to make public transport more affordable and accessible, but they do not favour proposals by the Scottish National Party Glasgow City Council to introduce a charge for drivers visiting the city. Does the Deputy First Minister agree that that would be the wrong policy direction? Will she and the Government accelerate plans to boost transport and connectivity investment to support people in Lanarkshire, not punish them?

Kate Forbes: Without wanting to comment on decisions that are rightly to be taken by local authorities, because I am a strong believer in local decision making, I agree with the importance of integrated transport links, additional and improved transport links and ensuring that all parts of the region benefit, including Monica Lennon's constituents in Lanarkshire.

A number of commitments through the city region deal emphasise transport. It is always worth remembering that it is a Glasgow city region deal; it is not just about the town centre.

Clare Adamson (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP): It is vital that the Scottish Government continues to work to stimulate economic development, growth and connectivity across all regions of Scotland. Will the Deputy First Minister say more about how the growth deals and strategic targeted investment from the Scottish Government are enhancing economic opportunities and innovation across Scotland?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: As briefly as possible, Deputy First Minister.

Kate Forbes: There are a number of examples of how the growth deals have supported the delivery of transport links, connectivity and improved infrastructure. What is important about the deals is that they are done on a tripartite arrangement. In other words, they are directly

informed by local priorities, with the support of local authorities and the UK Government.

City Region Deals (Major Projects)

8. **Sue Webber (Lothian) (Con):** To ask the Scottish Government what action it is taking to ensure that major projects funded through city region deals are delivered at pace through administrative hurdles, to avoid any rising costs or communities waiting unnecessarily for planned infrastructure. (S6O-04969)

The Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Economy and Gaelic (Kate Forbes): As part of our £1.9 billion commitment to the deals programme, we provide regional partners with the opportunity to lead on the delivery of major long-term infrastructure projects that will unlock transformative economic growth opportunities. That could be the Fife industrial innovation investment programme or the Edinburgh innovation hub, through the Edinburgh and south-east Scotland city region deal. In other words, deal-funded projects must adhere to statutory processes, but they are ultimately led and informed by local partners.

Sue Webber: I accept the premise that local decision making is a priority, but we are facing congestion at Sheriffhall that is frustrating for drivers and is holding back the economy of the Lothians and, frankly, all of south-east Scotland by making transport for businesses slower and far less reliable. Why has it taken two years for ministers to even consider the outcome of the public inquiry, which was submitted back in October 2023? When will the decision be made that we will get our Sheriffhall roundabout?

Kate Forbes: We are keen to see progress being made. More than 1,200 items of evidence were lodged for that public local inquiry, which indicates the extent of the interest in it. That also needs rigorous scrutiny from technical and legal advisers, and they need to be separate from those who are involved in the promotion of the project. Consequently, only a small number of people are working on the decision-making advice, and they are also the only people to be sighted on the inquiry report. We await advice on that from those officials.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: With apologies to those whom I was not able to call, that concludes portfolio questions on Deputy First Minister responsibilities. There will be a brief pause before we move to the next portfolio to allow members on the front benches to change.

Point of Order

14:25

Fergus Ewing (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I have given very brief notice of this—necessarily, because it just arose after an answer from Minister Lochhead, as well as an answer from Minister McKee yesterday. With respect, it is a very important matter. I seek your guidance under rule 9.8.4 of standing orders, which is the part that deals with stage 3 amendments and which states that there may be amendments that are inadmissible.

It has been contended by me twice to the relevant ministers, both today and yesterday—Ministers Lochhead and McKee—that the Scottish Government sought to lodge an amendment to the Housing (Scotland) Bill that would have had the effect of amending the Visitor Levy (Scotland) Act 2024 in order to empower local authorities to charge a flat tax in addition to, or instead of, a percentage rate. The Government has said not that it was minded to do that, but that it is considering doing that. However, if it is the case that the Government lodged an amendment, it is a matter of fact that it decided that it wished to do that. The Government cannot thereafter say that it is considering doing it.

I do not expect that you will necessarily be able to give a reply now, Presiding Officer, because this is a point of principle and one that I certainly have not heard raised in the chamber before, but my question is this: what is the status of inadmissible amendments? If the Government lodges an amendment that is declared to be inadmissible, are the public ever entitled to hear about it? Is the Government required to publish that amendment? I cannot see any requirement under standing orders that it does so, but where something is a matter of clear public interest, does democracy not require that the public and MSPs have a right to be told the truth? Was there an amendment or not? If we cannot be told the truth, is that not a very serious defect in the powers of this Parliament democratically to hold our Government to account?

The Deputy Presiding Officer (Liam McArthur): Thank you, Mr Ewing. As you will be aware, the Presiding Officer responded to a similar concern that was raised yesterday. I will ensure that the comments that you have just made are further reflected on. If there is anything further that can be added, I will ensure that the chamber is kept updated.

Portfolio Question Time

14:28

Finance and Local Government

The Deputy Presiding Officer (Liam McArthur): The next portfolio is finance and local government. Again, we have the same provisions that I set out earlier in terms of the time pressures that we are under over the course of this afternoon and this evening.

Budget 2025-26 (Aberdeenshire Council)

1. **Alexander Burnett (Aberdeenshire West) (Con):** To ask the Scottish Government what analysis it has undertaken of the potential impact of the funding allocated in its budget 2025-26 on Aberdeenshire Council's ability to invest in local infrastructure and support economic development. (S6O-04970)

The Cabinet Secretary for Finance and Local Government (Shona Robison): The 2025-26 budget provides local government in Scotland with record funding of more than £15.1 billion. As a result of the Scottish budget, Aberdeenshire Council received a record funding settlement worth £627.7 million to support day-to-day services. How that funding is deployed to deliver local services, statutory duties and nationally agreed priorities is of course a matter for locally elected members.

Alexander Burnett: It is clear from conversations with constituents that local services are their biggest priority. Those services are overstretched and underfunded by the Scottish National Party Government, with potholes that will not be fixed, grit bins being removed and bridges closed, breaking communities in two. Park bridge closed in 2019 and Aboyne bridge closed in 2023. Those are just two examples of more than 50 bridges that are at risk in Aberdeenshire.

Record funding aside, Aberdeenshire Council remains one of the lowest-funded local authorities in the country, because it receives around 10 per cent less funding per head than the Scottish average, despite being the third-largest geographic area. Will the cabinet secretary commit to ensuring that Aberdeenshire Council receives the funding that it needs to maintain its critical infrastructure?

Shona Robison: I welcome Alexander Burnett's acknowledgement in his supplementary question that there was record funding for local government and for Aberdeenshire Council. If memory serves me correctly, the independent Accounts Commission has confirmed that there has been a real-terms increase in funding over the past three years.

It is up to each council to decide which infrastructure priorities to take forward. We help with the capital allocations to local government, which also has the ability to borrow to progress infrastructure investment projects. The funding formula that Alexander Burnett referred to is agreed by the 32 local authorities through the Convention of Scottish Local Authorities. It is not for the Scottish ministers to change the funding formula, so I suggest that he takes up that issue with COSLA.

Empowering Communities Programme

2. **Bill Kidd (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP):** To ask the Scottish Government what assessment it has made of the empowering communities programme, including the impact of the investing in communities fund. (S6O-04971)

The Cabinet Secretary for Finance and Local Government (Shona Robison): Our empowering communities programme is a much-valued mechanism that provides funding to communities across Scotland to support delivery of regeneration. The programme covers a range of community funds and grants that build capacity in our communities and deliver regeneration, including the investing in communities fund. To understand their impact, the funds and grants are routinely assessed through established grant monitoring and reporting processes.

Bill Kidd: The programme, particularly the community fund, has been a huge success story across Scotland, and nowhere more so than in my constituency of Glasgow Anniesland, where Kingsway Community Connections' proud, capable and confident programme received more than £280,000 of funding to build social capital in the community, and it has become part of the heart of the community.

Given the programme's success and impact, can the cabinet secretary give an indication of the future of the fund when the current three-year funding round comes to a close?

Shona Robison: I echo those comments on the value of projects such as Kingsway community connections. Decisions concerning future Scottish Government funding programmes will be considered and addressed through the budget and the spending review processes.

All organisations that receive funding from the ICF are aware that it is a three-year fund and have been asked to consider how their projects will be sustained after the ICF funding period ends on 31 March 2026, but those will be active discussions.

Local Authority Senior Officer Pay and Conditions

3. **Stephen Kerr (Central Scotland) (Con):** To ask the Scottish Government what discussions it has had with the Convention of Scottish Local Authorities about increasing the transparency of senior officer pay and conditions alongside improved democratic oversight and accountability. (S6O-04972)

The Cabinet Secretary for Finance and Local Government (Shona Robison): The Scottish Government respects the independence of local government and it is for individual councils to manage their own budgets and workforce, including their senior officers.

However, I am aware of recent press coverage of senior council officers' early retirement and redundancy payments. I note the findings of the Accounts Commission's recent report on the situation. I urge all councils to take action in response to the report's recommendations in order to uphold the highest levels of integrity in our public services and to prevent similar situations from occurring in the future.

Stephen Kerr: The cabinet secretary is absolutely right to mention the Accounts Commission's report on what happened in Glasgow, where senior council officers saw fit to award themselves eye-watering sums in pay-offs. I have no doubt that we will all be equally appalled the next time that it happens, unless action is taken, so I ask the cabinet secretary to go further in her answer to me.

Today, will she commit to re-establishing proper democratic oversight in our councils by issuing clear guidance that decisions on senior officer pay-offs must rest with elected councillors and not be quietly delegated to officers? Will she further commit to monitoring compliance with that guidance and reporting back to the Parliament?

Shona Robison: Let me say a few things about that. The Accounts Commission wrote to every council to ensure that its recommendations were carefully considered. We will work with local government to support elected members and council officers to operate with integrity and transparency.

It is important that every council implements the Accounts Commission's recommendations. It concluded that there was an absence of independent scrutiny from councillors and of formal documentation detailing how decisions were made and whether they demonstrated value for money. Councillors were not informed about those decisions, and they should have been involved in the decision-making process.

Governance arrangements have to be improved. The new chief executive of Glasgow City Council has rectified many of the issues, with input from councillors. The Accounts Commission report will lead to all local authorities implementing the recommendations to ensure that nothing like what happened in Glasgow can happen anywhere else.

Tess White (North East Scotland) (Con): Huge sums of taxpayer money have been used to line the pockets of penny-pinching paper pushers in Glasgow as they sail off into taxpayer-funded early retirement. There is no accountability. Will the cabinet secretary ensure that there is a code of conduct for council chief executives and officers, with proper sanctions, to stop rogue officers exploiting the public purse for personal gain?

Shona Robison: I reiterate that the Accounts Commission has investigated and has written to every council to highlight its recommendations and the importance of elected members and officers following the Nolan principles of public life. As I said, the new chief executive of Glasgow City Council has rectified the issues, with input from councillors. The council leader, Susan Aitken, has made clear her absolute outrage at what happened in the authority, and an agreement has been reached with Strathclyde Pension Fund for the former chief executive to repay some money to the council.

These are serious issues, but it is important to be clear that there has been no inference that such practice is widespread across our local government structures. The issue was particular to Glasgow City Council, and the Accounts Commission has responded in a very strong manner.

Road Safety (A84)

4. **Evelyn Tweed (Stirling) (SNP):** To ask the Scottish Government how much it has allocated in its budget for the improvement of road safety on the A84 trunk road between Stirling and Lochearnhead. (S6O-04973)

The Cabinet Secretary for Finance and Local Government (Shona Robison): Through the 2025-26 casualty reduction budget, Transport Scotland has programmed £120,000 for road safety work on the A84.

Evelyn Tweed: Will the cabinet secretary explain the budget prioritisation process and how the views of local communities are reflected in it?

Shona Robison: Evelyn Tweed will appreciate that responsibility for Transport Scotland and its operations is outwith my portfolio, but I will get the Minister for Agriculture and Connectivity to write to her with details of how the prioritisation process

works. I am sure that the minister will be happy to meet Evelyn Tweed to discuss those matters in more detail.

Budget 2025-26 (Waste Management Services)

5. **Maurice Golden (North East Scotland) (Con):** To ask the Scottish Government what funding it has allocated from its budget 2025-26 to support local authorities to improve waste management services, in line with its plan for a transition to a circular economy. (S6O-04974)

The Minister for Public Finance (Ivan McKee): The 2025-26 budget delivered record funding of more than £15.1 billion for local government, which represented a real-terms increase of 5.5 per cent, as confirmed by the Accounts Commission. How that record funding is deployed to deliver local services and statutory duties, such as waste management services, alongside nationally agreed priorities is, of course, a matter for locally elected members.

In addition, we are making one of the biggest investments in a generation to modernise recycling in Scotland through the £70 million recycling improvement fund. In 2025-26, £13.9 million is allocated to local authority projects to improve recycling and reuse services.

Maurice Golden: Clearly, record funding and the recycling improvement fund are not working, because recycling rates in Scotland have stalled. The 2013 target has still not been met more than a decade on, so there is clearly a need for sustained support to help councils to make the required progress. Does the minister agree that ring fencing extended producer responsibility funds for recycling infrastructure could provide a stable, long-term solution that could also deliver wider investment and new jobs across Scotland?

Ivan McKee: The fund that Maurice Golden refers to is managed by the United Kingdom Government, which allocates that money directly to local authorities. We are engaging with the Convention of Scottish Local Authorities and the UK Government on how the fund is operating, but, as I said, we are not responsible for its collection or management.

Statistics show a reduction of 61 per cent since 2011 in the amount of Scottish waste that is landfilled. The recycling rate in Scotland was 62.2 per cent in 2023, which represents significant progress. Only around 14 per cent of the waste that we produce is processed elsewhere. Therefore, we are making progress, but we recognise that there is more work to be done in this area.

Sarah Boyack (Lothian) (Lab): The key to delivering a circular economy locally and to creating jobs is to set targets for reuse. Spain, Portugal, France and Belgium are making progress on it, so will the Scottish Government set a reuse target and support local authorities with advice and finance to deliver on it?

Ivan McKee: As I have indicated, our recycling improvement fund has allocated more than £66 million to 48 projects and 27 local authorities in order to deliver more frequent recycling collections and boost Scotland's capacity to recycle problematic materials such as plastic film. We are also the first Government in the UK to commit to action on single-use vapes—from 1 June 2025, they can no longer be stocked or supplied in Scotland. We are taking measures to make a difference, and the numbers demonstrate that we are making progress.

Social Housing (Funding)

6. **Christine Grahame (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP):** To ask the Scottish Government what discussions the finance secretary has had with ministerial colleagues regarding different funding models that may be available to finance the building of social housing, in light of the approach adopted by Falkirk Council which awarded Hearthstone Investments £30 million through its local government pension scheme fund to invest in social and affordable housing in 2015. (S6O-04975)

The Minister for Public Finance (Ivan McKee): The investment by the Falkirk pension fund was accompanied by significant public subsidy to deliver affordable homes. In recent years, ministers, including the Cabinet Secretary for Finance and Local Government, have focused on models that can leverage more investment to make public subsidy stretch further. A return is needed no matter the source of the capital, whether it is public sector pension funds, capital markets or traditional borrowing.

On housing, recent market testing for our new fund for mid-market rent has shown strong demand and that it will be able to build on the investment that has already been secured, including from public and private pension funds through similar routes.

Christine Grahame: Notwithstanding that it will need some public funding, I put this proposal because it is my understanding that the total of the local government pension scheme fund in Scotland amounts to almost £60 billion, which is 140 per cent of what is required to service the pensions. Does the minister agree that that 40 per cent surplus—which, at the very least, is just under £20 billion—could be invested in building social housing for rent, which would be an ethical investment of local government pension funds

and, importantly, would contribute to reducing council waiting lists for housing?

Ivan McKee: Christine Grahame is absolutely right to raise that issue. She will know that the £60 billion figure for Scottish pension funds is, pro rata, significantly higher than the figure for the United Kingdom as a whole and that Scotland's 11 local government pension schemes are in a strong position.

I met representatives of local government pension schemes and others last week to press the case for them to invest more of their resources in housing and other infrastructure opportunities in order to support Scotland's economy.

The Deputy First Minister is leading overall on that work to attract more investment into Scotland's economy so that our performance and capital investment can match our successful performance in attracting foreign direct investment. That is something that we will continue to do.

I reiterate the point that, in order to build affordable housing, no matter the source of the capital, significant public subsidy is required.

Public Sector Pay Deals

7. **Alexander Stewart (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con):** To ask the Scottish Government what assessment it has made of whether its current above-inflation public sector pay deals have appropriate contingencies in place, in light of the recent rise in the consumer price index and reported concerns regarding inflation. (S6O-04976)

The Cabinet Secretary for Finance and Local Government (Shona Robison): The Cabinet Secretary for Finance and Local Government (Shona Robison): Pay costs are managed in line with the Scottish Government's wider financial management approach, which reflects the requirement to balance its budget in-year. That means that spending must not exceed income in any financial year. To manage the impact of additional pay costs, cabinet secretaries are responsible for setting and managing their portfolio budgets in-year, including for pay. We remain focused on delivering fair pay while ensuring that the public pay bill remains fiscally sustainable.

Alexander Stewart: Does the cabinet secretary accept that prioritising above-inflation pay rises can fuel further inflation while, at the same time, draining funds from vital areas such as social care and capital expenditure? Consistently going above pay policy makes unions more likely to push for even higher settlements. Is it not time that the Scottish Government was honest about trade-offs instead of pretending that there is a limitless supply of money from the taxpayer?

Shona Robison: It is interesting that Alexander Stewart mentions social care. We have supported pay in the social care workforce to ensure that we can recruit into that workforce to look after our growing elderly population and those who need that level of support. That was a very interesting example for Alexander Stewart to use.

We have set out the requirement for multiyear pay deals, which is important, because that allows us to have certainty and to reduce the risk of any industrial action, which brings its own huge costs. Through those multiyear pay deals, we are able to take forward the important reform work that Ivan McKee is leading on through the public service reform strategy.

United Kingdom Budget

8. **Stuart McMillan (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP):** To ask the Scottish Government what recent discussions it has had with the UK Government regarding the next UK Budget, which will be delivered on 26 November. (S6O-04977)

The Cabinet Secretary for Finance and Local Government (Shona Robison): I met the new Chief Secretary to the Treasury, James Murray, on Monday, when I impressed on him the need to prioritise investment in public services, infrastructure and support for the most vulnerable in society in the UK autumn budget. I will have further conversations with him next month. It is vital that the UK budget delivers the funding that Scotland needs.

Stuart McMillan: I note the slashing of capital spend by the UK Government that was forecast in the Scottish Government's medium-term financial strategy. Can the finance secretary please advise me what impact that will have on the Scottish Government and on local authorities, which want to invest in public services and public infrastructure in Scotland?

Shona Robison: The UK spending review means that Scotland's capital block grant will reduce by 1.1 per cent in real terms between 2025-26 and 2029-30. That is compounded by the historic real-terms cut to our block grant by the previous UK Government and by sustained high levels of inflation.

Work is under way to develop the next multiyear Scottish spending review and infrastructure pipeline. Difficult decisions will need to be taken to reprioritise our capital programme to ensure that it is deliverable and fiscally sustainable and that it drives progress against our priorities.

The Deputy Presiding Officer (Liam McArthur): That concludes portfolio questions on

finance and local government. I am minded to suspend the meeting briefly, as we are missing a couple of colleagues for the next item of business.

14:48

Meeting suspended.

14:49

On resuming—

Residential Outdoor Education

The Deputy Presiding Officer (Annabelle Ewing): The next item of business is a statement by Natalie Don-Innes on improving provision and access to residential outdoor education for children and young people in Scotland. The minister will take questions at the end of her statement, so there should be no interruptions or interventions.

14:50

The Minister for Children, Young People and The Promise (Natalie Don-Innes): I welcome the opportunity to address the Parliament to provide an update on the Scottish Government's on-going support for outdoor learning provision for our children and young people and, in particular, on our formal position on the financial resolution for the Schools (Residential Outdoor Education) (Scotland) Bill, which was introduced by Liz Smith. As members are aware, for Liz Smith's bill to proceed to stage 2, a motion for a financial resolution must be lodged within six months of the conclusion of stage 1. I very much welcome the engagement that I have had with members from across the chamber, and I thank the member in charge, Liz Smith, for the constructive discussions that we have held.

I am pleased to confirm that, following very careful and full consideration of the matter, the Scottish Government has today lodged a motion for a financial resolution for the bill, which we will vote to support when ministers move the motion tomorrow. I trust that that will come as welcome news to members from across the chamber.

As I have made clear to members since stage 1, the Scottish Government absolutely recognises the important role that outdoor learning in all its forms, including residential outdoor education, can play in supporting the development of our children and young people. That is reflected in our refreshed learning for sustainability action plan, which was published in 2023. It might be helpful to briefly note some of the Government's activity in that regard for the Parliament's awareness more widely. The work includes the new Scottish outdoor learning strategic working group, which will provide recommendations next month on how the Government and partners can continue to strengthen support for outdoor learning. Education Scotland is supporting the Association of Heads of Outdoor Education Centres and the Scottish Advisory Panel for Outdoor Education in the development of a quality residential framework and a training resource for outdoor education

centre instructors. Systemic change is being delivered through the curriculum improvement cycle, which is strengthening the place of outdoor learning across the three-to-18 curriculum, and we continue to provide pupil equity funding and the learning estate investment programme, which many schools make use of to support delivery of residential and on-site outdoor learning.

What that package of work demonstrates is that, even in the absence of legislation, the Scottish Government is working with partners across the education sector to improve provision of and access to impactful, safe and varied outdoor learning experiences, including residential outdoor education. Our schools and dedicated school staff are doing their best to ensure that pupils can benefit from such experiences. For example, Cedarbank school, an additional support needs school in West Lothian, is committed to ensuring that all pupils across broad general education receive two hours of outdoor learning a week, and all subject areas across the senior phase are encouraged to integrate regular outdoor learning as part of lesson plans. Pupils at Ulva primary school on the Isle of Mull take part in regular outdoor learning through activities such as weekly shore school, learning key skills and taking ownership of their whole learning environment.

There is an important reason why I mention all that. The Scottish Government acknowledges the significant positive opportunity that Liz Smith's bill represents, but, as it progresses to stage 2, we must ensure that the legislative approach aligns with and builds on, but does not detract from, all the good practice that is already under way to deliver outdoor learning across the system.

Although the Government accepts it as the Parliament's will that the bill proceeds to stage 2 and is therefore lodging the necessary financial resolution, the Parliament has a responsibility to ensure that the bill, should it become law, is fit for purpose, meaning that it is affordable and, of course, deliverable. I have discussed that at length with Liz Smith, and I am grateful to her for her willingness to work through a range of options. That will include further considering the total potential costs of the bill, equity of provision and workforce implications. All those issues were recognised by the lead Education, Children and Young People Committee in its stage 1 report, and they have formed a central focus of my discussions with Liz Smith to date, as members are aware.

Indeed, the Education, Children and Young People Committee concluded that the bill should only progress if concerns relating to the affordability and deliverability of the provisions were addressed.

As I said, the Government respects the will of Parliament that was clearly demonstrated at stage 1 when it supported the bill's moving forward. The onus is now on the Parliament to work with the member in charge of the bill—and, indeed, the Government—to address the challenges that have been raised in relation to funding. I assure members that the Government will play its part.

The Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills and I have discussed with Liz Smith how she, as the member in charge, and the Government may look to continue to work constructively together as the bill progresses. That we have established a shared understanding in that regard is important, as we are now beyond the point—as set out in standing orders—at which the Government would otherwise seek to take on the bill as Government legislation.

Specifically, we have agreed that, as the member in charge of the bill, Liz Smith will work with the Government on stage 2 amendments to address the challenges of affordability and deliverability, which relate to the duty to fund, the targeting of those children who might benefit the most and a change in commencement.

