We the undersigned, as legal academics, practitioners, and members of the legal profession, write to demonstrate our solidarity for the trans community in the wake of the UK Supreme Court ruling in *For Women Scotland v The Scottish Ministers*<sup>1</sup>, of April 16th 2025.

We believe that transgender people, be they men, women, or non-binary people, deserve the human right to private and family life which was affirmed under Article 8 ECHR in *Goodwin v United Kingdom*<sup>2</sup> and which has been repeatedly reaffirmed by the European Court of Human Rights in numerous decisions in the past twenty years.

We believe that the law in the United Kingdom lags behind that of other jurisdictions in the recognition of transgender people, in that it forces trans men and women through arduous processes to gain a Gender Recognition Certificate (GRC)<sup>3</sup>, and does not grant recognition to non-binary people at all.<sup>4</sup> Nevertheless, we believe that the rights that it does grant to trans persons were hard-won and should not be lightly undermined.

We find that the judgment in *Scottish Ministers* positions trans people in an indeterminate space when it comes to equalities law. The judgment defines a person's sex under the Equality Act 2010 as 'biological sex,' reaching back to the Sex Discrimination Act 1975.<sup>5</sup> However, for all other purposes, the acquisition of a Gender Recognition Certificate changes the legal sex of its holder to that which is stated on the GRC. The *Scottish Ministers* decision therefore leaves GRC holders in a legal paradox where they are of one sex for the purposes of everything except equalities law, where they remain of the other - hardly the clarity the Supreme Court purported to enact.

We believe that the Supreme Court, in deciding *Scottish Ministers*, failed to consider several important points of law, including:

- The UK's obligations under the Human Rights Act 1998, which incorporates the rights under the European Convention on Human Rights into UK law;
- The decision in *Chief Constable of West Yorkshire v A (No 2)*<sup>6</sup> wherein the House of Lords held that "the SDA 1975 used a trans-inclusive definition of sex by virtue of the Equal Treatment Directive";

<sup>2</sup> (2002) 35 EHRR 18.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> [2025] UKSC 16.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> GRA 2004 ss. 1-4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Castellucci v Gender Recognition Panel [2025] EWCA Civ 167.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Using the s 9(3) exemption in the GRA 2004.

<sup>6 [2004]</sup> UKHL 21.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> C. Wigley, *'For Women Scotland*: A Case of Significant Silences', U.K. Const. L. Blog (6th May 2025) (available at <a href="https://ukconstitutionallaw.org/">https://ukconstitutionallaw.org/</a>)

- The meanings of 'sex' and 'gender' in the Equality and Human Rights Commission Statutory Code of Practice as explored in *AEA v EHRC*<sup>8</sup>

We further affirm that the EHRC 'interim guidance,' as issued on 25 April 2025, is merely an opinion and does not have the force of law.

We consider the 'interim guidance' to go much further than the *Scottish Ministers* ruling requires in its scope and its intent to ban trans people from using the services which correspond to their true gender. We believe this is discriminatory, marginalising, and hurtful to the community, and has already caused considerable fear and distress.

We believe that forcing trans people to use services according to their sex assigned at birth breaches their right to privacy under Article 8 ECHR, and exposes them to the potential of forced outing, shaming, and even violence.

Lastly, we affirm that the trans community is an important part of society and deserves to be treated equally. We uphold their human rights. We disavow transphobia in all its forms, and we promise to be active allies to community members, interrogating our own biases and calling out transphobia when we encounter it in our profession and otherwise.

