



OFFICIAL REPORT
AITHISG OIFIGEIL

Meeting of the Parliament (Hybrid)

Tuesday 14 June 2022

Session 6



The Scottish Parliament
Pàrlamaid na h-Alba

© Parliamentary copyright. Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body

Information on the Scottish Parliament's copyright policy can be found on the website - www.parliament.scot or by contacting Public Information on 0131 348 5000

Tuesday 14 June 2022

CONTENTS

	Col.
TIME FOR REFLECTION	1
BUSINESS MOTION	3
<i>Motion moved—[George Adam]—and agreed to.</i>	
<i>Amendment moved—[Neil Bibby].</i>	
Neil Bibby (West Scotland) (Lab)	3
The Minister for Parliamentary Business (George Adam)	5
TOPICAL QUESTION TIME	12
Nursery Staff Recruitment Targets	12
Pupil Equity Funding (Police Officers)	14
BENEFITS OF INDEPENDENCE	18
EDUCATION REFORM UPDATE	30
<i>Statement—[Shirley—Anne Somerville].</i>	
The Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills (Shirley-Anne Somerville)	30
BUSINESS MOTION	43
<i>Motion moved—[George Adam]—and agreed to.</i>	
GOOD FOOD NATION (SCOTLAND) BILL: STAGE 3	44
DECISION TIME	176
GREAT BERNERA COMMUNITY LAND BUYOUT	177
<i>Motion debated—[Alasdair Allan].</i>	
Alasdair Allan (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)	177
Donald Cameron (Highlands and Islands) (Con)	180
Ruth Maguire (Cunninghame South) (SNP)	181
Mercedes Villalba (North East Scotland) (Lab)	183
Ariane Burgess (Highlands and Islands) (Green)	184
Kenneth Gibson (Cunninghame North) (SNP)	186
Rhoda Grant (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)	188
The Minister for Public Finance, Planning and Community Wealth (Tom Arthur)	189

Scottish Parliament

Tuesday 14 June 2022

[The Presiding Officer opened the meeting at 14:00]

Time for Reflection

The Presiding Officer (Alison Johnstone): Good afternoon. Our first item of business is time for reflection, and our time for reflection leader is Elaine Duncan, who is the chief executive of the Scottish Bible Society.

Elaine Duncan (Scottish Bible Society): In a park in Kyiv, Scottish Bible Society staff were distributing humanitarian aid when a woman came and asked whether they had any Bibles. My colleague was surprised to find that a queue of people had formed to receive Bibles. One man stood with a loaf of bread in one hand and a Bible in the other and said, "I know which is most important." It might be surprising to hear that, for some people, spiritual hunger can outweigh physical hunger during times of conflict and distress.

Maybe another story from Ukraine will help to put that in context. A few weeks ago, at the end of a service of holy communion for soldiers who were serving on one of the many front lines, Bibles were being distributed. A soldier came to my colleague, Anatoliy, and asked for a Bible. He said, "I have never been interested in God or religion. However, now I feel my conversation with God should begin." That soldier was searching for something that would give him hope and a sense of purpose in the midst of conflict, fear, injustice and despair.

The sociologist Émile Durkheim stressed that values enable individuals to feel that they are part of something bigger than themselves. For that soldier, there were probably several layers of things that were bigger than himself, including his family, the army or a nation rallying against a foe—yet, he was looking for something more and had a sense that the Bible would help him to connect with God.

In the Bible Society, we find that that is a common experience around the world—and not just in times of conflict and difficulty. People want the Bible.

The values of wisdom, justice, compassion and integrity, which are engraved on the ceremonial mace of this Parliament, are all readily found in the Bible and relate in some way to the character of God himself. I believe that there is something timeless about those attributes.

The accepted values of any culture, community or individual can and do change from time to time. It could be said that the accepted values of our generation are individual achievement, personal happiness and materialism. Of course, we could debate the truth of that view, but I am relieved that they are not the values that are inscribed on the mace. If they were, we might find ourselves fulfilling Oscar Wilde's quip that we know

"the price of everything and the value of nothing".

My prayer for the members of this Parliament is that you will continue to act with wisdom, justice, compassion and integrity, and that God will help you as you lead this nation.

Business Motion

14:05

The Presiding Officer (Alison Johnstone):

The next item of business is consideration of business motion S6M-04990, in the name of George Adam, on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, setting out changes to today's business. Any member who wishes to speak against the motion should press their request-to-speak button now.

Motion moved,

That the Parliament agrees to the following revisions to the programme of business for—

(a) Tuesday 14 June 2022—

after

followed by Topical Questions (if selected)

insert

followed by Ministerial Statement: Benefits of Independence

delete

6.00 pm Decision Time

and insert

7.20 pm Decision Time

(b) Wednesday 15 June 2022—

after

followed by Health, Social Care and Sport Committee Debate: Health and Wellbeing of Children and Young People

insert

followed by Stage 3 Debate: Good Food Nation (Scotland) Bill

delete

5.00 pm Decision Time

and insert

6.00 pm Decision Time—[George Adam]

The Presiding Officer: I call Neil Bibby to speak to and move amendment S6M-04990.1.

14:05

Neil Bibby (West Scotland) (Lab): I rise to speak in support of the amendment that I have lodged to the business motion.

At a meeting of the Parliamentary Bureau today, the Scottish Government indicated that, unfortunately, the Cabinet Secretary for Rural Affairs and Islands is self-isolating due to Covid and is unable to attend Parliament. We wish her a speedy recovery. Ministers have previously participated in debates remotely. However, the cabinet secretary is scheduled to lead for the

Government in the stage 3 proceedings on the Good Food Nation (Scotland) Bill, for which many amendments have been lodged, so her appearing remotely would mean that she would be unable to take direct interventions in order to provide clarity on the proposed legislation. It would also inhibit the free flow of debate. I raised serious concerns about that at the bureau's meeting today.

As members will be aware, remarks that are made by ministers at stage 3 form part of the interpretation of legislation for years to come. It was suggested that another minister could respond, but it was also acknowledged—fairly, I think—that they would not have the intimate knowledge of the bill that would enable them to respond properly and to provide clarity to members.

The suggestion of taking interventions at the end of the cabinet secretary's contributions is also unsatisfactory and would not be conducive to free-flowing debate. I did not think that that approach was satisfactory earlier; I do not think so now. It would show Parliament in a bad light.

Stephen Kerr (Central Scotland) (Con): Does Neil Bibby agree that his attempt to change the business motion is, in fact, an expression of the idea of the straw that broke the camel's back? Today, Parliament has been treated with nothing but contempt—[*Interruption.*]

The Presiding Officer: Thank you. We will hear Mr Kerr.

Stephen Kerr: —by the Scottish Government. Does he share my growing concern that the Parliament is unable to hold the Government to account, and is therefore failing the people of Scotland, because of the arrogance of the First Minister and the Scottish Government?

Neil Bibby: That issue was also discussed at the bureau today. I made clear my views that Government announcements should be made to Parliament first, and that press conferences should happen later. The view was also expressed at today's bureau meeting that such statements should be given by the First Minister and not by the Cabinet Secretary for the Constitution, External Affairs and Culture.

I also think that there are serious concerns about the business that is scheduled for later today on the Good Food Nation (Scotland) Bill—not only about holding the Government to account but about properly scrutinising the bill and the Government providing clarity on its proposals.

I did not think that that situation was satisfactory at the bureau's meeting, and I do not find it so now, which is why I will move an amendment that would postpone consideration of the Good Food Nation (Scotland) Bill at stage 3 to ensure that

there can be proper parliamentary scrutiny and clarity on that important piece of legislation.

I move amendment S6M-04990.1, to insert after “followed by Ministerial Statement: Education Reform Update”:

“delete

followed by Stage 3 Proceedings: Good Food Nation (Scotland) Bill”.

The Presiding Officer: I call George Adam to respond on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau.

14:08

The Minister for Parliamentary Business (George Adam): As you will know, Presiding Officer, Ms Gougeon tested positive for Covid today but was still fit enough to be online earlier and to take part in the bureau’s proceedings. We agreed there that there would be an option and— with the Presiding Officer’s indulgence—flexibility to find a way to work around the situation that we have found ourselves in, and to ensure that members would have an opportunity to engage with Ms Gougeon. There will be a minister here in the chamber who will, should there be any technical issues, be able to fill in the spot that is left by the cabinet secretary, as is normal practice.

Today’s statement is on publication of a scene-setting and comparative analysis paper, which makes no significant policy commitments or announcements regarding our proposals for an independent Scotland. [*Interruption.*] We will seek to engage—[*Interruption.*]

I find it hard to believe that the Opposition members find it difficult to understand that the SNP and the Greens believe in an independent Scotland.

Presiding Officer, the Scottish Government respects the role of Parliament in scrutinising delivery of its work programme. The Cabinet Secretary for the Constitution, External Affairs and Culture is in the chamber and is ready to provide more information to Parliament on the publication.

Once again, I stand by the business motion and the discussions that we had in the meeting of the Parliamentary Bureau.

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment S6M-04990.1, in the name of Neil Bibby, which seeks to amend motion S6M-04990, in the name of George Adam, on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, on changes to the business programme, be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division. There will be a short suspension to allow members to access the digital voting system.

14:10

Meeting suspended.

14:17

On resuming—

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment S6M-04990.1, in the name of Neil Bibby, which seeks to amend motion S6M-04990, in the name of George Adam, be agreed to. Members should cast their votes now.

The vote is now closed.

The Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills (Shirley-Anne Somerville): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app did not register my vote. I would have voted no.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you. We will ensure that that is recorded.

Paul O’Kane (West Scotland) (Lab): On a point of order, Presiding Officer.

The Presiding Officer: Could you wait one minute, Mr O’Kane?

Paul O’Kane: I could not connect, and I would have voted yes.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr O’Kane. We will ensure that that is recorded.

Willie Rennie (North East Fife) (LD): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I had the same situation and would have voted yes.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Rennie. We will ensure that that is recorded.

The Minister for Public Health, Women’s Health and Sport (Maree Todd): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I voted no, but my vote does not appear to have registered. I am not sure whether it has registered.

The Presiding Officer: I confirm that your vote has registered.

For

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)

Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)

Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division on amendment S6M-04990.1, in the name of Neil Bibby, which seeks to amend motion S6M-04990, in the name of George Adam, on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, on changes to the business programme, is: For 49, Against 66, Abstentions 0.

Amendment disagreed to.

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that motion S6M-04990, in the name of George Adam, on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, on changes to the business programme, be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division. Members should cast their votes now.

The vote is now closed.

Kenneth Gibson (Cunninghame North) (SNP): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. The app did not allow me to access the system. I would have voted yes.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Gibson. We will ensure that that is recorded.

Jeremy Balfour (Lothian) (Con): On a point of order, Presiding Officer.

The Presiding Officer: I can confirm that your vote has been recorded, Mr Balfour.

The Cabinet Secretary for the Constitution, External Affairs and Culture (Angus Robertson): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app was not working. I would have voted yes.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Robertson. We will ensure that that is recorded.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Forbes, Kate (Skye, Lochaber and Badenoch) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)

Sturgeon, Nicola (Glasgow Southside) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Baillie, Jackie (Dumbarton) (Lab)
 Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Gallacher, Meghan (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Gosal, Pam (West Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Marra, Michael (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 66, Against 49, Abstentions 0.

Motion agreed to,

That the Parliament agrees to the following revisions to the programme of business for—

(a) Tuesday 14 June 2022—

after

followed by Topical Questions (if selected)
insert
followed by Ministerial Statement: Benefits of Independence
delete
 6.00 pm Decision Time
and insert
 7.20 pm Decision Time
 (b) Wednesday 15 June 2022—
after
followed by Health, Social Care and Sport Committee Debate: Health and Wellbeing of Children and Young People
insert
followed by Stage 3 Debate: Good Food Nation (Scotland) Bill
delete
 5.00 pm Decision Time
and insert
 6.00 pm Decision Time

Topical Question Time

14:21

The Presiding Officer (Alison Johnstone): The next item of business is topical question time. In order to get in as many members as possible, I would appreciate short and succinct questions and responses.

Nursery Staff Recruitment Targets

1. **Meghan Gallacher (Central Scotland) (Con):** To ask the Scottish Government whether it will provide an update on its nursery recruitment targets. (S6T-00781)

The Minister for Children and Young People (Clare Haughey): The Scottish Government does not set targets for early learning and childcare workforce recruitment.

Meghan Gallacher: In 2018, Nicola Sturgeon promised to recruit 435 additional graduates in nurseries to close the poverty-related attainment gap. Four years later, that target has not been met. New figures show that a quarter of posts are lying empty and more than 100 nurseries in the most deprived areas are missing a teacher. That is yet another Scottish National Party education failure. Why has that target never been met? Why have children in the most deprived areas been left without a nursery teacher?

Clare Haughey: Since 2017, the early learning and childcare workforce has expanded significantly. Since the ELC workforce expansion began in 2017, the number of graduates working in ELC with degrees relevant to the early years has increased by 52 per cent. That expansion meant that, by August 2021, every local authority in Scotland confirmed that they were able to offer 1,140 hours of ELC funding to all three and four-year-olds and the two-year-olds who needed that. That is great for the ability of families and children to access high-quality ELC that is delivered by a range of staff with different skills and qualifications, and it is a cornerstone of narrowing the poverty-related attainment gap.

Meghan Gallacher: I am astounded that the minister believes that the Scottish Government is doing a good job when our nursery sector is facing a staffing crisis. Nursery owners in the private, voluntary and independent sector have warned the Scottish Government that the expansion of free early learning and childcare is under threat. Pay gaps between local authority and private settings of around £1.40 an hour are causing nursery staff to leave the sector. The Scottish Government cannot continue to ignore those serious concerns. What measures will it implement to create equity

between local authorities and the PVI sector? How will it address the staffing crisis?

Clare Haughey: Our collective focus throughout the 1,140 hour expansion has been on improving conditions across the private, voluntary and childminding workforce with regard to funded ELC. When ELC expansion began, local authorities were already paying above the living wage to their staff. The funding settlement reflects that. By contrast, our research indicates that around 80 per cent of staff who delivered funded ELC in the private and third sectors were paid less than the living wage at the time.

We have seen real progress since then, with our 2021 health check indicating that 88 per cent of private providers intended to pay the real living wage to all their staff by August 2021.

Public funding and Scottish Government policy can only effect a certain amount of change and, ultimately, business owners make their own decisions about their business models and salaries. That said, the Scottish Government has taken a range of actions to support the private and third sectors through the 1,140 hours of early learning and childcare expansion programme, including to support the recruitment of highly qualified childcare staff. We are taking a strategic approach to marking out the workforce requirements to deliver our existing and new commitments and we are taking forward a series of actions to support recruitment and retention across all parts of the childcare sector.

Mark Griffin (Central Scotland) (Lab): It is excellent news for families that children are being offered 1,140 hours of early education and childcare. How many children who were offered that 1,140 hours have actually received it over the course of this year?

I know of a number of nurseries that have had to move to reduced hours to cope with staff absences because of a lack of resilience and staff shortages in the system.

Clare Haughey: As of January 2022, more than 111,000 children were benefiting from funded ELC—that is 97 per cent of eligible children.

Alex Cole-Hamilton (Edinburgh Western) (LD): I am grateful to Meghan Gallacher for highlighting the Scottish Liberal Democrat research on this issue. At the current rate of progress, it will take 10 years to achieve a one-year target. No wonder the attainment gap is getting wider. Thousands of nursery children have been and gone without the benefit of the extra teacher that they were promised by Nicola Sturgeon. Given that she has just abandoned that commitment, which was made in 2017, how shall we believe any future commitment made by the First Minister in this chamber?

Clare Haughey: Teachers continue to have an important role to play as leaders and educators, alongside other degree-qualified ELC specialists supporting our youngest children on their learning journey.

Research shows that the best experiences for children are provided where there is a range of staff with complementary skills and higher level qualifications. We are proud of the continued growth in the number of degree-qualified ELC staff and those working towards degree-level qualifications.

Since the ELC workforce expansion began in 2017, the number of graduates working in ELC with degrees that are relevant to the early years has increased by 52 per cent; I hope that Mr Cole-Hamilton will welcome those statistics.

Pupil Equity Funding (Police Officers)

2. Willie Rennie (North East Fife) (LD): To ask the Scottish Government what immediate action it will take, in light of recent reports that nearly £2 million in pupil equity funding has been spent on police officers in schools since 2018. (S6T-00784)

The Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills (Shirley-Anne Somerville): Decisions on how to use pupil equity funding are taken by headteachers in an empowered education system. We trust schools and headteachers to know their pupils best, and to take decisions that are in the best interests of children and young people.

The majority of the £634 million in PEF distributed to schools is invested in approaches to improving literacy, numeracy and health and wellbeing through the recruitment of additional teaching and support staff, family link workers and partnerships with third sector organisations.

Where there are projects involving Police Scotland in place, schools find those to be of great benefit. They are highly engaged in proactive and preventative work in communities with families, working alongside social work and third sector organisations. They are not policing in schools.

To be clear, the £2 million described is a very small proportion—just 0.3 per cent—of the pupil equity funding that has been distributed to schools across the 32 councils since 2017-18.

Willie Rennie: The education secretary really needs to cut the slopy shoulders act, because the pupil equity funding operational guidance that I have read—which I am sure that she wrote—that encourages this kind of spending says:

“Consideration should be given to how the school may want to work with community partners beyond education”,

so this is her doing. The Aberlour Child Care Trust, the children’s charity that made this

discovery, wants to know what evidence there is that policing in schools will help children's learning, so where is the evidence?

Shirley-Anne Somerville: For Mr Rennie's benefit, I repeat that the police are not policing in schools, as I made very clear in my original answer.

Schools know their learners best. They are responsible for using pupil equity funding to undertake approaches that they think will best support their pupils to achieve their full potential.

It is very important that we look at how the money is spent. It is often spent on family link workers, for example, and in collaboration with those outside the school, including on youth work and family learning, and on approaches to reducing the cost of the school day.

I will give one example of how the money can be used and has been used in schools in Fife, where school holiday programmes have been targeted at supporting vulnerable and at-risk children, anti-violence programmes and transition programmes. The schools show an improved attendance rate, with early intervention in supporting children and families to avoid or limit criminal behaviours, and very much improved community relations. That is what happens when schools work with partners across the community, including—if they decide that it is necessary and appropriate—with the police. I think that some of the examples of that show that that has been working, as is shown from the feedback from headteachers.

Willie Rennie: The cabinet secretary presented no evidence. There is no evidence that policing in schools will help close the poverty-related attainment gap by 2026—or whatever the policy is this week—but her operational guidance still encourages that. What a slur on children from disadvantaged backgrounds. They have been branded as criminals by their Government before they have even had their first lesson. [*Interruption.*] It is the money that is supposed to follow the child—

The Presiding Officer: Members! Thank you.

Willie Rennie: —not the police. Will the education secretary—

The Presiding Officer: Excuse me, Mr Rennie.

Willie Rennie: —revise the operational guidance without delay—

The Presiding Officer: I am sorry, but the levels of noise in the chamber are wholly unacceptable. I could not hear a word that Mr Rennie said; neither, I am sure, could many others.

Mr Rennie, please continue.

Willie Rennie: Presiding Officer, I will say it again. Children have been branded as criminals by their Government before they have even had their first lesson. The money is supposed to follow the child, not the police. Will the education secretary revise the operational guidance without delay to prevent vital funds for education being diverted to fund police in schools?

Shirley-Anne Somerville: Unsurprisingly, that has drawn great criticism from across the chamber. Mr Rennie may criticise the Scottish Government—Opposition parties may criticise the Government—but what he has just said is not a slur on the Scottish Government but on the headteachers who have chosen to use the pupil equity funding in that way. It is a slur on the teachers who have decided that they know their children best.

It is not often that I quote a Liberal Democrat conference speech, but I will on this occasion because Mr Rennie once said:

“I want teachers to be at the centre of how we make Scottish education the best”.

I presume that, in making that comment, Mr Rennie is saying that he wants education to be delivered by teachers.

However, here in the chamber, Mr Rennie is saying that teachers do not know best. Somehow, he knows best, without knowing any of the details of the projects that are involved. He is quite happy to come to this chamber and accuse teachers of making young people criminals. I hope that he goes away and thinks seriously about that. He need not apologise to me, but he needs to apologise to the teachers who have put the measures in place and to the pupils who they are there to serve.

Kaukab Stewart (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP): As someone with 30 years of experience as a teacher, I would like to celebrate the hard work of teachers and our young people in all their endeavours. I know from recent discussions with teachers and local police that staff are building relationships with the most vulnerable young people in our society and intervening early to build confidence and increase engagement with the curriculum, thereby increasing achievement.

Although it is a shame that Mr Rennie appears to have forgotten the commitment that he made at the 2020 Lib Dem conference to put teachers in charge, will the cabinet secretary assure the chamber that this Government is committed to empowering teachers to use PEF to best meet the needs of the young people in their schools?

Shirley-Anne Somerville: We have heard from Kaukab Stewart another example of one of the projects in which schools have been reaching out

and working directly with the police. Such projects have been shown, through constant positive feedback from staff and learners, to have made a difference, because young people have found that approach to be exceptionally useful. That approach can be used in a range of projects if teachers feel that that is the right thing to do. As the Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills, I think that it is important that I do not just talk about empowerment but that I support it in practice. It is a shame that, rather than doing that, the Liberal Democrats have come here today to accuse teachers not only of the inappropriate use of funds but of making young people criminals. That is a sad and sorry state, even for Mr Rennie.

Oliver Mundell (Dumfriesshire) (Con): The Education, Children and Young People Committee heard that pupil equity funding is being used to plug gaps in the budget—little did we realise that that meant the policing budget, too. Will the cabinet secretary take this opportunity to say that that practice is wrong? It might be, in her view, a small amount of money, but every penny that goes into education should be focused on teaching and learning. Can she not even agree with that?

Shirley-Anne Somerville: A number of directors of education came to the committee to state, in response to questions, that pupil equity funding is additional funding and that they find that additionality important. That evidence from directors of education is on the record.

There is absolute support in the teaching profession for the use of pupil equity funding. Teachers feel that the funding is an important part of our empowered system. The Government is committed to an empowered education system; it is unfortunate that it seems that the Opposition parties are not.

Benefits of Independence

14:36

The Presiding Officer (Alison Johnstone):

The next scheduled item of business is a statement by Angus Robertson on the benefits of independence. Yesterday afternoon, significant news that should have been announced in the chamber, as a matter of courtesy and respect to Parliament, was reported by national media, which trailed a media event this morning.

Long-established good practice guidance on announcements by the Scottish Government states that

“announcements by the Government on matters of importance”

should

“not enter the public domain before or without being communicated to the Parliament.”

The guidance goes on to say that

“where the subject matter relates to matters on which members of the public would have a clear interest, there is a strong expectation that a Ministerial statement would be scheduled with appropriate notice”,

and that

“where a Ministerial statement has been programmed ... the details of that statement should not be released to the media before the statement is made.”

It is not possible to square the Government's action on this matter with respect for that guidance, which is designed to ensure that Parliament is given its proper place. It is my role to represent the Parliament's interests. In doing so, I take account of all members' interests equally. The Government is in no doubt that I do not regard its action as acceptable. In the circumstances, Parliament's time will be used best by moving straight to questions.

Douglas Ross (Highlands and Islands) (Con):

Thank you, Presiding Officer. Conservative members have heard very clearly your standing up for the role of the Parliament and parliamentarians in the parties. I am sorry that the First Minister could not be here in person to listen to your views.

What we heard from Nicola Sturgeon today was an announcement that more of the Scottish Government's resources and time will, all over again, be wasted on its drive to separate Scotland from the United Kingdom. We heard from the First Minister that Scotland now faces a clear choice between two futures in the crucial years following the Covid pandemic. We can focus on rebuilding Scotland or, as the Scottish National Party wants, on dividing Scotland. Pushing for another divisive referendum—perhaps even an illegal wildcat

referendum, as Nicola Sturgeon suggested earlier—is the wrong priority at the worst possible time.

The people of Scotland want the focus to be on the huge challenges that we face. We want the Government's focus to be on creating better jobs and opportunities, and on improving public services. Instead, the SNP Government just offers more distraction, disruption and division. In the middle of a global cost of living crisis, the SNP is diverting resources and public money away from the front line. Nicola Sturgeon pushes her obsession with separation by asking, "Why not Scotland?"

Let me ask a better question. Why not improve Scotland now? Why not use the powers of this Parliament, which the Government has right now, to improve the lives of the people of Scotland? Why not create better Scottish jobs now? Why not restore Scottish schools now? Why not tackle Scotland's drug deaths shame now? Why not build a ferry in Scotland now?

This Government is obsessed with independence, when it should be obsessed with delivering for Scotland now. Therefore, I ask the Government just one thing. Please, give it a rest and focus on the priorities that people across Scotland have now.

The Cabinet Secretary for the Constitution, External Affairs and Culture (Angus Robertson): Clearly, it is an inconvenient truth for Conservative members that 72 of 129 members who were elected by the people of Scotland last year were elected on a manifesto commitment to deliver an independence referendum during this parliamentary session. That independence-supporting majority is larger than the majority at any previous Holyrood election. For anyone who believes in parliamentary democracy—I assume that that includes all 129 members—that should not be shrugged off as an inconvenient fact to be ignored, but should instead be taken as a democratic instruction from the people of Scotland.

Opposition members are where they are because they and their anti-independence ticket were rejected by the people of Scotland. This Government was elected because we are committed to the people having their say.

The paper that was released today provides crucial context for the rest of the independence prospectus series. I note that Douglas Ross did not ask a single question relating to the document. I commend it to Parliament and to colleagues, and I look forward to debating the independence referendum, which we intend will take place next year, following the express wishes of the people of Scotland, who elected a majority of members of

the Scottish Parliament who are in favour of holding such a referendum.