I believe that, across the Opposition parties, there is a wider recognition of the need to, and a willingness to, robustly consider amendments that seek to ensure that the bill will be more affordable. Amendments must also reflect the need for equity of provision and the time that will be required for the outdoor education sector to build sufficient readiness in advance of any new statutory duties coming into effect.

Further close collaboration with a range of stakeholders, including outdoor education centres, teacher trade unions, the Convention of Scottish Local Authorities and the Association of Directors of Education in Scotland will be critical in informing stage 2 considerations. That is why I am pleased to confirm that Liz Smith has also agreed to develop, with the Government, a work plan that will set out activities to be undertaken, led by the member in charge, in the lead-up to the stage 2 proceedings to help to further address outstanding concerns and to develop draft amendments.

I have offered to undertake certain engagements with Liz Smith on a joint basis. Support from my officials will also be made available, as appropriate, to further the policy development and analysis that will be necessary to shape a suitable way forward that best takes account of the outstanding issues.

As part of our most recent conversation, Liz Smith discussed with ministers potential approaches to addressing the known challenges that the bill as introduced presents for the teacher workforce. We have also shared initial thinking on

the potential role of capital investment in supporting improvements across the outdoor education estate. Those issues require more focused deliberation.

I am assured, and I am grateful, that the member in charge is open and willing to explore compromises in her bill to help to mitigate unintended consequences and to strengthen the feasibility of implementation, should the bill become law. Importantly, we discussed the fact that, in working to strengthen the deliverability of the bill, there must continue to be a focus on ensuring equity of provision and equity of access to residential outdoor education so that all pupils have the opportunity to experience the range of benefits that such activities can provide. For example, it is widely accepted that residential outdoor education can deliver improvements in personal development, behaviour, attendance and pupil-teacher relationships. Therefore, that will remain at the heart of the Scottish Government's interactions with the member in charge and the Parliament more broadly as the bill progresses.

Subject to the Parliament agreeing to the motion for the financial resolution tomorrow, I assure members that I and Liz Smith will swiftly engage again to agree the details of a work plan. Of course, we must make the best use of the time that will be available ahead of the formal stage 2 proceedings to make the progress and improvements that are required.

The Scottish Government recognises the opportunity that the bill presents for children and young people across Scotland, but we must get it right. I look forward to working with the member in charge and members from across the Parliament to ensure that we do so.

I am now happy to take questions.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The minister will now take questions on the issues raised in her statement. I intend to allow around 20 minutes for questions, after which we will move to the next item of business.

I call Liz Smith, who joins us remotely.

Liz Smith (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con): I apologise profusely for not being in the chamber in person. The reason for that—the Finance and Public Administration Committee's visit to the Lithuanian Parliament—is a rather different one from those that are normally given.

I thank the minister for the letter that she sent me this morning and for the statement. I am very grateful to her on both counts. I am obviously delighted that the Scottish Government has seen fit to ensure that the will of Parliament is supported and that it will now lodge the necessary financial resolution to allow the bill to proceed to stage 2.

I am also delighted by the commitment, which I received at an extremely positive meeting last week, that the Scottish Government and I, and members across the chamber, can work together to ensure that we lodge the best possible amendments so that we can, I hope, pass the bill at stage 3.

I am very aware that there is still an awful lot of work to be done on the bill, but I have to say that I think that today is a very good day for young people right across Scotland and for the outdoor education sector. It is also a very good day for MSPs right across the political spectrum who have worked so incredibly hard to persuade ministers as to why the bill is so necessary in building the resilience of our young people.

I will ask the minister two questions. First, can she give me a little bit of a guide as to when she thinks that the Scottish Government will be able to start the discussions that have to take place at stage 2? Secondly, how long does she envisage that process taking?

Natalie Don-Innes: I am probably not able to give definitive answers.

On when I want those discussions to start, I am more than happy to contact Ms Smith following the statement to get arrangements in place to have a follow-up meeting about the matters that we discussed at our meeting last week. On the first point, the answer is therefore as soon as possible.

On the second point, which was about how long we think that deliberations at stage 2 will take, again I cannot give a definitive answer. Ms Smith is aware of the concerns that the Government has laid out, and I hope that we can get to the bottom of some of those, or find solutions for some of them, through stage 2 amendments. I cannot necessarily advise how long that will take. However, as I have said, I am very willing to engage with both Ms Smith and the associated groups that will be relevant to those concerns in order to find a way through at stage 2.

Pam Duncan-Glancy (Glasgow) (Lab): I thank the minister for advance sight of the statement.

I welcome the fact that the Government has decided to lay the financial resolution for this important bill, because outdoor education experiences are crucial for young people, and in particular young people with additional support needs. However, evidence to the committee found that a number of young people with ASN were missing out, which is, of course, unjust and unfair.

Will the minister set out what work she has done, in the time that it has taken to make the decision on the financial resolution and come back to the chamber, to establish what is needed to ensure access for pupils with ASN? What can she

say to reassure Parliament today that the needs of those pupils will be fully considered as the Government engages and as the bill progresses through Parliament?

Natalie Don-Innes: That has been a key consideration for the Government in our deliberations in relation to the financial resolution. I think that I set that out to the member in the committee. We have found similar issues, in that there are pupils and children with additional support needs who are not necessarily getting that experience.

Equally, one of the issues with the bill is that we are not sure that the centres and the capacity are necessarily there to deal with the number of children and the range of very complex needs.

I assure the member that that is a key consideration as we go into stage 2, because we want to ensure equity for all children in relation to residential outdoor experiences.

George Adam (Paisley) (SNP): Among the many issues with the bill as it is currently drafted, which has been mentioned today, is the issue of costings. How did the member in charge improve the cost estimates, and is the financial memorandum still, at best, a guesstimate and, at worst, a complete fiscal fantasy? Will the minister also give me detail as to how the measures that are contained in the bill will be financed?

Natalie Don-Innes: I have been clear that the Government's position is that the proposals must be affordable and must support equity, as I have just advised, and that, when it comes to deliverability, due consideration must be given to the expectations that are placed on teachers to organise and take part in the trips. Liz Smith MSP's proposals to adopt a transitional or phased approach to delivery, alongside the potential targeting of funding to support primary school pupils with additional support needs or in deprived circumstances, are truly welcomed in that regard. We had further discussion on some of those aspects in our meeting last week. However, the total costs that are cited in the financial memorandum are extensive, and they underestimate the total potential costs of the bill as introduced. We need to zone in on those aspects ahead of stage 2, because it is about not just the costs on the face of the bill but unknown costs as well.

Miles Briggs (Lothian) (Con): I genuinely welcome what I think is a change of attitude from ministers, and I genuinely hope that they will work to help the member to deliver the will of Parliament, to deliver the bill and to deliver other members' bills that are going through the Parliament. What steps will the Scottish Government take with local authorities and representatives of teachers to look at how the bill can be delivered, especially given that some councils, including my own—the City of Edinburgh Council—are already delivering the policy? The bill presents a huge opportunity to councils.

Natalie Don-Innes: I thank Miles Briggs for those points. I remind members that it is Liz Smith's bill, and it is up to Liz Smith to deal with some of the concerns and challenges that are ahead. However, as I set out in my statement, I am more than happy not only to engage with some of those organisations alongside Ms Smith but to continue discussions on those points. On engagement with COSLA and teachers' unions, I believe that I said that I would meet them jointly with Liz Smith. COSLA has real concerns about affordability, equity of provision and workforce capacity. That was also discussed at length in a meeting that I had with trade union representatives.

I assure Mr Briggs that the Government is very alive to those issues and is willing to work with Liz Smith to find a solution in a way that will bring costs down.

Stuart McMillan (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP): To follow on from the final point that the minister touched on, what engagement has taken place with local authorities up to this point, and does local government support the bill as it is currently framed?

Natalie Don-Innes: As I said, I met the COSLA spokespeople on 6 August, and officials have had on-going engagement with COSLA officers and the Association of Directors of Education in Scotland. COSLA has also written to me and the member in charge, expressing similar concerns to those of the Government and the Education, Children and Young People Committee on the costs, equity and workforce implications, as I laid out to Miles Briggs. It will be important to engage with COSLA again. Equally, we hear some very good examples of how individual local authorities are driving the agenda forward, so it will be important to engage with them as well.

Martin Whitfield (South Scotland) (Lab): The minister said that the Government respects the will of the Parliament. That is as it should be, although the progress of this part of the bill has involved a U-turn for the Scottish Government. Surely, good-faith engagement is the absolute minimum that any member of the Parliament should expect from the Government. I am therefore glad that the minister has said that she will commit to engaging in good faith with Liz Smith on the bill. Will she also make that commitment to all the parties and representatives who sit in the chamber, both on this bill and as other bills progress?

Natalie Don-Innes: I believe that I said that in my closing line. I said that I look forward to working with Liz Smith and engaging with her and the rest of the Parliament.

I take a very open approach on any bill that I am involved in. I always want to hear from members across parties about ways in which they think we could improve provisions. I absolutely assure Martin Whitfield that I would be more than happy to meet him to discuss aspects of this bill.

Emma Harper (South Scotland) (SNP): Do the teaching unions support the bill as it is currently framed? What does it mean for the terms and conditions of teachers in Scotland?

Natalie Don-Innes: I have touched on that, but I am happy to elaborate, because it is a key concern on the bill. The approach that is proposed by Liz Smith assumes that teachers will continue to engage voluntarily in residentials. That is a successful mode in the current context, and there are many examples of schools offering residential outdoor experiences on that basis. However, assurance has yet to be established that that approach is operable on a national scale to meet the legal duties that the bill will entail. That concern was expressed both at stage 1 by teachers and in my engagement with COSLA and the professional associations. There are ways in which we can work through that, and we will need to work through those issues during stage 2.

Ross Greer (West Scotland) (Green): The minister referenced the importance of outdoor learning being reflected in the learning for sustainability action plan, which I was proud to work on with the Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills. I am glad to see it being referenced.

The passage of Liz Smith's bill would result in far more children and young people gaining the kind of knowledge and skills that come from outdoor residential education. That knowledge and those skills should be formally recognised, in line with what the action plan says about developing new qualifications. Does the minister agree with that? Will the Scottish Government look again at Professor Louise Hayward's proposals on that in her 2023 report?

Natalie Don-Innes: I would be more than happy to discuss that with Mr Greer ahead of stage 2. As I outlined in my statement, I can see the benefits of residential outdoor education, which I spoke about at the centres that I visited. We know that it has many positive aspects, including the fact that it leads to huge improvements in pupils' attendance, their behaviour and their relationships with teachers. On the other hand, the non-residential outdoor education that takes place at schools and nurseries daily also has huge benefits, which we need to continue to promote as the bill progresses. I am more than happy to discuss the specific points that Mr Greer raised, in the same vein as I have committed to speaking to members across the chamber.

Willie Rennie (North East Fife) (LD): What is the cash difference between Liz Smith's costings and those of the minister? If the gap can be closed, will the Government support the bill?

Natalie Don-Innes: I do not know whether I can give a specific answer. As I have laid out clearly to the Parliament, we have Liz Smith's revised costs as well as the costs that the Government has put forward, but there are also a bunch of unknown costs, as I have discussed at length with Mr Rennie. That includes the cost of the workforce and of equity of provision, alongside issues of transport, centre capacity and potential upgrades. A host of work needs to be undertaken in order to consider some of those issues prior to stage 2. Members have been asking me about the bill's affordability, but we need to understand the unknown costs before we can get to that stage.

Roz McCall (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con): As much as the statement is welcome news, it is disappointing that the Scottish Government delayed and obfuscated about the financial resolution. The statement highlights that our schools and dedicated school staff are doing their best to ensure that pupils can benefit from such experiences and that progress should be made, to align with and build on existing practices. Given that, what steps will the Government, local authorities and other partners take to ensure that as many children as possible are in a position to access their right to a week's residential outdoor education? As Pam Duncan-Glancy noted, that needs to include pupils who have complex additional support needs.

Natalie Don-Innes: I emphasise again that Liz Smith lodged the bill to introduce a week-long residential trip for children and young people across Scotland. I have given my commitment that I am more than willing to engage with her and members across the Parliament to ensure that we can get the bill to a deliverable and affordable place. [*Interruption*.] I am sorry; Roz McCall is saying something to me, but I cannot hear it.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Members should let the minister respond to the questions that have been asked.

Natalie Don-Innes: Perhaps we could pick up those conversations after my statement.

I want to be as clear to the Parliament as possible that we have produced the financial resolution today and we will be voting for it tomorrow. I will continue to engage with members and others to get the bill to an appropriate place.

Christine Grahame (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP): Having supported the bill at stage 1, subject to the caveats that I emphasised on both capital and revenue funding, I am pleased that it will now progress to stage 2. We know that those issues will not be easy to resolve.

Will Broomlee outdoor education centre in West Linton, in my constituency, which I have visited often, be a consultee? I have huge regard for the facility and its staff and would hope for an extended future for it, which could perhaps include provision for children with ASN in the Borders, which is much needed.

Natalie Don-Innes: Although I am not aware of the specifics around Ms Grahame's contribution, I have been clear to Mr Briggs and other members that it would be helpful to be able to draw on good practice and examples. If Ms Grahame is willing to write to me following the statement with the details of the issue that she raises, I can certainly consider them.

John Mason (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind): I have major reservations about the announcement, and I want to press the minister further. What kind of cost are we committing to? Is this a blank cheque? Is it £40 million? Is it £60 million?

Natalie Don-Innes: As I have said, members have details of the finances in front of them, and I am aware of Mr Mason's concerns, which we have discussed at length. I have been clear today that, although this is the approach that we are taking, the Government is still concerned about some of the specific aspects of affordability.

I assure Mr Mason that we are not issuing a blank cheque. What we will do at stage 2 is try to make the bill more affordable and deliverable. Ultimately, members will have the option to support the bill or not when it comes to the time to vote on the bill.

Clare Adamson (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP): It is not normal for a curriculum to prescribe outdoor education in such a way as the bill proposes. Nonetheless, North Lanarkshire has a proud tradition of offering such an opportunity to young people. Unfortunately, the Kilbowie outdoor centre in Oban was closed in 2020 and has since been demolished. I am interested in hearing whether the minister can give us further information about how the capacity to fulfil the commitment in the bill could be provided, and about whether investment in centres will be needed.

Natalie Don-Innes: Earlier in the year, work was done on capacity and understanding the sector's needs. I have been clear in my answers today that further work is needed on that, specifically in relation to children with additional support needs. Although I cannot necessarily go into the specifics, because I have yet to engage with Ms Smith on the work plan, I assure Clare Adamson that that will be a key consideration.

Fergus Ewing (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind): Outdoor learning is said to be a core part of curriculum for excellence, but it was reported this week that Scottish primary school children receive only seven minutes a week of outdoor learning other than through their physical education classes, compared with 30 minutes a week about 10 years ago. Is that adequate? If it is not, what is adequate? What is the Scottish Government's view? We are letting down our children at the moment, are we not?

Natalie Don-Innes: I want all children to get access to outdoor learning and outdoor play on a daily basis. I saw the report that the member refers to, but I do not know all the details behind it. However, I do not think that looking at an average figure is a fair reflection of the situation, because that discounts some of the fantastic work that is under way. I have spoken at length before about some of the fantastic outdoor experiences that I have witnessed, and I am sure that members across the chamber will have seen the same thing in their local nurseries and schools.

Again, I have been clear that we are driving forward our ambitions in relation to outdoor learning, and now, in relation to the bill, residential outdoor learning. However, I know that we still have work to do on ensuring access for all pupils, and that continues to be a focus of the Government.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That concludes the statement.

Motion without Notice

15:14

The Deputy Presiding Officer (Annabelle Ewing): Before we restart proceedings on the Housing (Scotland) Bill, I advise members that, following consultation between the Minister for Parliamentary Business and the business managers, I am minded to accept a motion without notice, under rule 11.2.4 of standing orders, to move decision time to 9 pm.

Motion moved,

That, under Rule 11.2.4 of Standing Orders, Decision Time on Wednesday 24 September be taken at 9 pm.—[*Graeme Dey*]

Motion agreed to.

Housing (Scotland) Bill: Stage 3

15:19

The Deputy Presiding Officer (Annabelle Ewing): The next item of business is stage 3 proceedings on the Housing (Scotland) Bill. In dealing with the amendments, members should have the bill as amended at stage 2—that is, Scottish Parliament bill 45A—the marshalled list and the groupings of amendments. The division bell will sound and proceedings will be suspended for around five minutes for the first division of stage 3. The period of voting for the first division will be 30 seconds. Thereafter, I will allow a voting period of one minute for the first division after a debate. Members who wish to speak in the debate on any group of amendments should press their request-to-speak buttons or enter RTS in the chat function as soon as possible after I call the group.

Members should now refer to the marshalled list of amendments. Before we move to the next group, which is group 9, I will make some further comments. All the matters to be discussed and debated are extremely important, and I understand that all members will wish to do justice to that. Equally, I hope that members will reflect on making succinct contributions while achieving those objectives. I ask that members also make their interventions brief.

After section 23

The Deputy Presiding Officer: We move to group 9. Amendment 178, in the name of the cabinet secretary, in the only amendment in the group.

The Cabinet Secretary for Housing (Màiri McAllan): Amendment 178 responds to amendments lodged at stage 2, which sought to create a statutory duty to publish a report every five years on the operation and effectiveness of rent controls.

At stage 2, we recognised the overarching aim of those amendments and we agreed to consider them further before now. I have therefore lodged amendment 178. It obliges ministers to conduct a review on the operation and effectiveness of part 1 of the bill and to prepare a report on that review. That will be informed by consultation with local authorities and representatives of landlords and tenants, and it will take place five years from the provisions of part 1 taking effect. That will ensure that the review is carried out after the first cycle of local authority assessments of rent controls and will therefore be informed by part 1 having operated. That is the only way that we can truly review the process and the operation of rent

controls in practice. I ask members to support the amendment.

I move amendment 178.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I note that no other members have sought to make a contribution. I ask whether the cabinet secretary has anything to add by way of winding up.

Màiri McAllan: I have nothing to add.

Amendment 178 agreed to.

Amendment 6 moved—[Maggie Chapman].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 6 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division. I will suspend for around five minutes to allow members to access the digital voting system.

15:22

Meeting suspended.

15:29

On resuming—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: We will proceed with the division on amendment 6.

The vote is closed.

The Cabinet Secretary for Housing (Màiri McAllan): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I could not vote. I would have voted no.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, cabinet secretary. Your vote will be recorded.

The Minister for Public Finance (Ivan McKee): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I could not connect to the app. I would have voted no.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, minister. Your vote will be recorded.

Stuart McMillan (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I could not connect to the app. I would have voted no.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr McMillan. Your vote will be recorded.

Audrey Nicoll (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I would have voted no.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Ms Nicoll. Your vote will be recorded.

Lorna Slater (Lothian) (Green): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I would have voted yes.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Ms Slater. Your vote will be recorded.

Sarah Boyack (Lothian) (Lab): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I would have voted no.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Ms Boyack. Your vote will be recorded.

Rona Mackay (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I could not connect to the app. I would have voted no.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Ms Mackay. Your vote will be recorded.

For

Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)

Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 6, Against 97, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 6 disagreed to.

Amendment 179 moved—[Edward Mountain].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 179 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)

Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 32, Against 71, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 179 disagreed to.

Amendment 180 moved—[Edward Mountain].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 180 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

Sarah Boyack: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I tried to vote. I would have voted no.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Ms Boyack. Your vote will be recorded.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)

Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 31, Against 73, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 180 disagreed to.

Amendments 181 to 191 not moved.

Section 24—Private residential tenancies: duty to consider delay to eviction

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Group 10 is on dealing with evictions. Amendment 79, in the name of Meghan Gallacher, is grouped with amendments 80, 192, 283, 81, 193, 82, 194, 83, 84, 195, 85, 86, 196, 8, 198, 198A, 197, 197A, 7, 44, 284, 284A, 394 to 397, 285 to 287, 37, 288, 289, 266, 265, 50, 378 and 25.

Meghan Gallacher (Central Scotland) (Con): The amendments that I have lodged in this group will strengthen the bill to include provisions on terminal illness when we are dealing with evictions. I thank the cabinet secretaries—Shirley-Anne Somerville and Màiri McAllan—and their officials for not only being sympathetic to my proposals at stage 2 but working with me to produce amendments to support families who are living with a terminal illness.

We have a lot of amendments to get through this afternoon, so it is not my intention to go through each and every one of my amendments. They will add provisions to the bill so that, when the courts or the First-tier Tribunal are looking at evictions, they can consider the impact on a tenant or a member of the tenant's household who has a terminal illness. That is a compassionate way to look at evictions.

I thank Marie Curie for the exceptional work that it has carried out in trying to gain cross-party consensus on the issue. It has been working hard alongside colleagues and speaking to MSPs about how we look at evictions in a compassionate way. I will speak briefly about the evidence that Marie Curie has found and what led to the amendments being lodged. Every year, approximately 27,600 people in Scotland have to move home because of a close bereavement. The amendments will make huge improvements for terminally ill tenants and will provide bereaved families with every opportunity to succeed a property or remain in their own homes.

The "Dying in the Margins" research study by the University of Glasgow and Marie Curie, which documents the direct impact of financial hardship on terminally ill people, has been central to informing the amendments. In particular, there is the story of Stacey and Joost, who faced significant issues in getting an accessible home that met Stacey's need, followed by a decision to evict Stacey's widower from their home just 12 days after Stacey died. The amendments will go some way to preventing such instances from happening again and ensuring that everyone is treated with dignity throughout their end-of-life experience.

We need to thank the wonderful team at Marie Curie for raising the issue with me and other MSPs and for its tenacity in continuing to improve conditions for people with a terminal illness.

Given our time considerations, I will briefly speak to a couple of other amendments in the group, but I do not intend to speak to them all, because we are up against it.

Maggie Chapman's amendments 7 and 44 were also lodged at stage 2. Although I understand her argument, I still believe that the amendments are unworkable. I hope that, if they are moved, members will vote against them, because they could create more problems with evictions before the period begins or ends, which could put pressure on other housing options such as social housing.

Amendments 197 and 197A, on protection against eviction in the first 12 months of a tenancy, have prompted stark warnings from industry bodies. I have gone on the record to say that such a provision would be a gift to rogue landlords and would drive more good landlords out of the sector.

In turn, that would worsen the housing emergency, so I hope that Maggie Chapman does not move those amendments.

Amendments 284 and 284A would require landlords to pay removal costs to tenants. They would impose unreasonable financial burdens, even in eviction cases that were lawful and accepted as necessary. We cannot afford to risk discouraging property letting, particularly among small-scale landlords, which could further reduce the housing supply. It would also add complexity and potential for dispute, which would strain the tribunal system even further.

There are other amendments in the group, but I will leave my remarks there for timing reasons.

Edward Mountain (Highlands and Islands) (Con): I reiterate the declaration that I made yesterday. I am a landlord who lets houses under private residential tenancies and I have also let or given housing to individuals as part of their job. I have been letting houses for more than 30 years and I am a qualified surveyor. Before I was involved in politics, I let houses for clients. I say that so that there is no accusation that I have ever used weasel words to cover up what I do.

Amendments 192 to 196 would ensure that, when an eviction is to be carried out at the end of a tenancy, it must be done within four months of the end of the tenancy. The rationale behind that is that, in every month that the tenant who stays there is unable to pay the increased rent, the burden on them to pay it at a later stage increases. Amendments at stage 2 suggested a period of three months. I am now probing to see whether the cabinet secretary agrees that four months is a more reasonable period than three months and she is therefore in a position to support that. I do not believe that it would restrict the discretion of tribunals and courts; it would just give them deadlines to work to.