## Signed,

- 1. Dr Sylvia de Mars, Newcastle Law School, Newcastle University
- 2. Professor Colin Murray, Newcastle Law School, Newcastle University
- 3. Dr. Sandra Duffy, Lecturer in Law, University of Bristol Law School
- 4. Anurag Deb, Queen's University Belfast
- 5. Prof Aoife O'Donoghue, Queen's University Belfast
- 6. Jess O'Thomson, PhD Law Student, University of Leeds
- 7. Prof Máiréad Enright, Professor of Feminist Legal Studies, University of Birmingham
- 8. Mr Conor Flannery, PhD Student, Queen's University Belfast, School of Law
- 9. Dr Emily Jones, Newcastle Law School, Newcastle University
- 10. Dr Emily Grabham, Professor of Law and Society, Loughborough University
- 11. Dr Elizabeth Agnew, School of Law, Queen's University Belfast
- 12. Dr Tilly Clough, School of Law, Queen's University Belfast
- 13. Dr James Greenwood-Reeves, School of Law, University of Leeds
- 14. Dr Daragh Murray, School of Law, Queen Mary University of London

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> R (Authentic Equity Alliance CIC) v Equality and Human Rights Commission [2021] EWHC 1623 (Admin).

- 15. Dr Sarah Zarmsky, School of Law, QUB
- 16. Dr Jocelyn Bosse, School of Law, Queen's University Belfast
- 17. Dr Francesco de Cecco, Newcastle Law School, Newcastle University
- 18. Dr Lea Raible, School of Law, University of Glasgow
- 19. Sharon Cowan, Professor of Feminist and Queer Legal Studies, University of Edinburgh
- 20. Dr Ruth Houghton, Newcastle Law School
- 21. Dr Marisa McVey, School of Law, Queen's University Belfast
- 22. Professor Charlotte O'Brien, York Law School, University of York
- 23. Dr Alice Welsh, York Law School, University of York
- 24. Dr Sarah Craig, School of Law, Ulster University
- 25. Dr David M Scott, School of Law, Queen Mary University of London
- 26. Prof. Martin Jones, Professor of International Human Rights Law, York Law School, University of York
- 27. Helen Flynn LLM, Human rights campaigner
- 28. Ciara Bartlam, barrister
- 29. Phil Bates, Associate Professor in Law, University of Plymouth
- 30. Damian Fisher, Solicitor at nplaw
- 31. Oscar Davies, Barrister, Garden Court Chambers
- 32. Johanna McDavitt, Solicitor
- 33. Dr Tom Flynn, Lecturer, Essex Law School
- 34. Dr Jess Lawrence, Senior Lecturer, Essex Law School
- 35. Dr Joanna Gilmore, York Law School, University of York
- 36. Dr Jesse Bachir, University of Birmingham Law School
- 37. Dr Erin Ferguson, School of Law, University of Aberdeen
- 38. Beth Currie, Pupil Barrister, Garden Court North Chambers
- 39. Dr Alan Greene, Reader in Constitutional Law and Human Rights, Birmingham Law School
- 40. Prof Ralf Michaels, Chair in Global Law, Queen Mary University, London
- 41. George Collecott, solicitor at the Global Legal Action Network (GLAN)
- 42. Dr Inga Thiemann, School of Law, University of Leicester
- 43. Dr Tara Mulqueen, School of Law, University of Warwick
- 44. Dr Anne Neylon, School of Law and Social Justice, University of Liverpool
- 45. Dr Joy Twemlow, School of Law, Durham University
- 46. Dr Lydia Morgan, Birmingham Law School, University of Birmingham
- 47. John Wadham, solicitor (not practicing)
- 48. Monique Bouffé, Barrister, Outer Temple Chambers
- 49. Brie Stevens-Hoare KC (Barrister, Gatehouse Chambers)
- 50.Dr Damian Gonzalez Salzberg, Birmingham Law School, University of Birmingham
- 51. Dr Hayley Gibson, Lecturer in Law, University of Kent