The Presiding Officer: Members who wish to ask a question should, please, press their request-to-speak buttons now.

Sarah Boyack (Lothian) (Lab): This is clearly going to be the first of several last-minute announcements, when the First Minister has made a press announcement then the cabinet secretary comes to the chamber so that we can ask questions about a lengthy report that has just been published. Does the cabinet secretary not appreciate the irony of launching a report that talks about the importance of doing better a week after his statement on this year's census failures, which he was in charge of but is yet to take responsibility for?

With hundreds of thousands of Scots being forced to choose between heating and eating, surely we need to build recovery—[*Interruption.*]

The Presiding Officer: Colleagues! We will not get very far this afternoon, and we will unfortunately not be able to hear all the members who want to ask a question if I have to keep asking for a bit of quiet for the member who is speaking. Even where we disagree, we all owe one another the courtesy of hearing one another respectfully.

Sarah Boyack: With hundreds of thousands of Scots being forced to choose between heating and eating, surely we need to build recovery from the pandemic, and to deal with the pressures that our national health service faces because of Scottish National Party mismanagement.

Today's report outlines how we could be like other nations, but is it not true that the Parliament could make similar decisions now on co-operative energy, but the SNP-Green Government decided not to follow the example of Nordic countries and instead decided to sell off our sea bed? Given that the report says that

"An independent Scotland could not be transformed to match the success of the comparator countries overnight",

and that we have been told that it would be "Brexit times 10", will the cabinet secretary admit that independence would make Brexit look like a walk in the park?

Angus Robertson: No, I do not agree with the Labour spokesperson. Independence is about Scotland's recovery from Brexit, and from Tory rule and Boris Johnson. At its heart, it is a question of democracy.

What is sorely lacking—unsurprisingly from the Conservatives, but disappointingly from the Labour front bench, which has a long tradition of supporting Scottish democracy—is the basic

acknowledgement that, in the election that was held last year, candidates who support a referendum on Scotland's independence won the election, and the Conservative Party and Labour Party lost the election.

I will move on to the substance of the issue. Scotland is not a region of a unitary state. We are a country in what the Welsh Labour Government calls a "voluntary association of nations". We have a right to decide our own future. All of us should support that. As democrats, we should endorse the fact that a referendum should take place. We will be on different sides of the argument, but please do not deny the people of Scotland their say—which is, in effect, what we have heard from the Labour front bench.

Alex Cole-Hamilton (Edinburgh Western) (LD): The First Minister described Scotland as "a nation in waiting". We are exactly that. We are waiting for ambulances and cancer care, long Covid clinics and mental health appointments for our children. We are waiting for overdue ferries and replacement bus services for cancelled trains, for progress on pupil attainment and on the climate emergency, and for help with the biggest hit to household incomes since the end of rationing. We are tired of waiting, so I ask the cabinet secretary why every single one of those priorities has now fallen behind the break-up of the United Kingdom in the queue for this Government's attention.

Angus Robertson: Now we have all the Opposition parties lining up in their agreement of democracy denial. It is a sad day when illiberal anti-democrats stand up and suggest that we should not go forward with a democratic vote about the future of the country. It is, frankly, shameful. We will be on different sides of the argument about Scotland's future, but they should, please, not come to the chamber and say that the people of Scotland cannot have their say after they voted in an election to be able to do just that.

Michelle Thomson (Falkirk East) (SNP): They say that change is made inevitable when parties fundamentally diverge based on their values. Does the cabinet secretary agree that it is important to contrast our vision, which is based on democracy and ethical values, with that of the failing UK state? In particular, does the cabinet secretary agree that today's news regarding the willingness of the UK to break international treaty obligations and, domestically, to shield dramatic levels of financial corruption is merely a glimpse of the folly of dependence, while independence is a harbinger of a very different and better future?

Angus Robertson: I agree with Michelle Thomson that a better future is possible. That is what we are steering towards.

What has been published today is an analysis that compares the UK with all of our neighbour states—Ireland, Iceland, Norway, Denmark, Sweden, Finland, Austria, Switzerland, Belgium and the Netherlands. They are our neighbouring countries. What do they all have in common? They are all wealthier—some significantly—than the UK. The wealth gap is lower, income inequality in those countries is lower, poverty rates are lower, and there are fewer children living in poverty. The comparator countries have higher social mobility and most have a smaller gender pay gap. They have higher productivity than the UK, gross expenditure on research and development is higher in most of them, and business investment is higher, too.

Those are the differences between the United Kingdom and all our neighbouring countries in 2021. The time is coming for us to embrace a better future. We will do that through a democratic vote for independence. We have options: they are the status quo of Brexit Britain under Boris Johnson, or an independent Scotland that is run by the people who were actually elected by the people who live in this country.

Murdo Fraser (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con): Have the Scottish Government's law officers been asked to give an opinion on whether a referendum that is run without a section 30 agreement would be lawful?

Angus Robertson: Today's statement is about the opening publication in the series—*[Interruption.]*

The Presiding Officer: Members! Thank you. We will hear the cabinet secretary.

Angus Robertson: As the First Minister said earlier, this is the first in a series of publications. More publications will follow covering the full range of issues, including how a referendum will take place. Murdo Fraser will just have to cool his jets—*[Interruption.]*

The Presiding Officer: A year on from the election, I am fairly sure that all members are aware that if I have not called them to speak, they should not be speaking.

Angus Robertson: I have pretty much said everything that needs to be said to Murdo Fraser. However, perhaps I could take this opportunity, at the end of my answer, to invite him—I hope, as a fellow democrat—to agree, given that the people of Scotland have voted for a majority in Parliament who want a referendum, that a referendum should take place.

Christine Grahame (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP): Eight years ago, in 2014, pensioners were told to vote no or they would lose their state pensions. Does the

cabinet secretary agree with me—I am a pensioner—that with one of the worst state pensions in Europe, and with each pensioner now losing £500 a year as the United Kingdom ditches the triple lock, Scotland’s pensioners would benefit from independence?

Angus Robertson: The facts about pension levels are there for all to see in the comparisons with other countries, whose pensioners are significantly better off than pensioners in the UK. Pensions will be explored in greater detail in one of the forthcoming papers in the series, but it is a statement of fact that pensioners are significantly worse off in the UK, so I look forward to their having a better future in an independent Scotland.

Paul O’Kane (West Scotland) (Lab): The paper is light on detail and heavy on cherry-picked examples, but the First Minister confirmed one thing today when she said:

“If we are in the Single Market, and the rest of the UK is outside the Single Market, then yes there are issues in terms of regulatory and customs requirements”.

The Government paints a rosy picture of trading bliss within the EU, but glosses over the barriers and challenges that lie in the way. The paper that was published today says next to nothing about the actual practicalities of independence. Will the cabinet secretary take the opportunity now to confirm to the democratically elected members of the Parliament, as the First Minister did in her answer to a journalist, that with independence, there would be a hard border between Scotland and the rest of the UK? What analysis has the Government done on the impact that that would have on Scotland’s businesses, economy and wider public services?

Angus Robertson: It is obviously news to the Labour Party that a border is already being built, because of the UK’s decision to leave the European Union. Border infrastructure is currently being built in Scotland to deal with trade between Great Britain and Northern Ireland. That is the fact of the situation—it is happening already.

The issue of borders, which is a perfectly legitimate area of inquiry, will be in a future document, at which stage no doubt—

Members: Oh!

Angus Robertson: Well, there is obviously great demand for these sessions—*[Interruption.]*

The Presiding Officer: Thank you! We will hear the cabinet secretary.

Angus Robertson: Despite the faux outrage of the Tories, I look forward to being able to discuss all areas of the prospectus in the run-up to the referendum.

I also extend my hand to colleagues in the Labour Party, as I have to colleagues in the Conservative Party, to find agreement on one point, if we are going to disagree about everything else: as democrats, can we please sign up to the fact that the people of Scotland are sovereign? They have voted to have a say on the subject and that is exactly what they should have.

Emma Roddick (Highlands and Islands) (SNP): In the challenging times that we are living through, this is an exciting moment to be discussing the opportunities of Scottish independence. Does the cabinet secretary agree that the Scotland that we see now offers hope for the positive, progressive vision of independence that we can pursue more fully with the full powers of independence, such as a social security system that treats people with dignity, fairness and respect, a sustainable and affordable housing system that is fit for the future and an entrepreneurial economy that promotes world-leading standards in fair work and wellbeing?

Angus Robertson: I totally agree with Emma Roddick. To be able to deliver all those things, we need to have the powers in the Parliament so that we can make the decisions about the ambitions that she has outlined, and that is exactly what this Government is committed to doing.

I hope that, when we move past the faux outrage that we have heard from the Opposition members whose parties lost the election on this issue, we can move on to discussing the substance of issues such as pensions. I look forward to being able to debate those issues in the months ahead, and to moving on to the referendum campaign itself, and I would welcome it if colleagues from the Opposition parties were able to get up at any stage and paint a rosier or better picture of Scotland as part of the United Kingdom in Boris Johnson’s Brexit Britain.

Liz Smith (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con): Let me try. John Kay, a leading economist and former adviser to the Scottish Government, warned that an independent Scotland would start off with £180 billion of debt and would be forced to borrow £20 billion annually to plug the huge black hole in public finances. Does the cabinet secretary seriously believe that saddling Scotland with that level of debt is either fiscally prudent or what businesses in Scotland really want?

Angus Robertson: What Liz Smith failed to mention is that the United Kingdom has had one of the biggest debts of any country in the European Union, so we will take no lessons from those on the Conservative front bench.

It is eminently better for us to be able to make decisions closer to home on all the key issues. I invite Liz Smith to have a look at the document,

which rests on reputable statistics of a high standard from the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development and others, and ask herself why it is the case that all our neighbouring countries are significantly better off than Scotland is in the United Kingdom.

I know that it must be a very difficult read when confronted with the facts, but the facts are the facts, and they show that our neighbouring countries are significantly better off. I suggest that that is a much better future for Scotland, rather than a United Kingdom with its mountain of debt.

Kenneth Gibson (Cunninghame North) (SNP): It is always better to make our own decisions than to leave them to our next-door neighbour, and for unionists the time is never right.

Does the cabinet secretary agree that Scotland, like other independent nations from Australia to Canada to New Zealand and, indeed, the United States—which had to fight for independence, not just vote for it—will flourish with the self-confidence, ideas and innovation that independence inspires? Does he also agree that we will be able to harness our economy and natural resources and work globally as an equal partner in the family of nations to deliver prosperity for all who live and work here?

Angus Robertson: I agree with Kenneth Gibson. Not only will we be one of the wealthiest countries to have become independent, but we will have more institutions in place in the run-up to the forthcoming referendum than we had in the run-up to the 2014 referendum. That will give a great many people who are open-minded about the prospect of voting yes the assurance that they need that a Scotland in charge of its own destiny is a significantly better prospect than leaving it up to people whom we have not elected—and, incidentally, from a party that has not won a single election in Scotland since 1955—to make bad decisions on our behalf.

There is a better future in prospect. There will be different views about the merits of the case, but we should all agree that we have elected a Government to deliver on a referendum. That is exactly what should happen.

Ross Greer (West Scotland) (Green): Today's paper notes that inequality and poverty rates are lower across a number of countries comparable to Scotland. Does the cabinet secretary agree that, given that organised workforces are the most powerful way of raising wages and thereby lifting families out of working poverty and that the UK has some of the worst anti-worker and anti-union laws in Europe, independence gives us the opportunity instead to make Scotland one of the best countries in the world in which to work and to organise in the workplace?

Angus Robertson: Yes, it does, and that is exactly what our neighbouring countries have done. One of the interesting aspects of the research on this question is that there is no fits-all approach across our comparative neighbouring countries. There are different models—some that Ross Greer might find to be closer to his political heart and others that centre-right politicians might see as the right way forward. What is interesting is that all of those countries, across the piece and almost without exception in terms of the metrics, are better off. What appears to be key to the success of them all is that they are able to make better decisions for themselves.

Incidentally, I note that, with the exception of Switzerland, every single one of our comparator countries has, in relatively recent historical memory, been part of a wider union and decided that it was better for them to make decisions closer to home. They managed it, and I am sure that we will manage just as well.

Emma Harper (South Scotland) (SNP): Independence will allow all decisions, in every aspect of Scottish society, to be put in the hands of the democratically elected Scottish Parliament. Can the cabinet secretary reaffirm that that will allow this Parliament to reverse the harms that have been created by consecutive UK Governments and to build a fairer and more inclusive Scotland that values human rights as well as the wellbeing of our citizens? Will he also reaffirm that no Government should deny the people of Scotland the right to take that decision?

Angus Robertson: Indeed I will. However, this is about much more than just ameliorating harms; it is about making better decisions for the future. One thing that is very close to my heart—as it should be to the majority in the chamber and across parties who believe that we should be in the European Union—is the restoration of EU citizenship rights to everybody in this country, which is something that I look forward to.

There is absolutely no chance that either a UK Tory Government or even a Labour UK Government is going to see Scotland, while part of the UK, re-enter the European Union. The only way to do that is for Scotland to be an independent member state; that is the way that we can rejoin the European Union. In all the conversations that I have had with a great many European politicians, there is a significant appetite for Scotland to become a member of the EU again. I look forward to that greatly.

Stephen Kerr (Central Scotland) (Con): This whole statement and this morning's media circus are a shameful deflection from the priorities of the people of Scotland. The SNP's agenda of separation is rarely if ever stated as a priority by the Scottish people; indeed, the SNP likes to talk

about anything other than the people's priorities. Today, my colleagues and I submitted a raft of urgent questions about issues that impact the everyday lives of the people of Scotland—health, education, transport, justice, net zero and jobs—but here we are talking about the same old SNP obsession.

Let me help the cabinet secretary. Will he apologise to Parliament and the Presiding Officer for the contempt that he, his boss and his Government have shown Parliament today?

Angus Robertson: Talk about deflection, Presiding Officer. I am just asking myself whether the Stephen Kerr who just asked that question is the Stephen Kerr who ran in the Scottish Parliament elections last year in Falkirk West and came third. If it is the same Stephen Kerr, and I imagine that it is—[*Interruption.*] Is it not the same Stephen Kerr? Was it another Stephen Kerr who stood in Falkirk West? I do think that it was the same Stephen Kerr who was defeated in Falkirk West.

Why this is relevant—[*Interruption.*]

The Presiding Officer: Members!

Angus Robertson: Why this is relevant is that in that election, Stephen Kerr stood in that constituency asking for the vote of electors in opposition to a referendum, and he lost. The candidate who stood for the Scottish National Party in that constituency won. I know that humility does not come easily to Stephen Kerr. However, perhaps as a fellow democrat—I hope that he is a fellow democrat—he will acknowledge, as an election loser, that the people who won and the Government that is in office were elected to deliver a referendum, and that is what should take place.

Jamie Greene (West Scotland) (Con): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I hope that the cabinet secretary is not implying in any way whatsoever that regionally elected members of Parliament are in any way inferior to constituency members. If that is the case, he should apologise to each and every one of us.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Greene. As that is not a point of order or a matter for the chair, I will move on to the next question.

Oliver Mundell (Dumfriesshire) (Con): I start by reminding members that I did not come third.

How can the Government give us a preferred date for a referendum, but not a date for closing the education attainment gap? What does the cabinet secretary think that that says about the Government's priorities?

Angus Robertson: I look forward to the proposed date for the independence referendum being confirmed in good time. It will take place in

the autumn of next year, as has been outlined by the Government. That is what this Government has been elected to do, and that is what we are working towards.

There is something that I hope that Conservative members will impress on their UK colleagues, given the great many quotes on it from many people. Indeed, I came across an interesting quote on this very question from Ruth Davidson, who said that, if political parties

“get over the line and can make a coalition, make a majority, get the votes in the Parliament, then they'll vote through a referendum. That's what democracy is all about.”

Hopefully the Conservative benches still agree with that.

Jackie Dunbar (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP): Some of the rhetoric that we have heard paints independence as a terrifying and unprecedented journey and a terrible risk for Scotland. Will the cabinet secretary point out, as the new paper lays out so clearly, the many examples in northern Europe and across the wider world that illustrate the simple fact that independence is normal for middle-sized, internationalist and progressive democracies such as our own?

Angus Robertson: I totally agree, and I observe that, of the 10 comparator countries—our neighbouring comparatively sized countries in northern Europe—nine were previously in unions and governed or were governed by neighbouring countries. Not a single one of them has thought it a good idea to give up its independence and return to being governed by a neighbouring country. It is good enough for them to govern themselves—in fact, it is more than that; it is much better than how we are governed as part of the UK. This is a great idea, and the fact that all those countries have done it should give us inspiration to get on with it.

Gillian Martin (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP): Health inequalities and poor life expectancy are exacerbated by a welfare system that punishes and sanctions—that has been the view of successive witnesses at the Health, Social Care and Sport Committee over the past month. Does a Scottish social security and welfare system not present a seismic opportunity for the people of an independent Scotland, who have suffered as a result of being dependent for decades on the broken institutions of the UK? Do those people not deserve a chance to vote on their future?

Angus Robertson: Yes, they do. Obviously, a Scottish social security system is developing, but the majority of social security powers still rest with the UK Government. We have shown that, with limited powers, we can do much; with independence, we can do much more. That is an additional reason for having the referendum and

for voting yes in it—it will be transformational for people in this country.

The Presiding Officer: That concludes the ministerial statement on the benefits of independence. Before we move to the next item of business, I will allow a moment or two for the front benches to reorganise.

Education Reform Update

The Presiding Officer (Alison Johnstone): The next item of business is a statement by Shirley-Anne Somerville, on an education reform update. The cabinet secretary will take questions at the end of her statement, so there should be no interventions or interruptions.

15:08

The Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills (Shirley-Anne Somerville): I am grateful for the opportunity to update the Parliament on the Scottish Government's education reform and improvement agenda. I will cover a number of areas, including our forthcoming national discussion on the vision for Scottish education, the creation of three new national education bodies, the independent review of qualifications and assessment that Professor Louise Hayward has been asked to lead, and the development of a set of purpose and principles for the post-school education research and skills system.

As have other education systems across the world, the Scottish education system has been tested by the pandemic. In many ways, it has shown itself to be resilient, creative and adaptive. However, the pandemic has presented big challenges and it is therefore right that, collectively, we take the opportunity to reflect and reform.

We start from strong foundations. Scotland is the only part of the United Kingdom to offer 1,140 funded hours of early learning and childcare to eligible children. Our school pupils are benefiting from more teachers. Teacher numbers are at their highest since 2008 and are the highest, per pupil, of any United Kingdom country. More than 93 per cent of school leavers have progressed to positive destinations in education, employment or training.

On tackling the attainment gap, we are making good progress, too. A record 16.7 per cent of university entrants in 2021 came from backgrounds that were in the most deprived 20 per cent of areas according to the Scottish index of multiple deprivation.

Scotland has a highly educated population. It has the highest proportion in the UK of adults with tertiary-level education. At the heart of our reform programme is pride in the skills, talent and commitment in our education system, with a recognition that we cannot stand still, that change is needed and that reform is necessary as we look to the future. That is a message in Professor Ken Muir's report and one that we hear from across the sector.

I have made clear my determination to deliver change, but that is something that Government cannot and should not deliver alone. Professor Muir highlights in his report that education policy and services are best developed when they are informed by the practice and experience of those people who use and deliver them at every level. We want to bring the widest possible range of voices and views into the room.

I am sure that the chamber will agree that it is our children and young people who hold the biggest stake in our education system, and I am determined that they will be heard just as strongly across our reform programme as they were in Professor Muir's report.

We know the incredible work that teachers, school staff and practitioners do to support learners and we will continue to draw on that experience and expertise through our engagement with professional associations and more widely. We will be proactive in engaging with all those who have a stake in the continued success of our education system—delivery partners, trades unions, equality and human rights organisations, Gaelic medium and Scots language sectors, practitioners working at every level, employers, the youth work sector, parents and carers and their representative organisations, and wider communities. It is also important that the agenda for education reform is far reaching and covers the span of our lifelong learning journey.

I have committed the Scottish Government to holding a national discussion to establish a compelling and consensual vision for the future of Scottish education. Those people who work in the sector and many in the chamber will recall the national debate on education, which was held in 2002 and led to the creation of curriculum for excellence—a curriculum that last year's Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development independent report found

“offers an inspiring and widely supported philosophy of education”.

Two decades on from the last national debate on Scottish education, the time is right to discuss our vision for the education system. That discussion is for everyone, and I have written today to education spokespeople from all parties in the chamber to invite them to take part. Professor Muir has challenged all of us to work together to establish a consensual vision for education that can genuinely put the learner at the centre. I sincerely hope that we all rise to that challenge, including today.

We might not agree on everything, but that should never stop us from finding common ground. The Scottish Government and the Convention of Scottish Local Authorities, our local

government partner, will co-convene the national discussion, which will launch in the new term.

Local government is the statutory provider of education and any truly national discussion has to be a joint endeavour. I am grateful to COSLA for its support for the national discussion and look forward to working with it in the coming months.

I am pleased to inform Parliament that Carol Campbell, who is a professor of leadership and educational change at the Ontario Institute for Studies in Education at the University of Toronto, and Dr Alma Harris, who is emeritus professor at Swansea University and professor at Cardiff school of education and social policy, have agreed to co-facilitate the national discussion.

Both professors have extensive experience of educational change, leadership and school improvement, as well as a strong understanding of the Scottish education system through their work as members of the international council of education advisers. They are committed to ensuring that the discussion engages widely and reflects the views of those to whom we need to listen most—our learners. It is by listening carefully to the learners of today that we will build a vision for the education system of the future. We are grateful to the Scottish Youth Parliament for the work that it will do over the summer to start gathering the views of young people and we look forward to working with many other organisations and learners as we seek to hold a discussion in which we prioritise listening to those whose voices are seldom heard.

I want that discussion to be the most inclusive ever on education, and I look forward to meeting later this month all the members of our international council of education advisers, who will be able to bring their diverse, international perspectives to bear on the opportunities and challenges for Scotland's education system in a post-pandemic world.

It is crucial that our reform programme takes this opportunity to reflect, debate and develop what we need not just now but in the future for all parts of the learner journey, which is why I asked Professor Louise Hayward to undertake an independent review of qualifications and assessment.

As with Professor Ken Muir's work, that process is fully independent, and I can confirm that Professor Hayward has now started the review and is committed to meaningful engagement with all interested parties, not least young people themselves. An independent review group has been established that includes young people and teachers, who will now work with their peers to consider options for change.

The review will also engage directly with schools, colleges and key partners in learner journey qualifications and assessment. Professor Hayward will report to me by the end of March 2023 and, crucially, will work closely with the national discussion, so that key initial findings from that exercise can be considered ahead of final recommendations on the future of examinations and assessment.

Those strands of work will also connect into and inform the development of the purpose and principles for our post-school education, research and skills ecosystem. The development of the purpose and principles is an opportunity to stimulate debate, challenge perceptions and further develop a shared evidence base on what the post-school ecosystem delivers for Scotland, aligning our efforts and decisions to deliver the outcomes that we want to see.

I have spoken about our commitment to design and deliver real change and to bring wide and diverse voices into the conversation. That will also be reflected in how we create a new qualifications body, a new national agency for Scottish education and an independent inspectorate body. Those bodies will replace the Scottish Qualifications Authority and Education Scotland.

Design and delivery of the new bodies will be informed by engagement with a broad spectrum of those with a stake in their success and underpinned by a determination to bring in external views and innovative ideas that test, challenge and embed new approaches, cultures, governance, accountabilities and ways of working.

I have ensured that Professors Ken Muir and Louise Hayward have key roles in those arrangements, in order to provide on-going strategic and external support and critical challenge. I will also ensure that a number of external individuals sit at the very centre of the work that is now starting to design the new bodies, to provide the critical challenge that will be needed to achieve real change and reform of the system.

Building on the foundations that have been laid by Professor Muir's extensive engagement, a stakeholder reference group, which I will chair, will shortly be established, and we will also look to draw on the approach that has been taken by Social Security Scotland through its experience panels, so that a broad range of people with an interest in education can have a say in the design of processes and services for the new bodies. However, I emphasise to Parliament that overall accountability and responsibility for the reform programme will be with the Scottish Government and, ultimately, with me as cabinet secretary.

I have been clear and unambiguous in setting out my desire for substantive change and

meaningful reform, with children and young people, families, teachers and practitioners playing a key part in that decision making.

Staff in Education Scotland and the SQA deserve our thanks for continuing to deliver for Scotland's learners, including successful delivery of exams over the past two months, and we will ensure that their knowledge, expertise and experience contributes to the reform process.

I spoke earlier about the importance of early learning and childcare. We are committed to ensuring that inspection of early learning and childcare supports delivery of high-quality services and ensures appropriate scrutiny, but we need to remove unnecessary burdens and duplications.

We welcome Professor Muir's recommendation that there should be a shared inspection framework for early learning and childcare settings, which will be developed by the Care Inspectorate and the new education inspectorate. We will shortly come forward with specific proposals to consult the sector, followed by a programme of engagement over the summer and autumn. I am working with Her Majesty's chief inspector of education and the chief executive of the Care Inspectorate to identify what they can do in partnership—from the start of the next academic year—to streamline and improve the inspection process for providers.

Each of the areas that I have updated on today will be developed through joint working in the weeks and months to come. It will be a discussion and journey for everyone who has a stake in the continued success of Scottish education.

I look forward to continuing to work constructively with members and others on our reform ambitions.

The Presiding Officer: The cabinet secretary will now take questions on the issues that have been raised in her statement. I intend to allow around 20 minutes for questions, after which we will move on to the next item of business. I would be grateful if members who wish to ask a question were to press their request-to-speak buttons now.

Oliver Mundell (Dumfriesshire) (Con): This is not education reform; it is more of the same with a different name. While standards continue to slip and our young people are let down, this Government does not do very much at all. Professor Walter Humes sums it up as

"boards ... populated by the usual suspects",

including senior staff

"from the bodies which are to be replaced."