Amendments 394 to 397 are about evictions for antisocial behaviour. They relate to PRTs, secure tenancies, assured tenancies and protected statutory tenancies. They mandate that, for each type of tenancy, the tribunal's specified period for a person to be evicted for antisocial behaviour should be no more than two months. That provision has been specifically requested by people who are not landlords but are tenants, because they have been told that tenants in the house next door to them have been behaving antisocially. In some cases, they might be drug users or drug sellers who never seem to be moved on, which causes problems for neighbouring people in tenancies. That has happened in various places around Inverness and across the Highlands. It is therefore perfectly reasonable that, once antisocial behaviour has been proven, there should be a finite amount of time before the tenant is moved on.

I support Meghan Gallacher's amendments on terminal illness, which I am delighted that the cabinet secretary and the Government appear to support. It seems totally appropriate that terminal illness is considered in such cases.

I cannot support Maggie Chapman's amendment 8, which would extend the eviction period to 12 months in certain circumstances, such as when the landlord intends to sell the property or when the extension is intended to alleviate financial hardship. All that it would do is to create more financial hardship for the landlord and tilt the balance too far in the tenant's favour.

The provisions in amendments 198 and 198A would be unfair on both parties. There is no justification for the notice period for evictions to be extended beyond 16 weeks.

15:45

Maggie Chapman's amendments 77 and 44 propose a five-month ban on evictions every year. I think that the ban would be during the winter period. That would mean that a tenant could not be evicted during the winter, whatever the problems were. I am not sure that I see the logic of that, so I look forward to hearing Maggie Chapman's arguments. It would be a bit like the transfer window for football teams, with things not being allowed to happen at certain times of the year.

Under amendments 284 and 284A, removal costs would be paid by the landlord. That would be completely unjust, and I see no reason for it. It should be for the tenant to move their equipment out of the house in the same way as they moved it in. If Ms Chapman expects the Conservatives to support amendments 284 and 284A, which would compensate the tenant for moving out, will she give me an assurance that the Greens will support my amendments 206 and 214, which would require tenants to pay for the cleaning costs at the end of their tenancy if they have kept a pet in the home? I might then be in a position to support her.

Katy Clark's amendment 288 sets out that, if a landlord has been unable to sell a property, they cannot let the property. That means that, just because of the state of the market, they would be burdened with having to pay double council tax on that property for the period in which it was unable to be let.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Mr Mountain, I ask you to bring your remarks to a close, please.

Edward Mountain: I am just doing that.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Perfect. If we all stick roughly to the time limits, we will get through all the business that we need to get through.

Edward Mountain: The provisions in amendment 288 would be unjust. I will leave it there.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Mountain.

At the beginning of today's stage 3 proceedings, I said that I would appreciate succinct contributions. The expectation is that members with the right to speak have a maximum of five minutes to do so. I think that that is fair.

Maggie Chapman (North East Scotland) (Green): To be clear, I will not move amendments 7, 8 and 25 in this group.

A warm and safe home that we can call our own is central to our wellbeing. That being the case, forcing someone out of their home should be done only in the most rare and unavoidable circumstances. At the moment, eviction notice periods work differently depending on how long someone has been in the property, and I struggle to see the justification for that. Someone being forced from their home against their will and being made homeless will have an impact regardless of how long they have been there. That being the case, my amendment 198 would provide a four-month notice period for everyone, so all tenants would be treated equally. It also has the virtue of simplifying the system.

Amendment 197 would provide a 12-month protection from eviction—the same protection that the Renters' Rights Bill will shortly give to tenants in England. That would ensure that people were guaranteed a minimum of one year of stability in their home and that protections in Scotland did not fall behind those in other parts of the United Kingdom.

Both of those amendments have the support of Living Rent, Crisis and Shelter. I welcome that and thank them for their support. They are the experts in supporting renters and they are not troubled by the concerns that the Conservatives have raised. I note that similar provisions were part of the Conservative Government's Renters (Reform) Bill, so I encourage them to consider their position.

Edward Mountain: It would be interesting if a tenancy was not allowed to be ended within the first 12 months. Should Maggie Chapman's amendment also refer to the tenant, not just the landlord, not being able to end a tenancy within the first 12 months? That would seem to be equitable and fair. Does Maggie Chapman have a view on that?

Maggie Chapman: Tenants and landlords are not equal in this situation. The landlord owns the asset, whereas the tenant is at risk of losing their home. Those are two very different situations.

The Liberal Democrats also supported the Renters' Rights Bill at its third reading in the Commons. It contains the same provisions, so I trust that they will be consistent and support amendments 197 and 198. If not, their constituents may well ask why Lib Dem MPs voted to give better protections to English renters but Lib Dem MSPs did not vote for the same protections for those who rent in Scotland. Let us be clear that, if those amendments are not supported today, renters in Scotland will be less strongly protected than those south of the border. If the Government still cannot support those amendments, which have such wide support, I ask it to at least support amendment 33, which would ensure that eviction protections are kept under review compared with those in the rest of the UK.

Amendment 44 would provide a ban on winter evictions, specifically between November and March. Disallowing evictions in the winter period is not at all experimental. We recently had a substantial evictions pause in Scotland, and measures that are almost the same as what I am proposing have been in force in France for 70 years. In a country that can be as cold as ours, I do not think that I need to press the point too strongly that we should not be moving people out of their homes and into temporary accommodation that is often poorly insulated and, where the new arrangements do not work out, on to our freezing streets.

There are, of course, appropriate exemptions and exceptions, but the ban would apply to most of the common grounds for eviction. I understand that the Scottish Government's approach to flexing evictions prizes that flexibility. That is appropriate when ensuring that evictions do not coincide with things such as exams being taken by a member of the household, which can happen at any time of the year. However, the situation is totally different for winter evictions. As we all know from sliding down the Royal Mile to the Parliament in the ice and snow, Scotland is reliably cold in the last and first few months of the year. The amendment simply asks for inconsistency across the piece. The bill says that tribunals "may" consider delaying an eviction due to a "seasonal factor", but they may not, and they may also differ on the interpretation of what a "seasonal factor" is.

If the cabinet secretary does not intend to support that proposal, I have a simple question. When the Scottish Government included both my party and that of the cabinet secretary, it brought in an evictions pause through the Cost of Living

(Tenant Protection) (Scotland) Act 2022. If that was the right thing to do then, why is it not now?

Amendment 284 would give effect to a long-standing ask from Generation Rent. It would empower, but not require, ministers to establish a system whereby those who are evicted on no-fault grounds, such as for the sale of a property, could be compensated. That would recognise the significant costs that tenants incur when being evicted—when, let us be clear, they are being made homeless. Polling on that issue that was carried out by Survation for Generation Rent shows how much money tenants lose. Some 52 per cent of the tenants reported that they took more than four days to pack, clean and move at the end of a tenancy, often requiring time off work, which can be costly for those who do not have leave available.

Due to overlapping tenancies, 40 per cent of the private tenants reported that they paid rent on more than one property at a time when moving home. Of those, more than a third paid rent on two properties for more than two weeks. That is not to mention the costs of cleaning or having the property cleaned, or of hiring vehicles to move renters' furniture and other items.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Ms Chapman, I ask you to bring your remarks to a close.

Maggie Chapman: I will do so very quickly.

When up-front costs are so high, we need those protections. It is a modest measure.

I support a number of other amendments in the group, but I do not have time to speak to them. I will leave it there.

Mark Griffin (Central Scotland) (Lab): Amendment 285 seeks to place sensible restrictions on the issuing of eviction orders when a landlord has recently received an ECO4 grant to improve the energy efficiency of a property. For members who are not aware, landlords are selected to receive such grants entirely on the basis of the income and personal circumstances of the tenant in their property.

Amendment 285 seeks to give the tenant protection from eviction for 12 months. It would seem strange for the Government to grant money to a landlord for upgrading a property in order to improve energy efficiency and save a tenant money, based on that tenant's circumstances, if the landlord removed them after receiving that grant. Members will recall that I lodged a similar amendment at stage 2. At that time, the Government discounted the proposal, arguing that it did not allow for extenuating circumstances to be considered for landlords.

Having listened to that feedback, and in response to it, I have amended my proposal at stage 3 to address those concerns. The revised amendment makes it clear that, where a landlord has received an ECO4 grant—under the energy company obligation scheme—in the previous 12 months,

"the Tribunal must not grant an eviction order"

on certain grounds, such as an intention to sell, to carry out destructive works or to move in themselves, unless,

"having considered the landlord's circumstances, it is reasonable"

to do so. I think that that is a solid compromise position coming from the amendment that I lodged at stage 2, and I ask members to support amendment 285 today.

Amendments 286 and 287 would require the Scottish ministers to undertake a review of the eviction grounds in schedule 3 to the Private Housing (Tenancies) (Scotland) Act 2016 and in other tenancy types within 24 months of the bill coming into force.

Over the past few years, evidence from the First-tier Tribunal and the experiences shared by tenant organisations have highlighted that some of the current eviction grounds do not always deliver a fair balance between tenant and landlord rights. Although many of those grounds are technically discretionary, there are still loopholes that can be exploited, leaving tenants at risk of losing their homes unfairly. The changes made to eviction grounds during the pandemic demonstrated that reform is possible and can make a real difference to tenant security, but it is clear that more comprehensive action is needed to address the underlying issues in the system.

Part 2 of the bill takes important steps to tighten the rules around evictions, but amendments 286 and 287 go further by calling for a full review of the framework, to ensure that our tenancy laws are fit for purpose, based on lessons learned since the 2016 act came into force and since the subsequent changes.

We will all have heard of tenants having been told that a property has been listed for sale and having been evicted only for them to see it listed for rent at a higher price a few months down the line. Those are not isolated stories, and they point to a wider problem in the system that needs to be addressed at its root. Ultimately, the proposals are about rebalancing the system and protecting tenants from unfair eviction while ensuring that landlords can still act when there is a genuine need. I ask members to support amendments 286 and 287.

Katy Clark (West Scotland) (Lab): I will speak to amendments 288 and 289, in my name. Amendment 288 relates to eviction orders for

occupied properties on grounds of sale when the landlord seemingly abandons plans to sell. Generation Rent found that, in 2022, nearly a third of private landlords who evicted tenants in order to sell their property had failed to sell the property more than a year later. We know of many situations in which tenants have been evicted on grounds of sale and the property has been put back on the rental market at a higher rent. Amendment 288 is intended to address that scenario. The amendment would restrict landlords from letting, or attempting to let, the property in question within six months of an eviction order being granted. That change would bring the law in Scotland into line with the provisions outlined in the UK Government's Renters' Rights Bill, which has been debated at Westminster over recent months, and it would therefore bring the law in Scotland into line with that of the rest of the UK.

Edward Mountain said that he believed that that would mean that the landlord would pay double council tax, but, of course, that is not the position when there is an attempt to sell a property. No doubt, we can come back to that later if the member does not accept that point.

Amendment 289 seeks to strengthen the criminal law in relation to wrongful termination. That offence criminalises the act of intentionally misleading a tenant into ceasing to occupy a let property and misleading the First-tier Tribunal into issuing an eviction order. Of course, there are already criminal offences relating to such matters, but amendment 289 would increase the maximum penalties for such offences, which would be appropriate in situations involving repeat offenders. There are already offences for unlawful eviction, and the amendment would simply strengthen the law in this area, increasing the penalties.

Both of my amendments are supported by Living Rent and other campaigns.

16:00

Jeremy Balfour (Lothian) (Ind): I will speak to a couple of the amendments in the group. I welcome Megan Gallacher's amendments on terminal illness, and I put on record that Marie Curie's work on the issue has achieved cross-party support. It will make a big difference to people's lives. As a Parliament, we have a good record on helping people who have terminal illness.

I will also speak to Meghan Gallacher's amendment 283. I remind members that I am a member and an elder of the Church of Scotland. The amendment deals with property, such as a church manse, that is owned by churches or faiths. As many of us are aware, a number of churches have closed or merged with others over the past few years, and, while people are looking for new ministers or pastors, the house remains empty. The churches are looking for a way to allow people to use that house while the church is vacant and then, when a new minister is appointed, for that house to be made available for the church to use for that individual.

We have debated the issue on several occasions, and I am disappointed that the amendment has never been accepted by the Parliament or the Government. We all know that there is a housing shortage, and any house that becomes available for however long a period should be grabbed and used. If this amendment is not passed today, many churches and denominations will simply leave such a property empty, because they know that they will require it in months to come. I hope that the Government and the Parliament will accept amendment 283, and I again thank Meghan Gallacher for lodging it.

The Deputy Presiding Officer (Liam McArthur): I remind everyone that members who are participating remotely should have their cameras on when they are participating.

Fulton MacGregor (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP): I will speak briefly to Edward Mountain's amendment 192, on behalf of a constituent who has been following the bill and has reached out to me for representation on the issue. By way of background, my constituent attempted to evict a tenant who had been antisocial. The First-tier Tribunal delayed hearings, which caused a huge financial strain on my constituent, leading to tens of thousands of pounds' worth of losses and a huge financial and emotional impact on her and her family. My constituent believes that, had the amendment been in place, it would have given her a set timeframe in which to budget for an eviction. In the end, the process dragged on for so long that the situation was solved outwith the tribunal system—basically, a letting agency stepped in and moved the tenant to a different property. My constituent has been badly affected by the experience and, as you will imagine, is considering her future options in relation to being a landlord.

Although, because of that case, I have some sympathy with the amendment, I cannot support the amendment for a number of reasons, including the risk that it would undermine fairness. Strict deadlines may force tribunals to rush complex cases without properly considering the circumstances of vulnerable tenants, and there could be a risk of unjust outcomes and homelessness. Threatening judicial independence by legislating for rigid timeframes could be seen as political interference in how tribunals operate and manage case loads. Administrative

impracticality—tribunals are already underresourced—and imposing deadlines without additional funding or staffing could create procedural chaos and even more appeals. For those reasons, I cannot support the amendment although, as I have said, I have great sympathy with it. Will the cabinet secretary outline ways in which the principle of Edward Mountain's amendment could be achieved in practice while still safeguarding vulnerable people?

Màiri McAllan: Before I set out the detail of the Government's position on the amendments in this group, I assure members that brevity will be the order of the day for the Government. However, given that we see ourselves as having a responsibility to show members the courtesy of responding to their amendments, I will not necessarily be able to do that in five minutes for every group in which there are many amendments, but I will keep my remarks as short as possible.

I turn to Meghan Gallacher's amendments 79 to 86. I thank her, Marie Curie and Mark Griffin, who was also involved in the work on this matter, for their engagement with me. The eviction process is exceptionally difficult for anybody, but it is particularly difficult for those with a terminal illness, so I am pleased to be able to support amendments 79 to 86.

Meghan Gallacher's amendment 283 seeks to create a further exemption from the duty to consider a delay in the enforcement of evictions specifically for the Church of Scotland. I am afraid that, as we set out at stage 2, I am not persuaded that an exemption in such circumstances is appropriate. The current legal framework ensures that the rights of landlords and tenants are taken into account in any decision to delay the enforcement of eviction. That means that a delay will be ordered only when it is reasonable, in all circumstances, to do so. The type of landlord and the purpose for which the property is used, in and of themselves, do not merit a stand-alone exemption.

Willie Rennie (North East Fife) (LD): The practical effect of the existing provision is that manses are lying empty. I know of manses that have lain empty as a result of that provision. Whatever the law is, the practical effect of it is that we have empty homes that could be used. Can the cabinet secretary not find a way to resolve that problem?

Màiri McAllan: I will certainly continue my engagement with the Church of Scotland. I take Willie Rennie's point; I do not want any houses—manses or otherwise—to lie empty. However, it has already been legislated for in primary legislation that such circumstances can be taken into account. I do not think that such circumstances merit the creation of a stand-alone exemption for the Church of Scotland, not least because the proposed exemption would not include other religious bodies. However, I will stay engaged on those issues.

Edward Mountain's amendments 192 to 196 would prevent the First-tier Tribunal and the courts from ordering a delay to an eviction of more than four months. I do not think that it is appropriate to restrict the discretion of the courts in that way. They need to be able to make orders that they deem reasonable, taking account of all the circumstances that they have before them. In addition, by linking the start of the period to the day after proceedings are raised by the landlord, we could risk there being no delay at all or minimal delay in some cases, which would undermine the purpose of the measures in the bill. Therefore, I cannot support amendments 192 to 196.

I am also unable to support Mr Mountain's amendments 394 to 397, which would place a requirement on the courts and the First-tier Tribunal whereby, in cases in which antisocial behaviour grounds have been satisfied, an eviction order must be made no later than two months from the date of application. I listened to what Mr Mountain said about amendments 394 to 397, but I cannot support them, for a number of reasons. The principal reason is that the bill already contains an exemption from the duty to consider delaying an eviction on antisocial behaviour grounds. That means that it is a matter for the court or the tribunal to issue an eviction order as it deems fit. Nothing in the bill should hinder the judicial process in that regard.

I will not speak to Maggie Chapman's amendment 8, as she indicated that she would not move it.

Amendment 198 seeks to address concerns by providing ministers with regulation-making powers to change the notice period that a landlord must give to a tenant when ending a tenancy, such that the notice period would be 16 weeks in certain circumstances. It would also require that notice period to be applied to evictions in cases in which the ground for eviction relates to the sale of property.

Connected to that, amendment 198A would turn that power to make regulations into a duty to make regulations. The provision to convert the power to a duty is defective, because it would fetter the Parliament's role and remit. On the substance of the amendment, further work is required to understand the implications of increased notice periods before changes are made. The repossession grounds review that will be conducted provides a mechanism for such detailed work.

Amendment 197 and consequential amendment 265 would give regulation-making powers to ministers relating to protection against eviction within the first 12 months of a tenancy. Again, those are inflexible provisions. As I have said previously, such issues are best considered as part of our review of repossession grounds, which will allow a fulsome and proper assessment to be made of how the current system is operating and how it might operate better. I know that the question of eviction grounds is a concern for many members; I can confirm to the Parliament that that review will begin before the end of this year, and I would welcome members' involvement in it.

Amendment 197A would turn the power in amendment 197 into a duty—again, removing the Parliament's role, which the Government could not support.

Amendments 7 and 25 have been debated today. They seek to reintroduce the winter evictions ban that would apply every year from November until April, except in limited circumstances. The same amendments were lodged at stage 2 and were not agreed to. For the same reasons that we set out then, I cannot support them today.

Kevin Stewart (Aberdeen Central) (SNP): It has been stated that the amendments in relation to a winter eviction moratorium might constitute a disproportionate control on the use of a landlord's property. However, we managed to do that during the course of Covid; Ms Chapman said that it was during the cost of living crisis, but it was mainly for Covid.

It has also been said that the existing powers in the bill already allow for consideration of a delay year round, with discretion for the courts and tribunals to apply that as they deem reasonable in the circumstances of each case.

Will the cabinet secretary continue to monitor all of that, so that we get it right for people across the board?

Màiri McAllan: I will, of course, keep a close eye on those matters, and particularly on how the courts and tribunals use those existing powers to delay the enforcement of an eviction at any time of the year. It is worth noting that seasonal impact is set out as one of the specific factors that can be considered.

There are two other reasons why I do not think that amendments 7 and 25 are necessarily appropriate. First, there are other times of year when particular strain means that protection could be argued for, such as other religious periods, exam periods and so on. Secondly, with a ban of that type, we would risk creating a flood of cases come April rather than having the ability to deal with matters throughout the year. Therefore, I cannot support those amendments.

Maggie Chapman's amendments 44 and 50 are alternatives to amendments 7 and 25, so the same issues apply.

I will skip forward as quickly as I can.

Amendment 284 would enable ministers to require payment of removal costs if a tenant was being evicted from a residential property. It is not clear from the amendment who would pay for that, but I think that, by implication, it would be the landlord.

When a similar amendment was lodged at stage 2, we committed to considering the need to assess the impact of payments for removal costs. Although amendment 284 would not compel ministers to make regulations, I am concerned about supporting a provision in relation to which the justification has not been fully understood and if it is not clear.

For the same reason, I have significantly greater concerns about amendment 284A, which would require ministers to make regulations regardless of the need for and the impact of any changes. For those reasons, and some other technical problems with the amendments, I cannot support them.

In relation to amendment 37, I am unconvinced of the need for an unlimited on-going statutory requirement for a five-yearly review of protections. Ministers can already carry out a review of eviction protections in the social and private rented sectors whenever it is considered appropriate to do so.

Mark Griffin's amendment 285, which he has explained, seeks to address concerns about a small number of landlords acting unreasonably after receiving ECO4 funding. I remain of the view that the amendment is not necessary and I cannot support it. Our current framework already provides protection from unreasonable eviction in those circumstances. That is because, in Scotland, all grounds for eviction are discretionary, and the tribunal can take into account all the circumstances in the case.

However, I agree that there are concerns about ECO4, which is a UK Government scheme. I understand that we asked UK ministers last year to make changes to strengthen those safeguards, but they were not able to do so at the time. I would therefore welcome Mark Griffin's support in seeking to have those changes made.

Amendment 286 would introduce a requirement on ministers to carry out a review of repossession grounds under the Private Housing (Tenancies) (Scotland) Act 2016. However, as I have said, I am committed to a review of all eviction grounds, and I welcome members' engagement in that.

16:15

Similarly, amendment 287 would require ministers to carry out a review of repossession grounds across all the main tenancy regimes, including the social sector. I have not heard any calls for a review for the social rented sector, and I do not believe that such a review would be appropriate. The amendment would also require us to carry out reviews on types of tenancies that are scarcely used.

I absolutely understand the intent behind amendment 288 in the name of Katy Clark but, unfortunately, I cannot support it. On a similar amendment at stage 2, we set out that any additional restrictions and measures in relation to wrongful termination need careful consideration, which should be done through our review of repossession grounds to ensure the right balance. I understand that Katy Clark's intention is to ensure that certain repossession grounds cannot be used spuriously; however, in such a circumstance, it would already be open to a tenant to apply to the tribunal for a wrongful termination order.

Similarly, on amendment 289, which would introduce a new offence, I assure Katy Clark that there is an existing offence through the Scottish Tribunals (Offences in Relation to Proceedings) Regulations 2016, which could result in imprisonment for up to two years, a fine or both.

For all those reasons, I ask members to support Meghan Gallacher's amendments 79 to 86 and Mark Griffin's amendment 286 but not to move or support any other amendment in the group.

Meghan Gallacher: I thank members, as I do not believe that anyone has spoken against my amendments in relation to terminal illness. I also thank colleagues who have engaged with Marie Curie and have been fully supportive of what those amendments seek to achieve. As the cabinet secretary laid out, when people who have a terminal illness experience an eviction, that is an added pressure on what not only they but their families are dealing with. It is good that we are working together to add some compassion to the bill. I thank everyone who has worked with Marie Curie to make that possible.

I will be brief and then will close my remarks. On amendment 283, in my name, which relates to religious properties, and on the points that have been raised by colleagues Jeremy Balfour and Willie Rennie, I still believe that the issue is unresolved. I therefore ask the cabinet secretary to continue to engage with the Church of Scotland. A representative of that church contacted me and other members across parties to bring about an amendment of that nature. If there are unresolved issues, there are still opportunities, in my view—even if they are not written into the bill—to look at those, to make sure that properties are not sitting empty when they could be used. That goes back to the fact that we have a shortage of homes up and down the country, and we should make use of every possible lever to use the homes that are already in existence.

I will leave my remarks there, and I press amendment 79.

Amendment 79 agreed to.

Amendment 80 moved—[Meghan Gallacher]—and agreed to.

Amendment 192 moved—[Edward Mountain].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 192 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)

Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 25, Against 81, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 192 disagreed to.

Amendment 283 moved—[Meghan Gallacher].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 283 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

The Minister for Business and Employment (Richard Lochhead): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I vote no.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Lochhead. I will make sure that that is recorded.

The Minister for Agriculture and Connectivity (Jim Fairlie): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I would have voted no.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Fairlie. I will make sure that that is recorded.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)f
Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)

Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 44, Against 63, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 283 disagreed to.