- 52. Caroline Harrison KC (Barrister in independent practice)
- 53. Melvyna Mumunie, Solicitor
- 54. Professor Emeritus Phil Scraton PhD, School of Law, Queens University Belfast
- 55. Dr. Tara Lai Quinlan, Birmingham Law School, University of Birmingham
- 56. David Faith, Legal Counsel
- 57. Dr Silvana Tapia Tapia, Associate Professor in Law, Birmingham Law School, University of Birmingham
- 58. Oliver Edwards, Solicitor of Greater Manchester Law Centre
- 59. Dr Matt Howard, Lecturer in law, University of Kent
- 60. Dr Flora Renz, Senior Lecturer in Law, Kent Law School, University of Kent
- 61. Dr Kit Colliver, York Law School, University of York
- 62. Declan Owens, Solicitor
- 63. Prof Michelle Farrell, School of Law and Social Justice, University of Liverpool
- 64. Jack Heron, Solicitor
- 65. Dr Eleanor Drywood, Liverpool Law School
- 66. Matthew Burton, Lecturer in Law, University of Bristol
- 67. Professor Michael Gordon, School of Law and Social Justice, University of Liverpool
- 68.Dr Greg Davies, Law Lecturer, School of Law and Social Justice, University of Liverpool
- 69. Dr Emily Ireland, Law Lecturer, School of Law and Social Justice, University of Liverpool
- 70. Dr Alex Latham-Gambi, Birmingham Law School
- 71. Professor Catherine O'Rourke, Durham Law School, Durham University
- 72. Dr Danielle Watson, School of Law, University of Leicester
- 73. Ellie Fayle, Solicitor
- 74. Brenda Efurhievwe, Barrister at Goldsmith Chambers
- 75. Taylor Blair, Barrister
- 76. Dr Nikki Godden-Rasul, Law School, Newcastle University
- 77. Dr Kay Crosby, senior lecturer in law, Newcastle University
- 78. Dr Laura Lammasniemi, School of Law, University of Warwick
- 79. Dr Danielle Griffiths, School of Law and Social Justice, University of Liverpool
- 80. Alexa Thompson, Barrister at Garden Court North
- 81. Dr Elizabeth Chloe Romanis, Associate Professor, Durham Law School
- 82. Professor Sharon Thompson, School of Law and Politics, Cardiff University
- 83. Dr Charlotte Bendall, Birmingham Law School, University of Birmingham
- 84. Dr Ed Horowicz, Senior Lecturer, School of Law and Social Justice, University of Liverpool
- 85. Dr Henry Jones, Associate Professor, Durham Law School
- 86. Dr Illan Wall, school of Law, University of Galway / University of Warwick
- 87. Sean Madden, PhD Candidate in Law, University of Birmingham

- 88. Professor Ruth Fletcher, School of Law, Queen Mary University of London
- 89.Dr Tina Sikka, Reader in Technoscience and Intersectional Justice, Newcastle University
- 90. Professor Rosemary Hunter, Loughborough Law, Loughborough University
- 91. Dr Chloe Wallace, School of Law, University of Leeds
- 92. Hamish McCallum, Barrister at Garden Court Chambers
- 93. Dr Elena Loizidou, Professor of Law and Political Theory, School of Law, Birkbeck College.
- 94. Dr Jane Rooney, Associate Professor in International Law, Durham Law School
- 95. Dr Jonathan Collinson, School of Law, University of Sheffield
- 96. Professor Nicola Barker, School of Law and Social Justice, University of Liverpool
- 97. Dr Julie McCandless, Senior Lecturer, Kent Law School
- 98. Dr Magdalena Furgalska, the York Law School, University of York
- 99. Dr Senthorun Raj, Manchester Law School, Manchester Metropolitan University
- 100. Dr Dimitrios Kagiaros, Assistant Professor in Public Law and Human Rights, Durham Law School
- 101. Dr Ruth Brittle, Leicester Law School, University of Leicester
- 102. Ka Lok Yip, Solicitor (non-practising)
- 103. Daniel Cloney, Regent's Park College, University of Oxford
- 104. Chiara Cordone, Barrister at 39 Essex Chambers
- 105. Melissa Symes, Senior Lawyer, nplaw
- 106. Michael Clements, Solicitor
- 107. Dr Victoria McCloud, retired UK judge, legal author and legal consultant
- 108. Laura Jones, LLB (Hons); PG Dip (LP); LLM
- 109. Dr Vidya Kumar, Senior Lecturer in Law, SOAS Law School, University of London, UK
- 110. Professor Natasa Mavronicola, Professor of Human Rights Law, University of Birmingham
- 111. Meghan Campbell, Reader in International Human Rights Law, University of Birmingham
- 112. Dr. Robert Vardill
- 113. Dr Julian Scholtes, School of Law, University of Glasgow
- 114. Dr Mattia Pinto, Centre for Applied Human Rights & York Law School, University of York
- 115. Dr Brando (School of Law and Social Justice, University of Liverpool)
- 116. Professor Kate Bedford, University of Birmingham
- 117. Dr Natalie Sedacca, Assistant Professor in Employment Law, Durham Law School
- 118. Marc Mason, Senior Lecturer and Barrister, University of Westminster
- 119. Dr Sarah Keenan, Queen Mary University of London Law School
- 120. Dr Rachel Hubbard (Senior Lecturer in Social Work, UWE Bristol)