He says:

"It sounds like insider dealing, with those who are part of the problem being tasked with producing solutions."

He is right, is he not? The cabinet secretary and the First Minister are part of the problem, are they not?

Shirley-Anne Somerville: The remarks that Oliver Mundell refers to were made before I made the statement and before the Scottish Government made any announcements about the governance of the process.

To any member who still has a doubt about my ambitions for change in the area, I say that, very early after I came into my post, I set out my determination on the reform process. I came to education from another position in the Scottish Government that has moved away from a system that was unpopular, and about which people had concerns, and from that we have developed a social security system that has delivered real change and is now respected across Scotland. The Government has—and I have—a history of delivering such change, and that is exactly what I am determined to do.

I appreciate that people will be concerned that this is not a complete programme of reform. I have made it very clear why that is not the case. The programme will be overseen by ministers but, of course, it will be delivered by Scottish Government officials. In my statement, I spoke about the importance of the critical friends and critical contact that we will have in that process. Nothing will prevent change from happening.

Michael Marra (North East Scotland) (Lab): I hope that the cabinet secretary will appreciate the frustration of members in the chamber over the interminable delays here. She talks about real change, but nothing has actually changed although we have more and more groups talking about it. If the cabinet secretary wanted to send an invitation to join a group, she could have picked up the phone; she did not have to make a statement to Parliament to do that.

There was precious little else in the statement that we did not already know. It confirmed, once again, only the glacial pace of reform. Today—eight months on from Professor Hayward’s appointment—could we not have expected to have an interim report, at the very least? When on earth will the actual report be published? This delay is not without cost or consequence. A generation of young Scots has been failed by the Scottish Government, debilitated by the pandemic and left without solution or redress, which is entirely unacceptable.

It is good to have it confirmed today that Education Scotland will go. Has the cabinet secretary written a letter to the leaders of that organisation today, too? Only days ago, the Education, Children and Young People Committee was told that that body was not being scrapped

and that, for years to come, it was going to be “business as usual”. That, Presiding Officer, is the problem. It means savage yearly cuts in schools, colleges and universities—or the post-school ecosystem, as civil servants would have us call it. Does the cabinet secretary agree that any discussion of reform must be accompanied by an acknowledgement of those cuts and a commitment to resource our education system properly?

Shirley-Anne Somerville: I look forward to the Scottish Labour Party actually bringing through costed proposals at the next budget. I may have a long wait, Presiding Officer, because it does not do so; its members simply make statements in Parliament and do not back them up with information on how their proposals would be resourced. That is the difference between being in opposition, with no hope of being in government, and being in government itself.

Business as usual is important, because, until the new organisations are established, the existing ones will continue to deliver support for teachers and to deliver exams. The idea of business as usual therefore should not be mocked or sidelined; it is to be encouraged, to ensure that our children and young people are still supported through the process.

We have talked about the need for speed on the issue. It is true that there is room for improvement on that, which is exactly why the Scottish Government has already delivered 2,000 additional teachers over pre-pandemic levels and has committed to £1 billion-worth of expenditure. When looking at longer-term progress on reform, it is important that we do so not just as a Government, but in a wider way that encourages a great conversation and a discussion about what needs to happen. That is exactly why we have set up—and will continue to pursue—facilitation work with the Scottish Youth Parliament, our teachers and stakeholder groups to ensure that they are hearing from each other and that their conclusions are getting directly to me.

Professor Louise Hayward is independent of the Scottish Government. She has been working exceptionally well with people in the education system to develop an innovative approach to delivering her report. She is keen to work with the national discussion. It is important that she responds after that stage, because I do not want to be in a position whereby what is decided for qualifications tilts what we do on the rest of our progress on education reform. That is exactly why the reform process has been worked on closely right across the education system. I hope that, despite the questions that he has asked today, Michael Marra will take part in that.

Kaukab Stewart (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP): I welcome the cabinet secretary's update and the next stage of crucial reform that she has set out today, particularly the commitment to put the voices of our young people at the heart of that reform. The cabinet secretary will agree that we must provide assurances to learners that the process will deliver real and meaningful change. What assurances can the cabinet secretary provide of her personal commitment to delivering just that?

Shirley-Anne Somerville: As I made very clear in my initial statement and in my answer to Oliver Mundell, I am determined to deliver real change in the education system. We will work across Government to engage with practitioners, learners, those who deliver and use education and those who have differing views from the Scottish Government to ensure that all those views are heard at the centre of the reform process. An example of that is what we have set up in the national discussion and in the reform and replacement of the organisations and qualifications.

We are learning from what has worked well in other parts of Government—for example, around social security—to ensure that we are using a wide range of partners who are not just the usual suspects that you would expect to see around the table in a discussion on education. We are reaching out as extensively as we possibly can—for example, through the user panels.

There is an opportunity for real change, and that is what I am determined to deliver.

Meghan Gallacher (Central Scotland) (Con): That was another education statement, with a lot of words but no direct action. We have commitments from the cabinet secretary today that will create greater levels of bureaucracy, but we have yet to see any meaningful change. Call me cynical, but why has the statement been brought forward to today? Is it just a ploy to deflect attention from the Scottish Government's desperate attempt to kickstart a new independence referendum campaign?

Shirley-Anne Somerville: Meghan Gallacher will know that it is not the job of the Government—and, in particular, not my job—to set the parliamentary timetable. It was important to get out a statement on Scottish education. Normally, I am criticised for not making statements or holding debates on Scottish education, but now we are being criticised for bringing them to the Parliament. *[Interruption.]*

What Meghan Gallacher calls democracy, I call consultation. That is what people are looking to see. The need for consultation came through very

strongly in Ken Muir's report, as did the need to listen to young people. *[Interruption.]*

I am afraid that Michael Marra is not even listening to my response, never mind to the children, young people and teachers. Consultation is required. That came through strongly in Professor Muir's work—it was his first recommendation to the Government. I am prepared to take that on. I do not see any response from the Opposition parties to suggest that they are rising to the challenge so far.

Graeme Dey (Angus South) (SNP): Like any reasonable person, I welcome the cabinet secretary's invitation to Opposition parties to play a constructive role in the reform programme process. Can the cabinet secretary provide any further detail on the robust and credible nature of the external challenge regime that she envisions?

Shirley-Anne Somerville: One of the most important aspects of the reform programme is inviting that critical challenge at the heart of the reform process. I have spoken about the stakeholder reference group, which I will chair. That group will ensure that a wide range of stakeholders have direct ability to have discussions with me about areas of hope and concern and will ensure that that is core to the reform process.

I hope that the role within the programme that we have offered to Professor Ken Muir and Professor Louise Hayward, to provide that critical challenge, offers reassurance to those in the sector. In particular, the work of Professor Ken Muir, which has already been published, has been widely acknowledged to have landed well. It presents the education secretary with challenges as well as a lot of hope for the future.

There is a great deal that we can do in the national discussion. I mentioned the co-facilitators that we have used in an attempt to take the politics out of the discussion on the education system, as was suggested, for example, by the outgoing secretary of the Educational Institute of Scotland, Larry Flanagan. I hope that the national discussion, co-chaired by the Convention of Scottish Local Authorities but facilitated by two external experts, will be another way of ensuring that we do just that.

Paul O'Kane (West Scotland) (Lab): With a rising attainment gap, lower levels of attainment funding and an organisation that the cabinet secretary has deemed not fit for purpose leading our assessments—although apparently we should not criticise business as usual—is she not disappointed and frustrated by her lack of pace in implementing the reforms? They will seek to undo the damage of Scottish National Party reforms since 2007, of which there are too many to list.

Shirley-Anne Somerville: There has been increased funding for attainment, with £1 billion allocated over this parliamentary session compared with £750 million in the previous session. We were seeing improvement in the attainment gap pre-pandemic, although it is clear that the pandemic presented Scotland with certain challenges, as it did education systems across the world. That is exactly why we have provided additional funding for the attainment challenge and why we are providing more teachers. We have made the commitment to have 3,500 more teachers by the end of the parliamentary session and, as I mentioned earlier, 2,000 more teachers than pre-pandemic levels.

Ruth Maguire (Cunninghame South) (SNP): The reformed system of education that the cabinet secretary outlines needs to serve learners. Children and young people must be centred in the process of reform; how will the Scottish Government ensure that that happens?

Shirley-Anne Somerville: I will meet a group of children and young people in the first of a series of engagement sessions very soon to hear directly from them about their priorities for education. That is the first in a series of moves that we are making in education to shift the power balance in order to enable learners to be fully centred in the development of the reform progress.

I mentioned in my statement the important work that we will carry out, which will be facilitated by the Scottish Youth Parliament. It will undertake an open discussion in its forthcoming summer sitting to ask young people how the national discussion should be shaped, and Professor Hayward has two members of the Scottish Youth Parliament working on her independent review group. I hope that that gives Ruth Maguire some examples of how we are putting young people at the heart of the process.

Willie Rennie (North East Fife) (LD): In the past few days, the education secretary's speech to the EIS has been described as "pathetically weak" by its new general secretary, she was humiliated by the First Minister on the date for closing the poverty-related attainment gap and she has broken her promise to have a qualified nursery teacher in every deprived community. With that record, what confidence can we have in the chance of real reform?

Shirley-Anne Somerville: I welcomed my discussions with the new general secretary of the EIS, as I enjoyed my discussions with the previous general secretary, and I am sure that those will continue on many issues, on some of which we will agree and some we will not.

However, we have a shared endeavour that is wider than just the Scottish Government and the

EIS, which is to have a discussion about education reform and the replacement of our organisations. Of course, there has been no change and will be no change to the policy on the removal of the attainment gap. Mr Rennie and others may wish to misinterpret and misconstrue that and attempt to claim that there is a division between me and the First Minister, but there is none, there will be none and we are determined to fulfil our pledges in the programme for government.

Siobhian Brown (Ayr) (SNP): We need to make sure that we hear from the people who know our pupils and education system best—our teachers. What opportunities will teachers have to shape Scotland's reformed education system through the process that the cabinet secretary has outlined today?

Shirley-Anne Somerville: Teachers will very much be at the heart of the reformed system, along with young people. I again mention the stakeholder reference group, in which teachers will play an important part. I mentioned earlier that we are giving further thought to who we can involve directly on the delivery boards, and I am sure that teachers will play a role in those.

That will go alongside the work that I continue to do when I meet, for example, the teachers panel, which ensures that I have direct contact with front-line teachers, which I find exceptionally useful. I would like to consider how we could take the important example of the experience panels that we used in Social Security Scotland and use them in the education reform process, and that will of course involve teachers.

Ross Greer (West Scotland) (Green): The success of the process will depend on a change in culture, as well as a change in structures. An entirely fair criticism in recent years has been about the hostility of the education agencies—particularly the SQA—to any feedback and constructive criticism. The role of the stakeholder reference group will be key to providing the unvarnished, constructive challenge that is needed to establish the new culture. How will that group engage directly with the officials who are designing the new bodies?

Shirley-Anne Somerville: An important aspect of the stakeholder reference group is that I will chair it and I will hear from it frequently during the reform process to ensure that it has a direct link to not just officials, but ministers.

Ross Greer's point about culture is exceptionally important. We have to ensure that we not only get the structures correct but that the cultures and values that we want in our education system are absolutely embedded from day 1 in our new agencies, whether that is the replacement for the SQA, the replacement for Education Scotland or,

indeed, the new inspectorate. We can do that by ensuring that, during the initial discussions and workings, the working group and the entirety of the reform programme board discuss culture and the fact that we cannot move on in any of this unless we ensure that the culture is appropriate in all the replacement organisations.

Rona Mackay (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP): We all want Scotland's education system to compete with the best in the world. How will the Scottish Government ensure that we use this opportunity of reform to learn from the best globally?

Shirley-Anne Somerville: One of the important ways in which we can do that is through the facilitators that I have announced for the national discussion on education. I will continue to ensure that I seek the views of the International Council of Education Advisers. I look forward to meeting it in a few weeks' time to discuss the reform process. We have, of course, invited the OECD to provide us with critical challenge on a number of occasions through the reviews of the curriculum for excellence and further reviews that it has carried out. It is important that we act on the recommendations. The reform process is a good example of that.

Stephen Kerr (Central Scotland) (Con): In the Education, Children and Young People Committee meeting on 18 May, I asked the cabinet secretary when the attainment gap would be closed. She said:

"I will not set an arbitrary date for when the attainment gap will be closed".—[*Official Report, Education, Children and Young People Committee*, 18 May 2022; c 4.]

Those are the cabinet secretary's very words in response to my very open question. The First Minister now says that that will be 2026. The Parliament deserves to hear the cabinet secretary say here and now that the attainment gap will be closed by 2026—within the lifetime of this session. Will she produce a set of milestones by which we can judge how she is progressing towards the achievement of that objective? Those are two very simple questions.

Shirley-Anne Somerville: The discussion that we had in the Education, Children and Young People Committee meeting and the discussion that is being had about the First Minister's reflections on the programme for government show that we are all—right across Government—determined to close the attainment gap. Yes, progress will have been impacted by the pandemic but, as the programme for government in 2016 set out, we are absolutely determined to see progress. That has been laid out in the programme for government—[*Interruption.*]—of 2026 and nothing has changed from what is in that programme for government, or in what the First Minister has said

on the issue, or, indeed, in any of the discussions that I have had in the Education, Children and Young People Committee. We are all—right across Government—determined to close the attainment gap and we will be able to see that.

We are determined to see local government, which is directly involved in delivering education, approach the work through the stretch aims that we have asked it to proceed with. That is a new addition to our education system. The local authorities will develop those stretch aims and I said in the Education, Children and Young People Committee meeting that we will publish those. [*Interruption.*] If I am not happy or I am concerned about the pace of change, I will, of course, let the Education, Children and Young People Committee know.

It is unfortunate, Presiding Officer, that through that entire answer, Mr Kerr has refused to listen, so I think that we will perhaps be round this road again, because he has refused to listen to what the Scottish Government is doing—[*Interruption.*]—or to listen to the work that we are doing with local government to ensure that we are delivering on the attainment gap.

The Presiding Officer: That concludes the ministerial statement on an education reform update. There will be a short pause before we move to the next item of business.

Business Motion

15:41

The Deputy Presiding Officer (Liam McArthur): The next item of business is consideration of business motion S6M-04969, in the name of George Adam, on behalf of the Parliamentary Bureau, setting out a timetable for the stage 3 consideration of the Good Food Nation (Scotland) Bill.

Motion moved,

That the Parliament agrees that, during stage 3 of the Good Food Nation (Scotland) Bill, debate on groups of amendments shall, subject to Rule 9.8.4A, be brought to a conclusion by the time limit indicated, those time limits being calculated from when the stage begins and excluding any periods when other business is under consideration or when a meeting of the Parliament is suspended (other than a suspension following the first division in the stage being called) or otherwise not in progress:

Groups 1 to 3: 1 hour

Groups 4 to 7: 1 hour 45 minutes

Groups 8 to 10: 2 hours 20 minutes

Group 11: 3 hours.—[George Adam]

Motion agreed to.

Good Food Nation (Scotland) Bill: Stage 3

15:42

The Deputy Presiding Officer (Liam McArthur): The next item of business is stage 3 proceedings on the Good Food Nation (Scotland) Bill. In dealing with the amendments, members should have the bill as amended at stage 2, the marshalled list and the groupings of amendments. The division bell will sound and proceedings will be suspended for five minutes for the first division of the afternoon. The period of voting for each division will be up to one minute.

Members who wish to speak in the debate on any group of amendments should press their request-to-speak buttons as soon as possible after I call the first amendment in the group.

Given the fact that the Cabinet Secretary for Rural Affairs and Islands will be participating remotely, it was agreed at the Parliamentary Bureau this morning that, if members who have already spoken in the debate wish to make a further contribution after the cabinet secretary has spoken, I would consider allowing that. I would invite members, in those circumstances, to press their request-to-speak buttons at that point and we would go back to the cabinet secretary thereafter.

Members should now refer to the marshalled list of amendments.

Before section 1

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Amendment 15, in the name of Rhoda Grant, is grouped with amendment 16.

Rhoda Grant (Highlands and Islands) (Lab): It appears strange to me that the Scottish Government chooses to legislate but refuses to spell out in the bill what the purpose of that legislation is.

A purpose clause would provide clarity on the Government's vision for implementing the legislation. We believe that a good food nation bill must give effect to our human right to food, and I believe that the cabinet secretary does as well. To quote her:

"it is the Good Food Nation (Scotland) Bill that will put in place the long-term planning that is necessary to make both the practical and cultural changes that we need to make human rights around food a reality for everyone in Scotland."—[Official Report, Rural Affairs, Islands and Natural Environment Committee, 23 February 2022; c 2.]

I welcome that commitment. The amendment seeks to put that aim and purpose in the bill.

The legislation has the potential to be world leading in its approach. At stage 2, the Government rejected a similar amendment, commenting that it had no force in law. Amendment 15 clarifies the matter by stating:

“Regard should be had to”

that

“purpose in preparing and implementing good food nation plans.”

15:45

The Scottish Government has committed to enshrining our human rights into Scots law, which is a welcome step. I cannot understand why it would refuse to state clearly in the legislation that its purpose is to implement our human right to food. As part of our ratification of international treaties, we already have the right to food. Despite that, we have a growing problem with hunger and malnutrition, which we must address. If we do not implement that right to food, we will store up problems for the future and the cost will be poor health and the resurfacing of diseases due to malnutrition.

Hunger also impacts on younger generations. It is impossible to learn on an empty stomach. I welcome moves towards providing free school meals and policies that address holiday hunger, but those policies are simply sticking plasters on the problem. To deal with hunger, we must deal with its root causes and allow every family to be able to feed their children. The inability to do that is inhumane and soul destroying. With the bill, we have an opportunity to put in train policies that deal with that. I urge members to support amendment 15.

I support amendment 16 in the name of Rachael Hamilton. It provides a detailed summation of what the bill should do and none of its points contradict my amendment 15.

I move amendment 15.

Rachael Hamilton (Etrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con): Without ensuring that a good food nation plan has a clearly defined purpose, it is unreasonable to expect that the aims of the bill can be met. Amendment 16 defines the purpose of a good food nation plan in a manner that matches the Scottish Government’s ambition for the bill. Plans should, of course, work for producers, purveyors and consumers, and they also need to work for the environment. The inclusion of those points in my amendment is strongly supported by WWF Scotland and NFU Scotland.

Throughout the passage of the bill, the Scottish Food Coalition has highlighted the need to ensure that those who are tasked with implementing plans

are guided by a clear purpose. My amendment seeks to address that need by offering succinct and substantive guidance on the matter, which would help to fulfil the aims of the bill.

I turn to Rhoda Grant’s amendment on the human right to food. Although the Scottish Conservatives are of the opinion that that could be covered in the Scottish Government’s human rights bill, we absolutely understand concerns and reservations about the Government’s pledge to deliver that bill any time soon.

Ariane Burgess (Highlands and Islands) (Green): As we agreed at stage 2, when the bill was before the Rural Affairs, Islands and Natural Environment Committee, the right to food is important and something that we want to see embedded in Scots law. However, the most appropriate way to do that is through a Scottish human rights bill, in which the right to food will be incorporated alongside other international treaties to ensure that they have legal effect.

The bill, as amended at stage 2, includes provision for ministers to “have regard to” a number of international instruments in relation to the right to food when preparing the Government’s good food nation plan. That will ensure that due attention is given to the right to food until a Scottish human rights bill is passed.

For those reasons, I will not support Rhoda Grant’s amendment 15.

Amendment 16 does not specify whether it applies to the Scottish ministers or to other authorities, so it is unclear where the responsibility for delivery would lie.

The Cabinet Secretary for Rural Affairs and Islands (Mairi Gougeon): Amendment 15 would insert wording stating that the purpose of the bill

“is to give effect to the human right to food through good food nation plans”

and that

“Regard should be had to this purpose in preparing and implementing good food nation plans.”

At stage 2, the member lodged a similar amendment containing a purpose provision in relation to the right to food. I did not support that amendment because it did not have a clear legal effect. Amendment 15 has a legal effect in that it sets out a duty that

“Regard should be had to this purpose in preparing and implementing good food nation plans.”

However, I have other concerns about the amendment. It would have the effect that the right to food would be the sole focus of the bill, which is not the intention. The bill is intended to cover the wide-ranging nature of the good food nation vision, not to focus on one specific aspect of food policy.

Furthermore, it is not clear what amendment 15 would add to the bill's current provisions on the right to adequate food in, for example, section 1A, on principles, and section 3, on consideration of international instruments.

We have also committed to incorporating human rights treaties in domestic law through the human rights bill, which will be introduced in the current parliamentary session. That bill will give effect to a wide range of internationally recognised human rights in Scots law, as far as possible within devolved competence, including the right to adequate food as part of the overall right to an adequate standard of living. The proposed human rights bill is the appropriate place to address the complex interrelationships between the rights and obligations across four treaties in a single, coherent and integrated framework.

For those reasons, I ask members not to support amendment 15, in Rhoda Grant's name.

Rachael Hamilton's amendment 16 also sets out a purpose provision. As I set out in relation to Rhoda Grant's amendment 15, my view is that any provision must have a clear legal effect, and amendment 16 does not. No duty would be placed on the Scottish ministers or relevant authorities.

At stage 2, I responded to similar views, expressed by stakeholders and committee members, that the bill should include high-level objectives to reflect the broad vision and ambitions for the good food nation policy. The approach that was taken through the amendments that were lodged in my name meant that, instead of our setting out a purpose provision, as is proposed by Rachael Hamilton, a set of high-level principles were included in the bill in a format that would give them legal effect. The Scottish ministers and relevant authorities "must have regard to" those principles when developing good food nation plans, and the high-level nature of the principles provides clarity as to what is being asked of them.

For those reasons, I urge members not to support amendments 15 and 16.

Rhoda Grant: I am obviously very disappointed in the response from the Government and, indeed, from the Greens. Their manifesto stated that the bill should include the right to food—how quickly they have ditched their principles for a sniff of power. It is a disgrace.

Stakeholders have called for the right to food to be included, but the Scottish Government is not listening. The right to food should be enshrined in the bill, but the Government has shown itself to be absolutely disinterested in taking steps to deal with hunger and starvation that is evident here and now in Scotland. At stage 2, the cabinet secretary stated clearly that having "regard to" principles would not bind ministers. Therefore, the excuses

that she has given not to support amendment 15 are spurious at best.

I urge members to look to their conscience and vote for amendment 15.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 15 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

There will be a brief technical suspension to allow members to get online.

15:53

Meeting suspended.

16:00

On resuming—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 15 be agreed to. Members should cast their votes now.

The vote is now closed.

Clare Adamson (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app would not work. I would have voted no.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Ms Adamson. We will make sure that that is recorded.

The Minister for Social Security and Local Government (Ben Macpherson): —[*Inaudible.*]

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Wait for your microphone to come on, Mr Macpherson.

Ben Macpherson: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I would be grateful if you would check whether my vote was recorded. I would have voted no.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: It was recorded, Mr Macpherson.

The Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills (Shirley-Anne Somerville): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. It appears that my app was not working. I would have voted no.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Your vote was recorded, but your card was not put in. If you could do that, it would be fine.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)

Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)

Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Abstentions

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Dowe, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division on amendment 15, in the name of Rhoda Grant, is: For 18, Against 64, Abstentions 28.

Amendment 15 disagreed to.

Amendment 16 moved—[Rachael Hamilton.]

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 16 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a 30-second division on amendment 16.

The vote is now closed.

Ben Macpherson: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app did not connect and I was unable to vote. I would have voted no.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Macpherson. We will make sure that that is recorded.

David Torrance (Kirkcaldy) (SNP): My app would not connect. I would have voted no.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Torrance. We will make sure that that is recorded.

Pam Duncan-Glancy (Glasgow) (Lab): My app did not connect. I would have voted yes.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you. We will make sure that that is recorded.

Clare Adamson: My app is not connecting. I would have voted no.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you. We will make sure that that is recorded.

The Minister for Culture, Europe and International Development and Minister with special responsibility for Refugees from Ukraine (Neil Gray): Unfortunately my app did not connect. I would have voted no.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you. We will make sure that that is recorded, Mr Gray.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 44, Against 63, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 16 disagreed to.

Section 1—Requirement to produce plan

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Group 2 is on scrutiny of proposed plan. Amendment 47, in the name of Colin Smyth, is grouped with amendments 49, 50 and 52.

Colin Smyth (South Scotland) (Lab): Amendments 47, 49, 50 and 52 seek to give the Parliament more time than the 28 days proposed in the bill to scrutinise the national good food nation plan.

Amendment 49 requires the Scottish ministers to lay the proposed plan before the Scottish Parliament for a period of 60 days, of which no fewer than 30 must be sitting days. At stage 2, I lodged an amendment for the period to be 120 days, based on the Climate Change (Emissions Reduction Targets) (Scotland) Act 2019. The minister raised concerns about the possible impact on the timetable to produce a plan and agreed to work with me after stage 2. As a result of that, and following discussions, amendment 49 is a compromise between the current requirement to lay the plan for 28 days, and my previous amendment seeking 120 days.

Amendments 47, 50 and 52 are simply consequential amendments to amendment 49. For example, amendment 50 makes changes to section 1B(1) to provide that the Scottish ministers must have regard to the things that are listed in section 1(1)(b) during the consideration period rather than before the expiry of the consideration period. Amendment 52 amends section 1B to remove sections 1B(4) and 1B(5), which relate to the 28-day period, and amendment 47 amends section 1B(2) of the bill, to specify the subsection of section 1B that contains the details of the length of the consideration period.