Section 25—Scottish secure tenancies etc.: duty to consider delay to eviction

Amendment 81 moved—[Meghan Gallacher]—and agreed to.

Amendment 193 not moved.

Amendment 82 moved—[Meghan Gallacher]—and agreed to.

Amendment 194 not moved.

Section 26—Assured tenancies: duty to consider delay to eviction

Amendments 83 and 84 moved—[Meghan Gallacher]—and agreed to.

Amendment 195 not moved.

Section 27—Protected tenancies and statutory tenancies: duty to consider delay to eviction

Amendments 85 and 86 moved—[Meghan Gallacher]—and agreed to.

Amendment 196 not moved.

After section 27

Amendment 8 not moved.

Amendment 198 moved—[Maggie Chapman].

Amendment 198A moved—[Maggie Chapman].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 198A be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is now closed.

The Minister for Public Finance (Ivan McKee): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I could not get connected. I would have voted no.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I will make sure that that is recorded.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)

Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 22, Against 85, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 198A disagreed to.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 198 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)

Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 22, Against 83, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 198 disagreed to.

Amendment 197 moved—[Maggie Chapman].

Amendment 197A moved—[Maggie Chapman].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 197A be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)

Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 22, Against 85, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 197A disagreed to.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 197 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)

Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 22, Against 83, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 197 disagreed to.

16:30

Amendment 7 not moved.

Amendment 44 moved—[Maggie Chapman].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 44 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)

Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 22, Against 83, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 44 disagreed to.

Amendment 284 moved—[Maggie Chapman].

Amendment 284A moved—[Maggie Chapman].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 284A be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is now closed.

Murdo Fraser (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app would not connect. I would have voted no.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I will make sure that that is recorded.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)

Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 22, Against 84, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 284A disagreed to.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I call Maggie Chapman to press or withdraw amendment 284.

Maggie Chapman: I will press.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 284 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is now closed.

Fergus Ewing (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I could not connect. I would have voted no.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I will make sure that that vote is recorded, Mr Ewing.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)

Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 23, Against, 83, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 284 disagreed to.

Amendments 394 to 397 moved—[Edward Mountain].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendments 394 to 397 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)

Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Amendments 394 to 397 disagreed to.

After section 28

Amendment 285 not moved.

Amendment 286 moved—[Mark Griffin].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 286 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]

Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 80, Against 25, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 286 agreed to.

Amendment 287 not moved.

After section 28A

Amendment 37 moved—[Maggie Chapman].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 37 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)

McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 23, Against 85, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 37 disagreed to.

Amendment 288 moved—[Katy Clark].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 288 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)

Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 24, Against 83, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 288 disagreed to.

Amendment 289 moved—[Katy Clark].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 289 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)

Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 24, Against 84, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 289 disagreed to.

Edward Mountain: On a point of order, Presiding Officer.

I seek your guidance. I am finding the process fairly difficult in the sense that, in the previous group, I had nine amendments and was allowed to speak for five minutes, which meant that I had only 33 seconds to speak to each amendment. In group 11, I will have 14 amendments, which gives me 21 seconds to push and give reasons for each—[*Interruption*.] The First Minister seems to think that that is more than sufficient, given his comments, but I think that it is a genuine point. We are here to make good legislation, and I find it really difficult to put forward an argument in 21 seconds for each of my amendments, and it gives me no chance to speak to other amendments in the group.

I have 50 per cent of the amendments in group 11, yet I will have less than 50 per cent of the time to speak in it. I wonder whether there is some leeway with the time, Presiding Officer. I do not want to string this out for any longer than is necessary, but I think that 21 seconds is just too little for each amendment.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Mountain. As you will be aware, the timings for the groups of amendments were agreed with the business managers and should have been communicated to those who were participating in the debate. As you will have found yesterday and, indeed, today, those in the chair are seeking to apply as much latitude as we can, reflecting the amount of ground that members are trying to cover.

We are also conscious of the fact that we had a late sitting yesterday, we are likely to have a late sitting again tonight and we will most certainly have one next Tuesday. We will exercise as much latitude as we can, but we need co-operation from members in accordance with what the chamber voted on in terms of the business motion and timings.

Section 29—Private residential tenancies: keeping pets and making changes to let property

The Deputy Presiding Officer: We move to group 11: tenants' rights to keep a pet. Amendment 9, in the name of Maggie Chapman, is grouped with amendments 10, 199, 87, 200, 12, 201 to 203, 88, 89, 204, 90, 205, 91, 92, 206, 93, 13, 14, 102, 103, 214, 104, 215 to 217, 15, 218, 219, 26 and 27.

Maggie Chapman: Pets make a house a home, and part 3 of the bill sets out a clear framework for tenants to make requests for their pet to live with them. There is a lack of pet-friendly rented homes in Scotland. A 2021 survey of landlords, letting agents and tenants on pets and rental properties conducted by YouGov on behalf of Cats Protection and the Dogs Trust found that 68 per cent of private landlords in Scotland who do not currently allow pets in any or all of their properties say that nothing would persuade them to do so.

Currently, tenants are being denied the opportunity to experience the benefits of pet ownership simply because their contract says "No pets". The bill will end blanket no-pets policies by allowing tenants to request to keep a pet.

Giving responsible tenants the right to request to keep a pet in their home—a request that landlords cannot unreasonably refuse—will decrease the burden on animal rehoming organisations such as Cats Protection. In 2023, Cats Protection took in around three cats each day due to landlords not allowing them in their properties. The current proposals have the potential to help relieve the large wait lists faced by rehoming organisations and allow them to focus their resources on other animals in need.

16:45

I have lodged a number of amendments to make the process work better, and my amendments have been developed in partnership with Cats Protection, Dogs Trust and Sight Scotland. Amendments 87 and 15 would reduce the time that a tenant has to wait to get a response to a pet request from 42 to 30 days. The Dogs Trust believes that that would allow tenants to better plan for pet ownership, reduce any kennelling or cattery expenses, and lessen the significant stress on people of not knowing whether they will be able to keep their pet in their rented property.

I thank the Scottish Government for its support for amendment 87, which applies to private housing. I know that it is reluctant to support the social housing version in amendment 15, but supporting both amendments would ensure that private and social tenants are treated equally.

Otherwise, we would be treating social and private tenants differently, which is simply not fair. After discussing the issue for the best part of this year, I still have not heard a convincing argument as to why that should be the case.

Amendment 12 addresses a loophole in the proposed system. If a landlord does not meet the deadline, they are currently deemed to have refused the tenant consent to keep a pet, which is also not fair. Tenants have no way of knowing why the landlord does not consent to their keeping a pet and therefore have no ability to offer assurances to the landlord. Amendment 12 would change that so that the landlord would be deemed to have consented if they did not reply within the timescales. That is not new or untested—it is the same approach that appears in the bill for social housing. Again, there is no good reason why social and private tenants should be treated differently.

Amendments 9, 10, 13 and 14 would exempt assistance animals from the pet request process and grant an automatic right to have an assistance animal in a rented property. I have heard concerns that my amendments are already covered by the Equality Act 2010. However, although the act prohibits discrimination against disabled people, there are no specific provisions for disabled tenants who need their assistance animals at home. Sight Scotland reports having to work with the landlords of blind and partially sighted people to ensure that their assistance animals can live with them. If the Equality Act 2010 was perfectly clear on that point, that would not be happening.

I want to provide a quote from a person with sight loss in Edinburgh who has repeatedly been refused a tenancy because they need their guide dog to live with them. They said:

"It was very disheartening when I was told that I couldn't rent a property because of my Guide Dog. It made me feel very upset and frustrated. Even when I explained the laws and legislation I was still told no and that the letting agent had to take the landlord's side. It made me very wary of looking for a rental property and I started to discount a lot of properties as the adverts stated no pets. This left me with a very limited choice of houses to pick from. The stress of finding a property is bad enough without having to explain my sight loss and why I have a Guide Dog as my mobility aid."

Disabled people should not be made to jump through the hoops of the Equality Act 2010 to prove that it covers their ability to have their assistance animal with them in their home. There should instead be a clear and simple statement in Scottish housing law confirming that they can, which is what my amendments would do.

In the interests of time, I will not comment on other members' amendments. However, I ask Edward Mountain whether he has considered the requests that we discussed at stage 2 around exempting assistance animals from his amendment on bringing in a professional cleaner. I would be interested in his comments on that.

I move amendment 9.

Edward Mountain: I want to be clear at the outset that I am a great supporter of pets. I have four dogs and I would never want to be seen as preventing people from having pets in their houses and homes.

Amendments 199 to 201, 216 and 217 would require all notices regarding pets to be sent by recorded delivery. That might seem archaic, but it would protect both the tenant and the landlord in ensuring that the notices were sent and that copies of them were recorded. An unscrupulous landlord, for example, might say that he had responded to a notice from the tenant and all that would be required in law is for him to sign an affidavit to say that he had sent a notice—whether he had or not, he could just sign that. That could happen, which is why I believe that sending notices by recorded delivery, especially when there is a presumption in favour of one or the other party, would be sensible. In fact, in relation to most rented accommodation, notices are sent by recorded delivery.

Amendment 202 is a simple amendment that sets out that a pet cannot be kept at a property while an appeal about the pet is on-going.

Amendment 203 would mean that, if a tenant has applied to a tribunal to make a decision about a pet in a property, they cannot apply again in regard to that pet unless there has been

"a material change in circumstances."

Amendment 204 would allow the landlord to refuse consent for a pet if they have medical reasons to do so. I give the example that if I get too close to cats, I come out sneezing and break out in hives, so it is extremely difficult for me to go into a property that I have let if the tenant has cats. My point is that many people have such conditions.

The reason for amendment 205 is that I want ministers to have to make provisions within six months of the act receiving royal assent about when it is reasonable for a landlord to refuse consent for a pet.

Amendments 206 and 214 would mean that a landlord could specify as a condition of the rent that carpeted floors and soft furnishing should be cleaned by an independent company at the end of the tenancy. Landlords should be able to do that; I am not saying that they must do so. However, it is a critical point because pets can sometimes be deliberately difficult—I have one that leaves me messages in the morning. If I was renting a

property and that was the case with my pet, it seems only right that I should clean up.

Amendment 215 asks ministers to lay a draft instrument in relation to what they consider to be reasonable when it comes to keeping a pet.

Amendment 218 would mean that, when the landlord does not consent to a pet being kept, the tenant

"may not make a further application unless there has been a material change in circumstances."

Amendment 219 would keep the presumption in relation to consent in the landlord's favour rather than against it. That should not be an issue, because if ministers have laid regulations on the reasons for refusal, those should be quite clear.

To answer Maggie Chapman's specific question about assistance animals, I absolutely consider them to be critical to people's lives. Therefore, the presumption should be in favour of tenants being able to keep them. However, assistance animals are not always well-trained guide dogs; an assistance animal can also be a dog that keeps someone company. Therefore, it is suitable to say that the landlord may ask for carpets to be cleaned; that does not mean that they have to do so.

There are lots of other amendments in this group, so I will sum up. Amendment 15 shortens the timescale for responding to a pet request from 42 days to less than 30 days. That period is too short, especially if the landlord is perhaps on holiday or not in a position to receive the notice. Frankly, both parties should be talking to each other and speaking on the telephone.

Maggie Chapman: Thirty days is more than four weeks. If a landlord is to be away for such a time period, would it not be appropriate to have somebody else who could answer on the landlord's behalf? Thirty days is an awfully long time to leave renters in limbo. They might not be making a pet request; their request could be about another really urgent issue.

Edward Mountain: Not every landlord is in a position to appoint an agent. A period of 42 days is not unreasonable, especially if we consider the time that it takes Government agencies and ministers to respond to requests for information. I would leave the time period as it is.

I will leave it at that and listen to other points.

Màiri McAllan: Maggie Chapman's amendments 9, 10, 13, 14, 26 and 27 would allow private and social tenants to keep an assistance animal without the landlord's consent. Similar amendments were disagreed to at stage 2.

Although I absolutely appreciate the intended effect of the amendments, it is important to note that, under the Equality Act 2010, a disabled tenant can already ask a landlord about keeping an assistance animal. I am really sorry to hear about the case that Ms Chapman raised, but that is a question of the existing law being applied and does not justify creating different provisions, which could create a confusing landscape, so I cannot support those amendments.

Maggie Chapman: Given that the existing law is clearly not adequate, because Sight Scotland and others have repeatedly had to go through that process, I do not understand the rationale for not stating clearly in our housing law that assistance animals should be deemed to be acceptable.

Màiri McAllan: The rationale is entirely down to the fact that that is already part of our housing law. As I said, under the Equality Act 2010, a disabled tenant can ask a landlord about keeping an assistance animal, and such a request cannot be unreasonably refused. I am happy to work with Ms Chapman and others to ensure that the law is being applied, but an additional provision is not justified.

On amendment 87, I am grateful to Maggie Chapman and Emma Roddick for their engagement with me on the issue. In setting a timescale, it is important to ensure that there is enough time for the landlord and the tenant to discuss the request, resolve any concerns and agree reasonable conditions. Ultimately, that will help to avoid disputes. Therefore, a 30-day period is appropriate, so I am happy to support amendment 87.

The provision in amendment 12 was considered but not agreed to at stage 2 because of concerns about the negative consequences of switching to assumed consent in the private rented sector. It is unclear how disputes would be resolved in cases in which a landlord had a legitimate reason for a delayed response, and there would be added complications if the tenant had obtained a pet in the meantime. We do not want to cause confusion, so I cannot support amendment 12.

Amendment 15 would change the current one-month timescale for dealing with a request to keep a pet in the social rented sector to a timescale of not more than 30 days. That is unnecessary. The period of one month aligns with social landlords' response timescales for other requests, and it is clearly helpful for both landlords and tenants if a consistent approach is taken.

Edward Mountain's amendments 199 to 201, 216 and 217 would require pet requests and related applications to be sent by recorded delivery. I have listened to his position on the matter, but I think that the amendments are unnecessary. They would impose extra costs and additional administrative burdens on tenants and

landlords, who are accustomed to dealing with such things in the way that best suits them.

Edward Mountain: I hear the cabinet secretary's point, but I am trying to ensure that there is no dubiety, so that no one can say that something has happened when it has not happened. How would the cabinet secretary adjudicate in a situation in which somebody said that the notice had been served and the other person said that they had not received it? Whose side would she take?

Màiri McAllan: I would not adjudicate on such matters. It would be for a tribunal or, if the case was escalated, a court to do that. The point is that, right now, it is up to the tenant and the landlord to use the means that best suit them, and I do not think that we should change that.

Amendment 202 would restrict a private tenant from keeping a pet until the tribunal had made a determination. However, before keeping a pet, tenants must first have the permission of the landlord and, if the decision is disputed or appealed, they need to wait for a consent order from the tribunal. Therefore, amendment 202 is unnecessary, and I cannot support it.

Amendments 203 and 218 would prevent tenants from making further requests to keep a pet following a dismissed appeal unless there was a material change in circumstances. The amendments are a bit rigid. That could be achieved in a more balanced way—probably through guidance—that encouraged constructive discussion between landlords and tenants, so I do not support those amendments.

Amendment 204 would allow a private landlord, for medical reasons, to reasonably refuse a tenant's request to keep a pet. I hear what Mr Mountain said about his aversion to cats, but it is best for the detail on unreasonable refusals and reasonable conditions to be developed through consultation and guidance; it should not be set out in primary legislation.

My amendments 88 to 93 and 102 to 104 are technical. They revert three duties to make regulations back to powers. The powers enable ministers to make provision about when it is reasonable to keep a pet and about when a consent condition is reasonable. Those powers were turned into duties at stage 2, but we must restore the Parliament's role in that regard.

17:00

Edward Mountain's amendments 205 and 215 would instead require ministers to lay draft regulations within six months of royal assent. That is not appropriate, but I assure Mr Mountain that draft regulations will be laid as soon as is reasonably practicable after the powers take effect. I also assure him that it is my intention that the regulations will be in place when the associated right to have a pet comes into force.

On Edward Mountain's amendments 206 and 214, in relation to cleaning carpets and so on before one can keep a pet, I think that the detail of what is reasonable should, again, be developed in consultation. I firmly believe that that is the right approach. That is why the bill requires such consultation and why draft regulations must first be approved by the Parliament.

Amendment 219 would take the existing process in the social rented sector, whereby the failure of a social landlord to reply to a request is considered approval, and change that to deemed refusal. Processes in relation to keeping pets in the social rented sector are well established and understood, and I can see no good reason to change them.

For all those reasons, I ask members to support amendments 88 to 93 and 102 to 104, and I ask others not to press their amendments.

The Presiding Officer (Alison Johnstone): Members will note that we have passed the agreed time limit for the debate on this group to finish. I exercise my power under rule 9.8.4A(c) of standing orders to allow debate on the group to continue beyond that limit, in order to avoid the debate being further curtailed.

Jeremy Balfour: I speak in favour of amendments 13 and 14, which Maggie Chapman lodged. The Scottish Government and, to some degree, the Scottish Parliament are very good with rhetoric when it comes to disability issues. They want to be supportive and to say the right thing. However, when it comes to action, they often do not follow their warm words. We are seeing that yet again with the cabinet secretary saying that she and her Government will not support amendments 13 and 14.

On this occasion, what Maggie Chapman said is absolutely right. Other organisations have been in touch with me. If, as the cabinet secretary says, the amendments would simply restate what the law is in Scotland, surely it can do no harm, as we pass a new housing bill, to support something that will give greater protection to those with disabilities. Again, the cabinet secretary says that she is willing to work with Maggie Chapman and other MSPs going forward, but now is the opportunity for us to do something. I hope that members across the chamber will think about not just giving warm words to disabled people but doing something in law that will make their lives easier.

Maggie Chapman: I thank Jeremy Balfour for his words of support. I will not speak for too long,

but I will make one point. The cabinet secretary talked about consistency in the social rented sector in relation to the 30-day or one-month timescales. Why is consistency on that important, and why is consistency between the private rented sector and the social rented sector not important? I still have not heard convincing arguments as to why, in relation to some amendments, there is one rule for one and one rule for another. I will leave my comments there.

The Presiding Officer: Ms Chapman, will you confirm whether you intend to press amendment 9?

Maggie Chapman: I press amendment 9.

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 9 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 25, Against 84, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 9 disagreed to.

Amendment 10 not moved.

Amendment 199 moved—[Edward Mountain].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 199 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 40, Against 67, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 199 disagreed to.

Amendment 87 moved—[Maggie Chapman]—and agreed to.

Amendment 200 not moved.

Amendment 12 moved—[Maggie Chapman].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 12 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

Craig Hoy (South Scotland) (Con): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app froze. I would have voted no.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Hoy. We will ensure that that is recorded.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 24, Against 85, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 12 disagreed to.

Amendment 201 moved—[Edward Mountain].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 201 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 43, Against 66, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 201 disagreed to.

Amendment 202 moved—[Edward Mountain].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 202 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)

Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 40, Against 69, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 202 disagreed to.

Amendment 203 moved—[Edward Mountain].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 203 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)

Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 41, Against 68, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 203 disagreed to.

17:15

Amendment 88 moved—[Màiri McAllan].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 88 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)

Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 60, Against 49, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 88 agreed to.

Amendment 89 moved—[Màiri McAllan].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 89 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)

McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 59, Against 48, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 89 agreed to.

Amendment 204 moved—[Edward Mountain].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 204 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)

Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 40, Against 68, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 204 disagreed to.

Amendment 90 moved—[Màiri McAllan].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 90 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)

McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 99, Against 9, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 90 agreed to.

Amendment 205 moved—[Edward Mountain].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 205 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)

Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 41, Against 68, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 205 disagreed to.

Amendment 91 moved—[Màiri McAllan].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 91 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)

Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 59, Against 50, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 91 agreed to.

Amendment 92 moved—[Màiri McAllan].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 92 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)

Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 60, Against 47, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 92 agreed to.

Amendment 206 moved—[Edward Mountain].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 206 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)

Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 40, Against 68, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 206 disagreed to.

Amendment 93 moved—[Màiri McAllan].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 93 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (Ind)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 101, Against 8, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 93 agreed to.

The Presiding Officer: We move to group 12: tenants' rights to make changes to let property. Amendment 207, in the name of Edward Mountain, is grouped with amendments 208, 94, 209 to 211, 95, 96, 212, 38, 97 to 99, 213 and 100.

Edward Mountain: A lot of the confusion over amendments in group 12 would have been clarified if we had known what category 1 and category 2 changes were. The business and regulatory impact assessment gave some idea that category 1 would include simple things such as putting up pictures and posters, and that category 2 might include the painting of walls. From a personal point of view, if a tenant moves in and wants to make the property their home, I would normally expect them to put up things such as pictures and posters; I would be surprised if they were not able to do so. Category 2 changes such as the painting of rooms, if that is what is involved, should be agreed with the landlord in advance.

Amendments 208, 209 and 211 would require notices between the landlord and tenant regarding category 2 changes to be sent in writing and by recorded delivery. I know that the cabinet secretary does not accept my opinion, but I am trying to ensure that there is no confusion at a later date and that any proposed changes do not set the landlord against the tenant. There is nothing worse than that happening when somebody is trying to move out of their home to a different property.

17:30

Amendment 210 proposes that a tenant must return any category 2 changes to their original state. To me, that would seem perfectly sensible if category 2 changes include things such as painting. I have seen lots of properties where the landlord may not recognise the colour scheme that a tenant has used as a nice one. Most landlords will go with a bland colour so that a tenant can move in and find the colour acceptable, but I have seen tenants use bright purples or fluorescent pinks with blue stars on them.

Martin Whitfield (South Scotland) (Lab): Very nice.

Edward Mountain: I think that Mr Whitfield is saying that that is his house. I have not been to your house, Mr Whitfield.

All that I am trying to suggest is that, at the end of a tenancy, the property should be returned to the landlord in the state that it was in at the beginning.

Maggie Chapman: Does the member intend that disabled people should have to pay to take out disabled aids that have been put into a property? That situation could fit into amendments 207 and 210.

Edward Mountain: I will come to that specific point, if I may. I know that the member kept an eagle eye on the various amendments that were lodged and will have seen my proposed amendment 399, which was not selected by the Presiding Officer. I lodged the manuscript amendment because I received a letter from the cabinet secretary 47 minutes after the lodging deadline to say that I was being discriminatory against disabled people by not allowing category 1 changes for disabled access. I never wanted to do that. I lodged my manuscript amendment so that it would be entirely clear that I believe that the bill should allow disabled people to put in anything that they want to in order to make their lives easier, provided that it does not require structural changes. As Ms Chapman will know, in most cases, structural changes would require a building warrant. I am disappointed that I was not able to clarify that. I think that a lot of the disagreement between the cabinet secretary and me stemmed from the fact that it is not clear what are classified as category 1 and category 2 changes.

I will speak briefly to the other amendments in the group. Maggie Chapman's amendment 94 seeks to change the number of days' notice that the tenant is required to provide to the landlord from 42 days to 30 days. I think that 42 days is the right length of time, for the reasons that the cabinet secretary noted earlier.

I am disappointed by amendments 95, 96, 98 and 99, because they will change the wording that the committee agreed to in amendments that I lodged at stage 2, which will mean that ministers "may" instead of "must" specify changes. That is disappointing, as it overrides the committee's discussion. Amendments 212 and 213 do the same thing. I remind people about the manuscript amendment.

Maggie Chapman's amendment 38 proposes that tenants may make changes to properties if those changes promote nature recovery. I absolutely understand why that might be appropriate. For example, tenants may want to change their garden into a vegetable garden, but if the existing garden is established and it already has trees and plants that improve the amenity of the property, they should need to negotiate those changes with the landlord, rather than having an automatic right to go ahead.

I will leave it there and will listen to the arguments that are made. I believe that I will also get a chance to sum up.