- 121. Dr Sarah Lamble, Professor of Criminology, Birkbeck, University of London
- 122. David Thomas, Lecturer in Law, Brighton University
- 123. Jolyon Maugham KC, Founder of Good Law Project
- 124. Dr Mireia Garces de Marcilla, Lecturer in Law, University of Exeter
- 125. Dr Ronit Matar, Lecturer in Human Rights Law, School of Law, Queen Mary University London
- 126. Dr Kay Lalor, Reader in Human Rights Law, Manchester Metropolitan University
- 127. Dr. Liam Sunner, Queen's University Belfast
- 128. Professor Bryan Clark Law School Newcastle University
- 129. Dr Jessie Blackbourn, Associate Professor, Durham Law School
- 130. Dr Joshua Jowitt, Newcastle Law School, Newcastle University
- 131. Eleni Methymaki, Lecturer in International Law, University of Glasgow
- 132. Dr Rosie Fox, School of Law, University of Leeds
- 133. Dr Liam Edwards, School of Law, Ulster University
- 134. Dr Sarah Singh, School of Law & Social Justice, University of Liverpool.
- 135. Dr Zoe Tongue, School of Law, University of Leeds
- 136. Dr Laurène Soubise, University of Leeds
- 137. Jessica Benton, PhD Candidate in International Criminal Law, Leeds Beckett University
- 138. Professor emeritus Eric Clive, Edinburgh University Law School
- 139. Dr Adam Tucker, School of Law and Social Justice, University of Liverpool
- 140. Dr Daniella Lock, Lecturer in Law, King's College London
- 141. Prof. Ioana Cismas, York Law School, University of York
- 142. Caroline McLeod, Solicitor
- 143. Professor Marie Fox, School of Law & Social Justice, University of Liverpool
- 144. Dr Maja Grundler, Northumbria Law School
- 145. Japheth Monzon LLM (Access to Justice and Human Rights Campaigner)
- 146. Aoife Edith Rosa Bowdler, PhD Candidate in Law, University of Liverpool
- 147. Professor Jen Ang, University of Glasgow, School of Law
- 148. Katherine East, Solicitor at Clyde & Co LLP
- 149. Prof Anna Carline, School of Law and Social Justice, University of Liverpool
- 150. Dr Jess Randall Liverpool John Moores University
- 151. Professor Alex Sharpe, School of Law, University of Warwick
- 152. Dr Lewis Graham, University of Cambridge
- 153. Dr Katy Vaughan, Senior Lecturer, School of Law, Swansea University
- 154. Dr Michael Lane, Lecturer in Law, University of Worcester
- 155. Alasdair Mackenzie, Barrister
- 156. Prof. Matthew Weait, Professor of Law and Society, University of Oxford
- 157. Dr Alex Powell, Principal Lecturer in Law, Oxford Brookes University
- 158. Ceri Lloyd-Hughes, Solicitor