Concern about the lack of opportunity for Parliament to scrutinise the plan was a recurring theme in stakeholder responses and the committee's report. I therefore urge members to support the amendments to ensure that Parliament is given a period beyond the planned period of 28 days to effectively hold the Scottish Government to account on how it delivers our collective ambitions to be a good food nation through any proposed national good food nation plan.

I move amendment 47.

Mairi Gougeon: As Colin Smyth has just said, we both lodged amendments at stage 2 that would have introduced a requirement to lay a draft version of the national good food nation plan before the Scottish Parliament for a period of consideration. My amendment set out a period of 28 days, which was agreed by the committee, and

Colin Smyth's amendment set out a period of 120 days. I agreed to work with Colin Smyth to agree on a compromise, which is why I fully support his amendments today to require a consideration period of 60 days.

Amendment 47 agreed to.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Group 3 is on content of plans. Amendment 17, in the name of Rachael Hamilton, is grouped with amendments 1, 2, 18, 19, 48, 20, 63, 3, 29 and 64 to 66.

Rachael Hamilton: The Good Food Nation (Scotland) Bill represents an opportunity to tackle some of the most pressing issues that Scotland faces, and I have no doubt that the Scottish Government would agree that tackling child poverty is one of those issues. I know that Monica Lennon has also lodged amendments to achieve similar aims, which my colleagues and I will support.

Tackling child poverty has taken on added importance given the global inflationary pressures that families around the world are facing. Although the UK Government continues to implement measures to alleviate those pressures, amendment 17 would pull on a lever that is available to the Scottish Government to go even further. It would include tackling child poverty as an issue that the bill must have regard to. That should include

"the delivery of free school breakfasts in ... Scottish schools."

I have also lodged a similar amendment, which seeks the same aim regarding

"the free supply of milk to children in pre-school",

nursery and primary school settings. Monica Lennon moved that amendment at stage 2, but it was disagreed to.

I have a comment to make on Ross Greer, the Green Party's education spokesperson. I presume that he had not had his Weetabix that morning when he made the comment that he did about initiatives to provide free school meals. It is regrettable that he did so.

I move amendment 17.

Brian Whittle (South Scotland) (Con): My amendments in this group aim to ensure that the Scottish Government declares the outcomes of the bill; that they are fully understood and resourced to make it as simple as possible for food producers and local authorities with regard to food preparation contracts and hospital contracts; and that those outcomes are as connected as possible. The legislation should connect up the relevant parts to make the bill's asks of our food producers, local authorities and hospitals as straightforward as they can be.

Amendment 3 states that the good food nation plan must set out how a relevant authority will ensure that at least 60 per cent of the food that it procures is sourced within the United Kingdom, except in exceptional circumstances, and that free school meals will be locally sourced.

For so many reasons, that has to be the direction of travel of the bill. There are health reasons, given that Scotland has the unwanted tag of the unhealthiest nation in Europe, with a reducing life expectancy, which is already lower than in the rest of the United Kingdom. Regular, fresh and locally produced food can be a huge step towards addressing that health inequality.

With regard to the rural economy, we charge our farmers with producing some of the highest-quality food in the world. They have the highest standards of animal welfare and we give them custodianship of the countryside and ask them to pay the living wage. We must surely reward them by purchasing that produce at a fair price. To help us with our climate change targets, farmers are unfairly given such a hard time on emissions and climate change. Why, therefore, are we importing so much of our food for public procurement contracts, with all the air miles and road miles that are associated with that ridiculous behaviour?

We have hospitals that serve food that is procured, prepared and pre-packaged in Wales and driven up the M6 to be reheated, with over 50 per cent of it wasted. Where is the common sense in that? Recent events have highlighted all too starkly that we must protect and develop our own food security. If we do not support our own food producers right now, we risk losing them for good, necessitating further imports.

That brings me to amendment 2. If we are going to require councils and relevant authorities to develop plans to improve local procurement and good food standards, we should be making it easier for them to attain those standards. When I first entered Parliament, the Scottish Government's central Scotland Excel contract procured just 16 per cent of its food from Scotland. It imported chicken from Thailand, root vegetables and fruit from Europe, potato powder from Ireland and many dairy products from abroad. Those are all foodstuffs that are produced in Scotland, and we have the capacity to increase production if demand dictates it.

That poor record has hardly improved in the intervening six years, to the Parliament's shame. Making a bold statement and taking the lead by creating an Excel contract that procures at least 60 per cent of its food from the UK, and preferably from Scotland, would demonstrate serious intent, and would allow local councils and authorities an easy route to hitting their targets.

Amendments 2 and 3 would put an improvement in fresh food standards in schools and hospitals, for which amendment 1 provides, well within reach. That is surely an outcome that we would all want. The bill must contain an educational element that highlights and improves food literacy regarding where food comes from and how we process it. Too many people today have no idea how food is produced and processed. If we are to get buy-in from consumers, that needs to be dealt with.

16:15

A third of all food is wasted. If food waste were a country, it would be the third biggest emitter of greenhouse gases after China and the United States of America. It takes a land mass the size of China to produce the food that we throw away. The most critical point, for me, is that if we wasted just 25 per cent less than we currently waste, we could feed the world's starving people.

That is why I am asking that we reduce the rate of food waste from more than 30 per cent to less than 20 per cent by 2025. It can be done. A school in East Ayrshire used to throw away 40 per cent of its food. One of the teachers took the unused food, put it into meal-sized boxes and froze it. Unused food from the day before is left on a table and children are allowed to lift it at 4 o'clock. The idea is to protect the environment and no criteria have been put in place. There is no food waste at that school now.

Finally, we must process food closer to home. We should not send food down south and further afield for processing and packaging. It is about health, the local economy and the environment. We do not process much of our produce in Scotland, so to increase capacity by 50 per cent by 2030 would not be much of an ask. However, it would be a statement of intent that would encourage the private sector to grow capacity.

Members should remember that everything that I am talking about comes against a backdrop in which East Ayrshire procures 75 per cent of its food locally. It can be done.

The amendments in my name in this group are enabling amendments that would put in place building blocks to help us to hit the targets that we want to hit. They are eminently sensible and achievable. Not to agree to them would be to pass the buck to local authorities and abdicate responsibility. Let us make laws that enable change. I ask members to support the amendments in my name.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I call the cabinet secretary to speak to amendment 18 and other amendments in the group.

Mairi Gougeon: I reiterate what I have said throughout the process. This is a framework bill: it sets a framework for the good food nation plans. Many of the amendments in this group provide for specific details or matters that plans would have to contain.

For example, amendment 64, in Monica Lennon's name, is on universal free school meals. I thank Monica Lennon for meeting me to discuss her intention to lodge such an amendment at stage 3. The issue is of great importance to her, as it is to me and to other members of the Parliament.

Our programme for government set out our ambitions to provide free school breakfasts and lunches to local authority primary school pupils in Scotland all year round, and to all children in state-funded special schools in Scotland. We have made significant progress against that commitment: Scotland offers the most generous provision of free school lunches in the UK, and local authority pupils in primary classes 1 to 5 and in special schools already benefit from the offer of universal free school meals.

We are fully committed to the expansion of free school meals over the course of this parliamentary session and we will continue to work with local authorities to plan for that over the next academic year.

I will come back to the detail of amendment 64. First, I will give my view on other amendments in the group. My view on putting outcomes, indicators and targets in the bill remains the same: it is challenging to ensure that such measures are and remain up to date and meaningful if they are set out in primary legislation.

There is also a risk that future food plans would focus on those targets and neglect other, equally important considerations. We want the plans to cover the whole of the good food nation vision, which is wide ranging. For that reason, I am firmly of the view that the place for the level of detail that is envisaged is in the plans themselves. That is also the considered view of the Rural Affairs, Islands and Natural Environment Committee in its stage 1 report. The committee thought that the bill should contain high-level objectives but not detailed targets and outcomes.

I lodged amendment 18 in response to concerns from some stakeholders and committee members that there is no clear recognition of the role that the private sector plays in the food supply chain. The good food nation plans will contain policies and initiatives that inevitably involve or affect the private sector in different ways. Amendment 18 will require the Scottish ministers to set out, in the national good food nation plan, how they intend to ensure that implementation of the policies in

section 1(3)(c) is informed by the views of the private sector.

I want to address concerns about amendment 18 that have been voiced by some stakeholders in recent days. I want to be clear that it is not about giving food companies a hand in creating Government policy. Rather, it is about making sure that we properly take into account the views of those who grow, process, transport and sell food on how we implement the policies that are decided by the Government. Given the significant role that businesses of all sizes play in the food supply chain, no Government policy would succeed without at least understanding the views of business on how such a policy would work in practice. In essence, the duty is to garner those views, not necessarily to act on them.

I also draw members' attention to the definition of the "food business sector" in section 14(1). It includes everyone that is involved in the food industry, regardless of size or role. The aim is to recognise the role that the private sector plays across the supply chain and to provide a mechanism by which the views of the food business sector will inform the implementation of the policies in the plan.

Amendment 20, in my name, would amend section 1(5) to clarify that the requirement to have regard to the list of high-level outcomes in that subsection applies when determining the content of the national good food nation plan, in so far as that is required by section 1(3).

Brian Whittle's amendments 2 and 3 would place procurement targets in the bill. For example, amendment 2 would require the Scottish Government's "Central Scotland Excel contract" to "procure at least 60% of food from within the UK by 2025".

The amendments are similar to amendments that were lodged at stage 2 and which were not agreed to. As I set out at stage 2, strict rules on procurement may mean that the intended aim cannot be achieved. The trade and co-operation agreement with the EU contains a duty of non-discrimination in procurement. Amendments 2 and 3 are not compatible with our international obligations, and that is why I am unable to support them. However, the Scottish Government supports the use of procurement to improve the social, economic and environmental wellbeing of our areas, and we promote and facilitate the procurement of healthy, fresh and seasonal produce in contracts for food and catering.

Amendment 1, in Brian Whittle's name, sets out a series of outcomes that the national good food nation plan would have to include, including targets on food waste and food processing capacity.

Rachael Hamilton's amendments 48 and 65 make reference to Food for Life accreditation, setting out that that should be one of the indicators used to assess progress in achieving the outcomes of the good food nation plans. Amendment 66 would require local authorities to set out in their good food nation plans their plans to achieve accreditation under the Food for Life scheme.

I absolutely support the aims and objectives of the Food for Life programme, and I acknowledge the great work that has been done through it, which means that 18 local authorities now have Food for Life accreditation. However, it is not appropriate to set out such a level of detail in the bill. The process of obtaining Food for Life accreditation is a policy initiative that is best dealt with at the local authority level. Local authorities will set out the indicators against which progress against the outcomes that are set out in their plans will be measured. Given that the good food nation plans are yet to be drafted and, in particular, that consultation on local plans has not yet taken place, setting out an indicator in legislation is problematic.

I also bring to members' attention the fact that the reference in Rachael Hamilton's amendment 65 should be to subsection (4)(b) of section 7, rather than to subsection 3(b), as the amendment states.

My view on amendments 1, 48, 65 and 66 is as I have set out throughout the bill process. The bill is a framework, and the appropriate place for such a level of detail is in the plans themselves. I therefore ask members not to support those amendments.

Rachael Hamilton's amendment 63 would require a relevant authority to set out how it

"intends to work with other relevant authorities in its area to share good practice and to secure the achievement of the outcomes for individuals in receipt of social care."

However, it is not clear how the amendment would work in practice.

For example, the wording "in its area" is difficult to interpret. Does it mean working with relevant authorities within exactly the same area, with those whose boundaries overlap the area, or with those that are adjacent to the local authority? The amendment includes wording that is specific to social care, and it is not clear whether the sharing of good practice is a general requirement or is specific to social care. For those reasons, I ask members not to support amendment 63.

Several amendments relate to the provision of food in schools. Rachael Hamilton's amendment 17 would add to section 1 a requirement for the Scottish ministers to set out

"the policies which"

they

"intend to pursue in order to reduce child poverty, including the delivery of free school breakfasts in all Scottish schools."

Section 1(5) of the bill, as amended at stage 2, already requires that when

"determining the content of the national good food nation plan, the Scottish ministers must have regard ... to the scope for food-related issues to affect outcomes in relation to ... child poverty."

The policies to reduce child poverty will be set out in the plan itself, which, as I previously set out, is the appropriate place for the detail of those policies.

The wording of amendment 17 would require Scottish ministers to set out how they would ensure the provision of free breakfasts for all schools in Scotland, including those that would not be under the control of local authorities. I query how that would target those children who are in most need of that support.

Rachael Hamilton's amendment 19 would require the national good food nation plan to

"set out how the Scottish ministers will ensure the free supply of milk to children in pre-school, nurseries and primary schools."

The Scottish Government has committed to delivering a universal Scottish free school meal scheme to local authority primary and special schools, and to developing a pilot in local authority secondary schools. The wording of amendment 19 would also require Scottish ministers to set out how they would ensure the supply of free milk to primary schools not under the control of local authorities, which is outwith the scope of our current commitment.

As I have set out previously, this is a framework bill and it would not be appropriate to be prescriptive in the bill about which specific policies should be contained in the plans. Monica Lennon lodged similar amendments in relation to free school milk at stage 2, but they were not agreed to for the same reasons that I have just outlined.

Beatrice Wishart's amendment 29 would require local authorities, when formulating their good food nation plans, to ensure

"flexibility in meal provision"

and, in particular, not to

"restrict the ability of residents in any school hostels operated by the local authority to make choices in relation to their meals."

Evening meals that are provided in hostels that are run by local authorities must comply with the nutrient standards that are set out in the Nutritional Requirements for Food and Drink in Schools

(Scotland) Regulations 2020, which help ensure that young people are provided with an appropriate amount of energy and key nutrients to support their healthy growth and development.

The food and drink standards that are set out in the regulations also apply at mealtimes and are designed to limit the amount of fat, saturated fat, salt and sugar that is provided as part of a balanced diet. The regulations are already flexible enough to allow school hostel caterers to design menus that meet the needs and preferences of hostel residents.

In relation to Brian Whittle's amendment 3, which would require that

"free school meals provided by the local authority are locally sourced",

I refer to my earlier comments about the strict rules around procurement, but also to the good work that has already been carried out under the Food for Life accreditation scheme, which promotes the use of local food. That work is already under way and there are plans to run a pilot programme that will look at expanding Food for Life into the wider public sector.

I turn to Monica Lennon's amendment 64, which would require

"a relevant authority's good food nation plan"

to

"set out how the relevant authority intends to ensure the provision of universal free school meals for all children and young people ... high uptake of universal free school meals ... free of stigma"

and "high-quality, nutritious food" during school holidays.

However, careful consideration is required so that such a requirement, which might not achieve the desired aim, is not added to legislation. As I have noted throughout the bill process, the bill is a framework bill and the place for the detail is in the good food nation plans themselves.

I do not believe that the wording of the amendment that Monica Lennon lodged achieves the intended aim. The proposed amendment applies to all relevant authorities, including local authorities, health boards and all bodies that are specified in regulations under section 7(2), which would have to include in their plans how they intend to ensure the provision of universal free school meals. However, health boards have no role in the provision of school meals to pupils and, as such, amendment 64 would require them to explain how they would do something that they ultimately have no responsibility to do.

In relation to local authorities, the amendment is not just restricted to the pupils at schools under the authority's control, so it would require that

aspect of the plan to extend to independent schools and grant-aided schools.

Monica Lennon's amendment 64 would not impose a direct duty on a relevant authority to provide universal free school meals, but it would require a relevant authority to include in its plan how it intends to ensure the provision of universal free school meals and other matters that are set out in paragraphs (b) and (c) of the amendment.

Where legislation seeks to impose a legal duty on a person or body, the duty should be express, clear and unambiguous, in relation to not only the fact that a duty is being imposed but the terms of the duty. A duty could not be created by an amendment in the proposed way, which would require relevant authorities to explain in their plan how they would ensure something that they currently have no duty to do.

16:30

Paragraph (c), on the provision of meals during school holidays, would ensure something that is not yet a right in Scots law. The requirement in paragraph (b) to set out how the authority would ensure the "high uptake" of free school meals and how that would be done "free of stigma" duplicates the existing legal duty to provide free school meals.

There are duties on education authorities in the Education (Scotland) Act 1980, under section 53A, on "promotion of school lunches", and section 53B, on

"protection of identity of pupils receiving school lunches".

In contrast with the 1980 act, there is no definition in amendment 64 of "school meal" and no reference to free school meals being provided to pupils in attendance at schools. Instead, it refers to "children and young people". Therefore, it is really unclear what is intended. For example, should the provision extend to independent schools and the home education of children and young people? How does it relate to the 1980 act duties?

I hope that I have explained the significant issues with those amendments. I strongly urge members not to accept them, for the reasons that I have set out.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I call Beatrice Wishart to speak to amendment 29 and other amendments in the group.

Beatrice Wishart (Shetland Islands) (LD): Amendment 29, which is in my name, would require local authorities to ensure that their good food nation plans allow

"for flexibility in meal provision and, in particular,"

that they do not

“restrict the ability of residents of any school hostels operated by the local authority to make choices in relation to their meals.”

Amendment 29 has been created in order to avoid situations such as have been brought to my attention, in which school-hostel residents have felt restricted by the prescriptive nature of meal provision. In school hostels, which are a home from home for many pupils, all meals of the day are provided and follow school meals regulations, which can lead to pupils feeling that their meals are too prescriptive and do not allow flexibility for their choices, or independence. Being overly prescriptive about meal provision in school hostels can remove enjoyment and the social elements of meals, and can result in pupils rejecting hostel meals and instead buying unhealthier alternatives elsewhere.

As we are aware, habits that are created early in life are hard to break. It is an irony that guidance to ensure healthy food provision is driving learners towards unhealthy options.

Providing food must not only be about ensuring nutrition; it should also be about the social and cultural aspects of food, as well as individual preferences. Amendment 29 would ensure that those issues would be taken into account in settings where all meals are provided by the relevant authority—in particular, in school hostels.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I call Monica Lennon to speak to amendment 64 and other amendments in the group.

Monica Lennon (Central Scotland) (Lab): I am sorry that the cabinet secretary is unwell and unable to join us in the chamber. I hope that she feels better soon.

I will limit my remarks to amendment 64. Labour members will support all the amendments in the group. I know that we are pushed for time today.

The inspiration behind amendment 64 is no secret; it is the Scottish Trades Union Congress’s trailblazing “Food for thought” campaign, which is about making real the rights of all young people to food, education and fun. The campaign is widely supported by MSPs and political parties, all trade unions, anti-poverty charities, and children and young people’s organisations.

Amendment 64 would require the good food nation plan of a relevant authority to set out how it intends to ensure

“(a) the provision of universal free school meals for all children and young people”

and

(b) high uptake”

of meals in ways that are

“inclusive ... and free of stigma”.

It would also require the authority to set out how it intends to ensure

“(c) the fulfilment of children and young people’s right to high-quality, nutritious food”

during holiday periods.

Building on my child poverty amendments 74 and 79, which were agreed to at stage 2, amendment 64 seeks to strengthen section 7 of the bill. As we have heard, section 7 places a requirement on public bodies to produce good food nation plans. Section 7 of the bill, as amended at stage 2, makes it clear that that relates to areas for which public bodies have responsibility. We are not trying to throw in things for which public bodies have no responsibility. In the bill, it is quite clear that there would not be duplication of efforts.

We should all agree that building a good food nation must start with getting things right for all children and young people. Universal provision of free school meals is a crucial policy mechanism that would help to alleviate poverty, mitigate food insecurity and support efforts to tackle the poverty-related attainment gap. It would also be critically important in embedding whole-school community approaches to nutrition.

Including universal provision of free school meals in the good food nation plan would build on the Scottish Government’s very welcome commitment to incorporate into Scots law the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child. Expansion of universal school meals provision would also help to deliver the Scottish Government’s aspirations to significantly reduce child poverty and to close the attainment gap, in addition to its aspiration that Scotland become a good food nation by 2025.

I think that it is strange that the bill is silent on the rights of children and young people to universal provision of free school meals. In advance of the debate, members will have received a letter from Roz Foyer, who is the general secretary of the Scottish Trades Union Congress. The STUC represents more than half a million workers in Scotland, including teachers—some of whom are having to feed schoolchildren out of their own pockets—and the workers who staff our school canteens. It is important that we remember that.

I am grateful to Mairi Gougeon for her time and her willingness to engage on the issues. However, I feel that by not supporting amendment 64 the Scottish Government is missing a trick. We might have good intentions and good policies, but if we do not put them into action we are not helping people who need such help.

Just last week, at First Minister's question time, we were reminded of the rise in hidden hunger that is happening in our schools right now. Young people have told the Scottish children's charity Aberlour that their friends who are not eligible for free school meals are going hungry at lunch time, while others are deliberately saving up their lunch money to give it back to their parents. That is just shameful.

It is positive that Scottish Conservatives and Scottish Liberal Democrats are backing amendment 64. When I listen to Scotland's children and young people, they say that they want all members of the Scottish Parliament to work together to make their rights real. Ross Greer, who is not in the chamber at the moment, might think that it is somehow a disgrace that parties would work together; I think that it is positive that we do so now. I know that today's vote might not reflect it, but we are now in the position where everybody in Parliament wants to expand universal provision of free school meals beyond nursery and primary schools and into our secondary schools. The issues and challenges do not end at the gates of our primary schools.

It is regrettable that the Government and its coalition partners did not have the foresight to bring such issues within the scope of the bill; it is always more challenging for back benchers and Opposition members to do so. However, I take at face value the good will that the cabinet secretary has expressed. My plea is that if members decide not to support amendment 64, they recognise the existence of cross-cutting issues on food, education and the rights of children and young people, and that every minister in Government redoubles their efforts to ensure that children are not going without food.

We must question whether we are doing all that we can. If we vote against the amendment, we will not be doing all that we can and will have to come back again, tomorrow and the next day to try to do better. That is what children and young people are demanding from each and every one of us. The STUC is saying, with one clear voice, that workers who staff our schools and look after children across Scotland will no longer accept crumbs from the Government's table. We have to do more. We must start focusing on what we can do instead of what we cannot do.

I welcome the feedback from the cabinet secretary and I fully understand the need for legislation to be well drafted and for it not to have unintended consequences. When I met the cabinet secretary yesterday, I said that some of the objections that I was hearing had parallels to objections to period poverty legislation before the political will for it existed. I ask Green Party members to reflect on that.

This should not be about party politics and who lodges the amendment: we have time to get this right. People should look to their consciences; I know that there are back-bench members who really want to back amendment 64, so it will be a real shame if they are pressured by their party whips to do otherwise.

Colin Smyth: In the absence of an opportunity to intervene on the cabinet secretary's lengthy response, I am grateful for this opportunity to ask her some questions. Amendment 18, which is in the name of the cabinet secretary, makes provision for the implementation of policies for the national good food plan to be "informed by" the private food business sector. I do not have an issue with that, but perhaps the cabinet secretary can explain why other sectors that have interests in the policy have been excluded from having a statutory footing. Should not sectors such as those that are concerned with social wellbeing, climate change, wildlife, the natural environment, animal welfare and workers' rights have the same statutory rights as the private food sector?

It is deeply disappointing that the cabinet secretary continues to oppose the bill having a small number of high-level objectives and measurable indicators linked to outcomes, which would better enable monitoring and scrutiny of progress. The Scottish Parliament has enacted several bills in the past few years that include targets and outcomes, including the Climate Change (Emissions Reduction Targets) (Scotland) Act 2019 and the Child Poverty (Scotland) Act 2017. More recently, the Government published the draft circular economy bill, which would enable secondary legislation to set targets.

Will the cabinet secretary explain why food legislation does not require statutory targets to ensure that the Scottish Government's targets are reached and that food security is delivered across Scotland, while for other areas required targets are included in the relevant legislation?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I can confirm that I will go back to the cabinet secretary before I ask Rachael Hamilton to wind up.

Ariane Burgess: I am sympathetic to the aims of the amendments to expand provision of free food to all school-age children. It would be an important step towards closing the attainment gap. However, we have a responsibility to ensure that amendments that are agreed to in Parliament can be put into effect.

I will start by addressing amendment 64, which is in the name of Monica Lennon. It would introduce a blanket approach to free school meals provision, including providing food to people who attend fee-paying schools at which, arguably, there is not a need for such provision. As drafted,

the amendment would also apply to all relevant authorities under the bill—even those that have no role in provision of school meals.

It is unclear to whom the duties would apply. Because the issue was not raised with the committee during evidence gathering at stage 1, we have not collectively agreed recommendations on the issue. I am disappointed that, instead, Labour is raising the issue at the 11th hour, when time to agree a constructive way forward has run out.

Monica Lennon: It was disappointing that Ariane Burgess voted against the earlier iteration of the amendment at stage 2, without any questions, following instruction from the SNP cabinet secretary.

It is not the 11th hour. There is a campaign by the STUC that the Scottish Greens signed up to prior to last year's election, and which you made a flagship commitment on in your manifesto. I absolutely welcomed that: it is a shame that your party has forgotten all about that.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Please speak through the chair, Ms Lennon.

Monica Lennon: I am sorry. It is a shame that the Green Party has forgotten all that.

Is Ariane Burgess now saying that the Scottish Green Party's position has changed? As a party, are they now in favour of means testing? What in the amendment or bill relates to independent schools? Which public body has responsibility for independent schools?

Ariane Burgess: I am proud that the Scottish Greens have already taken steps to widen free school meals entitlement, as we had committed to doing. That includes using budget negotiations to expand free school meals provision from all pupils in primary 1 to P3 to all pupils in P1 to P5, which covers more than 120,000 children. We have also provided councils with more than £30 million this year to upgrade school catering facilities ahead of further expansion, and we will continue to work constructively with the Government to secure further progress.