Maggie Chapman: I have a couple of amendments in the group. Amendment 252 establishes the right to grow in outdoor spaces of rented properties. Renters could submit a category 2 change request, and that should not be unreasonably refused.

The physical and mental health benefits of gardening and growing our own food are well established, and the amendment seeks to ensure that there can be no undue barriers to renters using outdoor spaces that are part of the property that they rent to grow their own food, as well as to promote animal and insect life by, for example, planting flowers that support pollinators. Domestic gardens can be mini-havens for nature, and that kind of action is vital as we face a nature emergency, with many of Scotland's animal, insect and plant species threatened with extinction.

Urban creep, whereby green space in urban areas is lost, such as when gardens are turned into driveways, is driving nature loss and urban flooding. We need to do much more to ensure that green space is protected and looked after, and my amendment 252 is a small contribution to that.

According to TDS, which runs the SafeDeposits Scotland scheme, disagreements over gardening are the fifth most common reason for deposit disputes, so having more clarity will benefit tenants and landlords.

With young people in the most deprived areas of Scotland having significantly worse access to play space, the amendment also seeks to make it easier for modest changes to be made to gardens and other spaces, so that they can enjoy the benefits of outdoor play.

I listened carefully to comments that were made at stage 2, and I have changed the category from category 1, which would not require approval, to category 2, which would. The amendment would still allow landlords to refuse if they felt that the ask was unreasonable, so there are appropriate safeguards.

Amendment 94 will reduce the timescale for landlords to respond to a property change request. The Government having supported the timescale for pet requests, I look forward to it supporting amendment 94, and I am grateful for the conversations that I have had with the Government on the matter in recent weeks.

Màiri McAllan: I will begin with Edward Mountain's amendments 207 and 210, which would mean that a tenant was required to reinstate the property to its original condition following a category 1 or 2 change. I understand that the provision may reflect some landlords' concerns, some of which will be perfectly legitimate. However, I do not think that the inclusion of a blanket provision in the bill would be the right approach to take. The substance of the approach and the kind of restriction are likely to be disproportionate. However, the best way to test all of that is to engage in consultation and to set out what is to be taken forward in secondary legislation, and, of course, Edward Mountain can be part of that process.

Amendments 208 and 209, which are also in Mr Mountain's name, relate again to the question of recorded delivery, this time requiring that a request for a category 2 change, and the response to it, be sent by recorded delivery. As before, the landlord and the tenant should be free to agree the form of written communication that will be used during the tenancy, and I think that it is common for email to be used. Although I understand Mr Mountain's concerns, I cannot support that proposal.

Maggie Chapman's amendment 38 would mean that certain changes to outdoor space connected with a let property would be category 2 changes, and a tenant would have the right to make a request and not be unreasonably refused. I have a lot of sympathy with what Maggie Chapman has said. People's ability to enjoy green space is fundamental not only to their ability to feel comfortable at home but to their mental and physical wellbeing, so I do not have any objection in principle to the idea that prescribed changes should include the use of a property's outside space.

However, I am afraid that the amendment is too broadly framed. As it is drafted, it would apply to a very broad range of changes and we believe that it would face problems with implementation, particularly in respect of communal gardens. Such issues would have to be made clearer in any drafting. I do not want to create confusion for landlords and tenants, so I cannot support that amendment. Again, it comes down to what I said earlier: the best way to develop the detail of all of this is through secondary legislation that is supported by consultation and engagement with tenants and landlords, and I will be pleased to include some of the matters that Maggie Chapman raises in that work.

I welcome Maggie Chapman's amendment 94, which will reduce to 30 days the period in which a landlord in the private rented sector must respond to a request to make changes to a let property. If agreed, that will mirror the timeframe that is proposed under amendment 87 for responding to a pet request, and it will ensure the consistency that we are trying to support.

Turning to my amendments in the group, I am seeking Parliament's support for amendments 95 to 100, which will make changes to various duties to make regulations regarding requests to make changes to a let property. As before, those duties were originally set out as powers in the bill, but changes at stage 2 turned them into duties. While they are duties, Parliament's role is undermined, so my amendments are about restoring Parliament's role in scrutinising what the Government does. I assure Mr Mountain that he ought not to be disappointed about that, because it is about ensuring that Parliament has its rightful place in approving regulations.

Amendments 212 and 213, which are also in my name, are intended to reverse changes that were made at stage 2, the effect of which would be that it was always reasonable for structural change, however minor, to be refused. I listened to what Mr Mountain said. I am not able to speak to the manuscript amendments that he referred to because they are not up for debate. However, those restrictions would limit our ability to allow changes that support disabled people and their families—for example, the installation of support aids. I do not want that, and I am quite sure that Mr Mountain would not want it, either.

Edward Mountain: I seek clarity from the cabinet secretary on the definition of structural change. Structural change means one thing to me as a surveyor; it might mean something different to her. I would like to know what she means by structural change.

Màiri McAllan: In the context that I have referred to, I suppose that we are talking about things being affixed to walls. However, that is exactly why I have been stressing the point that consulting on those matters and making the changes via secondary legislation is the appropriate way to do it. I spoke about support aids because that involves affixing items to walls.

To reassure members, I note that the regulation-making powers in the bill will be subject to the affirmative procedure. That will ensure that powers are exercised appropriately, that a reasonable balance is achieved between tenants' rights and those of the landlord, and that Parliament has a fulsome part in that.

The Presiding Officer: I call Edward Mountain to wind up and to press or withdraw amendment 207.

Edward Mountain: I have listened to the arguments that have been put forward and I could go through all the reasons why I do not agree with them. I do not think that the cabinet secretary's definition of a structural change is one that would be recognised. Affixing things to the wall is not changing the structure of the property. Structural changes in a building would, in most cases, require a building warrant to be approved.

I have heard the arguments, and I will make the case one more time for using recorded delivery for the delivery of notices. I guarantee that what is in the bill will be a recipe for disaster and for argument. As a landlord, I have tried to avoid that, and I think that the cabinet secretary and members who vote not to have notices served by recorded delivery will be making a mistake.

I will leave it there, because I know that time is short.

The Presiding Officer: Mr Mountain, can you please confirm whether you are pressing amendment 207?

Edward Mountain: Yes, I am pressing it.

Maggie Chapman: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. In my remarks, I referred to amendment 252; I should have been referring to amendment 38. That was my error—apologies for that.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Ms Chapman. Your comments have been recorded.

The question is, that amendment 207 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

17:45

Brian Whittle (South Scotland) (Con): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. The app would not connect. I would have voted yes.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Whittle. We will ensure that that is recorded.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)

Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 40, Against 66, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 207 disagreed to.

Amendment 208 moved—[Edward Mountain].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 208 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)

Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 41, Against 67, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 208 disagreed to.

Amendment 94 moved—[Maggie Chapman].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 94 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast

by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 83, Against 24, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 94 agreed to.

Amendment 209 not moved.

Amendment 210 moved—[Edward Mountain].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 210 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)

Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 39, Against 69, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 210 disagreed to.

Amendment 211 not moved.

Amendment 95 moved—[Màiri McAllan].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 95 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 61, Against 46, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 95 agreed to.

Amendment 96 moved—[Màiri McAllan].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 96 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)

Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 58, Against 49, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 96 agreed to.

Amendment 212 moved—[Màiri McAllan].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 212 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

Douglas Ross (Highlands and Islands) (Con): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I could not connect to the app. I would have voted no.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Ross. We will ensure that that is recorded.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)

Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 69, Against 39, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 212 agreed to.

Amendment 38 moved—[Maggie Chapman].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 38 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)

Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 8, Against 98, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 38 disagreed to.

Amendments 97 to 99 moved—[Màiri McAllan].

The Presiding Officer: Does any member object to a single question being put on amendments 97 to 99?

Members: Yes.

The Presiding Officer: As there are objections, I will put the questions individually.

The question is, that amendment 97 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division. Members should cast their votes now.

The vote is closed.

The Cabinet Secretary for Constitution, External Affairs and Culture (Angus Robertson): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. Unfortunately, my device would not register my vote, which would have been a yes.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Robertson. We will ensure that that is recorded.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)

Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 100, Against 8, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 97 agreed to.

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 98 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)

Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 60, Against 47, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 98 agreed to.

18:00

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 99 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)

Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 61, Against 47, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 99 agreed to.

Amendment 213 moved—[Màiri McAllan].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 213 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 68, Against 39, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 213 agreed to.

Amendment 100 moved—[Màiri McAllan].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 100 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (Alba)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 99, Against 8, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 100 agreed to.

18:04

Meeting suspended.

18:20

On resuming—

After section 29

The Deputy Presiding Officer (Annabelle Ewing): We come to group 13, on social housing. Amendment 101, in the name of Paul Sweeney, is grouped with amendments 304, 305, 337 and 338.

Paul Sweeney (Glasgow) (Lab): I declare an interest, as I am a recently co-opted committee member of Reidvale Housing Association, which is

a community-based housing association in Glasgow.

The purpose of amendment 101 is to bring housing legislation into alignment with sections 109 to 113 of the Co-operative and Community Benefit Societies Act 2014. Doing so would mean that registered social landlords can transfer engagements only if two thirds of tenants vote in favour of a special resolution.

Currently, a simple majority of tenants in favour is required for the process to proceed. However, section 111 of the 2014 act, which governs shareholder voting and takeovers of societies, and is legislation that applies across the UK, stipulates:

"A resolution is a 'special resolution' if—

(a) the resolution is passed a general meeting by at least two-thirds of the eligible members who vote."

I was motivated to lodge amendment 101 because of what happened at Reidvale Housing Association last year. Had the measure in amendment 101 been in place at that time, the tenant ballot to transfer the association's housing stock would not have reached the required threshold for the proposal to proceed to a special general meeting of shareholders, at which the two-thirds majority requirement to transfer the engagements was not met. That was achieved only after a last-ditch local campaign against a well-resourced propaganda effort by Places for People Scotland to try and seize control of housing stock that was under community ownership.

In December 2023, Reidvale Housing Association proposed to transfer its housing stock of around 900 properties—with a market value of approximately £180 million—to Places for People Scotland. In a tenant ballot that was open for 32 days and in which 73 per cent of tenants cast their vote, 62 per cent voted in favour of the proposal. However, had the two-thirds majority rule been in place, the proposal would have fallen at that point because it did not meet the threshold of 66.6 per cent.

As members might know, Reidvale Housing Association was one of Scotland's first community-based housing associations. It was formed after the seminal Housing Act 1974, which is now celebrating half a century of community-based housing.

The Glasgow and West of Scotland Forum of Housing has highlighted that it has serious concerns about the pattern of transfers and engagements involving community-based housing associations over the past few years.

Transfers of engagements that have taken place have largely had the support of more than 90 per cent of tenants. The only one that fell below the 90 per cent threshold—the Pineview Housing Association and Kendoon Housing Association transfer—was unusual. Clearly, it is of concern when support from tenants of housing associations falls below the threshold.

When transfers of engagements are sought, they should enjoy the support of the vast majority of tenants for the proposition to be reasonable. With yes votes in transfers normally exceeding the 90 per cent threshold, it was clear that there was concern about the Reidvale case, because almost 40 per cent of voting tenants opposed the transfer, despite the enticing offer of a five-year rent freeze in return for handing over the £180 million of housing stock that they collectively owned. That was hardly a resounding vote of confidence.

The requirement for a supermajority—one that would require support from two thirds of the tenant body—would make it clear that there is a settled majority view. In the Reidvale case, that is about what is the best future for one of Scotland's community-based housing associations. After all, it is a one-way road from being a community-based association to joining one of the large national housing groups. There has never been a case in Scotland in which a large national housing group has spun out a small community-based housing association. Therefore, the amendment is important in protecting the sector.

It is important to note that, once the required approval of the transfer by tenants was in place, by a small majority, Reidvale Housing Association went on to hold a special general meeting of its shareholders on 16 January last year in order to seek ratification. The proposal was then voted down.

At the time, the chair of the Glasgow and West of Scotland Forum of Housing Associations said that, as an obvious supporter and promoter of community-based housing associations, they welcomed the shareholders' decision and recognised the concerns of members, including their concern about the impending loss of community assets and the inevitable disappearance of local decision making.

That is why I think that amendment 101 is reasonable and coherent. It proposes the prudent measure of bringing the voting threshold for tenants and shareholders of housing associations into alignment, with a two thirds threshold being required for both. That would serve to provide an extra layer of protection for community-controlled housing associations against what are often cynical and insidious attempts to railroad through irreversible takeovers of community-controlled assets that risk pitting tenants against the member shareholders. That has been a worrying trend in Scotland's housing sector in the past few years, of which the situation at Reidvale Housing

Association is only the latest and most egregious example.

It would be particularly fitting for the Parliament to support amendment 101—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Mr Sweeney, could you bring your remarks to a close, please?

Paul Sweeney: —because this year marks the 50th anniversary of Scotland's first community-based housing associations.

I will speak to the remainder of my amendments in my closing remarks.

I move amendment 101.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Members will note that we will shortly reach the next time limit, and that we have a further group still to debate. Therefore, under rule 9.8.5A, I am minded to accept a motion without notice to extend the debate on amendments by 30 minutes. I ask the Minister for Parliamentary Business and Veterans to move such a motion.

Motion moved,

That, under rule 9.8.5A, the third time limit be moved by up to 30 minutes.—[*Graeme Dey*]

Motion agreed to.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I invite Mark Griffin to speak to amendment 305 and other amendments in the group.

Mark Griffin: Before I speak to amendment 305, I express my support for the amendments in the name of Paul Sweeney and Ariane Burgess in this group, which promote co-operative and community-based housing models.

Amendment 305 would ensure that families are not prevented from moving to accommodation that better meets their needs simply because of outstanding housing arrears or related debts. It is a targeted and compassionate reform. It would not prevent local authorities or social landlords from recovering those debts, but it would remove a barrier that too often traps families in unsuitable homes.

We know from casework and from the experiences of advocacy organisations such as Aberlour that families on low incomes can find themselves stuck in overcrowded, unsafe or inappropriate housing and unable to move because of historical arrears. Being in that situation can deepen people's hardship, undermine family wellbeing and make it even harder for them to break the cycle of debt and disadvantage.

Yesterday—purely by chance—I received an email from someone who thought that I was their MSP. In fact, I am not; they are a constituent of the Rutherglen constituency. In the email, they said:

"I am a constituent living in Rutherglen in a small two-bedroom flat with my partner and our four children. Our family is currently living in conditions that are overcrowded and severely impacting our mental health and wellbeing.

We have been on the transfer list since 2017. We got into rent arrears during Covid and had our application suspended for a long time without us being notified, which set us back a long way."

The fact that I received that email, purely by chance, from someone who thought that I was their MSP highlights the situation that I am trying to avoid with my amendment. I am trying to avoid overcrowding for families, and children having their mental health and their physical health impacted by being in an overcrowded house because of arrears that are entirely outwith their control. That should not prevent their being moved to a house that properly meets their needs.

As I said, amendment 305 would not prevent a local authority or a social landlord from recovering such debts at a later stage, but it would allow us to treat families in that position with empathy and to give them the homes that they need.

I ask members to support amendment 305.

Ariane Burgess (Highlands and Islands) (Green): I apologise for arriving slightly late to the chamber for this grouping. Before I speak to my amendments, I note that I will support the amendments of Paul Sweeney and Mark Griffin, for the same reasons: they support community and co-operative housing.

Amendment 337 would require the Scottish Housing Regulator to "have regard" to different models of social housing, such as housing co-operatives. At present, the regulator adopts a blanket approach to all forms of social housing. However, that system does not take into account the fact that social housing comes in a variety of models, and regulations that rightly apply to one form of housing can be to the detriment of other forms. That particularly disadvantages non-traditional forms of housing, such as co-operatives.

18:30

I have spoken with several co-ops, which find that the regulator does not fully understand the model. It also expects them to operate in the same way that a major housing association might, when they do not have the same level of resource available to them. That means that what may be a simple, single step for a typical housing association translates into a complicated process for a registered social landlord co-operative.

That is simply not fair. These co-ops routinely deliver high levels of tenant satisfaction and prove, time and again, that they can operate effectively as social landlords.

We are now at a point at which the number of RSL co-ops in Scotland has tumbled from 20 to just seven in the space of two decades. On the one hand, the Scottish Housing Regulator is performing its duty to protect tenants, homeless people and others, but on the other hand, it is depriving those same people of a form of housing that could make a significant positive difference to their lives.

My amendment 337, which has been drafted with the support of Co-operatives UK, is reasonable in its scope and is within the spirit of the Housing (Scotland) Act 2010, which sets out the regulator's obligations. It is worded in a way that would not place co-operatives above other forms of social housing, nor does it seek to be overly prescriptive in what it would require of the regulator. It would mean, however, that the Scottish Housing Regulator would have to take a slightly different approach to governance.

If the amendment is agreed to, we could create a culture of supporting co-operatives in the sector to flourish and provide more affordable social housing options for people.

Màiri McAllan: I will begin with amendment 101, in Mr Sweeney's name. The Government's position on this issue has not changed since stage 2. The Housing (Scotland) Act 2010 sets out that, in order for a transfer to proceed, "a majority of tenants" should agree to it.

I was not initially clear on the rationale for Mr Sweeney's amendment, but I listened carefully to what he said. Nonetheless, I fear that moving to a requirement for agreement by two thirds of tenants could be viewed as setting out a position whereby the expressed wish of a simple majority of tenants could be ignored. Moreover, I have looked into the matter and it appears that, since 2010, 21 transfers out of a proposed 22 have all received approval by well over two thirds of tenants. That indicates, I think, that there is not a great case for change to be made.

Given the fact that there has been no consultation with the sector, with either landlords or tenants, coupled with the questionable need for change in the light of the paucity of evidence and the fact that all the transfers that have been agreed since 2010 have received a majority of well over two thirds, I will not be supporting the amendment.

Paul Sweeney: Does the cabinet secretary agree that the requirement for agreement by a two-thirds majority of shareholders in the Co-operative and Community Benefit Societies Act 2014 is justified? Does she accept that the attempted asset stripping of £180 million of community housing should be of concern to the Government?

Màiri McAllan: Of course, that may or may not be of concern to the Government, and I am happy to speak to Mr Sweeney about it some more. The question that is in front of me just now, however, is whether a change to primary legislation is required. When I see that 21 of the 22 transfers that have been proposed since 2010 have all received approval by well over two thirds of tenants, I do not think that there is a case for change.

John Mason (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind): Will Màiri McAllan give way?

Màiri McAllan: I will take one more intervention, and then I will move on.

John Mason: Would the cabinet secretary agree that it was very unfortunate to use a term such as "asset stripping" in the case that was mentioned? Places for People Scotland is a reputable association and it is seeking to help the people of Reidvale, but the jury is still out as to whether Reidvale can survive on its own.

Màiri McAllan: It is clear that Glasgow representatives are very well acquainted with the detail of the matter. Given that I am not, I will be careful not to use or endorse any of the terms that are used, but if either member wants to speak to me about the matter further, I would be happy for them to do so.

Amendment 304 would add a requirement for the Scottish Housing Regulator, in performing its regulatory functions, to encourage

"a diversity of social housing models, including housing co-operatives."

That sounds absolutely fine, but the regulator does not differentiate at all between different types of registered social landlords in its work. The amendment would present a change to the regulator's functions, and it would present technical challenges, as housing co-operatives are not defined in the Housing (Scotland) Act 2010. I am sympathetic to and supportive of the amendment's intention—namely, the promotion of co-operatives—but imposing a loosely defined additional duty, under the regulator's general functions, would present a challenge that we ought to avoid.

Paul Sweeney: Does the cabinet secretary agree that, in the context of providing ostensible neutrality, bigger housing associations will inevitably dominate smaller ones and that positive protections should be in place?

Màiri McAllan: On the contrary, it is important that the regulator is allowed to carry out its regulatory functions without drawing out one type of registered social landlord or another. However, that is not to say that co-operatives cannot be promoted in an alternative way, and I would be happy to work with Mr Sweeney on that.

Mr Sweeney's amendment 338 would require the assets of an RSL to be transferred to a community-based housing association that was operating in the area if there had been misconduct or mismanagement or if landlord viability was in jeopardy. My concern is that the amendment would be overly restrictive. It would not take into account the financial or organisational ability of the community-based RSLs in the area or their views on whether they wished to take on the assets of a failing RSL. Therefore, ultimately, it might not be in the best interests of existing tenants for such a transfer to go ahead.

In addition, legislation already requires that, before directing a transfer of assets, the Scottish Housing Regulator may consult tenants who would be affected by the transfer and any secured creditors. Furthermore, an RSL may already request that the regulator direct a transfer of its assets to another specific RSL. Such provisions exist, and they contain the relevant safeguards that are required.

I absolutely appreciate that the intention behind amendment 305 is to support tenants with rent arrears to obtain a mutual exchange. However, the provision would go much further than that, as it would prevent a landlord from refusing consent for a mutual exchange on the basis of rent arrears if the number of criteria that Mr Griffin has set out in amendment 305 were satisfied. That would apply regardless of the total amount of rent arrears or whether the tenant was currently paying the rent arrears or keeping to a repayment plan. In fact, the landlord could refuse consent only if a notice of proceedings had already been served on the tenant on conduct grounds or if an eviction order had been granted against the tenant for the current tenancy.

Mark Griffin: I appreciate the cabinet secretary's position, but surely the Government accepts that children in an overcrowded property did not contribute to the arrears. The quantum of the arrears and whether a repayment schedule is being met is not the fault of those children, so they should be given the opportunity to move to a house that meets their needs, regardless of the debt that has been incurred by others.

Màiri McAllan: I absolutely appreciate that. I am sure that Clare Haughey, as the constituency representative for Rutherglen, would be very glad to take up the case that Mr Griffin raised. She will be able to point the family to the fact that social landlords already have discretion to agree a mutual exchange between their properties when there are rent arrears. The bill already contains measures for social landlords to take action to support tenants with rent arrears, particularly those arising as a result of domestic abuse.

Ariane Burgess's amendment 337 would add a requirement on the Scottish Housing Regulator,

"when preparing, revising or withdrawing guidance",

to

"have regard for a range of different housing models including co-operative models."

Much as with Mr Sweeney's amendment 304, I absolutely appreciate the intention behind amendment 337, but I am afraid that it would not operate as intended in the context of the regulator's guidance on how it should assess each social landlord's progress towards meeting the relevant standards.

Again, the issue relates to the fact that, in carrying out its regulatory function, the housing regulator does not have a role in promoting one type of housing over another. However, as I noted to Mr Sweeney, I am very supportive of co-operatives. I had an excellent meeting with the West Granton Housing Co-op and I saw the wonderful work that it was doing. I would therefore be pleased to continue working with Ms Burgess and Mr Sweeney on how the Parliament and the Scottish Government might support it.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I call Paul Sweeney to wind up and to press or withdraw amendment 101.

Paul Sweeney: It is disappointing that the Government is not minded to support the amendments. It is also disappointing that I have had no engagement whatsoever with the Government to try to reach a point of consensus on them. Particularly at a time when Scotland is celebrating half a century of community-based housing associations, it is a pity that the Government is snubbing the sector in that way.

Màiri McAllan: With the greatest respect to Mr Sweeney, I want to say on the record that I have been engaging extensively with members over the summer and I have had a number of engagements with the Scottish Labour Party generally. Some members have been more able to meet than others.

Paul Sweeney: Unfortunately, no invitation was extended to me. I was keen to work across the chamber to reach consensus on the amendments, but that co-operation was not forthcoming. The amendments have the support of the co-operative sector and the community-based housing sector in Scotland. It is important to recognise that there are

valid and genuine concerns that have not been heard by the Government either today or at other times during the passage of the legislation.

We need proactive support to protect community-based housing associations that are clearly vulnerable to takeovers by large national housing groups, and to sustain housing co-operatives, which are actively being chastised by the regulator, which says that having committee membership restricted to tenants is not good enough.