- 159. Dave Busfield-Birch, Employment Law Supervisor, Toynbee Hall Free Legal Advice Centre
- 160. Robin Moira White, Barrister, Old Square Chambers
- 161. Professor Se-shauna Wheatle, Durham Law School, Durham University
- 162. Dr Jennifer Cobbe, Faculty of Law, University of Cambridge
- 163. Snigdha Nag, Senior Lecturer, City Law School, City St George's University of London
- 164. Dr Mitchell Travis, Associate Professor in Law and Social Justice, School of Law, University of Leeds
- 165. Dr Lena Holzer, Faculty of Law, University of Cambridge
- 166. Dr Marco Longobardo, School of Law, University of Westminster
- 167. Dr Raawiyah Rifath, Lecturer in Law, University of Exeter
- 168. Dr. Meghan Hoyt
- 169. Dr Sally Day, School of Law, Exeter University
- 170. Michael Passaro, PhD Law Student, Durham Law School
- 171. Salman Hasan, Solicitor
- 172. Prof Rory O'Connell, Professor of Human Rights and Constitutional Law, Ulster University
- 173. Mr David Morgan-Wilkins, eDiscovery Technical Lead, Norton Rose Fulbright LLP
- 174. Professor Louise Mallinder, School of Law, Queen's University Belfast
- 175. Professor Colin Harvey, Queen's University Belfast
- 176. Andrew Kearney, Barrister at Gatehouse Chambers
- 177. Dr Natalie Ohana, Law School, University of Exeter
- 178. Dr. Elif Ceylan Ozsoy, Law School Cornwall, University of Exeter.
- 179. Eilís Ní Chaoimh, PhD Researcher University of Galway
- 180. Dr Stephanie Dropuljic, Lecturer in Law, School of Law, University of Exeter
- 181. Dr Zaina Mahmoud, Lecturer, School of Law & Social Justice, University of Liverpool
- 182. Professor Yvette Russell, Professor of Law and Feminist Theory, University of Bristol
- 183. Professor Kimberley Brayson, Professor of Critical Jurisprudence, Leicester Law School, University of Leicester
- 184. Tamara Hervey, Jean Monnet Professor of EU Law, The City Law School, University of London
- 185. Dr David Lawrence, Durham Law School
- 186. James Milton, PhD Candidate at UCL Faculty of Laws
- 187. Isaac Abraham, Solicitor
- 188. Matteo Bassetti, PhD Candidate, Essex Law School
- 189. Cris van Eijk, PhD Candidate, Newcastle Law School
- 190. Dr Clair Quentin, Loughborough Law, Loughborough University

- 191. Dr Laura Graham, School of Law, Northumbria University
- 192. Dr Francesca Farrington, Lecturer, University of Aberdeen
- 193. Dr Michiel Poesen (School of Law, University of Aberdeen)
- 194. Dr Nevena Jevremovic, Lecturer in Law, University of Aberdeen
- 195. Alice Bushell, Solicitor
- 196. Dr Eva Nanopoulos, Reader in Law, Queen Mary University of London
- 197. Dr Benedict Douglas, Durham Law School
- 198. Dr Mitchell Lennan, School of Law, University of Aberdeen
- 199. Professor Beverley Clough, Manchester Law School, MMU
- 200. Alasdair Murray, Solicitor
- 201. Amy Allard-Dunbar, Research Assistant, Policy Institute, Faculty Social Science and Public Policy, King's College London
- 202. Professor Nadine El-Enany, School of Law, University of Kent
- 203. Dr Tanzil Chowdhury, School of Law, Queen Mary University of London
- 204. Raich Frith, PhD Student, Queen Mary University of London
- 205. Dr Elizabeth O'Loughlin, Durham Law School, Durham University