16:45

I turn briefly to the other amendments in the group. As this is a framework bill, Rachael Hamilton's amendments 17 and 19 on school breakfast and milk provision are at a level of detail that would best be placed in the good food nation plans, rather than in the bill. I also note that the Scottish Government has already committed to delivering a universal free school milk scheme to local authorities and special schools, and will pilot a roll-out in secondary schools. Amendments 48, 65 and 68 also include detail on accreditation

schemes that would be better placed in plans than they would in legislation.

Brian Whittle's amendment 1 in the group would insert a number of targets in the bill. As was discussed at stage 2, they are problematic in framework legislation of this kind. In addition, as they touch on trade issues, we must be careful about how provisions in the bill would interact with World Trade Organization rules and the United Kingdom's trade agreements with the European Union.

We will support the cabinet secretary's amendments 18 and 20, which will ensure that good food nation plans are realistic and informed by people who work in the sector, including farmers and crofters and people who work in the supply chain, hospitality and retail. Since the private sector accounts for the vast majority of food supply and will be impacted by the plans, it is crucial that we involve it from the start of the journey to the good food nation plans.

Rhoda Grant: Will the member take an intervention?

Ariane Burgess: No, I will not take an intervention; I am winding up.

Finally, Beatrice Wishart's amendment 29 seeks to ensure flexibility in meals provision in hostels that are local authority run. That is already provided for in the nutrition requirements in the Food and Drink in Schools (Scotland) Regulations 2020, so we will not support it.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: As we are nearing the agreed time limit, I am prepared to exercise my power under rule 9.8.4A of standing orders to allow the debate on this group to continue beyond the limit in order to avoid the debate being unreasonably curtailed.

Brian Whittle: The Good Food Nation (Scotland) Bill was such a good opportunity to tackle the health and education issues that have plagued the Scottish Government, to support the rural economy and to commit to tackling climate change. The Scottish Government is asking local authorities to come up with good food nation plans, but in the cabinet secretary's response, she indicated that it is unwilling to make uncontentious amendments to the bill—uncontentious amendments that are supported by NFU Scotland.

I understand procurement law well, and there is nothing in my amendments that contravenes that law. The fact of the matter is that, for years, East Ayrshire Council has been doing exactly what my amendments ask for, so the procurement law argument does not hold water. The reality is that we could amend the bill and use secondary legislation to change anything that we needed to change in future, but the Scottish Government is

risk averse, and, without tangible outcomes, there is no way for us to measure the bill's success or otherwise. The Government is abdicating responsibility; as for the Greens, they have abdicated all their responsibilities and all their principles.

The Scottish Government has missed a huge opportunity here, and it will leave the Good Food Nation (Scotland) Bill a shell of what it should have been.

Mairi Gougeon: I will try to cover most of the points that have been raised. Reflecting on the issues that Colin Smyth raised, my amendments are certainly not about excluding others. I recognise that all the initiatives that we will take forward will involve the private sector in practice. It is important to remember that everyone will have an opportunity to input into the development of the food plans, and we have already said that we want our consultation to be as broad and inclusive as possible, so the opportunity for people to feed in will be there. It is also important to remember that we lodged amendment 18 because we listened to and took account of the evidence that the committee took during its consideration of the bill.

On outcomes and indicators, as was stated in the committee and agreed to by the committee, the bill itself is not the place for the targets and outcomes that we want to see. Some of those that were proposed at stage 2 would have become out of date very quickly. We are not averse to looking at outcomes and indicators and how we monitor our progress, but the detail of that should be in the good food nation plans.

To go back to Monica Lennon's points, I really welcome the discussions that I have had with her on the amendments that she has lodged. We have had some really constructive discussions, including with trade union representatives. I do not think that we are far apart in what we are trying to achieve, but I have specific issues with particular amendments that have been lodged, which I have outlined.

I hope that I have been really clear about the commitment that we have made on the expansion of free school meals. The Government has enacted that and driven it forward, and we are committed to working with our local authority partners to take it further forward. I hope that members across the chamber can take some assurance from that. However, there are particular issues with the amendments that Monica Lennon has lodged, as there are with Brian Whittle's amendments. For those reasons, I urge members not to support them.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I will take a brief intervention from Finlay Carson before we go back to the cabinet secretary.

Finlay Carson (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con): Thank you, Presiding Officer. I was unclear what the protocol was, given that the cabinet secretary is attending remotely.

Back in 2016, the Scottish National Party first put a commitment to the good food nation in its manifesto, but it failed to deliver. In 2021, the regurgitated good food nation proposals suggested that we would create a single market brand for Scotland called sustainability Scotland. The SNP was also going to create a single independent Scottish food agency. However, we have heard over and over today that the bill is a framework bill. Why has the cabinet secretary failed to deliver on the aspirations of the stakeholders that have engaged in the belief that the bill would be transformational? The bill in front of us is not fit for purpose.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I call Monica Lennon.

Monica Lennon: I welcome what the cabinet secretary has said and its tone, but there is a need for action. I know that she has raised a concern about children who are home schooled and how things would work if the issue that I have raised was covered in the good food plan. Is it the Government's view that children who are home schooled should be excluded from accessing universal free school meals? We know from our constituency mailbags that many children are home schooled because they have additional support needs and the schools have not been properly resourced to meet their needs. What will the Government do in the meantime to support those children if they are experiencing hunger?

Mairi Gougeon: I will touch on that last point first. Obviously, we do not want to see any child or young person going hungry. That is why we have taken a number of actions to combat the poverty and extreme poverty that we know that people are currently facing. However, there are particular issues with the amendments that have been lodged, which is why we are unable to support them. That said, the commitment in relation to the provision of free school meals is still there.

Finlay Carson raised some of the other manifesto commitments that the Government is still committed to taking forward. I completely disagree with his comment that the bill is "not fit for purpose". We have listened to the evidence that the committee has taken and have lodged a number of amendments that take into account the evidence that it heard and the recommendations in its report. I simply disagree with Finlay Carson's statement.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I invite Rachael Hamilton to wind up and to press or withdraw amendment 17.

Rachael Hamilton: I will press amendment 17.

I would like to respond to the cabinet secretary's comments, particularly those that she made on amendments 48, 65, 66 and 63.

On amendment 48 and the Food for Life scheme, I cannot understand why the SNP Government will not support children to eat their five a day in school settings by encouraging all schools and all local authorities to adopt the whole-school approach and embedding that in the bill, because we know that independent evaluation has shown that pupils in schools that are engaged with Food for Life are twice as likely to eat their five a day compared with children in matched comparison schools. It would be good to hear why the SNP will not do that, because I do not believe that the reasons that the cabinet secretary has given mean that it is problematic.

I believe that amendments 17 and 19 would strengthen the actions to tackle child poverty, alongside the pilot that the Government has put forward for developing free school meals.

With regard to Ariane Burgess's comments, there was plenty of time in the committee process to have addressed some of the issues that she raised, if the Greens are so passionate about ensuring that children do not go hungry.

On amendment 63, I do not see the problems with the overlapping of local authority boundaries that the cabinet secretary mentioned, because those could be overcome. Amendments on the importance of the outcomes for individuals in receipt of social care were lodged at stage 2. We know that there is a national care strategy coming along, so why does the cabinet secretary not believe that the provision of food is integral to social care, whether it is early years provision, at-home care, crisis care or residential care? It is important that she recognises that the bill should have teeth and ambition but, unfortunately, that has not been delivered by the Scottish Government.

Mairi Gougeon: I reiterate the points that I made earlier in response to Rachael Hamilton. It is not clear from her amendments what they seek to achieve. It is because of that lack of clarity in the language that has been used in the drafting of the amendments that we are not able to support them.

Rachael Hamilton: I press amendment 17.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 17 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division. Members should cast their votes now.

The vote is closed.

Ben Macpherson: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My internet connection did not connect. I would have voted no.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Macpherson. We will ensure that that is recorded.

Stephanie Callaghan (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I, too, would have voted no. My vote was not recorded, either.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you. We will ensure that that is recorded.

Kenneth Gibson (Cunninghame North) (SNP): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I did not have a connection. I would also have voted no.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you. We will ensure that that is recorded.

The Cabinet Secretary for the Constitution, External Affairs and Culture (Angus Robertson): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I would have voted no as well.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you. We will make sure that that is recorded.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)

Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)

Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 46, Against 63, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 17 disagreed to.

17:00

Amendment 1 moved—[Brian Whittle].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 1 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

Pam Duncan-Glancy: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app is showing that I have not voted. I believe that I voted yes.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Ms Duncan-Glancy. We will make sure that that is recorded.

Claire Baker has a point of order. We have connection issues with Ms Baker, so I am afraid that we will just have to proceed.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)

Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)

Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 42, Against 66, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 1 disagreed to.

Amendment 2 moved—[Brian Whittle].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 2 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

Neil Bibby (West Scotland) (Lab): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app did not work. I would have voted yes.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Bibby. We will make sure that that is recorded.

The Cabinet Secretary for Social Justice, Housing and Local Government (Shona Robison): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app did not connect. I would have voted no.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Ms Robison. We will make sure that that is recorded.

Craig Hoy (South Scotland) (Con): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app did not work. I would have voted yes.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Hoy. We will make sure that that is recorded.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)

Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)

Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 40, Against 67, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 2 disagreed to.

Amendment 18 moved—[Mairi Gougeon]—and agreed to.

Amendment 19 moved—[Rachael Hamilton].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 19 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is now closed.

Neil Bibby: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app would not connect again; I would have voted yes.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Bibby. We will ensure that that is recorded.

Ben Macpherson: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My connection failed again. I would have voted no.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Macpherson. We will ensure that that is recorded.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)

Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)

McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 46, Against 63, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 19 disagreed to.

Amendment 48 moved—[Rachael Hamilton].

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 48 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Baker, Claire (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Lab)
 Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)

Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)

Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 46, Against 64, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 48 disagreed to.

Amendment 20 moved—[Mairi Gougeon]—and agreed to.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Group 4 is on matters that are to be taken into account when preparing plans. Amendment 4, in the name of Rachael Hamilton, is grouped with amendments 5, 8 to 10 and 14.

Rachael Hamilton: My amendments on the matters that are to be taken into account when the Government or relevant authorities are preparing good food nation plans seek to allow the bill to be updated when required. That will ensure that the bill can be expanded to adapt to developments. The past two years have been a lesson in how rapidly the world can change, and it is vital that the bills that we pass in the Parliament are suitably adaptable in certain areas to keep up with that. Important legislation should not be allowed to stagnate, and my amendments will provide the necessary flexibility to prevent that from happening.

Amendment 14 would ensure that any updates to the matters that are to be taken into account when preparing plans were subject to the affirmative procedure.

I move amendment 4.

Mairi Gougeon: Rachael Hamilton lodged similar amendments at stage 2, and at that time I set out my concerns regarding their particular wording and asked the member to work with me to identify an alternative wording. I thank her for doing so ahead of stage 3.

Amendments 4, 5, 8 and 9 would adjust the text in sections 1(5) and 7(6) to add further clarity, so that there would be a need to have regard to the specific matters that are listed, “among other things”. Amendment 10 would amend section 7(6) to add the phrase

“any other matter specified by the Scottish Ministers”

to the list of high-level outcomes, which would allow flexibility to add other matters to that list in the future.

I support the amendments and encourage members to support them, too.

Rachael Hamilton: I thank the cabinet secretary for working with me on this group of amendments. I will press them.

Amendment 4 agreed to.

Amendment 5 moved—[Rachael Hamilton]—and agreed to.

Section 1A—Preparation of plan: principles

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Group 5 is on principles. Amendment 21, in the name of Rhoda Grant, is grouped with amendments 22 to 27, 30 to 34 and 67.

Rhoda Grant: I will move amendment 21 and speak to it and to amendments 22, 27, 30, 31 and 34.

Amendments 21 and 30 would ensure that regard must be had to the principles that are outlined not only when preparing plans but when implementing them. Amendment 21 refers to section 1A, which places duties on the Scottish ministers, and amendment 30 refers to section 7A, which refers to health boards, local authorities and other specified public authorities.

One of the principles is

“the fact that adequate food is a human right (as part of the right to an adequate standard of living set out in Article 11 of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights) and essential to the realisation of other human rights”.

Amendments 27 and 34 would strengthen that principle in sections 1A and 7A respectively by adding the phrase

“how the plan can be used to ensure this right is implemented”

to ensure that the plans are used to ensure that the right is implemented in Scotland. As I said, the Government has acknowledged that the bill is a vehicle for ensuring that people have access to their human rights, and therefore it should ensure implementation. Amendments 27 and 34 would do just that.

Amendments 22 and 31 would place a duty on the Scottish ministers to have due regard to good food nation plans, which again would strengthen this part of the bill.

We are supportive of the other amendments in the group, although I ask Rachael Hamilton for clarity on her amendments 24 to 26. It is well understood that processed food can be cheap but laden with fat, salt and sugar and therefore

detrimental to health. However, some foods, especially plant-based foods, can be highly processed when used as a meat substitute, and it could be argued that those foods are still nutritious and essential for those who have a vegetarian or vegan diet. I would like to support amendments 24 to 26, because I believe that the sentiments are right, but I need reassurance from Rachael Hamilton that they will not have unintended consequences.

I move amendment 21.

17:15

Ariane Burgess: My amendments 23 and 33 would make a small change to one of the principles, which was added at stage 2 by the cabinet secretary. The bill states that Scottish ministers and relevant authorities “must have regard” to the principles in preparing their good food nation plans. Principle (b) as drafted is

“the role of sustainable food production in contributing to mitigation of climate change, halting and reversing of loss of biodiversity and improvement in animal welfare”.

My amendments change the phrase “sustainable food production” to

“sustainable food system and supply chain”.

That small change in wording carries significant meaning.

First, it expands the sphere of consideration to include what happens to food after it is produced. That includes food consumption and food waste or reuse. The choices that we all make about the food that we eat and the choices that public bodies make about the food that they procure and serve, and how much of it goes to waste, are crucial factors when it comes to the sustainability of the food system. I believe that that should all be kept under consideration and included in that principle.

Secondly, by explicitly including the supply chain within the principle of sustainability, it recognises the environmental improvements that can be made by, for example, using less packaging and shortening supply chains to reduce emissions from travel and refrigeration, while allowing for flexibility to fit the approach to particular circumstances. That complements the consideration of “resilient supply chains” in principle (e).

My amendment 23 would make that change in relation to the national plan, and amendment 33 would make it in relation to relevant authorities’ plans.

I do not support the other amendments in the group, as I believe that they are unnecessary and do not add significant meaning beyond that which is already in the bill.

Rachael Hamilton: There is a clear and undeniable link between ultra-processed food and poor health outcomes. Amendments 24, 25 and 26 acknowledge that link and provide an impetus for the good food nation plans to include provisions to reduce consumption of those foods in settings where it is possible, through the bill.

I understand the concern that has been raised by Rhoda Grant and, if she will allow me, I will explain what an ultra-processed food is defined as. I think that the concerns are perhaps unfounded, from looking at the concrete definitions of the term from *The BMJ*, the British Heart Foundation, the Soil Association and even the BBC, all of which came to the same conclusion about how the term should be defined.

The Soil Association defines ultra-processed foods as those that

“typically contain little or no whole foods, are ready-to-consume or heat, and are made using industrial additives and processes. They often bear little resemblance to the real foods found in nature. They are often high in fat, salt and added sugar, and depleted in dietary fibre.”

If that description satisfies Rhoda Grant’s concerns, I would appreciate her support for my amendments, because they provide a fantastic opportunity to encourage the consumption of more whole foods while reducing the consumption of less-healthy foods.

My amendment 32 on

“the importance of supply chain transparency, sustainability and traceability”

relates to the need for an enhanced approach to public sector procurement, which the bill has the capacity to achieve. Understanding where our food comes from, how it is procured and the impact of the food that we consume on the environment must be key considerations when the plans are being drawn up. The committee heard evidence to that effect. Those considerations should influence how relevant authorities and the Scottish Government conduct future food procurement. In turn, the amendment would help to foster more sustainable supply chains for public sector bodies and would help to improve the overall quality of the food that they procure.

We will support Ariane Burgess’s amendment. However, I am disappointed that we went through all the stages without any discussion from the Greens regarding some of the amendments that have been lodged at this stage.

Monica Lennon: Bear with me, Presiding Officer—I am drowning in paper. [*Interruption.*] I am sorry, but I am afraid that I have managed to lose my piece of paper on this, Presiding Officer. However, I know that my amendment 67 is not going to be supported by SNP and Green members. It fits with the amendment that was

discussed during an earlier grouping, and it is about trying to embed the rights of children and young people into the bill. I reached out to colleagues as recently as last night, so it is disappointing that the amendment is not going to get support, but I hope that what the cabinet secretary said earlier about the Government’s willingness to work beyond the bill passing is something that we can take at face value.

Mairi Gougeon: Amendments 21 and 30 would require the Scottish ministers and relevant authorities respectively to have regard to the principles set out in sections 1A and 7A when implementing the good food nation plans, in addition to the current requirement to have regard to the principles when preparing the plans. The existing duty to have regard to the principles when preparing the good food nation plans will ensure that consideration will be given to the principles when implementing the plans, as the policies included in the plans will have been prepared having had regard to the principles.

Amendments 22 and 31 propose changing the duty in sections 1A and 7A from “have regard” to “have due regard”. I set out clearly at stage 2 the Scottish Government’s position that the appropriate legal duty is to “have regard to” because that is a meaningful legal requirement and there is an obligation to consider that matter when we are making a decision.

Amendments 27 and 34 propose amending sections 1A and 7A to add wording about ensuring that the right to adequate food is implemented. Sections 1A and 7A start with the duty on Scottish ministers to have regard to the principles when preparing their plans, so there is already that need to have regard to that right when formulating the plans. For those reasons, I ask members not to support these amendments.

Rachael Hamilton’s amendments 24, 25 and 26 propose the addition of wording to section 1A in relation to ultra-processed foods. I reiterate what I have said in previous discussions on amendments, that this is a framework bill and the place for such detail is in the good food nation plans themselves. The principles in the bill are intentionally high level, so adding text on a specific issue such as this would not be appropriate. It is also not clear what “natural” means in relation to food. The word “nutritious”, which is already in section 1A(c) and section 7A(c), is broad enough to ensure that food is healthy, and the Scottish ministers and relevant authorities will have to have regard to that when preparing their plans.

Ariane Burgess’s amendments 23 and 33 would replace the words “sustainable food production” with

“a sustainable food system and supply chain”

in sections 1A(b) and 7A(b). I support those amendments. If members were to agree to that change, the intention behind amendment 32 with regard to adding wording about supply chain transparency, sustainability and traceability to section 7A would be addressed.

Monica Lennon's amendment 67 proposes adding wording to section 7A in relation to article 24 of the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child. However, the amendment does not accurately reflect the wording of article 24, which does not give a right to high-quality, nutritious food. The right set out in the article is to the

"enjoyment of the highest attainable standard of health and to facilities for the treatment of illness and rehabilitation of health."

It goes on to require state parties to pursue implementation of that right and take appropriate measures, including

"To combat disease and malnutrition ... through the provision of adequate nutritious foods".

Accepting amendment 67 would place a requirement on relevant authorities to explain in their plan how they intend to do something that they are not presently under a duty to do. For those reasons, I urge members not to support amendment 67.

In summary, I ask members to support amendments 23 and 33 and not to support the remainder of the amendments in the group.

Rhoda Grant: I intend to press amendment 21, and I am happy to support Rachael Hamilton's amendments, given the assurances that she provided. I share her concerns about the very late amendments from the Greens. They accuse other members, such as Monica Lennon, of lodging late amendments, but they do so themselves.

I am disappointed that the minister has rejected my amendments, as I believe that they would strengthen the bill. The bill is incredibly timid, and it is quite sad that the Government will not accept amendments that would make it much better. That is highlighted by the minister's rejection of amendments from me and Monica Lennon that would enhance people's existing human right to food.

The Presiding Officer (Alison Johnstone): The question is, that amendment 21 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The Minister for Mental Wellbeing and Social Care (Kevin Stewart): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app has not worked. I would have voted no.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Stewart. We will ensure that that is recorded.

Brian Whittle: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app has not connected. I would have voted yes.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Whittle. We will ensure that that is recorded.

Stephanie Callaghan: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app is not working. I would have voted no.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Ms Callaghan. We will ensure that that is recorded.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)

Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 45, Against 64, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 21 disagreed to.

Amendment 22 moved—[Rhoda Grant].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 22 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

Pam Duncan-Glancy: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app would not connect. I would have voted yes.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Ms Duncan-Glancy. We will ensure that that is recorded.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)

Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and
 Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse)
 (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine)
 (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley)
 (SNP)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 46, Against 62, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 22 disagreed to.

17:30

Amendment 23 moved—[Ariane Burgess]—and agreed to.

Amendment 24 moved—[Rachael Hamilton].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 24 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is now closed.

Stephanie Callaghan: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app froze. I would have voted no.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Ms Callaghan. We will make sure that that is recorded.

Neil Bibby: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I had problems with the app. I would have voted yes.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Bibby. We will ensure that that is recorded.

Edward Mountain (Highlands and Islands) (Con): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app was frozen as well—it does not seem to be working very well. I would have voted yes.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Mountain. We will ensure that that is recorded.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire)
 (Con)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)

White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)
Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley)

(SNP)
Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 43; Against 67; Abstentions 0.

Amendment 24 disagreed to.

Amendment 25 moved—[Rachael Hamilton].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 25 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)

Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 43; Against 67; Abstentions 0.

Amendment 25 disagreed to.

The Presiding Officer: Members will note that we are nearing the next time limit. In order to allow debate on groups 6 and 7, I am minded to accept

a motion without notice, under rule 9.8.5A, that the time limit for groups 4 to 7 be extended by 30 minutes.

Motion moved,

That, under rule 9.8.5A, the time limit for groups 4 to 7 be extended by 30 minutes.—[*Mairi Gougeon*]

Motion agreed to.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you. We hope to get that time back.

Amendment 26 moved—[Rachael Hamilton].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 26 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is now closed.

Stuart McMillan (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app did not connect. I would have voted no.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr McMillan. We will ensure that that is recorded.

Ruth Maguire (Cunninghame South) (SNP): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I would have voted no.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Ms Maguire. We will ensure that that is recorded.

The Minister for Children and Young People (Clare Haughey): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I would have voted no.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Ms Haughey. We will ensure that that is recorded.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)

Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)

Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 42, Against 68, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 26 disagreed to.

Amendment 27 moved—[Rhoda Grant].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 27 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is now closed.

Katy Clark (West Scotland) (Lab): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app did not work. I would have voted yes.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Ms Clark. We will ensure that that is recorded.

For

Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)

Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Abstentions

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Dowe, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)

Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 19, Against 65, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 27 disagreed to.

Section 1B—Requirement to lay proposed plan before the Parliament

Amendments 49 and 50 moved—[Colin Smyth]—and agreed to.

The Presiding Officer: Group 6 is on specifying new bodies. Amendment 51, in the name of Rachael Hamilton, is grouped with amendments 58 and 62. I call Rachael Hamilton to move amendment 51 and speak to all amendments in the group.

Rachael Hamilton: My amendment on publishing

“information about any public authority that the Scottish ministers intend to specify in regulations under”

the relevant section

“and the timescale for making the regulations”

seeks to encourage greater transparency of good food nation plans. The publication of that information will allow for a greater level of scrutiny over the plans and their implementation, particularly in relation to timescales for delivery. Ensuring that relevant authorities and the Scottish Government are held to account over the delivery of the plans is paramount. To vote against the amendment would undoubtedly suggest an intention to evade accountability over the delivery of the aims of the bill.

Amendment 62 in my name seeks to include integration joint boards—IJBs—as a relevant authority, as supported by The Food Train. The Scottish Food Coalition, which has been very involved in the process of the bill with all parties, has also called for the inclusion of IJBs as a relevant authority.

We know the preventative importance of food for health and wellbeing, so amendment 62 would ensure that provisions explicitly cover social care,

given the lack of statutory requirements on IJBs to produce a food plan.

The IJBs will become community health and social care boards. They should be required to produce good food nation plans, as they oversee the delivery of all community health and social care services and support within their local area, monitoring and improving impact, performance and outcomes for people.

I move amendment 51.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Ms Hamilton. Before I move on to the next speaker, I advise the chamber that abstentions were omitted in the vote results on amendment 27. For clarity, the result was: For 19, Against 65, Abstentions 26.

I call Colin Smyth.

Colin Smyth: Our IJBs oversee the delivery of community health and social care; therefore, we very much support their inclusion as a relevant authority in the bill. The provision of good food is integral to care, as well as for hospital discharges and food security in home care, crisis care, care at home, residential or nursing care. Amendment 62 ensures that such joint bodies do not slip through the net, and that they have either to produce their own good food nation plans or have their delegated functions addressed by the parent authority plans. That point is not currently clear in the bill.

Our health and social care partnerships produce plans in a host of areas that relate to care, so it makes no sense for good food nation plans not to be one of those areas. IJBs are best placed to lead on plans that relate to adult social care, so Scottish Labour very much supports the amendments in this group.

Mairi Gougeon: In relation to Rachael Hamilton's amendments 51 and 62, a requirement was put in place at stage 2 by Karen Adam's amendment 59 for consultation before regulations are made to add a new body to the list of relevant authorities. Setting out an intention to do so, as described in Ms Hamilton's amendments, would be pre-empting the results of any such consultation. In addition, adding a new relevant authority is subject to the affirmative procedure, so there would be an opportunity for scrutiny of the regulations at that point.

That would also apply to amendment 62, which proposes to add integration joint boards to the list of relevant authorities. It would be preferable to carry out a consultation before adding any new relevant authorities, as will be required if, as I hope, members agree to pass the bill. In addition, the forthcoming national care service bill could likely result in changes to the format and status of

IJBs, so their inclusion at this stage would be premature.

For those reasons, I ask members not to support amendments 51, 58 and 62.

The Presiding Officer: I call Rachael Hamilton to wind up and to press or withdraw amendment 51.