It is broadly recognised that, when transfers take place, they should enjoy supermajority support. When they do not enjoy such support, that should be a red flag and a matter of concern. Bringing the threshold up to two thirds is a prudent and benign measure to ensure that we do not have another situation such as that involving Reidvale Housing Association, where a community has had to fight a rearguard action to save its housing association stock.

Similarly, in a situation involving a transfer of engagements, priority should be given to ensuring that community-based housing stock goes to another community-based housing association in the first instance. If that does not prove to be viable or appropriate, the opportunity could be opened up more widely to national housing groups. There would be a bit of a sliding scale—we should not lock national housing groups out of the process, as it might be appropriate for them to be involved.

The measures that I have raised are all reasonable and would have been of great benefit to the sector. I would have enjoyed having a greater opportunity to engage in discussions around them, but it seems that the changeover of ministers has militated against that. It is unfortunate that we cannot do something with the proposals in the bill.

I press amendment 101.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 101 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

The Minister for Business and Employment (Richard Lochhead): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app did not connect. I would have voted no.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Lochhead. Your vote will be recorded.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)

MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 24, Against 80, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 101 disagreed to.

Section 30—Scottish secure tenancies etc: keeping pets

Amendment 13 moved—[Maggie Chapman].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 13 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)

McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 25, Against 80, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 13 disagreed to.

Amendment 14 not moved.

Amendment 102 moved—[Màiri McAllan].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 102 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)

Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 59, Against 47, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 102 agreed to.

Amendment 103 moved—[Màiri McAllan].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 103 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)

Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 53, Against 51, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 103 agreed to.

Amendment 214 not moved.

Amendment 104 moved—[Màiri McAllan]—and agreed to.

Amendment 215 moved—[Edward Mountain].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 215 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 46, Against 59, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 215 disagreed to.

Amendments 216 and 217 not moved.

Amendment 15 moved—[Maggie Chapman].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 15 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 23, Against 82, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 15 disagreed to.

Amendment 218 moved—[Edward Mountain].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 218 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 39, Against 66, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 218 disagreed to.

Amendment 219 moved—[Edward Mountain].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 219 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)

Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 24, Against 82, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 219 disagreed to.

Before section 31

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Group 14 is on tenancy deposits, premiums and guarantors. Amendment 45, in the name of Maggie Chapman, is grouped with amendments 290 to 292, 223 to 227, 379, 391 and 392.

Maggie Chapman: Amendment 45 requires the Scottish ministers to reduce the maximum deposit allowed. As deposits are usually linked to rents, as rents have increased, so have deposits. The average rent for a two-bedroom flat in Lothian is £1,358 per month. As landlords can ask for up to two months' rent as a deposit, a maximum deposit would be around £2,700. Scottish renters, who, the cabinet secretary has repeatedly said, enjoy more protections than those in England, can already be charged much higher deposits than their English counterparts, who can be charged no more than five weeks' rent in most cases. That change to five weeks was introduced under the Conservative Government's Tenant Fees Act 2019, which was voted through by Labour, Lib Dem and Conservative MPs. I again hope—perhaps in vain—to see some consistency: that their MSP counterparts will not deny their constituents that same right.

Generation Rent has conducted surveys with tenants, and it found that high deposits can cause serious issues with being able to afford to move, even when moving is essential. One tenant described needing to move for their partner's mental health but not being able to. They said:

"We really needed to move, but we couldn't because the deposit was the big sticking point. You can fiddle about with some other costs ... but having to have that deposit up front as well as the next month in advance, it was just too much."

Tenants face significant financial pressures at the beginning of a tenancy, with rent, deposits and other moving costs contributing to high up-front costs. In our survey, tenants were asked how they met those costs at the beginning of their current tenancy. Nearly a third—32 per cent of respondents—had to dip into their savings to cover their expenses, while a quarter of tenants had to borrow money from friends or family. For 14 per cent of tenants, credit became a lifeline to affording the deposit, whether through credit cards, overdrafts or loans.

High deposits also place pressure on discretionary housing payments. I am proud that Greens have successfully campaigned for more DHP funding, but higher deposits are taking up funding that can easily be redirected to other pressing needs if the maximum deposit is reduced.

I will now speak briefly to some of the other amendments in this group. Meghan Gallacher's amendment 290 would require deposits to be paid directly to a deposit protection scheme. That would set up a direct line of communication between tenant and scheme, and it would make it easier for deposits to be returned.

Ross Greer will speak to his amendments; I will not speak to them now.

We have another opportunity here to improve people's access to housing and to improve Scottish tenants' rights to match those elsewhere in the UK. I hope that members across the chamber can support that, and that they will vote for my amendment.

I move amendment 45.

Meghan Gallacher: For the benefit of all members in the chamber, I can say that I will not move amendment 290, as I have identified a concern with its drafting.

I will speak briefly to amendment 45, which Maggie Chapman lodged. I believe that lowering the deposit cap is unnecessary. It could leave landlords less protected against arrears and damage to property, and it could undermine the sector. For that reason, the Scottish Conservatives will not be supporting that amendment.

19:00

Maggie Chapman: Can Meghan Gallacher explain why exactly this provision—a maximum deposit of five weeks' rent—was introduced by her colleagues elsewhere in the UK? Why will she not back it?

Meghan Gallacher: We are discussing this amendment, not decisions that have been taken elsewhere.

When we consider balance and the parity of the sector, we have to be reasonable in the amendments that we lodge. I do not think that we can undermine confidence in the sector any more than it has already been undermined by decisions that have been taken in our consideration of the housing bill up to this point.

I believe that amendments such as this will lead to more landlords leaving the sector. We need a stable and predictable deposit scheme, which is good for maintaining landlord confidence. We will reflect that in what we vote for this evening.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I advise members that, as we are nearing the agreed time limit, under rule 9.8.4A(c), I consider it necessary to allow the debate on this group to continue beyond the limit in order to avoid the debate being unreasonably curtailed.

I call Ross Greer to speak to amendment 291 and other amendments in the group.

Ross Greer (West Scotland) (Green): I will try to reasonably curtail myself, in the interests of time.

Amendments 291 and 292 are alternative options to achieve the same aim: a guarantor scheme for people who are estranged from their families. Amendment 379 is a consequential amendment to either or both of those.

Amendment 291 would require ministers to create a scheme whereby a public body—such as a council or a university—is to act as a guarantor for a young person who is estranged from their family, supporting them with access to private tenancies.

Amendment 292 is an attempt at compromise. It was drafted to reflect points that were raised by the Government at stage 2, particularly around the need for consultation and its hesitance around specific bodies acting as guarantors.

Amendment 291 says that ministers "must" create a guarantor scheme for estranged young people. Amendment 292 replaces "must" with "may", giving ministers the power to do so, but not compelling them to use it.

The Government has recognised the significant barriers that estranged young people face in

accessing housing, so it is disappointing that it is not backing those options. Instead, the cabinet secretary announced yesterday that we are getting another mapping exercise. I have to say that I felt utterly deflated hearing that. How many times does the Government need to ask the same question, gather the same evidence and form the same working groups?

The Government commissioned research into the barriers that affect estranged young people in further and higher education, which was published three years ago, under the title, "Research to understand the experiences of estranged students in further and higher education in Scotland". That research said:

> "the implementation of a national guarantorship system was recommended to assist estranged students access accommodation more easily."

We know that it can be difficult for many young people and students to get landlords and letting agents to take them on, and they often require guarantors as a form of security. It is obvious that most people in that situation turn to older family members to step in as those guarantors. Those who do not have family that they can turn to due to estrangement are at a significant disadvantage, making it even harder for them to access housing and compounding the huge challenges that they already face.

We know that the landscape is uneven right now. Some universities, such as the University of Glasgow, have generous and comprehensive support packages, including guarantorship schemes. In Glasgow's case, that is due to the campaigning work of its former student, now the councillor for the area, Blair Anderson. However, other institutions have no arrangements in place at all.

The Government has already looked at the issue in this session and been told to act. This was a Bute house agreement commitment and, to be completely honest, the reasons that were given to me by some in the Government for not taking it forward over the past few years were tenuous, verging on nonsensical. The financial costs are completely negligible, for a start.

It is a sad reality that, for some young people, moving away from home for the first time for university or another reason is the first opportunity to escape an abusive family or home situation. Guarantor requirements act as a massive barrier to that, and they often allow abusers to maintain a position of power over young people into their adult life.

This small step would have a transformational impact for a vulnerable group in our society, who are at far higher risk of homelessness than most of us. If members agree on the principle of that but still have specific concerns that we do not have time to discuss today, and which mean that they cannot support amendment 291, I urge them to support amendment 292, to give ministers the clear power to set up such a scheme in the future, once the Government's concerns have been addressed.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I call Edward Mountain to speak to amendment 223 and other amendments in the group.

Edward Mountain: The point of these amendments is to ensure that unclaimed deposits are used properly and are not allowed to sit and fritter away.

I will give just a little bit of information. Members might be surprised to learn that, in November 2024, 23,123 unclaimed deposits were sitting with SafeDeposits Scotland, with a total value of £6,310,182. SafeDeposits Scotland is getting the interest, which I assume means that it is getting about £300,000 a year. That is the sort of money that is sitting there and that the Government, through some of its amendments, wants to use to inform tenants in private tenancies about the obligations and the bill. I do not want to do that. The money should be used to increase and improve the standard of social housing. We should allow the people who are renting in that sector to benefit from that £6 million pot, and my amendments 223, 224, 225 and 227 are all technical amendments to allow that to happen. I believe that they should get the Parliament's support, and I will be surprised if they do not.

I listened to Maggie Chapman's point on amendment 45. Sadly, she bases all her decisions on rents in urban areas. Rents in rural areas are much lower and could be as low as £700 a month. Two months' rent would be £1,400, which, in my mind and experience, would allow for just one room in one house to be repainted and recarpeted if there is any damage at the end of a tenancy. That seems entirely reasonable. If the amendment had been shifted round to suggest that the deposit should be a percentage at higher rents rather than catching all the lower rents, that would have made sense.

Ross Greer's amendments are interesting—I had not looked at the issue from the point of view that he set out. I will be interested to hear what the cabinet secretary says in response.

I strongly agree with Mr Griffin's amendments. Other things are sometimes included in the rent figure, such as private water supplies and private sewerage, that are not the rent for the house. Those charges are probably equivalent to what Scottish Water would charge, which we are told is so reasonable, for the disposal of waste.

I am interested to hear what the cabinet secretary says. I am sure that the Parliament will support my amendments, which would ensure that money goes into social housing, where it should be spent.

Mark Griffin: Amendments 391 and 392 are about delivering clarity, fairness and transparency for tenants across Scotland's rental sector. At present, there is a lack of consistency in how rent and service charges are defined and reported, which can leave tenants confused about what they are paying for and make it difficult to compare properties or challenge unfair charges.

The amendments would make it explicit that charges for domestic services such as water, sewerage, gas, electricity, broadband and district heating are not to be treated as premiums and must be kept separate from rent. That is not purely a technical change; it has real-world consequences for tenants, letting agents and rent officers. Too often, published market rents obscure whether utilities are included, making it impossible for tenants to know whether they are being charged fairly or to make meaningful comparisons between properties. That lack of transparency can undermine trust in the sector and can leave tenants vulnerable to hidden costs.

By clearly separating occupancy costs from service charges, the amendments would provide complete transparency to everyone involved. That would empower tenants to understand exactly what they are paying for, support rent officers in their regulatory role and ensure that letting agents operate on a level playing field. Ultimately, clarifying in the bill that rent means rent and is not bundled with service costs would help to create a more open, accountable and fair rental market. That would support accuracy in the open market, protect tenants from unfair practices and build trust in the system.

I understand that the Government's position is that it is already the case that the definition of rent premium does not apply to the charges for those essential services. I would be grateful if the cabinet secretary could confirm on the record whether that is in fact the case and if the Government could, if it feels that it would be appropriate, issue guidance to give clarity to the sector. If it is the case, I do not plan to move amendments 391 and 392.

Màiri McAllan: Amendment 45, in the name of Maggie Chapman, would require existing regulation-making powers to be used to, first, specify the maximum amount of deposit and, secondly, impose a restriction so that the amount must be less than the current maximum of two months' rent. I listened carefully to Maggie Chapman and I understand her intent. However, I cannot support her amendment. It would restrict ministers' ability to introduce draft regulations for the Parliament's approval that allow for appropriate tenancy deposits following consultation with landlords and tenants. In implementing the new right of tenants to seek consent to keep a pet, we have committed to consulting on conditions for approval, including on the potential for a supplementary pet deposit. It would not be right to restrict future changes if that is the right course of action. That will be borne out in our discussions with tenants and landlords. It is also worth noting that restricting the rents that can be made available can have unintended consequences whereby landlords look for other means to have security over their contract with the prospective tenant.

I will not speak to amendment 290, as Meghan Gallacher has confirmed that she will not move it.

Ross Greer's amendments 291, 292 and 379 seek to establish a rent guarantor scheme for estranged young people through regulations. I understand the concerns behind those amendments; I have met Mr Greer and discussed them with him. I am very sympathetic to the outcomes that are being sought, but I do not believe that any of the options that he has put before us are appropriate. I am not convinced that conferring functions on a public body to act as a guarantor is the best way to support estranged young people, particularly in view of the additional costs and time that it would take to set up such a new scheme. Consideration would also have to be given to how to describe estranged young people in an appropriate way. Perhaps most importantly, it has not been clear to me from the discussion of these matters why it would be readily justifiable to pursue provision for one group—that is, estranged young people—to the exclusion of all others who may need support with guarantees.

I know that Mr Greer has his doubts about it, but a mapping exercise is under way to identify gaps and barriers in guarantor provision across the board, and it is important that we do that work. Early findings show inconsistent support and a lack of clear pathways. My intention is that, once that work is complete, there will be a more consistent and accessible approach, potentially through national guidance or a framework. I commit today to progressing that work to improve access to rented accommodation for estranged young people, as well as others who may require support.

Ross Greer: I am grateful to the cabinet secretary for taking my intervention. My frustration with that work is that it has already been done—the Government published findings in 2022. I disagree with her argument that she is not convinced about public bodies acting as guarantors, but I accept that it is the Government's

position. However, that is an argument against amendment 291; I am still unclear as to why the Government opposes amendment 292. That amendment does not specify public bodies and does not say that the Government must set up that scheme; it simply gives it the power to do so if, for example, the mapping exercise concludes that that is necessary. Why would the Government not want the option of doing that at a later point, without the compulsion to do so?

Màiri McAllan: The work is under way. I do not need primary legislation for that to be the case. However, I will draw out my other point, which is very important and which we must not lose sight of, about how we justify pursuing a scheme for estranged young people to the exclusion of others. The work that I and the Government have been undertaking is much broader than that, and the results of it could, in turn, be much broader.

Edward Mountain's amendments 223 to 227 seek to change the purposes for which unclaimed tenancy deposits could be used. A similar amendment was lodged at stage 2. We made clear then what I will make clear today: unclaimed tenancy deposits are sums that have been paid by private tenants and we believe that they should be used to benefit private tenants and those seeking to access the private rented sector. I cannot support those amendments.

Amendments 391 and 392 have cropped up a few times throughout stage 3. For the reasons that I have set out before, I cannot support them. Mr Griffin knows that I do not support the changes to remove utility payments from the definition of rent payable, not least because that would take those payments outwith protections that might otherwise accrue to rent, which could leave tenants open to abuse of that provision.

I will leave it there.

19:15

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I call Maggie Chapman to wind up and to press or withdraw amendment 45.

Maggie Chapman: I will restrict my remarks to the issue of guarantors. Yesterday, I proposed a guarantor scheme for international students—students who will not have the family support networks or other people who are usually relied on to be guarantors. This evening, Ross Greer has called for a guarantor scheme for estranged students, or for the power to enable the Government to set one up, should it so wish.

The idea that we can keep going over the same ground, repeating the same calls for evidence and getting the same answers time and again is really frustrating, especially for young people and students who have been looking for a solution to the problem for years. This is not a new problem—the Government identified it and had a report with very clear recommendations three years ago. I find it deeply frustrating that we are back in the same place looking for more evidence on something that we know very well is necessary.

With that, I will press amendment 45.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 45 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)

Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 7, Against 98, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 45 disagreed to.

Amendment 220 moved—[Maggie Chapman].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 220 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)

Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 44, Against 61, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 220 disagreed to.

Amendment 221 moved—[Edward Mountain].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 221 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)

Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 40, Against 66, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 221 disagreed to.

Amendment 290 not moved.

Amendment 222 moved—[Maggie Chapman].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 222 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)

Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 7, Against 99, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 222 disagreed to.

Amendment 291 not moved.

Amendment 292 moved—[Ross Greer].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 292 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)

Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 9, Against 96, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 292 disagreed to.

Section 31—Use of unclaimed tenancy deposits

Amendment 223 moved—[Edward Mountain].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 223 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Abstentions

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)

Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 22, Against 68, Abstentions 16.

Amendment 223 disagreed to.

Amendment 224 moved—[Edward Mountain].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 224 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Abstentions

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)

Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 23, Against 67, Abstentions 16.

Amendments 224 and 225 disagreed to.

Amendment 226 moved—[Edward Mountain].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 226 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 47, Against 59, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 226 disagreed to.

Amendment 227 not moved.

After section 37

Amendment 228 not moved.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Group 15 is on landlord registration. Amendment 229, in the name of Maggie Chapman, is the only amendment in the group.

Maggie Chapman: Several times during the passage of this bill, I have talked about the need to ensure that there is proper incentive for rent controls to be respected by landlords. Without that, rent controls will be weakened, just like rent pressure zones were—that is why we have argued for higher fines. Amendment 229 would ensure that any landlord who has charged an illegal rent increase or wrongfully ended a tenancy would have that taken into account by the local authority when deciding whether they are a fit and proper person to be renting out property in their area.

Importantly, amendment 229 would not require local authorities to automatically strike off landlords for the reasons that are outlined in the amendment; it would require that they consider those things only when assessing whether the landlord is fit and proper. If there were to be mitigating circumstances for why the rent was inappropriately increased, those could be explained by the landlord and considered. Therefore, there are safeguards in place in the amendment.

Amendment 229 would put some important teeth into the bill. It would make it clear that rent controls should be respected and ensure there are appropriately penalties if they are not.

I move amendment 229.

19:30

Màiri McAllan: Maggie Chapman's amendment 229, although clearly well intentioned, is unnecessary. Section 85 of the Antisocial Behaviour etc (Scotland) Act 2004 already requires a local authority to "have regard to any" material that it considers is relevant to the question whether a person is fit and proper, including any such material that is mentioned in the additional examples that would be inserted by the amendment.

Picking out particular contraventions of landlord and tenant law would risk weakening the generality of the existing provision, without adding any protections. The Cabinet Secretary for Social Justice noted that point when the matter was raised at stage 2.

In addition to the material to be considered as part of the fit and proper person test for landlord registration, my amendment 74, which we debated in an earlier group, allows for additional powers to be conferred on the First-tier Tribunal to order a landlord to pay

"a financial penalty, or ... compensation"

should they fail to comply with the restrictions in a rent control area.

The Deputy Presiding Officer (Liam McArthur): I call Maggie Chapman to wind up and say whether she wishes to press or withdraw amendment 229.

Maggie Chapman: I will press amendment 229.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 229 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)

Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 23, Against 76, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 229 disagreed to.

Section 38—Private residential tenancies: ending a joint tenancy

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Group 16 is on joint tenancies and succession to tenancies. Amendment 293, in the name of Katy Clark, is grouped with amendments 232 to 235 and 302.

Katy Clark: I will speak to amendment 293, in my name. The bill allows tenants in a joint tenancy to give notice without the consent of the remaining tenants, which is an important improvement to prevent tenants from being trapped in a tenancy. My amendment 293 would provide greater protection for the remaining tenants, as well as the ability to transfer the joint tenancy to someone else.

That would, I hope, allow more flexibility for people in shared tenancies and the potential for easier transitions between tenancies. The amendment is supported by campaigns such as Living Rent. The Children and Young People's Commissioner Scotland also supports the amendment because it is worried that the bill's provisions to allow one tenant to leave a tenancy do not provide a

"guarantee that the remaining tenant would be able to continue the tenancy",

and could therefore leave

"more single parent households facing homelessness."

Living Rent, Scottish Women's Aid and other campaigns have raised that point, too. It has been a problem in England and Wales and has been reported on by the National Housing Federation, the Domestic Abuse Housing Alliance and the Domestic Abuse Commissioner. We should not risk going down that path in Scotland.

Amendment 293 would allow at least one party in a joint tenancy to remain in the house. There is not a guarantee on that in the bill as it is currently drafted, so my amendment would strengthen the law and deal with the situation.

In addition, the bill does not prevent a landlord from changing the conditions of a tenancy for the remaining tenants, and my amendment would address that issue also.

Edward Mountain: With amendments 233, 234 and 235, I am proposing that a non-related carer should be unable to inherit the tenancy. I absolutely agree that related carers should have that right, but I am not sure that I believe that non-related carers should. Amendment 232 is a technical amendment. I will be interested to hear what the cabinet secretary has to say about those amendments.

Katy Clark's amendment 293 is an interesting amendment, and I would be interested to hear what the cabinet secretary makes of it. It is a good problem for us to be airing.

With regard to amendment 302, I think that six months is quite a long period, given that three

months is where we are at at the moment. I would be interested to hear Mr Griffin's rationale for that.

Mark Griffin: Amendment 302, which I believe is supported by the Government, seeks to make a technical change to an amendment on succession that was agreed to at stage 2. It seeks to extend the period for which a qualifying person can remain in a let property following the death of a tenant from three to six months, to align it with other provisions in this section of the bill.

Màiri McAllan: I will not take too long, but I will take a little more time than I took in speaking to the amendments in the preceding few groups, because Katy Clark's amendment 293, in particular, pertains to an issue that is very important to me. I thank her for her engagement on her amendments in the group and, more widely, for her work in supporting those who experience domestic abuse, which is an issue that I feel very strongly about.

I absolutely understand that amendment 293 stems from concerns about the impact of a joint tenancy being ended for tenants—victims of domestic abuse, in particular—who would like to remain in their property. I have given careful consideration to the need for further change in that area in the run-up to stage 3, and I have looked closely at Katy Clark's amendments. Unfortunately, it is clear from looking closely at amendment 293 that it could mean that a departing joint tenant in the private rented sector could assign their interest in the joint tenancy to the remaining joint tenants. Crucially, they could do so without the consent of the landlord. In those circumstances, the tenancy would need to remain on the same terms.

The outcome in question—being able to end the tenancy—is already possible under existing provisions in the bill, but, crucially, with the landlord's consent. I will expand on that a little. The bill introduces a new provision whereby a victim of domestic abuse—or, indeed, anybody—could end their joint tenancy without the consent of, in this case, their abuser. In those circumstances, consent would currently be required. Crucially, the provision in the bill requires the landlord's consent, which retains legal competence. In such cases, the departing tenant's interest would be transferred to the incoming tenant, thereby preserving the tenancy.

As I have said, amendment 293 would completely remove the landlord's discretion from the process and would force the landlord to accept the assignation of the departing tenant's interest to the remaining tenants. In a domestic abuse scenario, we might say that that is justifiable, but, unfortunately, the legal underpinning prevents me from taking that view. Proposals such as those that are in front of us could amount to, or seriously risk being, a disproportionate control of the use of the landlord's property for the purposes of article 1, protocol 1 of the European convention on human rights. Therefore, I cannot support the amendment, because it is legally flawed.

However, I want to take a moment to make clear my determination to support the housing needs of women and children who face domestic abuse. It is worth taking time to point out some of the other measures that we are taking, in order to give members comfort, because I know that, like me, they will want to support amendment 293, but I must ask them not to.