Rachael Hamilton: Clearly, I do not agree with what the cabinet secretary has said. IJBs are an important relevant authority and they should have parity with other relevant authorities in the scope of the bill.

I do not believe that we should wait for a pre-emption of consultation results, because there are enough stakeholders out there that agree that IJBs are important to the delivery of the bill.

I will press amendment 51.

17:45

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 51 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division. Members should cast their votes now.

The vote is closed.

Tess White (North East Scotland) (Con): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I would have voted yes.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Ms White. We will ensure that that is recorded.

Fulton MacGregor (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app lost connection. I would have voted no.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr MacGregor. We will ensure that that is recorded.

Clare Haughey: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I would have voted no.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Ms Haughey. We will ensure that that is recorded.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)

Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)

Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division on amendment 51, in the name of Rachael Hamilton, is: For 45, Against 63, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 51 disagreed to.

Amendment 52 moved—[Colin Smyth]—and agreed to.

After section 1B

The Presiding Officer: We move to group 7, which is on the healthy basket guarantee. Amendment 53, in the name of Rachael Hamilton, is in a group on its own. I call Rachael Hamilton to move and speak to amendment 53.

Rachael Hamilton: Amendment 53 would ensure that a healthy basket guarantee is considered when good food nation plans are drawn up. The healthy basket guarantee encourages retailers to ensure that healthy food items, such as fresh fruit and veg, remain at affordable prices, in order to encourage healthier eating. Although that does not pertain exclusively to public sector bodies, the example that I give is that, during the pandemic, there were occasions when food had to be procured by the public sector from the private sector for individuals such as those who were shielding. It was widely reported that that food was not nutritionally adequate. The healthy basket guarantee would ensure that, if such schemes were to be repeated—which they might be—the best value for money options would always provide a high level of nutritional adequacy for those who have to rely on them.

Furthermore, the priorities of the bill have progressed since it was introduced at stage 1, because the issues have been exacerbated by the cost of living crisis, and that could provide a deeper understanding of food insecurity.

I move amendment 53.

Mairi Gougeon: I am of the view that amendment 53 should not be supported. This is a framework bill; the place for such a level of detail is in the good food nation plans. In addition, the term “healthy basket guarantee” is not defined. It is therefore not clear what the amendment, which would place a legal duty on the Scottish ministers, actually requires them to do. I urge members not to support amendment 53.

Rachael Hamilton: Once again, the Scottish Government is not supporting me on what is a proportionate measure to ensure that food security and the cost of living crisis are tackled and that people have the ability to access fresh fruit and vegetables at affordable prices, thereby encouraging healthy eating.

I intend to press amendment 53.

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 53 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division. Members should cast their votes now.

The vote is closed.

Kevin Stewart: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app seems to have failed. I would have voted no.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Stewart. We will ensure that that is recorded.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)

Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)

Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 47, Against 61, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 53 disagreed to.

Section 2—Preparation of plan: consultation

The Presiding Officer: Group 8 is on consultation. Amendment 54, in the name of Colin Smyth, is grouped with amendments 55, 55A and 59 to 61.

Colin Smyth: Amendments 54, 55, 55A and 59 to 61, in my name, would require the consultation process undertaken by the Scottish ministers on the development of the national good food nation plan to be as wide, inclusive and participatory as possible.

Amendment 54 would enable the participation of people with a range of lived experience of food-related issues. As we have discussed in relation to previous amendments, food policy is not just a matter for big, private food producers; it impacts on everyone's lives—from their health to decent standards in our workplaces and from the impact on our environment to animal welfare.

Amendment 55 would amend section 2 to add a new subsection requiring the Scottish ministers

“when laying the proposed national good food plan before the Scottish Parliament”

to

“publish a statement ... summarising ... the consultation process undertaken ... and ... any responses to the consultation”

and to set out how they had regard to those responses in the preparation of the plan.

Amendment 55A would require the statement to set out how the Scottish ministers had ensured that such consultation was “accessible and inclusive”.

Amendments 59 and 61 are consequential to amendment 55 and ensure that provisions relating to the preparation of the plan would also apply

when revising the plan. Amendment 60 would amend section 6 of the bill, as amended, to remove a reference to the subsections removed by amendment 52. Given the range of stakeholders with an interest in good food nation plans, it is important that any consultation is comprehensive and inclusive. The amendments in my name seek to achieve just that.

I move amendment 54.

Mairi Gougeon: I will speak to amendment 55 first, because if that is agreed to—as I hope that it will be—it would, as Colin Smyth has outlined, require Scottish ministers to publish a statement when weighing the proposed national good food nation plan, summarising the consultation process, any responses to it and setting out how section 2(1)(b) of the bill, as amended at stage 2, and what will become section 2(3) of the bill, if amendment 6 in the name of Rachael Hamilton is agreed to, have been complied with.

I support amendment 55 and the consequential amendments 59 and 61. I also support amendment 60.

I turn to amendments 54 and 55A, which are also in the name of Colin Smyth. As I set out at stage 2, I do not support making specific provision about who should be consulted, as Mr Smyth has done in amendment 54. It is our view that it is not practical to list everyone who should be consulted in the bill and that the inclusion of a partial list might inadvertently give the impression that those who are listed are of greater importance or should be given greater weight than those who are not listed.

Amendment 55A would require the statement referred to in amendment 55 to include information outlining the efforts made to ensure that the consultation was “accessible and inclusive”. That is unnecessary: the requirement to consult is already very broad and, in combination with amendment 6, lodged by Rachael Hamilton, amendment 55 already requires ministers to set out how they have complied with the requirement to communicate in an inclusive way. I also have concerns that the term “accessible” as used in amendment 55A is not defined.

For those reasons I urge members not to support amendments 54 and 55A. However, I encourage members to support amendments 55, 59, 60 and 61 in this group.

Colin Smyth: The consultation on good food plans undertaken by the relevant authorities needs to be wide, inclusive and participatory. It needs to enable the participation of specific groups, such as those who are vulnerable to food insecurity, people with protected characteristics, and those with experience of food-related issues. That is

what the amendments in this group seek to deliver.

Earlier, we had a debate over the fact that the Government had given private food companies a statutory authority when it comes to the implementation of good food nation plans—an authority that it will not give to any other stakeholders. The cabinet secretary has just said that we should not single out a particular sector, but by failing to support amendment 54, which seeks the views of those with lived experience, such as people with an interest in fair work, the cabinet secretary is doing just that. Frankly, it is hypocritical to say that, in the implementation, we should single out a particular sector, but when it comes to producing the plans, we should not get the views of those with lived experience.

The failure of the SNP and the Greens to support amendment 54 shows a lack of priority when it comes to the development of good food nation plans. I press amendment 54.

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 54 be agreed to. Are we all agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is now closed.

18:00

Paul O’Kane (West Scotland) (Lab): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app would not connect, and I would have voted yes.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr O’Kane. We will ensure that that is recorded.

Ben Macpherson: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I would be grateful if you could check if my vote has been registered; if not, I would have voted no.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Macpherson. We will check that.

Tess White: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I would have voted yes.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Ms White. We will ensure that that is recorded.

Mr Macpherson, I confirm that your vote has been recorded.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)

Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)

MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the vote on amendment 54, in the name of Colin Smyth, is: For 46, Against 63, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 54 disagreed to.

The Presiding Officer: Group 9 is on the importance of communicating in particular ways. Amendment 6, in the name of Rachael Hamilton, is grouped with amendments 56, 7, 11, 68, 12, 40, 13 and 43.

Rachael Hamilton: Amendments 6, 7, 11, 12, 13 and 43, which are in my name, all aim to ensure that Scottish ministers and relevant authorities

“have regard to the importance of communicating in an inclusive way.”

If the Scottish Government wishes to fulfil its ambition to make consultation on the good food nation plans as wide, inclusive and participatory as possible, amendments on inclusive communication should be accepted and welcomed by all parties in Parliament. The amendments in my name set out that regard must be had to that when consulting on the draft good food nation plans, when publishing any document under sections 1 to 6 or sections 7 to 12, and when consulting on regulations under sections 4, 7(2)(c) or 10.

Amendment 13 provides a definition of the term

“communicating in an inclusive way”.

Presiding Officer, would you like me to speak to section 16(1A) of the bill?

The Presiding Officer: Please feel free to speak to all the amendments that you wish to speak to in the group.

Rachael Hamilton: Thank you for that clarification. Section 16 relates to regulation-making powers and requires that, before making any regulations under sections 4, 7(2)(c) or 10, Scottish ministers must consult persons whom they “consider appropriate” and “have regard to” the responses.

The purpose and effect of amendment 43 is to amend subsection 16(1A) to provide that

“In consulting under subsection (1A), the Scottish Ministers must have regard to the importance of communicating in an inclusive way.”

I move amendment 6.

The Presiding Officer: I call Monica Lennon to speak to amendment 56 and other amendments in the group.

Monica Lennon: I will speak to amendments 56 and 68. I welcome Rachael Hamilton’s amendments and confirm that Labour will support them. As I said earlier, the rights of children and young people should be at the heart of Scotland’s plans to become a good food nation. Amendments 56 and 68 would require Scottish ministers and relevant authorities to

“have regard to the importance of communicating in a way that is effective in engaging children and young people”

when consulting on good food nation plans.

I previously introduced proposals at stage 2 that were similar to amendments 56 and 68; unfortunately, they were not supported. Following further discussion with the cabinet secretary, I believe that we have reached a position of agreement on the amendments, so I hope that members will support amendments 56 and 68.

Amendments 56 and 68 are intended to ensure that consultation is carried out in a way that takes account of the fact that there might be a need to take a different approach to consultation in order to encourage children and young people to take part. The amendments are intended to help to ensure that the voices of children and young people are heard.

The Presiding Officer: I will stop you for a moment, Ms Lennon. I am very aware of various conversations that are taking place around the chamber. I would be grateful if members would do Ms Lennon the courtesy of listening. Please continue, Ms Lennon.

Monica Lennon: I really appreciate that, Presiding Officer, because you can probably hear that I am struggling with my voice today. We are talking about the importance of communication, which obviously requires good listening skills.

I am grateful to the STUC and other organisations that have backed amendments 56 and 68, which are linked to other amendments to which I have spoken already. Together with Rachael Hamilton's amendments, they are important, because they will strengthen the bill.

Ariane Burgess: I support Rachael Hamilton's amendments in group 9, which will require the Scottish ministers and relevant authorities to have regard to communicating in an inclusive way, and Monica Lennon's amendments, which highlight the need sometimes to take a tailored approach in order to communicate effectively and inclusively with young people.

The Rural Affairs, Islands and Natural Environment Committee report noted that consultations on the good food nation plans should be as inclusive as possible to ensure that they draw on a wide range of perspectives, knowledge and experiences—for example, the lived experience of workers in the food supply chain or people who are facing food insecurity, and the knowledge of people who have first-hand experience of food policies in other countries.

I welcome the amendments, which will extend the principle of inclusivity to many aspects of the good food nation process through inclusive communication.

My amendment 40 would, if agreed to, provide that the food commission would have to

"have regard to the importance of communicating in an inclusive way"

when publishing documents. That relates to amendments in group 11 on the establishment of the food commission, which I will speak to later. The purpose of amendment 40 is to provide consistency in relation to the importance of inclusive communication and to embed the importance of inclusive communication in the work of the food commission.

Mairi Gougeon: At stage 2, I asked Rachael Hamilton to work with me prior to stage 3 to find a workable alternative to her amendments on inclusive communication that were lodged at stage 2. As I have previously set out, the Scottish Government's approach to consultation will be as open, accessible and inclusive as possible. I am very pleased that Rachael Hamilton has worked with me to find wording that will be workable in practice. I welcome and support her amendments and Ariane Burgess's related amendment 40.

On Monica Lennon's amendments 56 and 68, I have had productive discussions with her since stage 2, including on the importance of consulting children and young people. I support her amendments 56 and 68, which relate to the importance of communicating in a way that is effective in engaging children and young people.

Rachael Hamilton: I thank my colleagues and the cabinet secretary for engaging so positively. It is quite amazing what we can do when we work together. I also thank Camphill Scotland, which believes that the amendments in the group are important. Obviously, all of us here today agree with it.

My party and I will support all the amendments in the group.

Amendment 6 agreed to.

Amendment 55 moved—[Colin Smyth].

Amendment 55A moved—[Colin Smyth].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 55A be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division. Members should cast their votes now.

The vote is now closed.

Kevin Stewart: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app has not worked. I would have voted no.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Stewart. We will ensure that that is recorded.

Maggie Chapman (North East Scotland) (Green): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I would have voted no.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Ms Chapman. We will ensure that that is recorded.

For

Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carlaw, Jackson (Eastwood) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Dowe, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)

Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)

Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 44, Against 63, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 55A disagreed to.

The Presiding Officer: Colin Smyth—do you wish to press or withdraw amendment 55?

Colin Smyth: I press amendment 55.

Amendment 55 agreed to.

Amendment 56 moved—[Monica Lennon]—and agreed to.

Section 5—Reporting

The Presiding Officer: Group 10 is on review and report. Amendment 57, in the name of Colin Smyth, is grouped with amendments 69 to 71.

Colin Smyth: Amendment 57 seeks to ensure that Scottish ministers are required to report on the outcome from the national good food nation plans and the actions that they will take if policies are insufficient to achieve those outcomes.

The amendment would mean greater accountability for the Scottish Government on delivering good food nation plans and would ensure that both achievements and any lack of progress can be properly scrutinised by Parliament, along with the actions that ministers intend to take to remedy any lack of process.

I am grateful to the cabinet secretary for working with me on the detail of the amendment.

I move amendment 57.

Rachael Hamilton: My amendment 69, on the procurement of food by relevant authorities, aims to champion local produce, with rules on local public procurement being strengthened through the bill.

Members will notice that amendment 69 refers to the provenance of food, particularly the postcode. It is about ensuring that even small

suppliers that are under the £1,000 limit, which are currently not recorded by local authorities, are able to be part of the process. It also requires relevant authorities to set out the spend on their food procurement.

Authorities should have an understanding of where their food comes from, and local food producers should, where possible, always be preferred to producers from further away. The environmental argument for that is clear and I cannot see why members would not support the amendment.

There is a strong economic case for greater levels of local procurement. The Scottish Government wants to champion a circular economy and the amendment provides a fantastic opportunity for local resources to be spent on local produce—putting money into local businesses for the benefit of local communities. It is absolutely key to unlocking the potential of the bill, making it work for authorities, local businesses, the environment, and the people who, at the end of the day, will be consuming more high-quality, nutritious local produce.

On amendment 71, I refer members to amendments 62 and 63.

18:15

Mairi Gougeon: At stage 2, I asked Colin Smyth to work with me prior to stage 3 to discuss how to address, in the progress reports, any areas where outcomes are not being achieved. I have had productive discussions with him on the matter and I support his amendment 57.

I turn to Rachael Hamilton's amendment 69. Aside from the additional bureaucratic burden that the provision would place on relevant authorities to record the information that is required, I also have concerns about the drafting of the amendment. For example, is "locally" defined as being in the local authority area or from within Scotland? It also leaves questions as to how to deal with food that comprises components that originate from multiple locations.

Amendment 70 would require relevant authorities' progress reports to

"include information on how the relevant authority has ensured that food it procures has been procured locally and sustainably."

The principles that are set out in section 7A already require each relevant authority to "have regard to" both the role of sustainable food production and the fact that each part of the food system and supply chain plays a significant role in the provision of food. The aim of amendment 70 is already covered, which means that it is not needed.

I also have a concern that the use of the word "ensured" in the amendment suggests that there is an obligation on relevant authorities to procure local and sustainable food. Such an obligation does not currently exist, and adding a requirement for relevant authorities to report on how they have ensured that food is produced locally and sustainably would not be an appropriate way to impose such a duty.

For those reasons, I do not support amendments 69 and 70.

There are also issues with the wording of amendment 71, similar to those that I mentioned in relation to amendment 63 in Rachael Hamilton's name. The first part of the amendment would mean that the progress report, which the relevant authority must prepare by virtue of section 11, would have to

"set out how the relevant authority has worked with other relevant authorities in its area to share good practice".

It is not clear what that would mean in practice. For example, does "its area" mean in exactly the same area? What about areas where there is overlap with other relevant authorities or areas that are in close proximity or adjacent to one another?

The second part of the amendment then appears to link the sharing of good practice with a specific outcome in relation to social care. The aim of the wording is not clear.

Aside from issues with the wording, I reiterate the point that this is a framework bill. Therefore, the place for detail in relation to specific outcomes will be in the good food nation plans.

The progress reports must set out progress that is being made towards achieving the outcomes in the plans, so there is already a mechanism by which that will be captured. In addition, the reference to section 7(3)(a) should, I think, be a reference to section 7(4)(a).

In summary, I ask members to support Colin Smyth's amendment 57 but not to support Rachael Hamilton's amendments 69 to 71.

Brian Whittle: I listened with interest to the cabinet secretary's response to Rachael Hamilton's amendments, particularly amendment 69, which refers to setting out

"what proportion of its food is procured from ... within the local authority ... within Scotland"

and

"within the rest of the United Kingdom".

We can already get that information. Five years ago, I asked all 32 local authorities what they procure and where they procure from, and they were able to tell me every single item of food that

came into the public procurement process. I do not understand why the cabinet secretary objects to amendment 69.

Mairi Gougeon: I believe that I answered the points that Brian Whittle has just made when outlining my position on Rachael Hamilton's amendments. I made a point about the bureaucratic burden should the amendments be agreed to; there is also the issue in relation to the definition and the wording that are used.

The Presiding Officer: I call Colin Smyth to wind up and to press or withdraw amendment 57.

Colin Smyth: I am happy to press amendment 57.

Amendment 57 agreed to.

Amendment 58 moved—[Rachael Hamilton].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 58 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)

Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lochhead, Richard (Moray) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 44, Against 64, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 58 disagreed to.

Section 6—Review and revision of plan

Amendments 59 to 61 moved—[Colin Smyth]— and agreed to.

The Presiding Officer: Group 11 is on a Scottish food commission. Amendment 28, in the name of Ariane Burgess, is grouped with amendments 35 to 37, 37A, 38, 39, 41, 42 and 44 to 46.

Ariane Burgess: My amendments in the group add provisions to establish a food commission, which would provide an oversight and scrutiny role in relation to the delivery of the bill's provisions. Consideration of the need for a food commission is part of the Bute house agreement, and the issue has been discussed throughout the bill process, with a wide range of views having been expressed. I welcome the cabinet secretary's approach, which has involved working with committee members and others and listening to the views that have been expressed on the preferred approach. She has worked with me to deliver our shared commitment to the Bute house agreement.

My amendments 36, 37 and 38 set out provisions relating to the establishment, functions and independence of the commission. Amendment 39 sets out provisions relating to the funding and financial assistance that the

“Scottish Ministers may provide ... to the Commission.”

The functions of the commission, which are set out in amendment 37, are, among other things, to scrutinise, to make recommendations relating to good food nation plans and progress reports, to conduct research and to provide advice to the Scottish ministers and relevant authorities in carrying out their duties under the bill. The provisions aim to capture the range of views that were expressed on what the commission's functions should be and to provide the necessary oversight that the committee and a wide range of stakeholders want to be included in the bill.

Finlay Carson: Does the member agree that it was somewhat disrespectful to the work of the committee that the Government's amendment was lodged at the very last minute? That allowed us to provide no scrutiny whatsoever of such an important part of the bill.

Ariane Burgess: There has been no disrespect. There has been a long, drawn-out and on-going process to try to discover the correct approach. That is what I am setting out today.

Amendment 38 sets out that the commission is

“not subject to the direction or control of any member of the Scottish Government”.

That is intended to provide the level of independent scrutiny that has been one of the main drivers for establishing a food commission.

Amendment 39 sets out provisions in relation to funding and financial assistance that may be provided by the Scottish ministers.

Amendment 46 provides a schedule that sets out the detail with regard to the constitutional operation of the commission. That includes provisions on the status of the commission; the powers that it has to carry out its functions; details of the procedures associated with the commission; accountability; and the number of members of the commission. The new schedule also sets out information relevant to terms and conditions, remuneration, the appointment of staff, the application of legislation relating to public bodies and the amendments that are needed as a consequence of setting up the commission.

Amendments 28 and 35 are consequential amendments that relate to the requirement on the Scottish ministers and relevant authorities, when reviewing good food nation plans, to have regard to recommendations that the commission makes.

Amendments 44 and 45 are consequential amendments that set out that regulations under the section that is introduced by amendment 37 and under part 5 of the schedule, as introduced by amendment 46, are subject to the affirmative procedure. I believe that that is appropriate, because the regulations concerning the functions and composition of the commission are of sufficient significance to warrant active parliamentary approval.

My amendments set out detailed provisions in the bill for the establishment of a statutory food commission. They reflect the views of the committee and parliamentary colleagues from across the chamber and those of our partner organisations, such as the Scottish Food Coalition. The amendments also represent the culmination of the commitment in the Bute house agreement to consider the need for a statutory body such as the food commission. It is for those reasons that I strongly urge Parliament to accept my amendments.

Colin Smyth's amendment 37A would amend my amendment 37 to require that the commission, when carrying out its functions as described in amendment 37, must have regard to the principles set out in section 1A. That amendment is not needed, because the food commission will have an oversight role and, therefore, in carrying out functions such as scrutinising plans and progress reports, it would not be required to have regard to

the principles. I ask the Parliament not to support amendment 37A.

Rachael Hamilton's amendments 41 and 42 are identical except for the fact that one contains a proposed new subsection (6)(f). That was dependent on her amendment 16, which would have set out a purpose of the plans, being accepted. Ms Hamilton's amendments would set out regulation-making powers to establish a food commission rather than, as in my amendments, the detail of the constitution and operation of a food commission. It is for those reasons that I ask Parliament not to support the amendments in Rachael Hamilton's name.

In summary, I ask members not to support the amendments in the names of Colin Smyth and Rachael Hamilton, and, for the reasons that I have set out, I strongly urge members to accept the amendments in my name to establish a food commission.

I move amendment 28.

Colin Smyth: The fact that Labour supports amendments to establish an independent Scottish food commission will not come as a surprise to anyone. It is a key element of my colleague Rhoda Grant's proposed member's bill on a right to food and that of Elaine Smith in the previous session of Parliament.

At stage 2, Rhoda Grant and I lodged amendments to deliver such a commission only for Green and SNP MSPs to vote them down. I am pleased that, thanks to relentless campaigning by members of the Scottish Food Coalition, the Greens and SNP have been forced to U-turn and now back the establishment of a commission. We therefore will not see the Greens ditch yet another manifesto commitment as they ditched the commitment to enshrine the right to food through the bill.

However, unfortunately, as a result of the failure to back a commission earlier and the inclusion of such a major element of the bill on the last day of consideration of amendments, there has been no opportunity for any meaningful scrutiny of the detailed proposal. Ironically, Ariane Burgess complained about that earlier with regard to less-detailed amendments. Parts of her amendments are concerning, such as the provision to have as few as three commissioners, which was never proposed by anybody during the consultation on the bill. It is important that the commission has expertise across the whole food system, and limiting the number of commissioners might restrict its ability to represent all food-related issues.

Perhaps Ms Burgess can explain in her closing comments why there is a limit on the number of members when we do not, for example, set a limit

on the number of members of the Scottish Land Commission. Could she also explain who actually supported that limit at any time during the consultation on the bill? I am also concerned that the amendment seeks to limit the work of the commission to that related to the content of good food nation plans, so it is unclear whether the commission will be limited in how it is able to respond if those plans exclude important matters relating to food policy.

18:30

My amendment 37A seeks to address that concern, to an extent, and to focus the work of the commission on the principles that inform the preparation of the plans, which are in sections 1A and 7A of the bill, irrespective of whether those principles are properly reflected in good food nation plans, reinforcing the importance of those principles.

Ariane Burgess says that amendment 37A is not necessary, but that is not the view of the Scottish Food Coalition, which makes a mockery of her claim to be listening to stakeholders. I therefore urge members to support my amendment, to make sure that the Scottish food commission is as effective as possible in providing expert advice and supporting Parliament in its scrutiny of Scotland's progress towards becoming a good food nation.

Rachael Hamilton: Members will be aware of what seems to be some cross-party consensus on the need for the establishment of a Scottish food commission to provide oversight and ensure that we get the most from the bill.

Amendment 41, in my name, is based on the evidence provided by Dimbleby's important work on the UK national food strategy. The commission would consult a range of stakeholders from agricultural associations and organisations to prison boards and everything in between. Those stakeholders are best placed to understand what works best for their respective industries and roles within the public, private and third sectors. That will guide the implementation of the good food nation plans and ensure that they deliver for Scotland.

We, in the chamber, know that the Scottish Government has often been found guilty of marking its own homework—Marine Scotland during the Clyde fisheries fiasco, the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development's assessment of NHS Scotland dealing with poor performance, the Scottish Qualifications Authority's exam chaos. It is absolutely imperative that those mistakes are not repeated with the Scottish food commission and that it is allowed to

operate truly independently of the Scottish Government.

I understand that Ariane Burgess has submitted an amendment that is similar to amendment 41, and I am absolutely sympathetic to the aims of that amendment. However, given that she represents a party of Government, I was disappointed about the manner in which her amendments came about. As I said in my speech in committee at stage 2, I was thankful to the Scottish Government for meeting me to discuss the matter of a Scottish food commission and offering a collegiate approach to that, among other things.

The Greens' decision to vote against any amendments from Labour and the Conservatives relating to the establishment of a food commission or to the office of a commissioner was surprising, however, and Ariane Burgess did not attempt to approach any Opposition members regarding her amendment on the matter. She described it as a long, drawn-out approach, but that is just poppycock. It was just that the Greens remained opposed to a commission at stages 1 and 2, and they remained deathly silent with a lack of transparency. A refusal to seek input from people who were evidently sympathetic to the aims of the amendment was disappointing and regrettable.

We should be taking every opportunity to work together on the bill, which has taken six years to come to fruition. We should take that approach at all stages when it relates to common threads and themes that we all agree with in terms of our values. I hope that, going forward, the Greens will think somewhat on their duplicitous approach to amending legislation, particularly given the work that has been done on the bill by people on the Labour benches and all the people who have been so involved in it, particularly the Scottish Food Coalition and the WWF among many others.

Rhoda Grant: I welcome the change of heart by Ariane Burgess and the cabinet secretary, who voted against a food commission at stage 2. Although they have tried to clip the wings of the commission before it gets started, I believe that the calibre of the commissioners will make sure that it works.

I agree that the process of drafting the amendment was a stitch-up—I suspected it and said as much at stage 2. Despite the assurances to the contrary from the cabinet secretary, that is simply what happened.

I put on the record my thanks to campaigners such as the Scottish Food Coalition, the Co-operative Party, Elaine Smith and many others whose sustained campaigning has forced the Government into this very welcome U-turn.

Finlay Carson: At stage 2, a number of members proposed amendments to the bill that would have seen the introduction of a new Scottish food commission to provide greater oversight. At that stage, as at stage 1, the cabinet secretary said that she was not in a position to support the amendments but that the intention was that oversight would be addressed conclusively by the Government by the end of the bill process. There was, after all, plenty of time to do that and for it to come before the committee at stage 2.

At that time, I expressed my disappointment at the way in which the process had been handled. The commission could play a pivotal role in supporting the delivery of the good food nation plans, and it is something that a substantial number of stakeholders have called for. The Scottish Government had ample time when drafting the legislation to consider the inclusion of a food commission but opted not to do so. If the inclusion of a food commission was integral to the governance of the good food nation plans, why was it not included in the bill so that the committee and stakeholders could have scrutinised the proposals properly?

It is also hypocritical of Ariane Burgess to criticise others for last-minute stage 3 amendments when her own amendments should have been scrutinised at the committee stage. That sets a worrying precedent whereby we are presented with framework legislation that contains limited details using plans that are defined in secondary legislation to drive policy development.

We then had a major addition to the bill announced days before the stage 3 debate, providing limited scope for scrutiny. Although the cabinet secretary wrote to the committee to confirm her intention to support a food commission, the letter included no information to assist the Parliament's scrutiny of the legislative proposals. It was only after the request for further information that limited details about the costs, functions and status of the commission came out, but that did not allow proper time for scrutiny of those.

Stuart McMillan: Will the member take an intervention?

Finlay Carson: No, I will not.

That follows the disappointing and disrespectful—as I consider it—approach that the Scottish Government has taken to scrutiny of the bill, which saw the response to the stage 1 report not being received until almost five weeks after it was published and more than a month after the stage 1 debate. That response, in my opinion, was less than helpful in assisting the committee in its stage 2 deliberations. I ask the cabinet secretary

to reflect on what has been a less than satisfactory process during the passage of the bill.

The Presiding Officer: I am aware of the conversation that has been going on in the chamber for some time and I would be grateful if it could be either drawn to a close or taken elsewhere.

Mairi Gougeon: I was looking to start my contribution in a positive way because of the positive amendments that we have seen today, but I do not think that the way in which this group of amendments has been characterised and discussed by some of the members so far is fair. There has been a real mischaracterisation of the process.

Finlay Carson criticised the Government for supporting Ariane Burgess's amendments, but I think that we would have been criticised if we had not done so. That is what has been important about the process: we have listened. We did not support the amendment at stage 2 in order that I could have discussions with other parties and get members' views and we are now in a position in which we can support Ariane Burgess's amendments.

I thank the members of the RAINE Committee and other members who met me to discuss the issues, as well as the stakeholders who made their views known throughout the process. It was important that we did that and that we listened to what various members had to say.

As I set out in my recent letter to the convener of the RAINE Committee, it was important to take the time to consider all the viewpoints relating to oversight and I have had productive discussions about the preferred options for oversight of the bill. We have to take into consideration a variety of things, such as the costs and ensuring that there is that appropriate oversight and scrutiny of the good food nation plans.

As part of the Bute house agreement with the Scottish Green Party, the Scottish Government committed to considering the need for a statutory body such as a food commission. I thank Ariane Burgess for working with us to deliver on our shared commitment. I fully support the proposals lodged in her name to set up a statutory food commission.

Setting up a food commission as outlined in Ariane Burgess's amendments will strengthen the bill and provide that further impetus on Scotland's journey to being a good food nation. I look forward to working closely with other organisations and bodies in the food and drink landscape to achieve that shared goal.

I will turn now to Colin Smyth's and Rachael Hamilton's amendments. Colin Smyth's

amendment would require the commission to have regard to the principles set out in the bill when exercising its functions. That amendment is unnecessary, as the food commission has an oversight role. When, for example, it is carrying out a function of scrutinising the plans and progress reports, having regard to the principles is not required or, indeed, appropriate. For that reason, I urge members not to support Colin Smyth's amendment 37A.

Rachael Hamilton's amendments 41 and 42 are almost identical, with the exception of the inclusion of head (6)(f) in amendment 41. I believe that that is to reflect that amendment 41 is reliant on amendment 16 in her name being agreed to. Both amendments would establish a food commission, but leave the substantive work of doing so to a regulation-making power rather than, as in Ariane Burgess's amendment, including the detailed provisions for setting up a food commission in the bill. The detail that is set out in Ariane Burgess's amendments in the group would provide the clarity needed on the functions and structure of the food commission. It is for those reasons that I ask members not to accept the amendments in Rachael Hamilton's name.

In summary, I welcome and fully support the amendments in Ariane Burgess's name and strongly urge members to support her amendments to establish a food commission.

Ariane Burgess: Over months of evidence taking, the Rural Affairs, Islands and Natural Environment Committee heard why our food system would benefit from fundamental change and why a food commission is needed to motivate, support and oversee that transition. After many constructive discussions with the cabinet secretary, which she has just outlined, the Scottish Government and the Greens have agreed that an independent food commission would be best placed to effectively perform that oversight role and to help ensure that good food nation plans really deliver a successful transformation of our food system and supply chains.

I am well aware of the need to be exceptionally careful with public spending at this time, due to a range of pressures, including the on-going constraints on the Scottish Government budget. That is why this amendment sets out the framework for a lean, streamlined commission with a maximum of four members plus a chair—a similar model to the Scottish Human Rights Commission—and the ability to expand or contract as required. I am confident that that will be a wise and worthwhile investment that will help local authorities, health boards and the Scottish Government to save time and money in the long run, and will deliver significant benefits across portfolio areas.

I strongly urge members to accept the amendments in my name to establish a food commission. I press amendment 28.

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 28 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

18:45

Natalie Don (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app did not work. I would have voted yes.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Ms Don. We will ensure that that is recorded.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)

McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)

Abstentions

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 79, Against 1, Abstentions 25.

Amendment 28 agreed to.

After section 6

Amendment 7 moved—[Rachael Hamilton]— and agreed to.

Section 7—Requirements to produce plans

Amendment 62 moved—[Rachael Hamilton].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 62 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

Siobhian Brown (Ayr) (SNP): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app was not working. I would have voted no.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Ms Brown. We will ensure that that is recorded.

Collette Stevenson (East Kilbride) (SNP): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app froze. Had I been able to vote, I would have voted no.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Ms Stevenson. We will ensure that that is recorded.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)

Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)

Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley)
 (SNP)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 45, Against 63, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 62 disagreed to.

Amendment 63 moved—[Rachael Hamilton].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 63 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

Stuart McMillan: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I could not connect. I would have voted no.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr McMillan. We will ensure that that is recorded.

Brian Whittle: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app would not connect. I would have voted yes.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Whittle. We will ensure that that is recorded—it was a yes.

Ben Macpherson: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I would have voted no.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Macpherson. We will ensure that that is recorded.

Kenneth Gibson: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. Again, there was no connection. I would have voted no.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Gibson. We will ensure that that is recorded.

Anas Sarwar (Glasgow) (Lab): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I apologise—I would have voted yes.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Sarwar. We will ensure that that is recorded.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)

Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire)
 (Con)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)

McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 46; Against 63; Abstentions 0.

Amendment 63 disagreed to.

Amendment 3 moved—[Brian Whittle].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 3 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

Ben Macpherson: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I was unable to connect. I would have voted no.

The Presiding Officer: Could you please repeat that, Mr Macpherson?

Ben Macpherson: Unfortunately, I was again unable to connect. I would have voted no if I had been able to.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you. We will ensure that that is recorded.

The Minister for Community Safety (Ash Regan): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app would not connect. I would have voted no.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Ms Regan. We will ensure that that is recorded.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)

Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)

Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 42, Against 67, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 3 disagreed to.

Amendment 29 moved—[Beatrice Wishart].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 29 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

Angus Robertson: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. The app did not connect. I would have voted no.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Robertson. We will ensure that that is recorded.

Jim Fairlie (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. Unfortunately, my app did not connect. I would have voted no.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Fairlie. We will ensure that that is recorded.

I ask members for a bit of silence, because we are finding it difficult to hear, and I would be loth to miss anyone's vote.

Ruth Maguire: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. Can I check whether my vote registered? I would have voted no.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Ms Maguire. It had not registered, but we will ensure that it is recorded.

The Cabinet Secretary for Net Zero, Energy and Transport (Michael Matheson): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app did not work. I would have voted no.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Matheson. We will ensure that that is recorded.

Natalie Don: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app did not connect. I would have voted no.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Ms Don. We will ensure that that is recorded.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 45, Against 62, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 29 disagreed to.

Amendment 64 moved—[Monica Lennon].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 64 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

Ben Macpherson: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I was unable to connect. I would have voted no.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Macpherson. We will ensure that that is recorded.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Cole-Hamilton, Alex (Edinburgh Western) (LD)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)

Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 46, Against 63, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 64 disagreed to.

19:00

Amendment 65 moved—[Rachael Hamilton].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 65 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)

Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 45, Against 62, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 65 disagreed to.

Amendment 66 moved—[Rachael Hamilton].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 66 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)

Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)

MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 44, Against 62, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 66 disagreed to.

Amendments 8 to 10 moved—[Rachael Hamilton]—and agreed to.

Section 7A—Preparation of plans: principles

Amendment 30 moved—[Rhoda Grant].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 30 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

Paul O’Kane: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I could not connect. I would have voted yes.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr O’Kane. We will ensure that that is recorded.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)

Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)

Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 45, Against 63, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 30 disagreed to.

Amendment 31 moved—[Rhoda Grant].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 31 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

Craig Hoy: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app would not refresh. I would have voted yes.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Hoy. We will ensure that that is recorded.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)

Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)

Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 44, Against 63, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 31 disagreed to.

Amendment 32 moved—[Rachael Hamilton].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 32 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

Kenneth Gibson: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I could not connect to the system. I would have voted no.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Gibson. We will ensure that that is recorded.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)

Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)

McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 45, Against 63, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 32 disagreed to.

Amendment 33 moved—[Ariane Burgess]—and agreed to.

Amendment 34 moved—[Rhoda Grant].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 34 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

Kenneth Gibson: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. Again, I could not connect to the digital platform. I would have voted no.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Gibson. We will ensure that that is recorded.

Paul O’Kane: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I could not connect. I would have voted yes.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr O’Kane. We will ensure that that is recorded.

The Deputy First Minister and Cabinet Secretary for Covid Recovery (John Swinney): On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I was not able to connect to the app. I would have voted no.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Swinney. We will ensure that that is recorded.

For

Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)

Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)

Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)

Abstentions

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 18, Against 62, Abstentions 25.

Amendment 34 disagreed to.

Amendment 67 moved—[Monica Lennon].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 67 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

Kenneth Gibson: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. Once again, I could not connect to the digital platform. I would have voted no.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Gibson. We will ensure that that is recorded.

Finlay Carson: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I was unable to vote. I would have abstained.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Carson. We will ensure that that is recorded.

Pam Duncan-Glancy: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My vote has been recorded as no, but I thought that I had pressed yes. I do not know that a lot can be done about that, but I would like it to be put on the record that I had intended to vote yes.

The Presiding Officer: You are quite correct, Ms Duncan-Glancy: not a lot can be done now, but your comment is on the record.

For

Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)

Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Abstentions

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 17, Against 65, Abstentions 25.

Amendment 67 disagreed to.

Section 8—Preparation of plans: consultation

Amendment 11 moved—[Rachael Hamilton]—and agreed to.

Amendment 68 moved—[Monica Lennon]—and agreed to.

19:15

Section 11—Reporting

Amendment 69 moved—[Rachael Hamilton].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 69 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

Kenneth Gibson: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. Once again, I could not connect to the digital platform. I would have voted no.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Gibson. We will ensure that that is recorded.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)

Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 42, Against 66, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 69 disagreed to.

Amendment 70 moved—[Rachael Hamilton].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 70 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

Edward Mountain: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My voting app failed. I would have voted yes.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Mountain. We will ensure that that is recorded.

Colin Smyth: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I could not connect to the app. I would have voted yes.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Smyth. We will ensure that that is recorded.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)

Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 44, Against 64, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 70 disagreed to.

Amendment 71 moved—[Rachael Hamilton].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 71 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is closed.

Kevin Stewart: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app has failed; I would have voted no.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Stewart. We will ensure that that is recorded.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)

Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 44, Against 63, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 71 disagreed to.

Section 12—Review and revision of plans

Amendment 35 moved—[Ariane Burgess].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 35 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division. Members should cast their votes now.

The vote is closed.

Ariane Burgess: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app did not work, so I did not vote on my amendment, but I would have voted yes.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Ms Burgess. We will ensure that that is recorded.

Ben Macpherson: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. The connection did not allow me to stipulate the correct vote. I would have voted yes.

The Presiding Officer: Bear with me a moment, Mr Macpherson. I confirm that your vote has been registered.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)

McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)

Abstentions

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 80, Against 1, Abstentions 26.

Amendment 35 agreed to.

After section 12

Amendment 12 moved—[Rachael Hamilton]— and agreed to.

Amendment 36 moved—[Ariane Burgess].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 36 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division. Members should cast their votes now.

The vote is closed.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)

Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Abstentions

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 81, Against 0, Abstentions 26.

Amendment 36 agreed to.

Amendment 37 moved—[Ariane Burgess].

Amendment 37A moved—[Colin Smyth].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 37A be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division. Members should cast their votes now.

The vote is closed.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)

Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 45, Against 63, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 37A disagreed to.

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 37 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division. Members should cast their votes now.

The vote is closed.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)

Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)

Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Abstentions

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 81, Against 0, Abstentions 26.

Amendment 37 agreed to.

Amendments 38 to 40 moved—[Ariane Burgess]—and agreed to.

Amendment 41 moved—[Rachael Hamilton].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 41 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division. Members should cast their votes now.

The vote is now closed.

19:30

Kenneth Gibson: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I was unable to connect to the digital platform. I would have voted no.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Gibson. We will ensure that that is recorded.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)

Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)

Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 42, Against 65, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 41 disagreed to.

Amendment 42 moved—[Rachael Hamilton].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 42 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division. Members should cast their votes now.

The vote is now closed.

For

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)

Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 McArthur, Liam (Orkney Islands) (LD)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 O’Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

Against

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)

Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 41, Against 64, Abstentions 0.

Amendment 42 disagreed to.

Section 14—Other defined expressions

Amendment 13 moved—[Rachael Hamilton]—and agreed to.

Section 16—Regulations

Amendment 43 moved—[Rachael Hamilton]—and agreed to.

Amendment 14 moved—[Rachael Hamilton]—and agreed to.

Amendment 44 moved—[Ariane Burgess]—and agreed to.

Amendment 45 moved—[Ariane Burgess]—and agreed to.

After section 18

Amendment 46 moved—[Ariane Burgess].

The Presiding Officer: The question is, that amendment 46 be agreed to. Are we agreed?

Members: No.

The Presiding Officer: There will be a division.

The vote is now closed.

Neil Bibby: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. I would have voted yes.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Mr Bibby. We will ensure that that is recorded.

Collette Stevenson: On a point of order, Presiding Officer. My app froze. Had it been working, I would have voted yes.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Ms Stevenson. We will ensure that that is recorded.

For

Adam, George (Paisley) (SNP)
 Adam, Karen (Banffshire and Buchan Coast) (SNP)
 Adamson, Clare (Motherwell and Wishaw) (SNP)
 Allan, Alasdair (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP)
 Arthur, Tom (Renfrewshire South) (SNP)
 Beattie, Colin (Midlothian North and Musselburgh) (SNP)
 Bibby, Neil (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Boyack, Sarah (Lothian) (Lab)
 Brown, Siobhian (Ayr) (SNP)
 Burgess, Ariane (Highlands and Islands) (Green)
 Callaghan, Stephanie (Uddingston and Bellshill) (SNP)
 Chapman, Maggie (North East Scotland) (Green)
 Clark, Katy (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Coffey, Willie (Kilmarnock and Irvine Valley) (SNP)
 Constance, Angela (Almond Valley) (SNP)
 Dey, Graeme (Angus South) (SNP)
 Don, Natalie (Renfrewshire North and West) (SNP)
 Doris, Bob (Glasgow Maryhill and Springburn) (SNP)
 Dunbar, Jackie (Aberdeen Donside) (SNP)
 Duncan-Glancy, Pam (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Ewing, Annabelle (Cowdenbeath) (SNP)
 Ewing, Fergus (Inverness and Nairn) (SNP)
 Fairlie, Jim (Perthshire South and Kinross-shire) (SNP)
 FitzPatrick, Joe (Dundee City West) (SNP)
 Gibson, Kenneth (Cunninghame North) (SNP)
 Gilruth, Jenny (Mid Fife and Glenrothes) (SNP)
 Gougeon, Mairi (Angus North and Mearns) (SNP)
 Grahame, Christine (Midlothian South, Tweeddale and Lauderdale) (SNP)
 Grant, Rhoda (Highlands and Islands) (Lab)
 Gray, Neil (Airdrie and Shotts) (SNP)
 Greer, Ross (West Scotland) (Green)
 Griffin, Mark (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 Halcro Johnston, Jamie (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Harper, Emma (South Scotland) (SNP)
 Haughey, Clare (Rutherglen) (SNP)
 Hepburn, Jamie (Cumbernauld and Kilsyth) (SNP)
 Johnson, Daniel (Edinburgh Southern) (Lab)
 Kidd, Bill (Glasgow Anniesland) (SNP)
 Lennon, Monica (Central Scotland) (Lab)
 MacDonald, Gordon (Edinburgh Pentlands) (SNP)
 MacGregor, Fulton (Coatbridge and Chryston) (SNP)
 Mackay, Rona (Strathkelvin and Bearsden) (SNP)
 Macpherson, Ben (Edinburgh Northern and Leith) (SNP)
 Maguire, Ruth (Cunninghame South) (SNP)
 Martin, Gillian (Aberdeenshire East) (SNP)
 Mason, John (Glasgow Shettleston) (SNP)
 Matheson, Michael (Falkirk West) (SNP)
 McKee, Ivan (Glasgow Provan) (SNP)
 McKelvie, Christina (Hamilton, Larkhall and Stonehouse) (SNP)
 McLennan, Paul (East Lothian) (SNP)
 McMillan, Stuart (Greenock and Inverclyde) (SNP)
 McNair, Marie (Clydebank and Milngavie) (SNP)
 McNeill, Pauline (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Minto, Jenni (Argyll and Bute) (SNP)
 Mochan, Carol (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Nicoll, Audrey (Aberdeen South and North Kincardine) (SNP)
 O'Kane, Paul (West Scotland) (Lab)
 Regan, Ash (Edinburgh Eastern) (SNP)
 Rennie, Willie (North East Fife) (LD)
 Robertson, Angus (Edinburgh Central) (SNP)
 Robison, Shona (Dundee City East) (SNP)
 Roddick, Emma (Highlands and Islands) (SNP)
 Ruskell, Mark (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Green)
 Sarwar, Anas (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Slater, Lorna (Lothian) (Green)
 Smyth, Colin (South Scotland) (Lab)
 Somerville, Shirley-Anne (Dunfermline) (SNP)
 Stevenson, Collette (East Kilbride) (SNP)

Stewart, Kaukab (Glasgow Kelvin) (SNP)
 Stewart, Kevin (Aberdeen Central) (SNP)
 Sweeney, Paul (Glasgow) (Lab)
 Swinney, John (Perthshire North) (SNP)
 Thomson, Michelle (Falkirk East) (SNP)
 Todd, Maree (Caithness, Sutherland and Ross) (SNP)
 Torrance, David (Kirkcaldy) (SNP)
 Tweed, Evelyn (Stirling) (SNP)
 Villalba, Mercedes (North East Scotland) (Lab)
 Whitham, Elena (Carrick, Cumnock and Doon Valley) (SNP)
 Wishart, Beatrice (Shetland Islands) (LD)
 Yousaf, Humza (Glasgow Pollok) (SNP)

Against

Mackay, Gillian (Central Scotland) (Green)

Abstentions

Balfour, Jeremy (Lothian) (Con)
 Briggs, Miles (Lothian) (Con)
 Cameron, Donald (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Carson, Finlay (Galloway and West Dumfries) (Con)
 Dowey, Sharon (South Scotland) (Con)
 Findlay, Russell (West Scotland) (Con)
 Fraser, Murdo (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Golden, Maurice (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Greene, Jamie (West Scotland) (Con)
 Gulhane, Sandesh (Glasgow) (Con)
 Hamilton, Rachael (Ettrick, Roxburgh and Berwickshire) (Con)
 Hoy, Craig (South Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Liam (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Kerr, Stephen (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Lockhart, Dean (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Lumsden, Douglas (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Mountain, Edward (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Mundell, Oliver (Dumfriesshire) (Con)
 Ross, Douglas (Highlands and Islands) (Con)
 Simpson, Graham (Central Scotland) (Con)
 Smith, Liz (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Stewart, Alexander (Mid Scotland and Fife) (Con)
 Webber, Sue (Lothian) (Con)
 Wells, Annie (Glasgow) (Con)
 White, Tess (North East Scotland) (Con)
 Whittle, Brian (South Scotland) (Con)

The Presiding Officer: The result of the division is: For 80, Against 1, Abstentions 26.

Amendment 46 agreed to.

The Presiding Officer: As members will be aware, at this point in the proceedings, I am required under standing orders to decide whether, in my view, any provision of the bill relates to a protected subject matter—that is, whether it modifies the electoral system and franchise for Scottish parliamentary elections. In my view, no provision in the Good Food Nation (Scotland) Bill does so, so it does not require a supermajority to be passed at stage 3.

Decision Time

19:37

The Presiding Officer (Alison Johnstone): There are no questions to be put as a result of today's business, so that concludes decision time.

Great Bernera Community Land Buyout

The Deputy Presiding Officer (Liam McArthur): The final item of business is a members' business debate on motion S6M-04117, in the name of Alasdair Allan, on supporting Great Bernera's community land buyout. The debate will be concluded without any question being put. I invite members who wish to participate to press their request-to-speak buttons or place an R in the chat function if they are joining us online.

Motion debated,

That the Parliament recognises the work of the Great Bernera Community Development Trust towards a crofting community buyout and the development of the island; understands that, despite concentrated efforts on the Trust's part to bring the crofting land's sale to completion, a reported lack of cooperation by the island's absentee landlord has delayed and halted necessary progress; is deeply concerned by reported recent demands for significant payments by the landlord from local crofters before he will give permission for various legitimate, and elsewhere payment-free, transactions to proceed; understands that, in recent years, the island's school and local shop have both closed; further understands that part 3 of the Land Reform (Scotland) Act 2003 has not yet been successfully utilised, but considers Bernera to be an example of where that approach may well be required; notes the hope that all relevant agencies can continue to support the Great Bernera Community Development Trust in securing the buyout of the crofting land, and further notes the calls on the landlord to engage constructively and promptly with the local community going forward.

19:45

Alasdair Allan (Na h-Eileanan an Iar) (SNP): I thanks members for staying this late in the evening for the debate.

Since its re-establishment, this Parliament has helped empower many communities, beginning to address centuries of injustice in the way that land has so often been gifted, sold and, sometimes, neglected.

Around 57 per cent of Scotland's rural land is in private hands. I should say that many of those landowners work hard to develop their estates and engage reasonably with the communities who live and work on them. However, that is not the case when the landlord turns out to be an absentee with no visible plans for the estate other than the extraction of money.

The Land Reform (Scotland) Act 2003 and the Community Empowerment (Scotland) Act 2015 seek to ensure that landowners uphold their responsibilities and, particularly if they are not doing that, provide a legal basis for communities to negotiate a purchase of the land.

The island of Great Bernera has been connected by a short bridge to the west coast of

Lewis since 1953. The construction of that bridge, incidentally, came about only after islanders threatened to create their own informal causeway by obtaining their own explosives.

The people of Bernera have a long history of having to battle for their own rights. In the 1874 Bernera riot, crofters resisted the forced evictions that their then landlord attempted as part of the wider Highland clearances. Bernera's crofters eventually won their case against that landlord in court.

In 1972, the islands of Great and Little Bernera were bought by Count Robin de la Lanne-Mirrlees, a colourful man whose wartime exploits in the Balkans were said to have partly inspired the character of James Bond in his friend Ian Fleming's novels. His title as a count was bestowed—I understand—by the Government of San Marino. All that said, the count led a fairly simple life on the island, where I visited him a couple of times. He died in 2012, leaving the islands to his grandson—Cyran de la Lanne—in Germany, but told islanders that they should have the first option of buying the island should it ever be put up for sale.

In 2015, 85 per cent of Bernera's residents voted in favour of a community buyout. The district valuer set a sale figure of £70,000, reflecting the island's status under crofting tenure. However, the family of the owner considered that sum too low. Despite numerous efforts by islanders, some of whom visited the owner in Germany in 2017, negotiations did not get very far. There was an intention to purchase through a combination of grants from various sources, but the de la Lanne family stalled, not naming a price at which they would be willing to sell.