On 2 September, the Government rolled out across the country the national fund to leave. Beyond that, through the bill, in the social rented sector, we will broaden the definition of domestic abuse in housing legislation to align it with the Domestic Abuse (Protection) (Scotland) Act 2021. A new legal duty will be placed on all local authority landlords and registered social landlords to prepare and publish a domestic abuse policy. The bill will also require social landlords to take additional steps before initiating eviction proceedings for rent arrears in situations in which domestic abuse may have contributed to the arrears. A Government-supported amendment in the name of Meghan Gallacher will support the reflection in the Scottish social housing charter of tenants who are affected by domestic abuse.

Beyond that, outwith the bill, I let the Parliament know today that implementing part 2 of the Domestic Abuse (Protection) (Scotland) Act 2021 is an absolute priority for me. It will provide a new legal mechanism for social landlords to apply to the court for a tenancy transfer in favour of a victim survivor, which would mean allowing a woman who is being abused in a social home to stay in her home. I will briefly talk about the private rented sector. The bill introduces the new process that I have spoken about, whereby a joint tenant in the private rented sector can end their tenancy without the agreement of other joint tenants, which would mean that a person could do that without the agreement of their abuser. The bill provides that massive step forward.

We have also committed to further action to developing domestic abuse guidance for private landlords and strengthening the existing pre-action protocol guidance for rent arrears, so we have a suite of actions. I am afraid that I cannot support Katy Clark's amendment because of the legal flaw and the lack of landlord consent.

Ruth Maguire (Cunninghame South) (SNP): I welcome what the cabinet secretary has said about the implementation of part 2 of the Domestic Abuse (Protection) (Scotland) Act 2021. Can she give an indication of when that might happen?

Màiri McAllan: I understand why the member would want to know that. It is my intention to lay regulations by December this year.

I have taken a bit longer with my remarks, because I want to give members the absolute assurance that I have given Katy Clark's amendment 293 the most thorough consideration that I can. I regret that I am unable to support it.

Amendments 232 to 235, which are entirely new at stage 3, would change the existing rights of carers to succeed to a tenancy after the death of a tenant in both the private and social rented sectors. They would place an additional requirement in that a carer who wants to succeed to a tenancy must be a member of the tenant's family. Restricting succession in that way would mean that someone who had given up their principal home to care for someone, informed the landlord of that and met the qualifying period would be unable to remain in the tenancy, which could result in them being made homeless. I think that that is very unfair, so I will not be supporting those amendments.

Finally, in relation to Mark Griffin's amendment 302, I welcome the constructive discussions with members following stage 2 and have taken into consideration their views and those of Marie Curie and social housing stakeholders. The amendment would extend from three to six months the period for which a person may remain in a let property in a case where the person is qualified to succeed to a Scottish secure tenancy but has declined the tenancy. I support the amendment, which would provide a person with additional time to find alternative accommodation.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I discourage colleagues from having conversations in the chamber while members are on their feet. I call Katy Clark to wind up and to press or withdraw amendment 293.

Katy Clark: I will press amendment 293. It is clear that there is a gap in the law in this area, as social landlords have highlighted, and the changes in the bill bring the issue to the fore. I met the cabinet secretary before and after the amendment deadlines and made it very clear that I was happy to try to work together. We need to address the issue and we have the opportunity to address it in the bill. We need legislation. I will be raising the issue in further amendments in later groups. I urge members to vote for amendment 293.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 293 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

19:45

Edward Mountain: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app would not connect. I would have voted no.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Mountain. I will make sure that that is recorded.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)

Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 25, Against 80, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 293 disagreed to.

After section 38

Amendment 105 moved—[Pam Duncan-Glancy].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 105 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)

Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 84, Against 21, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 105 agreed to.

Section 38A—Social landlords: qualifying repairs

Amendment 294 moved—[Mark Griffin].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is that amendment 294 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

Clare Adamson (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app did not connect. I would have voted no.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Ms Adamson. I will make sure that that vote is recorded.

Edward Mountain: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I am afraid that, again, my app would not connect. I would have voted no.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Mountain. I will make sure that that is recorded.

Edward Mountain: I mean that I would have voted yes—I was confused for a second. I assume that we can correct the division list.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: You are too late. I do not think that we can reverse your vote, but your intention is on the record, anyway.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)

Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 44, Against 60, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 294 disagreed to.

After section 38A

Amendment 295 moved—[Mark Griffin]—and agreed to.

Amendments 296, 297, 231, 230, 298 and 299 not moved.

Amendment 300 moved—[Ariane Burgess].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 300 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

Pam Duncan-Glancy: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My vote did not register, but I would have voted yes.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Ms Duncan-Glancy. We will ensure that that is recorded.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)

Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 24, Against 81, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 300 disagreed to.

Amendment 301 not moved.

Section 38B—Private residential tenancies: succession

Amendment 232 moved—[Edward Mountain].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 232 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)

Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 24, Against 79, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 232 disagreed to.

Amendment 233 not moved.

Section 38C—Scottish secure tenancies: succession

Amendments 234 and 235 not moved.

Amendment 302 moved—[Mark Griffin]—and agreed to.

After section 40

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Group 17 is on the private rented sector. Amendment 47, in the name of Maggie Chapman, is grouped with amendments 303 and 16.

Maggie Chapman: In introducing the new system of rent controls and other protections for tenants, one of the biggest challenges that we face is ensuring that renters know their rights and also how to ensure that those rights are respected. The Generation Rent research on deposits that I mentioned earlier found that the number 1 reason why renters did not formally challenge deposit decisions that they disagreed with was that they were not aware that they could. Given the huge change to their rights that will result from the introduction of rent control areas, which will be new to absolutely everyone, it is vital that renters are fully informed.

Amendment 47 would require the Scottish ministers to create a charter for private sector housing that clearly spelled out the rights and duties of renters and landlords. That would not be unusual or experimental; it would be much the same as the charter that we already have for social housing. The previous major housing act—the Housing (Scotland) Act 2010—placed a duty on ministers to create a charter for renters and landlords in the social housing sector. Although I would have preferred otherwise, the charter that I propose would not create new rights but would allow existing ones to be clearly communicated to renters. There is no good reason at all why those living in social housing should have that benefit while those living in privately rented housing do not.

I acknowledge the hard work that Meghan Gallacher did on the issue at stage 2, and I am grateful for the opportunity to have lodged amendment 47 at stage 3. Following on from the Conservatives' amendment, I have lodged amendment 303, which would require the charter to be reviewed regularly. Amendment 16 would ensure that information on the charter would need to be provided to tenants and that their rights in relation to rent control would need to be explained to them.

If members are unwilling to support amendment 303, they might wish to ask themselves the following question. Only yesterday, in agreeing to amendment 155, they were happy to create a duty for landlords to tell renters when they are not supported by rent controls, so why would they not think today that there should be an equivalent duty to inform renters when they are covered by those controls? Such a disparity would be entirely inconsistent and would display a worrying bias towards landlords in the construction of the Government's arguments.

I therefore urge members to support amendments 47 and 303, the only aim of which is to provide what we already have in the social housing sector: a charter for private rented tenants to ensure that they actually know what their rights are.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: As we are nearing the agreed time limit, I advise members that, under rule 9.8.4AC of standing orders, I consider it necessary to allow the debate on the group to continue beyond the limit, to avoid it being unnecessarily curtailed.

Meghan Gallacher: As I lodged amendment 47 at stage 2, I will give a brief outline of why Scottish Conservatives will not support it at stage 3.

Further to the debate at stage 2, I had extensive discussions with stakeholders in the private rented sector. They raised concerns that the PRS charters—should they be brought into force—would work too slowly to address issues such as affordability and lack of supply. They also said that the issue could easily be addressed in regulations, which would be more capable of amendment should we need to examine further difficulties in relation to the private rented sector.

Maggie Chapman: I thank the member for taking my intervention. As she knows, the issue is not about investment or the other broader issues; it is about ensuring that renters know what their rights are. I struggle with the idea that we can tell renters when they are not covered by a rent control area but we should not tell them when they are covered by one.

Meghan Gallacher: I was talking not about investment but about affordability and lack of supply, which I am sure are two issues that Maggie Chapman would agree with me on when looking at making improvements in relation to good practice. However, I genuinely believe that the aim of amendment 47 could be achieved without legislation and therefore without it being in the bill. That is where we disagree.

The conclusion that I have now come to relates to the work that I have undertaken as part of lodging the amendment at stage 2.

Regardless of whether Maggie Chapman and I agree or disagree, I am pretty certain that if amendment 47 is not agreed to, there will be future discussions about how we can strengthen good practice to ensure that the private rented sector works not only for landlords but for tenants. As we so frequently discuss in the context of the bill, finding that balance is very important.

Màiri McAllan: Amendments 47 and 303, which seek the creation of the PRS charter that we have been hearing about, would have to be implemented within 12 months of the passing of the bill and would introduce five-yearly review requirements.

The Scottish Government regularly runs campaigns to ensure that landlords and tenants are aware of their rights and obligations in the PRS, and we frequently direct landlords and tenants towards appropriate guidance. As we said at stage 2, we do not think that placing a statutory duty on ministers to ensure the delivery of a PRS charter is appropriate.

Instead, consideration of the need for such a charter and the accompanying need to communicate rights and responsibilities can form part of a private rented sector strategy. Work on such a strategy is being undertaken by the expert panel that forms part of the Government's housing to 2040 strategic board. Consideration of the need for a charter is part of that work, which I believe is best undertaken by the board. For those reasons, I cannot support amendments 47 and 303.

Amendment 16 seeks to introduce a requirement similar to that lodged at stage 2, by requiring a landlord to provide additional information to a prospective tenant. I agree that it is vital that tenants are aware of their rights and are empowered to use them. That should include their having access to relevant information that might affect their tenancy. However, some of what amendment 16 would require would mean that landlords would be providing information that is much more readily available from other sources.

Looking at the breadth of issues on which they might be required to provide information, there is a risk that aspects of it could amount to providing legal advice, which would clearly involve a conflict of interest that would be inappropriate. Existing statutory requirements require specified information to be provided by the landlord to the tenants, free of charge and at the point at which their tenancy commences. That is important, but I am afraid that the amendment goes too far.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I call Maggie Chapman to wind up and to press or withdraw amendment 47.

Maggie Chapman: I press amendment 47.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 47 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)

Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 23, Against 77, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 47 disagreed to.

Amendments 303 and 16 not moved.

Amendment 304 moved—[Paul Sweeney].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 304 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

Edward Mountain: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I continue to have problems with my app. I would have voted no.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Mountain. We will ensure that that is recorded.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)

Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 23, Against 79, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 304 disagreed to.

Amendment 305 moved—[Mark Griffin].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 305 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast

by Ross Greer]
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Dr Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 44, Against 57, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 305 disagreed to.

Before section 41

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Group 18 is on homeless persons and persons threatened with homelessness. Amendment 306, in the name of Sarah Boyack, is grouped with amendments 106, 307, 308, 107, 108, 313 to 325, 109, 326, 110, 236, 18, 332, 330, 331, 335, 333, 334, 382, 383, 385, 384 and 119.

Sarah Boyack (Lothian) (Lab): I first draw members' attention to my entry in the register of members' interests and my previous work with the Scottish Federation of Housing Associations.

This aspect of the bill is critical, because it is about tackling homelessness and, crucially, preventing homelessness. That is not a current priority and the current measures are not working at the moment, as thousands of families and people are becoming homeless and are getting stuck in temporary accommodation for too long. That is a huge cost to them as individuals, and it is a huge cost to our local authorities.

Prioritising the prevention of homelessness is the purpose of my amendments in this group. I will shortly move amendment 306, which will establish a national register of homeless households. We cannot plan for what we do not measure, and data is currently fragmented across our councils. If we had more effective planning and a register, it would help us to understand the scale of the national housing emergency. We currently do not have sufficiently detailed data on those who are threatened with homelessness or those who are currently experiencing it.

We had a long debate about the matter several months ago with the then Minister for Housing, and we discussed the issue of data protection. I think that amendment 306 addresses both data protection and cost concerns. The detail sits in affirmative regulations after consultation by the Scottish Government. The information would constitute a minimal data set, and it would be subject to role-based access and audit. The Parliament would set the framework through the legislation, and ministers would be able to provide detailed safeguards for scrutiny and to design the detail, learning from discussions that I know will

have been held over a number of months with our new Cabinet Secretary for Housing.

If we were to accept amendment 306, we would ensure that organisations were able to work together to allocate suitable housing, which would streamline the resources that are required for a household that has applied to be homeless in multiple local authority areas. The amendment also gives more detailed information about the depth and breadth of the housing issues that Scotland faces.

It is critical to understand the scale of the issue in order to identify how many new homes are needed, and exactly where. Amendment 306 gives us the opportunity to get exact information on the scale of the housing need through a deliberative and preventative framework, and that has to be seen as an opportunity. Having a high degree of accuracy on the number of homeless households and on where they are will help us to prioritise and to determine where we need to focus in building and planning for the exact types of homes that are needed urgently to address homelessness.

Amendment 313 would create a clear statutory gateway for proportionate information sharing when a relevant body believes that someone is homeless or is threatened with homelessness. Prevention fails when our health systems, justice systems and education systems know that there is a risk, but people do not ask for the help that they need and then slip through the net. The provisions in amendment 313 would give clear, early legal information sharing with an opt-out, so that people do not have to tell their story again and again before they get help.

At the cross-party group on housing, we published a report on student homelessness, and it was incredibly moving to speak to students, given the huge pressures that they are facing. We should think about how that impacts on their lives and about the situation of young people who are stuck in temporary accommodation. Amendment 313 would give us the opportunity to provide a legal basis for action.

I know that ministers might say that guidance could deliver that, but we have a bill in front of us that would give a legal basis and enable us to get into the detail, which ministers could consult on in detail with the Information Commissioner's Office and stakeholders, and then come back to Parliament on. We need to share only what is necessary, no more, and only to stop a crisis before it happens. That is what amendment 316 aims to do.

I have included a raft of organisations in my next set of amendments, because an ask-and-act duty must exist whereby people who are aware of those risks then do something about it, because that is not happening at the moment. Naming bodies would also avoid buck passing and give consistency. The duty is proportionate: it is to ask, signpost, and make a referral as appropriate. It is absolutely not about taking over the roles of our councils; it is about helping them.

I have a series of seven amendments that name key organisations. Amendment 318 names the colleges of further education, the British Waterways Board and the Crofting Commission, which are bodies that potentially see risk early. Colleges support students who face family or financial shocks. The British Waterways Board and the Crofting Commission have access to rural households, whose housing security can be fragile. Therefore, a simple duty to ask and act would help to prevent crises before they reach the council.

Amendment 319 relates to community planning partnerships under the Community Empowerment (Scotland) Act 2015 and would enable co-ordinated and place-based prevention. CPPs are potentially the natural forum to spot systemic risks—for example, local employment changes, transport disruption, service design—and would close the loop so that we have practical referrals, not plans. I know that Elena Whitham has also lodged an amendment that aims to add community planning partnerships, so I hope that there is a degree of support for that key issue across the chamber.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: As briefly as possible, Ms Boyack.

Sarah Boyack: My last four amendments relate to a range of public sector organisations, including Highlands and Islands Enterprise, national park authorities, and regional transport partnerships. I also highlight Social Security Scotland in particular. Those organisations are important because they could save the public sector a huge amount of money at local authority level—and because they could keep people well and safe and prevent them from becoming homeless.

I move amendment 306.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I call Jeremy Balfour to speak to amendment 106 and other amendments in the group.

Jeremy Balfour: I agree with Sarah Boyack's opening remarks. This part of the bill is vital for the whole of Scotland but, in many ways, particularly for those of us who represent Edinburgh and Lothian, which is facing a major issue with homelessness and the lack of housing. I thank the many third sector charities that I have engaged with—both as an individual and with the committee—for bringing things forward.

I will not add too much about amendment 109 with regard to Social Security Scotland. I agree with the comments that Sarah Boyack made. I think that she has perhaps gone slightly too far with some of the organisations, but Social Security Scotland is undoubtedly one that should be there.

On amendment 119, the reason why I raise this matter again is that, in many ways, we are being asked to take a leap into the dark with the bill. We are being asked to accept that things will be followed up on through regulations once these pilot programmes have worked their way through. These programmes have not started yet, and we have very little detail as to how they will work in practice and what information they will give. It would seem irresponsible for this Parliament to make such decisions for the next Parliament, unless the pilot projects can be fully debated and the lessons learned, both positive and negative, can be worked out. That is why it is important that the next Scottish Government, whatever its colour, should bring forward a report that the whole Parliament—and certain committees in particular—can scrutinise in detail.

Amendment 107 is a similar amendment to that of Sarah Boyack with regard to data sharing. I know that all of us MSPs can get frustrated by the number of forms that we have to get our constituents to fill in before we can get information from a local authority or a health board.

Across the piece, the excuse that is often made by the national health service, local councils or other public bodies is, "We can't tell you this because of data protection." The scheme will not work unless organisations are willing to share appropriate information with one another. People do not want to come forward and share information again and again. If they do it once, they do not want to have to do it again. My fear is that, unless we can work this out properly, we will find that data sharing issues are an excuse that is used by those who do not want to take part in the scheme.

20:15

Amendment 108 is a probing amendment and I do not intend to move it. However, I am concerned that the bill has lots of carrots but not many sticks. The presumption of the cabinet secretary and the Government is that everybody will play nicely and do what they are meant to do. Perhaps I am just old and cynical, but my experience is that that is not the reality. I worry that there are not enough sticks to encourage those who are not playing as the cabinet secretary would want them to.

Amendment 106 relates to the suitability of accommodation. Again, I lodged the same amendment at stage 2 and I had a helpful discussion with the cabinet secretary on the issue during the summer. I do not want to prejudge what she will say, but I think that she will say that this is another thing that is already in legislation and is not required. I gently point out to her that I have on numerous occasions been contacted, particularly by disabled constituents but also by those who have many people in their family, who have been offered accommodation that clearly is not suitable.

Local authorities are not approaching the issue in a way that is fair to families. Too often, disabled people are put in accommodation that is clearly not suitable for them. The amendment would strengthen the law and would ensure that local authorities put families and individuals in accommodation that meets their needs, rather than just dumping them wherever they can find somewhere for them.

Pam Duncan-Glancy: At stage 2, I lodged amendments that were the same as amendments 307 and 308 with the support of many care leavers and of the Children and Young People's Commissioner Scotland. The issue is of great concern to a number of people who are in the care system or leaving it and who feel that people are failed at the point at which they leave the system, when they do not get the support that they need to access housing.

In cases where a homeless applicant is a care leaver, amendment 307 would put a duty on local authorities to offer them a referral to organisations that provide throughcare and aftercare support services. Care leavers are defined as those who are under the age of 26 and still entitled to throughcare and aftercare services from their local social work department.

When I lodged my stage 2 amendment, I noted that, despite the fact that care leavers are entitled to those services, in practice, when someone who is care experienced is made homeless or threatened with homelessness, we see a disconnect between housing providers and other areas of state support. The Children and Young People's Commissioner Scotland noted that some care leavers are unaware that support exists and that there are examples of them not receiving that entitlement when a situation of potential homelessness arises.

Recently, Claire Burns from CELCIS told the Education, Children and Young People Committee that we have to look at aftercare because

"there was too much feedback about its not working".—[*Official Report, Education, Children and Young People Committee,* 10 September 2025; c 94.]

Fraser McKinlay of The Promise Scotland told the committee that only 48 per cent of people access the aftercare and support that they need.

For those reasons, having opportunities to refer on to other organisations is not just helpful but could address gaps in statutory services and provide the additional support that is needed.

At stage 2, the cabinet secretary said that the homelessness system in Scotland is based on whether someone is homeless or threatened with homelessness, not on their circumstances. She also noted that legislation recognises the specific needs of particular groups through regulations and guidance. However, it is clear from the evidence that care-experienced young people are still falling through the gaps, and amendment 307 could help to address that.

Amendment 308, which is also in my name, seeks to place a duty on the Scottish ministers to prepare guidance for local authorities on throughcare and aftercare support that could be offered to care-experienced young people. It specifies that, in preparing the guidance, Government ministers should consult local authorities, organisations that provide support to care-experienced young people and others whom the ministers think appropriate, and such views must be represented.

Amendment 308 follows amendment 307 by seeking to ensure consistency across the support that is provided. Inconsistency is well recognised by stakeholders, and both amendments are supported by Who Cares? Scotland and the Children and Young People's Commissioner Scotland, which I thank for engaging with me on the issues.

Elena Whitham (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP): My amendments 314 and 315 seek to place responsibilities on community planning partnerships to have regard to the need to prevent homelessness and to any relevant guidance that is issued by Scottish ministers. That was a recommendation from the prevention review group, of which I was a member, as there was a recognition of the important strategic role that CPPs play in their localities across all sectors.

The amendments are intended to support the bill's intention for prevention of homelessness to become a shared public responsibility by requiring the key local strategic planning body to consider the need to prevent homelessness as part of its functions. That would be on top of the requirements on relevant bodies, many of which might be community planning partners, to ask individual service users about their housing situation and to act in line with their own functions.

Through its consultation work, which included consultations with the Convention of Scottish Local Authorities, the Association of Local Authority Chief Housing Officers and the Society of Local Authority Chief Executives, the homelessness prevention review group identified the strategic importance of CPPs in homelessness prevention. The amendments build on public bodies' responsibilities under the fairer Scotland public sector equality duty to reduce inequalities of outcome as a result of socioeconomic disadvantage, and they help to join up homelessness prevention with related strategic local priorities, such as tackling child poverty, delivering community justice, improving mental health, identifying employment opportunities and addressing violence against women and girls.

By including community planning partnerships as a listed relevant body, Sarah Boyack's amendment 319 seeks to achieve a similar purpose. The difference between my amendments and Sarah Boyack's amendment is that mine do not subject CPPs to the operational duties that are set out in proposed new sections 36A to 36C of the Housing (Scotland) Act 1987, which are not relevant to CPPS' strategic planning functions. I understand that CPPs are not considered to be legal entities, but they are the linchpin of local strategy setting.

I hope that the cabinet secretary can say something about how CPPs can be involved in any guidance that is issued, to ensure that their role in prevention is given due regard.

Meghan Gallacher: On amendments 316 and 317, I lodged amendments that were the same at stage 2 and have continued to liaise with the Chartered Institute of Housing with a view to bringing them back at stage 3.

We need to recognise the resourcing and capacity pressures that are placed on local authorities by the prevention duty. Amendment 317 sets out a continuing professional development requirement for key housing management and homelessness practitioners, which will help to ensure that practitioners remain skilled and knowledgeable. For example, letting agents in Scotland have to complete a minimum of 20 hours of CPD every three years, alongside having a core qualification.

In recognition of the potential impact of new duties on the housing workforce, the Government should help to develop a housing skills and employability task force that would ensure that there are sufficient routes into the sector to address the issues that social landlords face over the next few years. It would be important to have CPD in place for the ask and act duty as well, given the nature of that duty and all the additional requirements that will be placed on local authorities if they are to fulfil their duties.

I have a couple of brief comments on other amendments in the group. We will support the sensible amendments in the name of Jeremy

Balfour. Pam Duncan-Glancy's amendments on care leavers are also sensible. Like my colleague Roz McCall, she does a lot of work in that area. I thank her for lodging the amendments and look forward to voting in favour of them at the relevant time.

We will also support some of Sarah Boyack's amendments. There might be too many of them, but you have to be in it to win it with stage 3 amendments. We will vote for the ones that we think are relevant to the bill.

Mark Griffin: I have three amendments in this group in two distinct categories. I also want to express my support for all the other amendments in the group, and I highlight the important contribution that they make to refining and expanding the part of the 1987 act that brings the ask and act duties into primary legislation.

My amendment 322 would ensure that general practitioners—providers of "primary medical services"—are included in the ask and act duties that are set out in part 5. Many organisations have highlighted that GPs are a crucial point of contact for people who are at risk of homelessness. I think that the omission of GPs from the list of relevant bodies is a gap that needs to be addressed.