In 2020, the Great Bernera Community Development Trust began the process of pursuing a crofting community buyout. In March, I contacted Bernera's landlord with a request to meet him to discuss the various barriers that the estate was by then reported to be putting in place, hampering local development and blocking legitimate transactions with tenants.

After an initial agreement to meet, my office has followed up three further times to be told that currently "there are no suitable dates" for Mr de la Lanne and his father but that they might get back in touch "shortly". That tactic has, I understand, been employed repeatedly regarding the island's buyout efforts, as well as with individual tenants.

One Bernera crofter, Mr Neil MacAulay, has been seeking to exercise his legal right to purchase his own croft for a number of years. I am told that, rather than respond to any emails about that, Bernera's landlord has simply ignored him. Mr MacAulay's daughters want to move to Bernera

with their young families and hope to build long-term homes on their father's croft. However, they cannot do that until their father is allowed to buy it, which generally requires the co-operation of the landlord. The family's next step may involve the courts.

Another constituent, Mr Ian Murdo Macdonald, had been hoping to retire to his family home in Bernera but instead had to put the property on the market to pay for his late mother's care home fees. For 18 months, Bernera estate refused to agree to its formal decrofting to allow the sale until Mr Macdonald was prepared to cough up the completely arbitrary sum of £16,000, adding significant stress to an already difficult situation. That kind of sum might not mean very much to an absentee landlord, but it is impossible for most people to magic it out of thin air. I should also say that that practice is unheard of on other estates.

My constituent stood his ground and the landlord has now, finally, agreed to allow the sale to be finalised without that completely unjustifiable fee. However, unless something changes soon, Bernera's population will continue to decline. The island's school and shop have both closed in recent years and although there are young families who want to move back to the area, the lack of scope for local development under the current owner means that it is impossible to reverse the island's depopulation by building any new affordable housing.

Part 3 of the Land Reform (Scotland) Act 2003 provides for a hostile bid by a community. That route has never been taken, although it has been threatened previously where landlords were seen to be particularly unco-operative. The owner of Bernera seems to be determined to paint himself into that corner.

I hope that the minister may be able to say something in summing up about the contact that the Government, its officials and the Scottish land fund are able to have with my constituents to try to resolve the situation. According to the Scottish land fund, private estates in Scotland stay in the hands of the same families for an average of 122 years. I sincerely hope that that does not prove to be the case with Bernera.

The island of Bernera should belong to the people who live there and to those whose families have worked the land there and fished from the surrounding seas for generations. Morally and culturally, the land is, of course, already theirs; we must now continue to do all that we can to support the Great Bernera Community Development Trust to successfully take legal ownership so that the island's community can begin to develop and thrive once again.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I gently remind those who have not yet pressed their request-to-speak buttons to do so as soon as possible.

Donald Cameron joins us remotely.

19:52

Donald Cameron (Highlands and Islands) (Con): I refer to my entry in the register of members' interests as the owner of a landholding in the Highland Council region. I am grateful to Alasdair Allan for securing time to debate the issue. I also commend the work of the Great Bernera Community Development Trust.

When I was first elected to Parliament in 2016, I said that I would always seek to stand up for the most rural and remote communities, who often feel that Edinburgh is as far away as London and that decision making that reflects the concerns of such communities does not always happen in the Scottish Parliament. In that vein, I welcome the opportunity to debate this particular case. I hope that it shows that we can discuss important matters such as land ownership and land reform in both general terms and as they affect our constituents specifically.

Turning to the precise nature of the aims of the Great Bernera Community Development Trust, I reiterate the support of the Scottish Conservatives for many of the general principles that underpin land reform. It is often forgotten that the very first moves towards greater community ownership of land in Scotland were undertaken by the Conservative Governments of the late 1980s and early 1990s, which prominent land reform academics such as Professor Jim Hunter have acknowledged.

In the more recent past, our benches have noted support for improved transparency of land ownership as a means of tackling tax avoidance. We have also noted support for community empowerment, and it is interesting that aspects of the Community Empowerment (Scotland) Act 2015 were derived, in part, from United Kingdom Government localism legislation.

It is patently clear that although there is a very long way still to travel, we have been moving towards greater diversity in land ownership in Scotland, with many successful community landowners. I see that particularly in the Highlands and Islands, from where I am speaking tonight. From Eigg and Gigha to Carloway and West Harris, there is a plethora of different community landowners who have been not only successful but transformative in what they have achieved.

Alasdair Allan touched on the fact that in this specific case there is clearly a long-standing and contentious issue between the community

development trust and the island's landowner, and I share the worry of the Great Bernera community about the regrettable turn of events. I am grateful to Alasdair Allan for setting out the precise history and detail of the issues, in which, as the constituency MSP, he will be well versed. I cannot add much to that detail, but I am very concerned to note that the local school and shop on the island have closed, further adding to the unnecessary worry faced by the local community.

I touched briefly on the more general issue of island depopulation, which I feel that the issues on Great Bernera are tied into. There are concerning trends of depopulation across our islands, which is a huge cause for concern. In particular, the fact that the population of the Western Isles is expected to drop by 20 per cent come 2041 highlights the harsh reality of that issue.

There are things that we can do to reverse those trends: we need to ensure that connectivity between our islands and the mainland is reliable, continue to invest in the roll-out of broadband and better mobile connectivity, and ensure that investment is directed towards delivering more social and affordable housing to give young islanders an incentive to stay.

It is also critical that we support job creation where possible. For example, recently, I met a business that is looking to create several new jobs on Harris, but it faces real issues in getting the raw materials to set that up on the island.

We in the Parliament have an important role to play. I am grateful to Alasdair Allan for highlighting the specific issue around Great Bernera and I extend an offer to work on a cross-party basis where possible to secure a more desirable outcome for the community there.

As I said, community buyouts often work extremely well, and they can be powerful forces for good in local communities. I hope that a resolution can be found in this instance and in other instances in which communities are struggling to own land when that is in the wider interest of the areas in which they live and that they represent.

19:57

Ruth Maguire (Cunninghame South) (SNP): I congratulate Alasdair Allan on bringing this debate to the Scottish Parliament. I am happy to make some brief remarks in support of his motion, which recognises the work of the Great Bernera Community Development Trust towards a crofting community buyout and the development of its island.

The Land Reform (Scotland) Act 2003 and the Community Empowerment (Scotland) Act 2015

seek to ensure that landowners uphold their responsibilities, and they provide a legal basis for communities to negotiate a purchase of the land. As Alasdair Allan said in opening the debate, an absentee landlord might legally own and control the land—or, in this case, the island—but the question remains whether, morally, they should. Although we might say that morally and culturally the land already belongs to the people there, it is the case, particularly when we look at the experience of the citizens of Great Bernera, that in order for them to develop and thrive, legal ownership could be seen as crucial.

It is hugely regrettable that the lack of cooperation from the absentee landlord has delayed and halted progress in that regard. I am sorry that the legislation that is in place to deal with that, namely the 2003 and 2015 acts, have not yet delivered for that particular community. The reports of the highly unusual demands from the absentee landlord for payments from local crofters are, frankly, alarming. The community itself knows what is required to sustain the population there. The loss of the school, care home and shop, combined with rising house prices and the difficulties in developing land, contribute to a challenging picture for the community.

It is not just a matter for the Highlands or rural Scotland; it is of concern to urban communities, too. The fact that MSPs from around the country will contribute this evening reflects just how important the topic of who owns our land and assets, and what they are used for, is.

Land reform is defined as changes to land ownership and land use in the public interest. The issue of land ownership in Scotland can be a contentious one. It is of concern to many of us that large swathes of our country are being held by only a handful of private and in many cases non-resident landowners. As the Centre for Local Economic Strategies notes,

“Land ownership matters because it is an expression of economic and political power”.

The concentration of rural land ownership in the hands of only a few people is a structural problem, particularly when it results in land use that extracts wealth from local communities to their detriment and to the detriment of the wider public interest. The situation in Great Bernera highlights that.

I wish the Great Bernera Community Development Trust every success in its endeavours. I believe that ownership of the land being with the folk who live there will help to redirect wealth back into the local economy and place control and benefits into the hands of the local people, which is right and just.

20:00

Mercedes Villalba (North East Scotland) (Lab): I thank Alasdair Allan for lodging his important motion for debate.

Land ownership remains one of the greatest injustices that we face in Scotland, because the ownership of Scotland's land remains heavily concentrated in the hands of a wealthy few at the expense of communities. As Alasdair Allan and Ruth Maguire have so poignantly put it, those communities have a moral and cultural case for ownership of that land. That could not be seen more clearly than on Great Bernera—after all, the local community there has found its aspiration to purchase land frustrated by Scotland's inadequate land laws.

Despite residents seeking a sustainable and prosperous future through community land ownership, progress continues to be delayed by a lack of co-operation from the island's absentee landlord. In the meantime, the same landlord continues to exploit what should be the community's land for his own gain by demanding significant payments from local crofters.

Great Bernera is the prime example of what happens when Scotland's land laws fail to secure the public interest. That is what happens when a disinterested landowner is able to stifle the needs and aspirations of a local community. The truth is that landowners can get away with that because Scotland's land laws favour their interests over those of local communities.

Even after 20 years of devolution, our land laws lag far behind those of other European countries when it comes to protecting the public interest. In Scotland, it is left to communities with few resources to try to exercise complex legal rights in the face of a landowner that seeks to frustrate their ambitions and, as things stand, the Scottish Government has no right to formally ask whether a landowner is acting in or against the public interest.

That is why we urgently need radical and progressive reform of our land laws. Ministers must be given the powers to intervene and to ask the public interest questions that need to be asked. They must also be able to require the compulsory sale of land when the public interest demands it.

Although the Scottish Government's commitment to introduce a land reform bill is welcome, I am worried that it will fail to deliver the radical change that is needed. That is why I will introduce a land justice bill later this year. I am sure that the minister will remind us today that landowners have property rights. My bill will respect that, but it will not hide behind the timid interpretations of what those property rights might

mean that are, I fear, likely to emanate from Government lawyers.

Powers are not just needed when land is at the point of changing hands; they are also needed when the landed class—often an absentee landlord—frustrates the legitimate interests of the people. That is what I will propose through my land justice bill so that the people of Great Bernera and other communities can have their interests advanced far more easily than at present.

I hope that my fears about the Scottish Government's land reform bill will prove to be unfounded. It will have my support if it delivers the truly bold and radical change that is needed. However, Parliament deserves to have an opportunity to consider truly progressive land laws, and I will make sure that it has that opportunity through my land justice bill.

20:03

Ariane Burgess (Highlands and Islands) (Green): I, too, express my gratitude to Alasdair Allan for securing time for this debate.

I recognise the huge efforts that the Great Bernera Community Development Trust has made to try to complete the sale of the crofting land. It is deeply disappointing that the absentee landlord is refusing to engage co-operatively with the community. A rural community being rendered dependent on a feudal landlord should be something of the past. It is not reflective of the progressive Scotland that the Scottish Greens are striving for.

I understand that the Bernera community has sought to use crofting community right to buy powers, but it has been challenging, given that the process is complex and time consuming. Other communities across Scotland have instead made progress by reaching amicable agreements with landlords to complete buyouts. Unfortunately, that has not been the case to date in Bernera, and I urge the landowner to work with the community in the spirit of good will.

As Alasdair Allan pointed out, this is not the first time in Bernera's history that the crofters have fought for the right to own the land that they live and work on. In the 1870s, crofters' grazing land was reduced to smaller and smaller proportions of the island to make way for sporting estates. The crofters upheld their end of the agreement by paying rents and working to improve the land, but it was not long before agents of the landlord arrived with eviction notices.

Following local arrests, some remaining crofters took it upon themselves to march to Stornoway to defend their rights and get a fair hearing. Unfortunately, more legal wrangling was to come,

which ended in a court case. However, in 1874, the crofters were found not guilty of the charges against them. Eventually, the case played a part in the first successful challenge of the Crofters Holdings (Scotland) Act 1886, so the Bernera islanders who marched that day took some of the first steps towards land reform in Scotland.

Last week, I visited the islanders on Eigg to join them in celebrating 25 years since their successful community buyout of the island. I could not help being struck by the amazing possibilities that can be achieved by a community that is in control of its land and resources. We gathered in the island's brand-new community hub at the pier. The hub provides a fine tearoom along with food and craft shops and office space, all with stunning southerly sea views, and it is also a considerable local economic driver.

As part of the celebrations, I joined the Eigg electric tour to learn about Eigg's pioneering renewable electricity system. It is the first island to generate power from water, through hydro and wind, and with turbines and the sun, by utilising a large solar array. As the islanders said, their electricity is now cheaper than electricity on the mainland. Along with electricity, the islanders also have a successful and growing forestry initiative. Great Bernera's residents want those opportunities for generations of islanders to come.

It is the responsibility of all of us who are elected to the Parliament to ensure that land reform acts support successful buyouts. I know that the Government intends to introduce a land reform bill later in this parliamentary session, and I hope that we can tackle some of the issues that have been raised tonight through that bill, including by developing a public interest test for the sale of large land holdings and exploring what we can do to tackle overseas landowners.

While preparing for the debate, I came across a poem by Bernera crofter Iain Mac a' Ghobhainn, who lived on Bernera at the close of the 19th century and witnessed the first push for land reform on the island. The poem in English is titled "Spirit of Kindness", as translated by Derick Thomson. I will share a few lines:

"They handed over to the snipe
the land of happy folk,
they dealt without humanity
with people who were kind.
Because they might not drown them
they dispersed them overseas;
a thralldom worse than Babylon's
was the plight they were in."

Almost 150 years on from those lines being drafted, we must start a new chapter for Scotland's crofting communities and Great Bernera's land buyout.

20:08

Kenneth Gibson (Cunninghame North) (SNP): I, too, congratulate Alasdair Allan on securing this evening's important and interesting debate.

Beautiful Great Bernera on the rugged west coast of Lewis has a population of just over 250 people. It was linked to the Isle of Lewis in 1953 by the first pre-stressed concrete bridge in Europe, and the island welcomed 4,000 visitors on the bridge's opening day. The bridge was built only after islanders threatened to build their own causeway by dynamiting the hillside.

The island boasts the first planned crofting township in the Outer Hebrides, which was created in 1805, and the village boundaries are still in use today by the community. Great Bernera also boasts the marvel that is Bosta, which is the most well-preserved late iron age village that has been found in Scotland. Revealed in 1993 following an Atlantic storm and excavated three years later, Bosta features a series of preserved houses that were inhabited from the early first century, with some houses being virtually intact.

Great Bernera's resilient crofters resisted the Highland clearances, sparking the Bernera riot of 1874, at which the first victory for small tenants was recorded when they refused the evictions and rent increases for the expansion of sporting estates. No doubt that is why the island was not cleared as so many other tragic Highland islands were, such as Taransay and Mingulay, both of which are also in the Outer Hebrides. That victory catalysed future resistance in the Crofters Holdings (Scotland) Act 1886, which became known as the crofters' law. Scotland's modern land reform is rooted in its outcome—which, ironically, the island's future now depends on.

From 1960 until his death in 2012, the island was owned by Robin de la Lanne-Mirrlees. As Alasdair Allan said, he is one of the people who are associated with the James Bond character, but then so were Fitzroy Maclean and many of those landlords. I take all of that with a pinch of salt. Robin de la Lanne-Mirrlees offered the islanders first refusal to buy the island, and approximately 85 per cent of the island's population voted in favour. However, the new absentee landlord would not accede.

The Great Bernera Community Development Trust continues to try to negotiate with the island's landlord to purchase the island, despite underhand tactics and a lack of co-operation or willingness to engage in any meaningful negotiations.

Today, the community is mostly dependent on lobster fishing, crofting and tourism, with the Outer Hebrides welcoming more than 200,000 tourists annually. The island's priority is to bring the

community into ownership for its economic and social benefits and secure a stronger, more sustainable future.

The community hopes to ensure that money is invested back into the island to provide employment opportunities and encourage younger generations to remain on the island, helping to ensure its sustainability. With the growing number of people moving from the mainland to the Western Isles, house prices on Great Bernera have increased dramatically, pricing many out of the housing market. Affordable housing is therefore crucial to ensure that islanders can afford to stay and that it remains an attractive community. Of course, that cannot happen with the current landlord. The community needs to take control of their land. Support is also required to renovate housing to ensure accessibility for elderly islanders.

Currently, 70 per cent of people in the Hebrides are living on community-owned land. Community buyouts have been successful in Gigha, north Harris and west Harris, to name just a few, and we heard from Ariane Burgess about her experiences on Eigg. Community ownership has generated significant employment opportunities and affordable housing, highlighting that a bright future should materialise for Great Bernera when the buyout eventually happens, as I am sure we want it to.

The tightly knit community already takes a democratic approach to local matters, surveying islanders to ensure that decisions are made in the best interests of residents and the island. That highlights their capability to take on ownership of the island and plan its future. As the MSP for two island communities, Arran and Cumbrae, I can appreciate at first hand the harm that an unresponsive landlord can do, leading to depopulation and damage to an island's economy. I fully support a community buyout on Great Bernera.

Islands have a unique set of needs and I am proud that the Scottish Government continues to support island and rural communities. I am delighted by the support that the Scottish land fund has provided to Great Bernera, offering the cost of the land and funding for two part-time posts—a commercial manager and an administrative officer—to aid the community's future as a community-owned island. I hope that Great Bernera will successfully use part 3 of the Land Reform (Scotland) Act 2003. I trust that ministers will understand and sympathise with the islanders' reasons for the endeavour.

I also support continued land reform to ensure that we do not find ourselves in the same situation again. I urge the current landlord of Great Bernera to engage and co-operate with the island's

community development trust to reach a fair agreement that will reap huge benefits for the current islanders and future generations on Great Bernera.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The final speaker in the open debate will be Rhoda Grant.

20:13

Rhoda Grant (Highlands and Islands) (Lab): I congratulate Alasdair Allan on securing the debate.

The current situation arises wholly from the failure of the Scottish Government to legislate to make the community right to buy possible in the face of a hostile landlord. It has had 15 years to address that and it must introduce a new land reform bill urgently. The battles, particularly in Pairc, showed that, although the 2003 legislation was well intentioned, it was far too complicated in the face of a determined landowner. If there was serious intent to help communities such as Bernera, that would have been fixed long ago.

New legislation must ensure that anyone who owns large areas of land in Scotland must do so in the public interest. If they do not, there must be powers to remove that land from their ownership. Of course, there need to be checks and balances in any system but, at the end of the day, people such as Cyran de la Lanne-Mirrlees should not be put in charge of a cat far less people's futures and wellbeing. Indeed, there are more powers in Scotland to remove a cat from a bad owner than there are to remove land.

Bernera is a community that is in decline for the same reasons as many others. The key issues are housing and jobs. Both can be addressed only with access to land. It is scandalous that a place that has so long been associated with resisting landlordism is still cursed by the 21st century version of absentee landlordism without Government lifting a finger to stop it.

The Bernera buyout has been mooted for more than a decade, but it can go nowhere because of the intransigence of an individual sitting in Frankfurt. That shames Scotland and the Scottish Government. In the face of similar hostility, other communities do not even bother to try for a buyout.

The case shows us what is wrong with Scottish landowning patterns. While the Scottish Government procrastinates, people suffer. My colleague Mercedes Villalba is consulting on setting a limit for the amount of land that a person could own. That limit would, of course, disinvest Mr de la Lanne-Mirrlees of the majority of the land that he owns in Scotland, which would be beneficial to the people who would no longer be

held hostage by his unreasonable and unlawful demands.

Mr de la Lanne-Mirrlees states that he is being advised by Savills to extort huge amounts of money from house sales on the island, but that has no legal bearing on the matter. If that is the case—and I sincerely hope that it is not—it begs the question whether Savills should be practising in Scotland.

Agents who represent such estates must take some responsibility for the abuses that are being perpetrated. In the case of Bernera, a 26-year-old student in Frankfurt hides behind a legal firm in Stornoway that seems powerless to extract any communication from him, leaving people in dreadful circumstances and the community in dismay. The agents for such landowners need to consider whether they are representing the interests of the community by continuing to represent them and provide them with a shield of virtual anonymity.

The lack of progress by the Scottish National Party on land reform is a disgrace and the work that was done in the early years of Holyrood has never been built on or advanced. That is the hidden scandal. Bernera symbolises the fact that that is the bigger issue.

20:17

The Minister for Public Finance, Planning and Community Wealth (Tom Arthur): I commend Dr Allan for securing the debate, the powerful way in which he narrated the circumstances of his constituents on Great Bernera and the way in which he explained the powerful and intrinsic links between land ownership, development and sustaining a growing population. I also recognise the contributions from colleagues across the parties that were delivered in a constructive and thoughtful tone.

No landowner should ever be able to exert such control over the lives of people who happen to live on land that they own. That is especially so in the case of Great Bernera, given that the previous owner had already given the community first refusal to purchase the island following his death in 2012. When it was put to the community, 85 per cent of them turned out to vote on the buyout. In total, 142 backed the purchase of the island, with 37 against.

The community trust received £100,000 from the Scottish land fund, financed by the Scottish Government, to help to purchase the 2,260 hectares of the Great Bernera estate, including 69 crofts around Kirkibost, Tobson, Hacklete, Breaclete and Croir. Ideas for boosting the island's economy range across various areas and types of

development, including renewable energy and, indeed, a pier.

Why has that not happened? Other crofting communities have faced similar challenges and succeeded. In 2007, the Galson Estate Trust took ownership of 22,000 hectares in the north of the Isle of Lewis. On the same island, Pairc Trust took ownership of 11,000 hectares in 2015. Neither of those buyouts was without its challenges, most notably in the case of Pairc Trust, but both succeeded.

The most obvious answer lies in the tenacity and belief of the communities themselves. Both communities believed that they could take on the running of the land around them and improve the circumstances of their own communities in doing so. Both communities were determined to see that through, no matter what obstacles were put in their way.

The Scottish Government brought in legislation that was aimed at giving rights to communities to purchase land, and the crofting community right to buy was aimed at just this type of situation. However, it is notable that neither of the two successful groups concluded the transfer of the estates using the right to buy. In the end, both concluded the transfer through a negotiated sale, and the preferred way of achieving these outcomes should be both parties reaching common ground and deciding on the way forward. In the case of Pairc, it took several years and a few legal challenges, but it still got there.

Although neither community concluded their deal using the right to buy, it is equally worth noting that, without that right to buy, it is unlikely that either would have got a seat at the table. Both communities began the right-to-buy process and, through using it, brought the owners of the estates to a position of either negotiating with the community or facing a compulsory purchase through the right to buy. The right to buy is a strong tool for a community to have at its disposal.

In the case of Great Bernera, the community is facing some of the same challenges that the Pairc Trust faced. It has an owner who, through the various means at their disposal, is not willing to entertain any discussion with the community about it purchasing the whole estate. They are exerting influence on those who live on land that they own—to what ends, we can only speculate—making it more difficult for the people who live there to plan for any kind of future.

Any owner of land has responsibility to the land itself and to those who call it their home. The Scottish Government's land rights and responsibilities statement, which was published in 2017 and is the first statement of its kind in the world, says exactly that in two of its principles:

“The holders of land rights should exercise these rights in ways that take account of their responsibilities to meet high standards of land ownership, management and use. Acting as the stewards of Scotland’s land resource for future generations they contribute to sustainable growth and a modern, successful country”;

and

“There should be greater collaboration and community engagement in decisions about land.”

If the Great Bernera Community Development Trust feels that those principles are not being followed, there is the crofting community right to buy. The trust has already been investigating that route, and it has been in discussion with Scottish Government officials. Admirably, the trust has continued to pursue the negotiation route, but I recognise that there is a view that the time has now come for a more forceful line of action. Officials are considering how the trust could access the right to buy route and they will continue to do so, as they did in the Pairc and Galson cases.

Looking forward, I note that, as has been touched on during the debate, the 2021-22 programme for government committed to introducing a further land reform bill during the current parliamentary session. During the summer, we will work with all stakeholders, including landowning interests, to develop policy and legislative solutions to progress our proposals. We will undertake a wide-ranging consultation on proposals for the bill, which we aim to introduce by the end of 2023. Our proposals will comply fully with the ECHR, including the right to private property, and with terms of the current devolution settlement, but they will also be ambitious and aimed at making sure that the land plays its full part in delivering the vision set out by the just transition commission of a fairer, greener future for all. That reflects the principled position of the Scottish Government and our explicit commitment to respecting, protecting and fulfilling human rights for every member of society.

The programme for government also committed to doubling the Scottish land fund to £20 million by the end of the current parliamentary session. The fund was put in place to make it possible for community groups to apply for awards to purchase assets, no matter which route that ownership takes.

I close by congratulating Great Bernera Community Development Trust on continuing to persevere in the face of adversity, and I encourage it to pursue the purchase by any means at its disposal. Indeed, in responding to Dr Allan’s specific request, I hope that the land fund will now be able to enter into more detailed discussions with the buy-out trust to examine the options that it wishes to pursue.

The crofting community right to buy has never been used to completion, but maybe it is about time that it was. In this case, it might be able to bring the owner to the negotiating table. If not, I feel that this community is the type to follow through with its plans and take it as far as it can until it becomes the owner of the land.

Meeting closed at 20:24.

This is the final edition of the *Official Report* for this meeting. It is part of the Scottish Parliament *Official Report* archive and has been sent for legal deposit.

Published in Edinburgh by the Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body, the Scottish Parliament, Edinburgh, EH99 1SP

All documents are available on
the Scottish Parliament website at:

www.parliament.scot

Information on non-endorsed print suppliers
is available here:

www.parliament.scot/documents

For information on the Scottish Parliament contact
Public Information on:

Telephone: 0131 348 5000

Textphone: 0800 092 7100

Email: sp.info@parliament.scot



The Scottish Parliament
Pàrlamaid na h-Alba