The evidence is overwhelming that there are strong links between health and housing, and that people's use of health services often peaks just before they make their first homeless application, so I think that it is essential that GPs are covered by the ask and act duties. For reasons of clarity and accountability, it is important to set out a clear list of bodies with duties placed on them. Without that, there is a lack of clarity regarding the expectations on those who are not explicitly listed.

I absolutely recognise the concerns about GP capacity and the fact that GPs are essentially private businesses. However, given the close links between a person's use of and interaction with health services and the point at which they make their first homeless application, this is a crucial area that is missing from the bill and it should be urgently addressed.

Amendments 331 and 383 would address a technical but crucial gap in the application of the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child to part 5, which relates to homelessness prevention. The amendments have been developed with the support of the Children and Young People's Commissioner Scotland, which has been clear about the need for change in this area. Part 5 introduces important new duties to prevent homelessness by amending part 2 of the Housing (Scotland) Act 1987. However, crucially, because the 1987 act is an act of the UK Parliament, those new provisions fall outside the scope of the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child (Incorporation) (Scotland) Act 2024. Therefore, as it stands, public authorities would not be legally required to act in accordance with the UNCRC when carrying out these duties and, crucially, children would have no power to challenge a failure to uphold their rights. That is different from other parts of the bill and could leave some of the most vulnerable children without enforceable rights.

Amendment 331 would provide a solution by allowing the Scottish Government to

"repeal and restate Part 2 of the 1987 Act",

including the new homelessness prevention duties, so that they fall within the scope of the 2024 act. It is not about duplicating law but about ensuring that children's rights are fully protected and enforceable. I understand that the Government is not opposed to that in principle, and I welcome that, but I urge members to consider the omission caused by the anomaly of relying on a 1987 act of the UK Parliament. It is right to ensure that children's rights are upheld and covered by agreeing to my amendments.

Màiri McAllan: Similar to one or two other groups this evening, this is a large group. Again, I want to give members the courtesy of providing the Government's response to their amendments, but I will try to do so as swiftly as I can.

Amendment 306, in the name of Sarah Boyack, would require ministers to

"establish and maintain a register of homeless households."

I understand Sarah Boyack's intention, and I listened very closely to what she said, but the point is that local authorities already have a record of anyone who makes an application for accommodation or assistance in obtaining housing under the Housing (Scotland) Act 1987, and a record of all those who are assessed as homeless or threatened with homelessness.

Local authorities will continue to hold those records until they have discharged their obligations in respect of those individuals. Also, we already have annual homelessness statistics, the most recent of which was published last week. What is being called for is duplication and is not necessary. I therefore cannot support the amendment.

20:30

Sarah Boyack: The key issue that I am trying to get at is joined-up information sharing between local authorities. There are records in every local authority, but they are not joined up, which means that people can be registered in several local authorities. That does not make sense, surely.

Màiri McAllan: There are existing means of accessing that information. I am not sure whether the member is suggesting that the information should be held on a public register, because I think that we would both agree that that would be an inappropriate use of data. However, the fact that the data already exist and that we already have national statistics means that I will resist the amendment.

Jeremy Balfour's amendment 106 is about securing permanent accommodation and having regard to the particular needs of the person arising from their protected characteristics. [*Interruption*.] Mr Balfour is quite right in pre-empting what I am about to say, which is that that is already provided for in law. If in his view the law as it stands is not working, we need to ensure that it is being implemented, not layer more legislation atop it and confuse the landscape.

Amendments 307 and 308, in the name of Ms Duncan-Glancy, are on care leavers. Much of what is proposed is already catered for in the bill, and I have looked very closely to make sure that that is the case. With ministers' power to prescribe the types of advice and assistance that must be provided to those who are threatened with homelessness, we have the opportunity to set those out in a way that is specific to young people leaving care. That will be informed by our consultation following the Care Inspectorate's thematic review and by the potential package of support for young people leaving care that the Scottish Government is working on with partners.

I assure Ms Duncan-Glancy in respect of care leavers, and Mr Balfour in respect of people with protected characteristics requiring to be heard and understood, that I will make sure that the powers under the bill to understand and then make provision for support are used to support those individual groups.

Pam Duncan-Glancy: I do not doubt the cabinet secretary's intentions, but can she set out to Parliament what will be different about the guidance to support care-experienced young people under the bill and the guidance to support care-experienced young people under all the other legislation, despite which there is still a gap in support?

Màiri McAllan: If I understand the member's question correctly, the difference is that the guidance under the bill will pertain to people's housing needs. It will be informed by the work that the Government is doing and will follow the Care Inspectorate's thematic review. I will seek to ensure that the inspectorate's expert work is replicated under that piece of work.

Amendments 107 and 108, in the name of Jeremy Balfour, relate to the new ask and act duties of relevant bodies. Amendment 107 would confer a new power for a relevant body to share information with any other relevant body

"for the purpose of preventing or relieving homelessness".

It would allow relevant bodies to share information for the purposes of the exercise of their new functions. However, those functions include acting to

"remove or ... minimise the threat of homelessness".

The purpose of relieving homelessness is solely the function of a local authority. The information-sharing powers in the bill are important. Those are sufficient to enable bodies to perform their ask and act duties. What amendment 107 seeks goes beyond what we would be asking bodies to take on under the ask and act duties.

Amendment 108 would confer a regulation-making power on the Scottish ministers to specify the procedure by which a person who has been supported under the proposed new section may raise a concern. However, I point out that the bill already amends section 35A of the 1987 act to make it clear that a person may request a review of any decision by a local authority. Mr Balfour and I were able to discuss that in advance of stage 3.

Amendment 313, in the name of Ms Boyack, provides for the information-sharing power to be set out in regulations. However, as I mentioned, proposed new section 36CA of the 1987 act, as set out in section 41 of the bill, will allow relevant bodies to share information. I agree that that is very important, and it is provided for.

Amendments 314 and 315, in the name of Elena Whitham, which are on community planning partnerships, are relevant to proposed new section 36D of the 1987 act, as set out in section 41 of the bill, which places the duty on relevant bodies in the exercise of their functions "to have regard to" the need to prevent homelessness.

I thank Elena Whitham for taking the time to highlight the importance of CPPs, and also Sarah Boyack, who did likewise. The key point is that CPPs play an important role in co-ordinating services to reduce inequalities, including in preventing homelessness, but they do not deliver services. We will have the powers to update the list of relevant bodies by regulation at an appropriate time, which, importantly, will follow consultation with the bodies in question. For that reason, I ask that those amendments not be moved, and I will continue to work with members on the roles of CPPs.

Amendment 316 would place a duty on ministers to set out the principles that would apply to the ask and act duties. However, there are already clear objectives in the bill in relation to the ask and act duties. At stage 2, the proposed new

section 36C of the 1987 act was amended to give ministers the power to specify additional actions under regulations. I note that some of the principles that are listed in the amendment include duties that are already placed on relevant bodies, such as the need for them to "work together". If required, a statement of principles could be set out in guidance—principles are clearly more suited to guidance than to what is proposed.

Amendment 317 relates to continuing professional development. It is a positive thing to require continuing professional development to ensure that bodies with ask and act duties continue to be informed in an appropriate way. However, local authorities are already required by law to provide good-quality housing and homelessness advice free of charge to people in their area, and we will be able to provide for relevant continuing professional development for other bodies through regulation. Meghan Gallacher's amendment 317 would also require ministers to make regulations subject to the affirmative procedure. Therefore, there are also technical difficulties with it.

I am trying to move as fast as I can through the amendments; I will move to the proposals to add many bodies to the list of relevant bodies in relation to the ask and ask duties. In principle, the Scottish Government is willing to consider adding any appropriate body to the list of relevant bodies where there is evidence that that will help to achieve what we all want to achieve, which is the prevention of homelessness. However, where such a body is identified, it should be added only following consultation and discussion with it.

Section 41 of the bill will confer a new power on ministers to modify the meaning of "relevant body" and add bodies to the list. I note that the bodies that are currently listed have previously been consulted, and the list as it stands was based on the recommendations of an expert group that included people with lived experience of homelessness.

I will quickly try to move through some of the bodies suggested in amendments, but the principle is that, if appropriate, we would add them having consulted them.

Amendment 322 is about GP practices, which I know are of particular interest. We have already included health boards and special health boards in the list because community link workers in particular could have an important role to play. I am happy to consider further bodies, but I do not think that GPs are appropriate to add at this stage.

Similarly, on amendment 324, we are engaging with the Scottish Fire and Rescue Service about its potential inclusion on the list at a later date, but that work has not been completed.

On amendment 325, the bill already includes the Scottish ministers in the list of relevant bodies in so far as we have functions in relation to social security. That point also attends to amendment 109.

Amendments 110 and 236, in Maggie Chapman's name, relate to a different topic, which is intentional homelessness. Amendment 110 would require ministers, within a year of royal assent, to

"carry out a public consultation on removing the ability"

to treat intentional homelessness differently, followed by the publication of a report on other provisions. However, the amendment provides no timescale for that report and would allow ministers to repeal and replace existing primary legislation by regulations with no specified parliamentary procedure. That would be constitutionally inappropriate and I cannot support it.

Amendment 236 would require a report within two years of royal assent, which would risk pre-empting the outcome of the consultation that is planned later this year.

A more appropriate approach is the one that I have sought to set out in amendment 326, in my name. It will provide a delegated power to modify, repeal or replace the legislative framework on intentional homelessness with a requirement to consult on the use of the affirmative procedure. That will allow for proper engagement and detailed policy and legal analysis while ensuring full parliamentary scrutiny.

It is important that we do not pre-empt the findings of that important work on intentionality, and I therefore ask that members do not support the other amendments.

Amendment 18 and, similarly, amendment 332, from Maggie Chapman, seek to legislate for homelessness prevention strategies in respect of the LGBT+ community and the Gypsy Traveller community respectively. Again, I absolutely acknowledge that some groups, including those listed, will face specific challenges that put them at risk of homelessness. However, the homelessness prevention measures in the bill, like those in Scotland generally, apply to all of those who are threatened with homelessness and do not discriminate with regard to particular groups.

I am nearly there, Presiding Officer.

Amendments 330 and 382, from Edward Mountain, seek to clarify homelessness rights for those in accommodation that is tied to their employment. Local authorities are already required by law to assess someone's needs based on their circumstances and their current accommodation, regardless of their employment

status, so I will oppose those amendments as they are unnecessary.

Amendments 331 and 383, in Mark Griffin's name, refer—as he has taken us through—to the UNCRC requirements. I hope that Mr Griffin is aware of my commitment to meet the needs of children who are experiencing homelessness, but I am afraid that amendment 331 is not the right way to do that. The power that it proposes to confer is far too broad. It would allow Scottish ministers to repeal and re-enact the whole of part 2 of the 1987 act for any purpose, which is not appropriate in secondary legislation, so I cannot support it.

Martin Whitfield: Will the cabinet secretary take an intervention on that point?

Màiri McAllan: If I have time, Presiding Officer—yes.

Martin Whitfield: Is it not right that that is the very method that the Scottish Government has, on a number of occasions, indicated that it is going to use to ensure that the UNCRC rights are available for young people? In its offering in a bill that pre-dates the start of the UNCRC incorporation process in Scotland, the Government has not taken the opportunity to take it into account, as it assured members in the chamber that it would do.

The Presiding Officer: Cabinet secretary, I ask you, if you could, to begin to draw your remarks to a conclusion.

Màiri McAllan: Yes, I absolutely will.

I cannot comment on other bills, although I am sure that my ministerial colleagues who deal with the UNCRC legislation in particular would know the details of that. With regard to the provision in this amendment, however, I am not prepared to enable massive swathes of homelessness law to be repealed and re-enacted by secondary legislation. That is inappropriate.

Presiding Officer, if you need me to wind up, I will probably have to miss out some of the other amendments in the group.

The Presiding Officer: I would be grateful if you could begin to draw your remarks to a conclusion.

Màiri McAllan: Okay—I will do so very quickly.

Amendments 335 and 385, from Maggie Chapman, refer to the right to keep pets. We have already addressed pets and personalisation in the bill. Although there is no legal duty to do this, local authorities will be expected to consider the housing needs of any individual, including their pets.

Similarly, with regard to amendments 333 and 384 in respect of the housing first approach, I hope that Maggie Chapman knows that I have the greatest respect and support for that approach; I have just committed an extra £4 million to expand it this year. I cannot support amendment 384, but I will support amendment 334, which calls for an annual report to be published on housing first.

I will leave it there, Presiding Officer.

Maggie Chapman: I have several different amendments in the group and, as I have been brief in speaking to amendments in previous groups and have accepted interventions, I ask for a little bit of patience.

Amendments 110 and 236 concern the power to assess someone as intentionally homeless. Although some actions might seem intentional, they often stem from trauma, violence and disadvantage. If looked at from that point of view, they are absolutely not about choosing to become homeless; rather, such action should be taken to escape abuse, to get away from dangerous or compromising situations or to keep people safe.

Crisis skylight Edinburgh, in the Lothians, has not worked with anyone assessed as intentionally homeless who has not also had underlying support needs. Too many homelessness support services use up resources in challenging intentionality decisions. Crisis has made it clear that the intentionality test cannot be reformed to make it fairer; instead, Crisis says that it must be abolished and replaced with a much tighter concept.

If someone turned up at a hospital with an injury, our NHS would not provide lesser or no treatment simply because the person had deliberately injured themselves. It would treat their injury, and the person, with compassion and dignity. That is how our health service works, and it is how our homelessness services should work, too.

20:45

We have been moving in that direction for a long time, and we have already removed the requirement for local authorities to assess intentionality. Let us finish that job and abolish this cruel assessment, not just tweak around the edges. If the Scottish Government is not able to support doing that through amendment 110, I ask it to at least keep the issue on the agenda by supporting the reporting requirement that is proposed in amendment 236.

I acknowledge that the Scottish Government has listened to what Greens and others said at previous stages. Amendment 326, in the name of the cabinet secretary, who was not active on the issue at stage 2, will allow us to change the definition of intentionality, which is welcome. However, it stops short of complete abolition and

replacement with a more appropriate alternative, which Crisis and others have suggested is necessary.

Amendments 18 and 332 would require homelessness strategies to be prepared for LGBTQ+ and Gypsy, Roma and Traveller communities. Those communities have particular challenges that stem from stigma and discrimination, and that stigma and discrimination is on the rise. I am grateful to LGBT Youth Scotland for its help in preparing amendment 18, and for Alexander Stewart's work on the amendment on Gypsy, Roma and Traveller communities. If we are serious about our homelessness prevention work reaching those who are most in need, we need targeted and specific support to be provided for communities that bear the brunt of stigma and discrimination.

Amendment 335 would empower the Scottish Government to extend the right to keep a pet to those who live in homeless accommodation. The bill already does that for social and private sector housing tenants. I hope that every member would want to extend that benefit to those without a secure home.

Amendments 333 and 334 aim to support the roll-out of housing first. In many ways, housing first is a silver bullet for tackling homelessness for those with multiple and complex needs, but it is rolling out too slowly. The housing first experts whom I consulted in writing the amendments are concerned that the energy and speed behind housing first has ebbed somewhat.

The right to housing first for which amendment 333 provides would act as a major incentive to up the tempo in rolling out housing first support, and the reporting mechanism that amendment 334 proposes would provide a clear steer for doing so. I understand from an email from a Scottish Government representative that the Scottish Government will support amendment 334, and I am grateful for that. However, we need a more complete picture when it comes to housing first, and I urge the Government and others to support amendment 333.

Edward Mountain: I will speak to my amendment 330. I fundamentally disagree with what the cabinet secretary said about it, and I find it frustrating that she wrote it off as unnecessary. In my opinion, the amendment is necessary for the simple reason that people who live in accommodation that is provided as part of their job will no longer have that accommodation should they no longer have that job. There is a balance to be struck here, as there is with all things in life. The person who comes in to take on their job will probably need that house. If that person is prevented from moving in, it is unlikely that the business will be able to continue to function in the way that it does.

I take the cabinet secretary's point that local authorities have a duty to assess the condition of each person who applies for housing. However, the purpose of amendment 330 is different. It says that such persons should be classed as homeless and that they should be rehoused within three months of their employment ending. I think that that is a fair balance and that it is the right balance.

Amendment 382 is consequential to amendment 330, which I think is necessary—otherwise, I would not have lodged it.

I have looked at the other amendments in the group, and I will be able to support Jeremy Balfour's amendments. There is much in Sarah Boyack's amendments that I like, but I think that she pushes a bit far on occasion and stretches the envelope. However, I know that she feels that she is doing what is best and that therefore her amendments are necessary, too. I will vote for those that I think are appropriate.

Sarah Boyack: This has been a useful and constructive debate about a variety of amendments. We are all trying to strengthen the bill and the work that is done by a range of organisations across the public sector to prevent homelessness, because the issue is not going away.

I will press amendment 306, because this is a now issue. A lot is being done by local authorities and charities, but we need to do more. Strengthening the framework for the ask and act duties is critical, as is linking prevention work across the country so that people see a difference being made.

If the bill is to be successful, some of the amendments that others have lodged will be necessary. Jeremy Balfour's comments about the housing emergency were bang on. People who are homeless need permanent accommodation, and the issue of people with protected characteristics was raised. Elena Whitham mentioned child poverty. She and Edward Mountain raised employment issues. Meghan Gallacher made a point about shared responsibilities. There was such a lot in what was said.

We do not want the cabinet secretary to say that, although we have not done these things, we have ticked the box, so the bill can be passed. It is about what happens next. I suspect that some of us would be very up for future conversations, because we need to supercharge action against homelessness.

Pam Duncan-Glancy's comments about care leavers and Mark Griffin's comments about GPs are critical. Children's rights are central to what we are doing, because we want to protect current people and future generations in Scotland, including the disadvantaged groups that Maggie Chapman mentioned.

There is an awful lot in what has been said. I hope that the cabinet secretary will be prepared to discuss the issues with us. I also hope that, when I come to press my amendments, I go with the right ones—it is difficult to read the room and to know which ones people will support.

I go back to a point that I made earlier. The cabinet secretary talked about doing more of some things. It would be good for us to be able to influence future consultations and guidance, because ensuring that guidance is implemented is critical if we are to prevent homelessness. That issue could not be more urgent.

I press amendment 306.

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 306 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)

Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 46, Against 60, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 306 disagreed to.

Section 41—Duties of relevant bodies in relation to homelessness

Amendment 106 moved—[Jeremy Balfour].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 106 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 47, Against 59, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 106 disagreed to.

Amendment 307 moved—[Pam Duncan-Glancy].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 307 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

Martin Whitfield: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I am unsure whether my vote has been registered. I would have voted yes.

The Presiding Officer: I can confirm that your vote was recorded.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 47, Against 60, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 307 disagreed to.

Amendment 308 moved—[Pam Duncan-Glancy].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 308 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Ind)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
Burnett, Alexander (Aberdeenshire West) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Choudhury, Foysol (Lothian) (Lab)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Eagle, Tim (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Harvie, Patrick (Glasgow) (Green)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green) [Proxy vote cast by Ross Greer]
McCall, Roz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Rowley, Alex (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Russell, Davy (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Reform)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whitfield, Martin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Keith (Clackmannanshire and Dunblane) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don-Innes, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dornan, James (Glasgow Cathcart) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (LD)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Hyslop, Fiona (Linlithgow) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (Ind)
McAllan, Màiri (Clydesdale) (SNP)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP) [Proxy vote cast by Fulton MacGregor]
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD) [Proxy vote cast by Willie Rennie]
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 47, Against 59, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 308 disagreed to.

The Presiding Officer: At that point, I draw the bill proceedings to a close.

Business Motion

20:58

The Presiding Officer (Alison Johnstone): The next item of business is consideration of business motion S6M-19023, in the name of Graeme Dey, on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, setting out a business programme.

Motion moved,

That the Parliament agrees—

(a) the following programme of business—

Tuesday 30 September 2025

2.00 pm	Time for Reflection
followed by	Parliamentary Bureau Motions
followed by	Topical Questions (if selected)
followed by	Ministerial Statement: Techscaler Programme
followed by	Stage 3 Proceedings: Housing (Scotland) Bill
followed by	Committee Announcements
followed by	Business Motions
followed by	Parliamentary Bureau Motions
7.15 pm	Decision Time
followed by	Members' Business

Wednesday 1 October 2025

2.00 pm	Parliamentary Bureau Motions
2.00 pm	Portfolio Questions: Rural Affairs, Land Reform and Islands; Health and Social Care
followed by	Scottish Labour Party Business
followed by	Business Motions
followed by	Parliamentary Bureau Motions
followed by	Approval of SSIs (if required)
5.10 pm	Decision Time
followed by	Members' Business

Thursday 2 October 2025

11.40 am	Parliamentary Bureau Motions
11.40 am	General Questions
12.00 pm	First Minister's Questions
followed by	Members' Business
2.30 pm	Parliamentary Bureau Motions
2.30 pm	Portfolio Questions: Social Justice and Housing
followed by	Stage 1 Debate: Dog Theft (Scotland) Bill
followed by	Business Motions
followed by	Parliamentary Bureau Motions
5.00 pm	Decision Time

Tuesday 7 October 2025

2.00 pm	Time for Reflection
followed by	Parliamentary Bureau Motions
followed by	Topical Questions (if selected)
followed by	Stage 3 Proceedings: Criminal Justice Modernisation and Abusive Domestic Behaviour Reviews (Scotland) Bill
followed by	Committee Announcements
followed by	Business Motions
followed by	Parliamentary Bureau Motions
6.00 pm	Decision Time
followed by	Members' Business

Wednesday 8 October 2025

2.00 pm	Parliamentary Bureau Motions
2.00 pm	Portfolio Questions: Constitution, External Affairs and Culture, and Parliamentary Business; Justice and Home Affairs
followed by	Scottish Conservative and Unionist Party Business
followed by	Business Motions
followed by	Parliamentary Bureau Motions
followed by	Approval of SSIs (if required)
5.10 pm	Decision Time
followed by	Members' Business

Thursday 9 October 2025

11.40 am	Parliamentary Bureau Motions
11.40 am	General Questions
12.00 pm	First Minister's Questions
followed by	Members' Business
2.30 pm	Parliamentary Bureau Motions
2.30 pm	Portfolio Questions: Education and Skills
followed by	Stage 1 Debate: Right to Addiction Recovery (Scotland) Bill
followed by	Business Motions
followed by	Parliamentary Bureau Motions
5.00 pm	Decision Time

(b) that, for the purposes of Portfolio Questions in the week beginning 29 September 2025, in rule 13.7.3, after the word "except" the words "to the extent to which the Presiding Officer considers that the questions are on the same or similar subject matter or" are inserted.—[*Graeme Dey*]

Motion agreed to.

Decision Time

20:59

The Presiding Officer (Alison Johnstone): There are no questions to be put as a result of today's business.

Meeting closed at 20:59.

This is a draft *Official Report* and is subject to correction between publication and archiving, which will take place no later than 35 working days after the date of the meeting. The most up-to-date version is available here: www.parliament.scot/chamber-and-committees/what-was-said-and-official-reports/official-reports

Members and other meeting participants who wish to suggest corrections to their contributions should contact the Official Report.

Official Report
Room T2.20
Scottish Parliament
Edinburgh
EH99 1SP

Email: official.report@parliament.scot
Telephone: 0131 348 5447

The deadline for corrections to this edition is:

Wednesday 22 October 2025

Published in Edinburgh by the Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body, the Scottish Parliament, Edinburgh, EH99 1SP

All documents are available on
the Scottish Parliament website at:

www.parliament.scot

Information on non-endorsed print suppliers
is available here:

www.parliament.scot/documents

For information on the Scottish Parliament contact
Public Information on:

Telephone: 0131 348 5000
Textphone: 0800 092 7100
Email: sp.info@parliament.scot

The Scottish Parliament
Pàrlamaid na h-Alba